

Āṅguttara Nikāya:  
Tika-nipāta

The Book of the Threes  
from  
*The Numerical Discourses of the Buddha*

A Translation of the Āṅguttara Nikāya  
by Bhikkhu Bodhi  
Wisdom Publications • Boston • 2012  
© Bhikkhu Bodhi

This file is for exclusive use by students in the Sutta Study Class conducted by Ven. Bhikkhu Bodhi at Chuang Yen Monastery. Otherwise it is subject to all the conditions on the reverse of the title page in the original publication, namely:

“No part of this book may be reproduced in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photography, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system or technologies now known or later developed, without permission in writing from the publisher.”

## The Book of the Threes

### The First Fifty

#### I. The Fool<pp.>

1 Peril • 2 Characteristic • 3 Thinking • 4 Transgression • 5 Carelessly • 6 Unwholesome • 7 Blameworthy • 8 Afflictive • 9 Maimed • 10 Stains

#### II. The Cart Maker <pp.>

11 Well Known • 12 To Be Remembered • 13 A Bhikkhu • 14 Wheel-Turning • 15 Pacetana • 16 The Unmistaken • 17 Oneself • 18 Deva • 19 Shopkeeper • 20 Shopkeeper

#### III. Persons<pp.> Etc.

21 Saviṭṭha • 22 Patients • 23 Volitional Activities • 24 Helpful • 25 Diamond • 26 To Be Associated With • 27 Disgust • 28 Speech Like Dung • 29 Blind • 30 Inverted

#### IV. Divine Messengers

31 Brahmā • 32 Ānanda • 33 Sāriputta • 34 Causes • 35 Hatthaka • 36 Messengers • 37 Kings • 38 Kings • 39 Delicate • 40 Authorities

#### V. The Minor Chapter

41 Present • 42 Cases • 43 Advantages • 44 Smooth Flow • 45 The Wise • 46 Virtuous • 47 Conditioned • 48 Mountains • 49 Ardor • 50 A Master Thief

### The Second Fifty

#### I. Brahmins

51 Two Brahmins • 52 Two Brahmins • 53 A Certain Brahmin • 54 A Wanderer • 55 Nibbāna • 56 Depopulation • 57 Vaccha • 58 Tikaṇṇa • 59 Jāṇussoṇī • 60 Saṅgārava

#### II. The Great Chapter

61 Sectarian • 62 Perils • 63 Venāga • 64 Sarabha • 65 Kesaputtiya • 66 Sālha • 67 Bases of Talk • 68 Other Sects • 69 Roots • 70 Upasatha •

#### III. Ānanda

71 Channa • 72 Ājīvaka • 73 The Sakyan • 74 The Nigaṇṭha • 75 Should be Encouraged • 76 Existence • 77 Volition and Aspiration • 78 Setting Up • 79 Fragrance • 80 Abhibhū

#### IV. Ascetics

81 Ascetics • 82 The Donkey • 83 The Field • 84 The Young Vajjian • 85 A Trainee • 86 The Process of Training • 87 The Process of Training • 88 The Process of Training • 89 The Trainings • 90 The Trainings • 91 Paṅkadhā

#### V. A Lump of Salt

92 Urgent • 93 Solitude • 94 Autumn • 95 Assemblies • 96 Thoroughbred • 97 Thoroughbred • 98 Thoroughbred • 99 Bark Fabric • 100 A Lump of Salt • 101 The Soil Remover • 102 A Goldsmith

## The Third Fifty

### I. Enlightenment

103 Before • 104 Gratification • 105 Gratification • 106 Ascetics • 107 Wailing • 108 No Satiation • 109 Peaked Roof • 110 Peaked Roof • 111 Causes • 112 Causes

### II. Bound for the Plane of Misery

113 Bound for the Plane of Misery • 114 Rare • 115 Immeasurable • 116 Imperturbable • 117 Failures and Accomplishments • 118 Dice • 119 Activity • 120 Purity • 121 Purity • 122 Sagacity

### III. Bharañḍu

123 Kusinārā • 124 Arguments • 125 Gotamaka • 126 Bharañḍu • 127 Hatthaka • 128 Pollution • 129 Anuruddha • 130 Anuruddha • 131 Concealed • 132 Line Etched in Stone

### IV. A Warrior

133 A Warrior • 134 Assemblies • 135 A Friend • 136 Arising • 137 A Hair Mantle • 138 Accomplishment • 139 Growth • 140 Horses • 141 Horses • 142 Horses • 143 The Peacock Sanctuary • 144 The Peacock Sanctuary • 145 The Peacock Sanctuary

### V. Auspicious

146 Unwholesome • 147 Blameworthy • 148 Unrighteous • 149 Impure • 150 Maimed • 151 Maimed • 152 Maimed • 153 Maimed • 154 Homage • 155 A Good Morning

### VI. Ways of Practice

156 [Establishments of Mindfulness] • 157–162 [Right Strivings, Etc.]

### VII. Courses of Kamma Repetition Series

163–182

### VIII. Lust, Etc., Repetition Series

183–352

[101] The Book of the Threes

Homage to the Blessed One, the Arahant,  
the Perfectly Enlightened One

The First Fifty

I. The Fool

1 (1) Peril

Thus have I heard. On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Sāvattthī in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park. There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus: "Bhikkhus!"

"Venerable sir!" those bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

"Bhikkhus, whatever perils arise all arise on account of the fool, not on account of the wise person. Whatever calamities arise all arise on account of the fool, not on account of the wise person. Whatever misfortunes arise all arise on account of the fool, not on account of the wise person. Just as a fire that starts in a house made of reeds or grass burns down even a house with a peaked roof, plastered inside and out, draft-free, with bolts fastened and shutters closed; so too, whatever perils arise...all arise on account of the fool, not on account of the wise person. (1) Thus, bhikkhus, the fool brings peril, the wise person brings no peril; (2) the fool brings calamity, the wise person brings no calamity; (3) the fool brings misfortune, the wise person brings no misfortune. There is no peril from the wise person; there is no calamity from the wise person; there is no misfortune from the wise person.

"Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train yourselves thus: 'We will avoid the three qualities possessing which one is known as a fool, and we will undertake and practice those three qualities possessing which one is known as a wise person.' It is in this way that you should train yourselves." [102]

2 (2) Characteristics

"Bhikkhus, the fool is characterized by his actions; the wise person is characterized by his actions. Wisdom shines in its manifestation.<sup>1</sup>

"Bhikkhus, one who possesses three qualities should be known as a fool. What three? Bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct. One who

---

<sup>1</sup> Readings differ among the editions. *Ce apadānasobhinī paññā*, *Be apadānasobhanī paññā*, *Ee apadāne sobhati paññā*. Mp: "The meaning is that the fool and the wise person are each known through their conduct" (*bālā ca paṇḍitā ca attano attano cariten'eva pākaṭā honī ti attho*).

possesses these three qualities should be known as a fool. One who possesses three qualities should be known as a wise person. What three? Bodily good conduct, verbal good conduct, and mental good conduct. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a wise person.

"Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train yourselves thus: 'We will avoid the three qualities possessing which one is known as a fool, and we will undertake and observe those three qualities possessing which one is known as a wise person.' It is in this way that you should train yourselves."

### 3 (3) Thinking

"Bhikkhus, the fool has these three characteristics of a fool, marks of a fool, manifestations of a fool.<sup>2</sup> What three? Here, a fool thinks badly, speaks badly, and acts badly. If the fool did not think badly, speak badly, and act badly, how would wise people know of him: 'This fellow is a fool, a bad person'? But because the fool thinks badly, speaks badly, and acts badly, wise people know of him: 'This fellow is a fool, a bad person.' These are the fool's three characteristics of a fool, marks of a fool, manifestations of a fool.

"The wise person has these three characteristics of a wise person, marks of a wise person, manifestations of a wise person. What three? Here, a wise person thinks well, speaks well, and acts well. If the wise person did not think well, speak well, and act well, how would wise people know of him: 'This fellow is wise, a good person'? [103] But because the wise person thinks well, speaks well, and acts well, wise people know of him: 'This fellow is wise, a good person.' These are the wise person's three characteristics of a wise person, marks of a wise person, manifestations of a wise person.

"Therefore ... [as in 3:2] ... It is in this way that you should train yourselves."<sup>3</sup>

### 4 (4) Transgression

"Bhikkhus, one who possesses three qualities should be known as a fool. What three? (1) He does not see his transgression as a transgression. (2) When he sees his transgression as a transgression, he does not make amends for it in accordance with the Dhamma. (3) When another person confesses a transgression to him, he does not accept it in accordance with the Dhamma. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a fool.

"One who possesses three qualities should be known as a wise person. What three? (1) He sees a transgression as a transgression. (2) When he sees a transgression as a transgression, he makes amends for it in accordance with the Dhamma. (3) When another

---

<sup>2</sup> *Bālalakkhaṇāni bālanimittāni bālāpadānāni*. Mp: "These are the means of recognition."

<sup>3</sup> Ee omits this concluding exhortation in 3:3–7.

person confesses a transgression to him, he accepts it in accordance with the Dhamma. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a wise person.

"Therefore ... It is in this way that you should train yourselves."

#### 5 (5) Carelessly

"Bhikkhus, one who possesses three qualities should be known as a fool. What three? (1) He formulates a question carelessly; (2) he replies to a question carelessly; (3) when another person replies to a question carefully, with well-rounded and coherent words and phrases, he does not approve of it. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a fool.

"One who possesses three qualities should be known as a wise person. What three? (1) He formulates a question carefully; (2) he replies to a question carefully; (3) when another person replies to a question carefully, with well-rounded and coherent words and phrases, he approves of it. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a wise person.

"Therefore ... It is in this way that you should train yourselves."

#### 6 (6) Unwholesome

"Bhikkhus, one who possesses three qualities should be known as a fool. What three? [104] Unwholesome bodily action, unwholesome verbal action, and unwholesome mental action. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a fool.

"One who possesses three qualities should be known as a wise person. What three? Wholesome bodily action, wholesome verbal action, and wholesome mental action. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a wise person.

"Therefore ... It is in this way that you should train yourselves."

#### 7 (7) Blameworthy

"Bhikkhus, one who possesses three qualities should be known as a fool. What three? Blameworthy bodily action, blameworthy verbal action, and blameworthy mental action. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a fool.

"One who possesses three qualities should be known as a wise person. What three? Blameless bodily action, blameless verbal action, and blameless mental action. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a wise person.

"Therefore ... It is in this way that you should train yourselves."

#### 8 (8) Afflictive

"Bhikkhus, one who possesses three qualities should be known as a fool. What three? Afflictive bodily action, afflictive verbal action, and afflictive mental action. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a fool.

"One who possesses three qualities should be known as a wise person. What three? Unafflictive bodily action, unafflictive verbal action, and unafflictive mental action. One who possesses these three qualities should be known as a wise person.

"Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train yourselves thus: 'We will avoid the three qualities possessing which one is known as a fool, and we will undertake and observe those three qualities possessing which one is known as a wise person.' It is in this way that you should train yourselves." [105]

#### 9 (9) Maimed

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, the foolish, incompetent, bad person maintains himself in a maimed and injured condition; he is blameworthy and subject to reproach by the wise; and he generates much demerit. What three? Bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct. Possessing these three qualities, the foolish, incompetent, bad person maintains himself in a maimed and injured condition; he is blameworthy and subject to reproach by the wise; and he generates much demerit.

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, the wise, competent, good person preserves himself unmaimed and uninjured; he is blameless and beyond reproach by the wise; and he generates much merit. What three? Bodily good conduct, verbal good conduct, and mental good conduct. Possessing these three qualities, the wise, competent, good person preserves himself unmaimed and uninjured; he is blameless and beyond reproach by the wise; and he generates much merit."

#### 10 (10) Stains

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities and without having abandoned three stains, one is deposited in hell as if brought there. What three? (1) One is immoral and has not abandoned the stain of immorality. (2) One is envious and has not abandoned the stain of envy. (3) One is miserly and has not abandoned the stain of miserliness. Possessing these three qualities and without having abandoned these three stains, one is deposited in hell as if brought there.

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities and having abandoned three stains, one is deposited in heaven as if brought there. What three? (1) One is virtuous and has abandoned the stain of immorality. (2) One is not envious and has abandoned the stain of envy. (3) One is not miserly and has abandoned the stain of miserliness. Possessing these three qualities and having abandoned these three stains, one is deposited in heaven as if brought there." [106]

## II. The Cart Maker

### 11 (1) Well Known

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, a well-known bhikkhu is acting for the harm of many people, for the unhappiness of many people, for the ruin, harm, and suffering of many people, of devas and human beings. What three? He encourages them indiscordantbodily action, discordant verbal action, and discordant [mental] qualities.<sup>4</sup> Possessing these three qualities, a well-known bhikkhu is acting for the harm of many people, for the unhappiness of many people, for the ruin, harm, and suffering of many people, of devas and human beings.

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, a well-known bhikkhu is acting for the welfare of many people, for the happiness of many people, for the good, welfare, and happiness of many people, of devas and human beings. What three? He encourages them inconcordant bodily action, concordant verbal action, and concordant [mental] qualities. Possessing these three qualities, a well-known bhikkhu is acting for the welfare of many people, for the happiness of many people, for the good, welfare, and happiness of many people, of devas and human beings."

### 12 (2) To Be Remembered

"Bhikkhus, there are these three [places] that a head-anointed khattiya king should remember all his life. What three? (1) The first is the place where he was born. (2) The second is the place where he was head-anointed a khattiya king. (3) And the third is the place where, having triumphed in battle, he emerged victorious and settled at the head of the battlefield. These are the three [places] that a head-anointed khattiya king should remember all his life. [107]

"So too, bhikkhus, there are these three [places] that a bhikkhu should remember all his life. What three? (1) The first is the place where he shaved off his hair and beard, put on ochre robes, and went forth from the household life into homelessness. (2) The second is the place where he understood as it really is: 'This is suffering,' and 'This is the origin of suffering,' and 'This is the cessation of suffering,' and 'This is the way leading to

---

<sup>4</sup> Mp. "*Discordant (ananulomike)* means not in conformity with the teaching. Gross 'discordant bodily action' is destroying life, etc.; or [more subtly] worshipping the directions or making offerings to the spirits. Gross 'discordant verbal action' is false speech, etc.; or [more subtly], if one does not wish to give to others, deceiving them by saying one does not have anything to give. Gross 'discordant mental action' is covetousness, etc.; or [more subtly], explaining a meditation subject incorrectly." Mp illustrates this with the story of the elder mentioned at [Vism 296,12-16](#), Ppn 9.6, who taught a young man to meditate on loving-kindness towards his wife. As a result he was overcome by lust and beat against the walls of his meditation cell all night. I translate *ananulomikesu dhammesu* in accordance with Mp, but the word *dhammesu* can also mean teachings and it is possible that this was the original intention.



the cessation of suffering.' (3) And the third is the place where, with the destruction of the taints, herealized for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, dwelled in it.<sup>5</sup> These are the three [places] that a bhikkhu should remember all his life."

### 13 (3) A Bhikkhu

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world. What three? The one without expectation, the one full of expectation, and the one who has overcome expectation.

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is the person without expectation? Here, a person has been reborn in a low family—a family of *caṇḍālas*, bamboo workers, hunters, cart makers, or flower scavengers<sup>6</sup>—one that is poor, with little food and drink, that subsists with difficulty, where food and clothing are obtained with difficulty; and he is ugly, unsightly, dwarfish, with much illness: blind, crippled, lame, or paralyzed. He does not obtain food, drink, clothing, and vehicles; garlands, scents, and unguents; bedding, housing, and lighting. He hears: 'The khattiyas have anointed such and such a khattiya.' It does not occur to him: 'When will the khattiyas anoint me too?' This is called the person without expectation.

(2) "And what is the person full of expectation? [108] Here, the eldest son of a head-anointed khattiya king, one due to be anointed but not yet anointed, has attained the unshaken.<sup>7</sup> He hears: 'The khattiyas have anointed such and such a khattiya.' It occurs to him: 'When will the khattiyas anoint me too?' This is called the person full of expectation.

(3) "And what is the person who has overcome expectation? Here, a head-anointed khattiya king hears: 'Such and such a khattiya has been anointed by the khattiyas.' It does not occur to him: 'When will the khattiyas anoint me too?' For what reason? Because his past expectation of anointment subsided when he was anointed. This is called the person who has overcome expectation.

"These are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world.

"So too, bhikkhus, there are three kinds of persons found existing among the bhikkhus. What three? The one without expectation, the one full of expectation, and the one who has overcome expectation.

---

<sup>5</sup> The second case, the understanding of the four noble truths, marks the attainment of stream-entry; the third, the destruction of the taints, is the attainment of arahantship.

<sup>6</sup> These were all considered low occupations fit only for social outcasts. The *caṇḍālas* were the most despised community. Ce omits *nesādakule vā*, apparently by oversight, as Mp (both Ce and Be) glosses it as "a family of deer hunters" (*migaluddakāṇaṃ kule*).

<sup>7</sup> On *acalappatto*, Mp says: "When the eldest—one due to be anointed but not yet anointed—is still an infant, he does not form any wish to be anointed. But when he reaches the age of sixteen and his beard begins to grow, he is called 'one who has attained the unshaken.' He is able to reign over a large realm, therefore [the Buddha] says 'one who has attained the unshaken.'" See too 4:87 §1.

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is the person without expectation? Here, some person is immoral, of bad character, of impure and suspect behavior, secretive in his actions, not an ascetic though claiming to be one, not a celibate though claiming to be one, inwardly rotten, corrupt, depraved. He hears: 'Such and such a bhikkhu, with the destruction of the taints, has realized for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it.' It does not occur to him: 'When will I, too, with the destruction of the taints, realize for myself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, dwell in it?' This is called the person without expectation.

(2) "And what is the person full of expectation? Here, a bhikkhu is virtuous, of good character. He [109] hears: 'Such and such a bhikkhu, with the destruction of the taints, has realized for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it.' It occurs to him: 'When will I, too, with the destruction of the taints, realize for myself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, dwell in it?' This is called the person full of expectation.

(3) "And what is the person who has overcome expectation? Here, a bhikkhu is an arahant, one whose taints are destroyed. He hears: 'Such and such bhikkhu, with the destruction of the taints, has realized for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it.' It does not occur to him: 'When will I, too, with the destruction of the taints, realize for myself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, dwell in it?' For what reason? Because his past expectation of liberation subsided when he was liberated. This is called the person who has overcome expectation.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons found existing among the bhikkhus."

#### 14 (4) Wheel-Turning

"Bhikkhus, even a wheel-turning monarch, a righteous king who rules by the Dhamma, does not turn the wheel without a king above him."

When this was said, a certain bhikkhu said to the Blessed One: "But, bhante, who is the king above a wheel-turning monarch, a righteous king who rules by the Dhamma?"

"It is the Dhamma, bhikkhu," the Blessed One said.<sup>8</sup> "Here, bhikkhu, a wheel-turning monarch, a righteous king who rules by the Dhamma, relying just on the

---

<sup>8</sup> Mp glosses *dhamma* here as "the Dhamma of the ten courses of wholesome kamma" (*dasakusala-kammāpathadhammo*). This is certainly too narrow, but it is clear that "Dhamma" here does not mean the Buddha's teaching as such. Rather, it is the universal principle of goodness and truth followed by virtuous

Dhamma, honoring, respecting, and venerating the Dhamma, taking the Dhamma as his standard, banner, and authority, provides righteous protection, shelter, and guard for the people in his court. Again, a wheel-turning monarch, a righteous king who rules by the Dhamma, relying just on the Dhamma, honoring, respecting, and venerating the Dhamma, taking the Dhamma as his standard, banner, and authority, provides righteous protection, shelter, and guard for his khattiya vassals, his army, [110] brahmins and householders, the people of town and countryside, ascetics and brahmins, and the animals and birds. Having provided such righteous protection, shelter, and guard for all these beings, that wheel-turning monarch, a righteous king who rules by the Dhamma, turns the wheel solely through the Dhamma,<sup>9</sup> a wheel that cannot be turned back by any hostile human being.<sup>10</sup>

(1) "So too, bhikkhu, the Tathāgata, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One, the righteous king of the Dhamma, relying just on the Dhamma, honoring, respecting, and venerating the Dhamma, taking the Dhamma as his standard, banner, and authority, provides righteous protection, shelter, and guard in regard to bodily action, saying: 'Such bodily action should be cultivated; such bodily action should not be cultivated.'

(2) "Again, the Tathāgata, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One, the righteous king of the Dhamma, relying just on the Dhamma, honoring, respecting, and venerating the Dhamma, taking the Dhamma as his standard, banner, and authority, provides righteous protection, shelter, and guard in regard to verbal action, saying: 'Such verbal action should be cultivated; such verbal action should not be cultivated.'

(3) "Again, the Tathāgata, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One, the righteous king of the Dhamma, relying just on the Dhamma, honoring, respecting, and venerating the Dhamma, taking the Dhamma as his standard, banner, and authority, provides righteous protection, shelter, and guard in regard to mental action, saying: 'Such mental action should be cultivated; such mental action should not be cultivated.'

"Having provided such righteous protection, shelter, and guard in regard to bodily action, verbal action, and mental action, the Tathāgata, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One, the righteous king of the Dhamma, sets in motion the unsurpassed wheel of the Dhamma solely through the Dhamma, a wheel that cannot be turned back by any ascetic, brahmin, deva, Māra, or Brahmā, or by anyone in the world."

---

people irrespective of their religious convictions. On the basis of this Dhamma the wheel-turning monarch provides righteous (*dhammika*) protection to all in his realm.

<sup>9</sup> Mp: "He sets in motion the wheel just by means of the Dhamma of the ten courses of wholesome kamma." Ce and Be read the verb here as *vatteti*, but below, in relation to the Buddha, as *pavatteti*; Ee has *pavatteti* in relation to both. If *vatteti* is the original reading, the change in verbs may be intended to suggest that a wheel-turning monarch does not initiate the rule of righteousness but continues the heritage of his forefathers, whereas a Buddha sets in motion the wheel of Dhamma previously unknown in the world.

<sup>10</sup> *Kenaci manussabhūtena paccatthikena pāṇinā*. Lit. "by any hostile living being that has become human." Mp: "The deities, it is said, can do whatever they want. Therefore they are not included, but 'human being' is mentioned." This is in contrast with the Buddha, whose wheel cannot be turned back by any beings including the deities.

15 (5) Pacetana<sup>11</sup>

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Bārāṇasī in the deer park at Isipatana. There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus: "Bhikkhus!" [111]

"Venerable sir!" those bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

"Bhikkhus, in the past there was a king named Pacetana. Then King Pacetana addressed a chariotmaker: 'Friend chariotmaker, six months from now there will be a battle. Can you make me a new pair of wheels?' – 'I can, lord,' the chariotmaker replied. After six months less six days the chariotmaker had finished one wheel. King Pacetana then addressed the chariotmaker: 'Six days from now there will be a battle. Is the new pair of wheels finished?' [The chariotmaker replied:] 'In the past six months less six days, lord, I have finished one wheel.' – 'But, friend chariotmaker, can you finish a second wheel for me in the next six days?' – 'I can, lord,' the chariotmaker replied. Then, over the next six days, the chariotmaker finished the second wheel. He brought the new pair of wheels to King Pacetana and said: 'This is the new pair of wheels that I have made for you, lord.' – 'What is the difference, friend chariotmaker, between the wheel that took six months less six days to complete and the one that took six days to complete? I do not see any difference between them.' – 'There is a difference, lord. Observe the difference.'

"Then the chariotmaker rolled the wheel that took six days to finish. It rolled as far as the impetus carried it,<sup>12</sup> and then it wobbled and fell to the ground. But the wheel that took six months [112] less six days to finish rolled as far as the impetus carried it and then stood still as if fixed on an axle.<sup>13</sup>

"[The king asked:] 'Why is it, friend chariotmaker, that the wheel that took six days to finish rolled as far as the impetus carried it, and then wobbled and fell to the ground, while the wheel that took six months less six days to finish rolled as far as the impetus carried it and then stood still as if fixed on an axle?'

"[The chariotmaker replied:] 'The wheel that took six days to finish, lord, has a rim that is crooked, faulty, and defective; spokes that are crooked, faulty, and defective; and a nave that is crooked, faulty, and defective. For this reason, it rolled as far as the impetus carried it and then it wobbled and fell to the ground. But the wheel that took six months less six days to finish has a rim without crookedness, faults, and defects; it has spokes without crookedness, faults, and defects; and it has a nave that is without without crookedness, faults, and defects. For this reason, it rolled as far as the impetus carried it and then stood still as if fixed on an axle.'

"It may be, bhikkhus, that you think: 'On that occasion the chariotmaker was someone else.' But you should not think in such a way. On that occasion, I myself was

---

<sup>11</sup> So Ce and Ee. Be gives the king's name as Sacetana.

<sup>12</sup> *Abhisāṅkhārassa gati*. An unusual use of the word *abhisāṅkhāra*, which in more technical contexts denotes volitional activity that creates kamma. Mp glosses with *payogassa gamanaṃ*, "the movement of (or due to) the effort."

<sup>13</sup> Mp: "As if fixed on an axle: as if an axle had been inserted so that it stood still."

the chariotmaker. Then I was skilled in crookedness, faults, and defects in wood. But now I am the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One, (1) skilled in crookedness, faults, and defects of the body; (2) skilled in crookedness, faults, and defects of speech; and (3) skilled in crookedness, faults, and defects of mind.

"Any bhikkhu or bhikkhunī who has not abandoned crookedness, faults, and defects of the body, speech, and mind [113] has fallen down from this Dhamma and discipline, just as the wheel that was finished in six days [fell to the ground].

"Any bhikkhu or bhikkhunī who has abandoned crookedness, faults, and defects of the body, speech, and mind is established in this Dhamma and discipline, just as the wheel that was finished in six months less six days [remained standing].

"Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train yourselves thus: 'We will abandon crookedness, faults, and defects of the body; we will abandon crookedness, faults, and defects of speech; we will abandon crookedness, faults, and defects of the mind.' It is in this way that you should train yourselves."

## 16 (6) The Unmistaken

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, a bhikkhu is practicing the unmistakable way and has laid the groundwork for the destruction of the taints.<sup>14</sup> What three? Here, a bhikkhu guards the doors of the sense faculties, observes moderation in eating, and is intent on wakefulness.<sup>15</sup>

(1) "And how, bhikkhus, does a bhikkhu guard the doors of the sense faculties? Here, having seen a form with the eye, a bhikkhu does not grasp its marks and features. Since, if he left the eye faculty unrestrained, bad unwholesome states of longing and dejection might invade him, he practices restraint over it; he guards the eye faculty, he undertakes the restraint of the eye faculty. Having heard a sound with the ear ... Having smelled an odor with the nose ... Having tasted a taste with the tongue ... Having felt a tactile object with the body ... Having cognized a mental phenomenon with the mind, a bhikkhu does not grasp its marks and features. Since, if he left the mind faculty unrestrained, bad unwholesome states of longing and dejection might invade him, he practices restraint over it; he guards the mind faculty, he undertakes the restraint of the mind faculty. It is in this way that a bhikkhu guards the doors of the sense faculties. [114]

<sup>14</sup> *Apaṇṇakapaṭipadam*. Mp gives a series of synonyms: "the unmistakable way, the definite way, the emancipating way, the causal way, the essential way, the exquisite way, the unopposed way, the conducive way, the way in accord with the Dhamma" (*aviraddhapaṭipadam ekamsapaṭipadam niyyānikapaṭipadam kāraṇapaṭipadam sārappaṭipadam maṇḍapaṭipadam apaccanīkapaṭipadam anulomapaṭipadam dhammānuddhammapaṭipadam*). *Apaṇṇaka*, in a similar sense, is found in AN at 4:71, 4:72, and 10:46. It also occurs as the title of MN 60. Mp explains that *yoni* has three meanings: a section of the aggregates, a cause, and the vagina (*khandhakoṭṭhāsa, kāraṇa, passāvamagga*). Here, the meaning of cause is intended.

<sup>15</sup> At SN 35:239, IV 175, 26–30, too, it is said that by these three practices "one has laid the groundwork for the destruction of the taints" (*yoni c'assa āradhā hoti āsavānaṃ khayāya*).

(2) "And how does a bhikkhu observe moderation in eating? Here, reflecting carefully, a bhikkhu consumes food neither for amusement nor for intoxication nor for the sake of physical beauty and attractiveness, but only for the support and maintenance of this body, for avoiding harm, and for assisting the spiritual life, considering: 'Thus I shall terminate the old feeling and not arouse a new feeling, and I shall be healthy and blameless and dwell at ease.' It is in this way that a bhikkhu observes moderation in eating.

(3) "And how is a bhikkhu intent on wakefulness? Here, during the day, while walking back and forth and sitting, a bhikkhu purifies his mind of obstructive qualities. In the first watch of the night, while walking back and forth and sitting, he purifies his mind of obstructive qualities. In the middle watch of the night he lies down on the right side in the lion's posture, with one foot overlapping the other, mindful and clearly comprehending, after noting in his mind the idea of rising. After rising, in the last watch of the night, while walking back and forth and sitting, he purifies his mind of obstructive qualities. It is in this way that a bhikkhu is intent on wakefulness.

"A bhikkhu who possesses these three qualities is practicing the unmistakable way and has laid the groundwork for the destruction of the taints."

#### 17 (7) Oneself

"Bhikkhus, these three qualities lead to one's own affliction, the affliction of others, and the affliction of both. What three? Bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct. These three qualities lead to one's own affliction, the affliction of others, and the affliction of both.

"These three [other] qualities do not lead to one's own affliction, the affliction of others, and the affliction of both. What three? Bodily good conduct, verbal good conduct, and mental good conduct. These three qualities do not lead to one's own affliction, the affliction of others, and the affliction of both." [115]

#### 18 (8) Deva

"Bhikkhus, if wanderers of other sects were to ask you thus: 'Friends, do you lead the spiritual life under the ascetic Gotama for the sake of rebirth in the deva world?' wouldn't you be repelled, humiliated, and disgusted?"

"Yes, bhante."

"Thus, bhikkhus, since you are repelled, humiliated, and disgusted with a celestial lifespan, celestial beauty, celestial happiness, celestial glory, and celestial authority, how much more then should you be repelled, humiliated, and disgusted with bodily misconduct, verbal misconduct, and mental misconduct."

## 19 (9) Shopkeeper (1)

"Bhikkhus, possessing three factors, a shopkeeper is incapable of acquiring wealth not yet acquired or of increasing wealth already acquired. What three? Here, a shopkeeper does not diligently apply himself to his work in the morning, in the middle of the day, or in the evening. Possessing these three factors, a shopkeeper is incapable of acquiring wealth not yet acquired or of increasing wealth already acquired.

"So too, possessing three factors, a bhikkhu is incapable of achieving a wholesome state not yet attained or of increasing a wholesome state already attained. What three? Here, a bhikkhu does not diligently apply himself to an object of concentration in the morning, in the middle of the day, or in the evening. Possessing these three factors, a bhikkhu is incapable of achieving a wholesome state not yet attained or of increasing a wholesome state already attained. [116]

"Bhikkhus, possessing three factors, a shopkeeper is capable of acquiring wealth not yet acquired and of increasing wealth already acquired. What three? Here, a shopkeeper diligently applies himself to his work in the morning, in the middle of the day, and in the evening. Possessing these three factors, a shopkeeper is capable of acquiring wealth not yet acquired and of increasing wealth already acquired.

"So too, possessing three factors, a bhikkhu is capable of achieving a wholesome state not yet attained and of increasing a wholesome state already attained. What three? Here, a bhikkhu diligently applies himself to an object of concentration in the morning, in the middle of the day, and in the evening. Possessing these three factors, a bhikkhu is capable of achieving a wholesome state not yet attained and of increasing a wholesome state already attained."

## 20 (10) Shopkeeper (2)

"Bhikkhus, possessing three factors, a shopkeeper soon attains vast and abundant wealth. What three? Here, a shopkeeper has keen eyes, is responsible, and has benefactors.

(1) "And how, bhikkhus, does a shopkeeper have keen eyes? Here, a shopkeeper knows of an item: 'If this item is bought at such a price and sold at such a price, it will require this much capital and bring this much profit.' It is in this way that a shopkeeper has keen eyes.

(2) "And how is a shopkeeper responsible? Here, a shopkeeper is skilled in buying and selling goods. It is in this way that a shopkeeper is responsible.

(3) "And how does a shopkeeper have benefactors? [117] Here, rich, wealthy, affluent householders and householders' sons know him thus: 'This good shopkeeper has keen eyes and is responsible; he is able to support his wife and children and pay us back from time to time.' So they deposit wealth with him, saying: 'Having earned wealth with

this, friend shopkeeper, support your wife and children and pay us back from time to time.' It is in this way that a shopkeeper has benefactors.

"Possessing these three factors, a shopkeeper soon attains vast and abundant wealth.

"So too, bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, a bhikkhu soon attains vast and abundant wholesome qualities. What three? Here, a bhikkhu has keen eyes, is responsible, and has benefactors.

(1) "And how, bhikkhus, does a bhikkhu have keen eyes? Here, a bhikkhu understands as it really is: 'This is suffering' ... 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' It is in this way that a bhikkhu has keen eyes.

(2) "And how is a bhikkhu responsible? Here, a bhikkhu has aroused energy for abandoning unwholesome qualities and acquiring wholesome qualities; he is strong, firm in exertion, not casting off the duty of cultivating wholesome qualities. It is in this way that a bhikkhu is responsible.

(3) "And how does a bhikkhu have benefactors? Here, from time to time a bhikkhu approaches those bhikkhus who are learned, heirs to the heritage, experts on the Dhamma, experts on the discipline, experts on the outlines,<sup>16</sup> and inquires: 'How is this, bhante? What is the meaning of this?' Those venerable ones then disclose to him what has not been disclosed, clear up what is obscure, and dispel his perplexity about numerous perplexing points. It is in this way that a bhikkhu has benefactors. [118]

"Possessing these three qualities, a bhikkhu soon attains great and vast achievements in wholesome qualities."

### III. Persons

#### 21 (1) Saviṭṭha

Thus have I heard. On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Sāvattṭhī in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park. Then the Venerable Saviṭṭha and the Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita approached the Venerable Sāriputta and exchanged greetings with him. When they had concluded their greetings and cordial talk, they sat down to one side. The Venerable Sāriputta then said to the Venerable Saviṭṭha:

"Friend Saviṭṭha, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world. What three? The body witness, the one attained to view, and the one liberated by

---

<sup>16</sup> *Mātikādhara*. Mp glosses this as "experts on the two outlines" (*dvemātikādhara*), which Mp-ṭ identifies as the bhikkhu and bhikkhunī *mātikās* (the Pātimokkhas for monks and nuns) or the *mātikās* of the Vinaya and Abhidhamma. The *mātikās* were lists of principles and practices that systematically represent the Dhamma. The *mātikādhara* are mentioned once in DN, twice in MN (in one sutta), not at all in SN, and twelve times in AN, which suggests that the suttas that refer to them are relatively late, or at least had been modified to accommodate them. On their nature and role, see Warder 1980:218–24.



faith.<sup>17</sup> These are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world. Which of these three kinds of persons do you consider the most excellent and sublime?"

"Friend Sāriputta, of those three kinds of persons, I consider the one liberated by faith to be the most excellent and sublime.<sup>18</sup> For what reason? Because this person's faculty of faith is predominant."

Then the Venerable Sāriputta said to the Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita: "Friend Koṭṭhita, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world.... [119] Which of these three kinds of persons do you consider the most excellent and sublime?"

"Friend Sāriputta, of those three kinds of persons, I consider the body witness to be the most excellent and sublime. For what reason? Because this person's faculty of concentration is predominant."

Then the Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita said to the Venerable Sāriputta: "Friend Sāriputta, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world.... Which of these three kinds of persons do you consider the most excellent and sublime?"

"Friend Koṭṭhita, of those three kinds of persons, I consider the one attained to view to be the most excellent and sublime. For what reason? Because this person's faculty of wisdom is predominant."

Then the Venerable Sāriputta said to the Venerable Savitṭha and the Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita: "Friends, we have each explained according to our own ideal. Come, let's approach the Blessed One and report this matter to him. We will retain it in mind as he explains it to us."

"Yes, friend," the Venerable Savitṭha and the Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita replied. Then the Venerable Sāriputta, the Venerable Savitṭha, and the Venerable Mahākoṭṭhita approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, and sat down to one side. [120] The Venerable Sāriputta then reported to him the entire conversation that had taken place.

[The Blessed One said:] "It isn't easy, Sāriputta, to make a definitive declaration about this matter and say: 'Of these three kinds of persons, this one is the most excellent and sublime.'"

---

<sup>17</sup> For formal explanations of these three types, see MN 70.17–19, I 478,4–479,3. All three classes are *sekhas* ranging from the stream-enterer through one on the path to arahantship. As general classes, they differ, not in their position relative to the final goal, but in their dominant spiritual faculty. The body witness (*kāyasakkhī*) gives prominence to concentration and attains the “peaceful formless emancipations.” One attained to view (*diṭṭhippatta*) gives prominence to wisdom and does not attain the formless emancipations. One liberated by faith (*saddhāvimutta*) gives prominence to faith and does not attain the formless emancipations. Because these three categories comprise persons standing anywhere from stream-enterer to the path to arahantship, their members cannot be prejudged as superior and inferior merely by falling into a particular class. To make such judgments, one would have to know their standing in terms of the six levels they each comprise. The body witness, on attaining arahantship, becomes “liberated in both respects” (*ubhatobhāgavimutta*). The other two become “liberated by wisdom” (*paññāvimutta*). On the two types of arahant, see MN 70.15–16, I 477,24–478,3.

<sup>18</sup> In the Pāli, each participant in the discussion repeats the opening statement about the three persons before expressing his own opinion. To avoid redundancy, I have deleted this repetition.

(1) "For it is possible that a person liberated by faith is practicing for arahantship, while a body witness and one attained to view are once-returners or non-returners. It isn't easy, Sāriputta, to make a definitive declaration about this matter and say: 'Of these three kinds of persons, this one is the most excellent and sublime.'

(2) "It is possible that a person who is a body witness is practicing for arahantship, while one liberated by faith and one attained to view are once-returners or non-returners. It isn't easy, Sāriputta, to make a definitive declaration about this matter and say: 'Of these three kinds of persons, this one is the most excellent and sublime.'

(3) "It is possible that a person attained to view is practicing for arahantship,<sup>19</sup> while one liberated by faith and a body witness are once-returners or non-returners. It isn't easy, Sāriputta, to make a definitive declaration about this matter and say: 'Of these three kinds of persons, this one is the most excellent and sublime.'"

## 22 (2) Patients

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of patients found existing in the world. What three? (1) Here, one patient will not recover from his illness whether or not he gets suitable food, suitable medicine, [121] and a competent attendant. (2) Another patient will recover from his illness whether or not he gets suitable food, suitable medicine, and a competent attendant. (3) Still another patient will recover from his illness only if he gets suitable food, not if he fails to get it; only if he gets suitable medicine, not if he fails to get it; and only if he gets a competent attendant, not if he fails to get one.

"Food and medicine and a competent attendant are prescribed particularly for the sake of the patient who will recover from his illness only if he gets suitable food, not if he fails to get it; only if he gets suitable medicine, not if he fails to get it; and only if he gets a competent attendant, not if he fails to get one. But because of this patient, the other patients should also be served. These are the three kinds of patients found existing in the world.

"So too, bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons similar to patients found existing in the world. What three? (1) Here, some person will not enter upon the fixed course [consisting in] rightness in wholesome qualities whether or not he gets to see the Tathāgata and whether or not he gets to hear the Dhamma and discipline proclaimed by the Tathāgata.<sup>20</sup> (2) Then another person will enter upon the fixed course [consisting in]

---

<sup>19</sup> Ce has, for this case only, "a person attained to view is an arahant or one practicing for arahantship" (*svāssa arahā vā arahattāya paṭipanno*). Be and Ee, consistent with the previous two types, state only that this person is practicing the way to arahantship. According to the typology of MN 70, a body witness, one liberated by faith, and one attained to view have not been completely eliminated their *āsava*s and therefore are not arahants.

<sup>20</sup> *Okkamati niyāmaṃ kusalessu dhammesu sammattaṃ*. This is a technical expression denoting entry upon the world-transcending path. Mp: "The fixed course [consisting in] rightness in wholesome qualities: rightness in wholesome qualities consisting in entry upon the path." Though "rightness in wholesome qualities" sounds redundant, what is intended is the harmony and strength of the wholesome qualities

rightness in wholesome qualities whether or not he gets to see the Tathāgata and whether or not he gets to hear the Dhamma and discipline proclaimed by the Tathāgata. (3) And still another person will enter upon the fixed course [consisting in] rightness in wholesome qualities only if he gets to see the Tathāgata, not if he fails to see him; only if he gets to hear the Dhamma and discipline proclaimed by the Tathāgata, not if he fails to hear it. [122]

"The teaching of the Dhamma is prescribed particularly for the sake of the person who will enter upon the fixed course [consisting in] rightness in wholesome qualities only if he gets to see the Tathāgata, not if he fails to see him; only if he gets to hear the Dhamma and discipline proclaimed by the Tathāgata, not if he fails to hear it. But because of this person, the Dhamma should also be taught to the others. These are the three kinds of persons similar to patients found existing in the world."

### 23 (3) Volitional Activities

"Bhikkhus, there are three kinds of persons found existing in the world. What three?

(1) "Here, bhikkhus, some person generates afflictive bodily activities, afflictive verbal activities, and afflictive mental activities.<sup>21</sup> In consequence, he is reborn in an afflictive world. When he is reborn in an afflictive world, afflictive contacts touch him. Being touched by afflictive contacts, he feels afflictive feelings, exclusively painful, as in the case of hell-beings.

(2) "Someone else generates unafflictive bodily activities, unafflictive verbal activities, and unafflictive mental activities. In consequence, he is reborn in an unafflictive world. When he is reborn in an unafflictive world, unafflictive contacts touch him. Being touched by unafflictive contacts, he feels unafflictive feelings, exclusively pleasant, as in the case of the devas of refulgent glory.<sup>22</sup>

(3) "Still another generates bodily activities that are both afflictive and unafflictive, verbal activities that are both afflictive and unafflictive, and mental activities that are both afflictive and unafflictive. In consequence, [123] he is reborn in a world that is both afflictive and unafflictive. When he is reborn in a world that is both afflictive and unafflictive, both afflictive and unafflictive contacts touch him. Being touched by both afflictive and unafflictive contacts, he feels both afflictive and unafflictive feelings,

---

needed to enter the path of stream-entry. For more on this expression in AN, see **5:151–53 and 6:86–88**. See too SN 25.1–10, III 225–28. *Sammattam* is the abstract noun based on *sammā*, which describes each of the path factors in the noble eightfold path.

<sup>21</sup> *Sabyābajjhaṃ kāyaṣaṅkhāraṃ abhiṣaṅkharoti, sabyābajjhaṃ vacīsaṅkhāraṃ abhiṣaṅkharoti, sabyābajjhaṃ manosaṅkhāraṃ abhiṣaṅkharoti*. Mp glosses *sabyābajjhaṃ*, "afflictive," with *sadukkhaṃ*, "with suffering." The "activities" are volitional actions that create kamma.

<sup>22</sup> *Devā subhakiṇhā*. These are the deities in the divine realm corresponding to the third jhāna. See 4:123.

mingled pleasure and pain, as in the case of human beings, some devas, and some beings in the lower worlds.<sup>23</sup>

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world."

#### 24 (4) Helpful

"Bhikkhus, these three persons are helpful to another person. What three?

(1) "The person through whom another has gone for refuge to the Buddha, the Dhamma, and the Saṅgha. This person is helpful to the other person.

(2) "Again, the person through whom another comes to understand as it really is: 'This is suffering,' and 'This is the origin of suffering,' and 'This is the cessation of suffering,' and 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' This person is helpful to the other person.<sup>24</sup>

(3) "Again, the person through whom, with the destruction of the taints, another realizes for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, dwells in it. This person is helpful to the other person.

"These three persons are helpful to another person.

"I say, bhikkhus, that there is no one more helpful to another person than these three persons. I say, too, that it is not easy to repay these three persons by paying homage to them, by rising up for them, by reverential salutation, by proper conduct, and by presenting them with robes, almsfood, lodging, and medicines and provisions for the sick."

#### 25 (5) Diamond

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world. [124] What three? One whose mind is like an open sore, one whose mind is like lightning, and one whose mind is like a diamond.

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is the person whose mind is like an open sore? Here, some person is prone to anger and easily exasperated. Even if he is criticized slightly he loses his temper and becomes irritated, hostile, and stubborn; he displays irritation, hatred, and bitterness. Just as a festering sore, if struck by a stick or a shard, will discharge even more matter, so too some person here is prone to anger ... and displays irritation, hatred, and bitterness. This person is said to have a mind like an open sore.

---

<sup>23</sup> Mp: "Those in the lower world referred to here are the afflicted spirits with palaces (*vemānika-petā*). For at times they experience fortune, at times they experience their [painful] kamma; they undergo mixed pleasure and pain."

<sup>24</sup> By understanding the four noble truths, the attainment of stream-entry is indicated. The destruction of the taints, just below, marks the attainment of arahantship.

(2) "And what is the person whose mind is like lightning? Here, some person understands at it really is: 'This is suffering,' and 'This is the origin of suffering,' and 'This is the cessation of suffering,' and 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' Just as, in the dense darkness of night, a man with good sight can see forms by a flash of lightning, so too some person here understands at it really is: 'This is suffering' ... 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' This person is said to have a mind like lightning.

(3) "And what is the person whose mind is like a diamond? Here, with the destruction of the taints, some person realizes for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, dwells in it. Just as there is nothing that a diamond cannot cut, whether gem or stone, so too, with the destruction of the taints, some person realizes for himself with direct knowledge ... the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and ... dwells in it. This person is said to have a mind like a diamond.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world."

## 26 (6) To Be Associated With

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world. What three? (1) There is a person who is not to be associated with, followed, and served; (2) a person who is to be associated with, followed, and served; and (3) [125] a person who is to be associated with, followed, and served with honor and respect.

(1) "And what kind of person, bhikkhus, is not to be associated with, followed, and served? Here, some person is inferior [to oneself] in virtuous behavior, concentration, and wisdom. Such a person is not to be associated with, followed, and served except out of sympathy and compassion.

(2) "And what kind of person is to be associated with, followed, and served? Here, some person is similar [to oneself] in virtuous behavior, concentration, and wisdom. Such a person is to be associated with, followed, and served. For what reason? [Because one considers:] 'Since we are similar with regard to virtuous behavior, we will have a discussion on virtuous behavior, and it will flow on smoothly between us, and we will feel at ease. Since we are similar with regard to concentration, we will have a discussion on concentration, and it will flow on smoothly between us, and we will feel at ease. Since we are similar with regard to wisdom, we will have a discussion on wisdom, and it will flow on smoothly between us, and we will feel at ease.' Therefore such a person is to be associated with, followed, and served.

(3) "And what kind of person is to be associated with, followed, and served with honor and respect? Here, some person is superior [to oneself] in virtuous behavior, concentration, and wisdom. Such a person is to be associated with, followed, and served with honor and respect. For what reason? [Because one considers:] 'In such a way I will

fulfill the aggregate of virtuous behavior that I have not yet fulfilled or assist with wisdom in various respects the aggregate of virtuous behavior that I have fulfilled. I will fulfill the aggregate of concentration that I have not yet fulfilled or assist with wisdom in various respects the aggregate of concentration that I have fulfilled. I will fulfill the aggregate of wisdom that I have not yet fulfilled or assist with wisdom in various respects the aggregate of wisdom that I have fulfilled.<sup>25</sup> Therefore such a person is to be associated with, followed, and served with honor and respect.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world."

[126]

One who associates with an inferior person declines;  
one who associates with an equal does not decline;  
attending on a superior person one develops quickly;  
therefore you should follow one superior to yourself.

## 27 (7) Disgust

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world. What three? (1) There is a person who is to be looked upon with disgust, not to be associated with, followed, and served; (2) a person who is to be looked upon with equanimity, not to be associated with, followed, and served; and (3) a person who is to be associated with, followed, and served.

(1) "And what kind of person, bhikkhus, is to be looked upon with disgust, not to be associated with, followed, and served? Here, some person is immoral, of bad character, impure, of suspect behavior, secretive in his actions, not an ascetic though claiming to be one, not a celibate though claiming to be one, inwardly rotten, corrupt, depraved. Such a person is to be looked upon with disgust, not to be associated with, followed, and served. For what reason? Even though one does not follow the example of such a person, a bad report still circulates about oneself: 'He has bad friends, bad companions, bad comrades.' Just as a snake that has passed through feces, though it does not bite one, would smear one, so too, though one does not follow the example of such a person, a bad report still circulates about oneself: 'He has bad friends, bad companions, bad comrades.' Therefore such a person is to be looked upon with disgust, not to be associated with, followed, and served.

---

<sup>25</sup> *Tattha tattha paññāya anuggahessāmi.* Mp: "One assists with wisdom the aggregate of virtuous behavior in one or another respect by avoiding those things that are uncongenial and unhelpful to virtuous behavior and by cultivating those things that are congenial and helpful [to it]. The same method holds for the aggregates of concentration and wisdom." "Aggregate of virtuous behavior" (*sīlakkhandha*) is spoken of in the sense of the assemblage of factors that constitute virtuous behavior, and so too for the aggregates of concentration and wisdom.

(2) "And what kind of person is to be looked upon with equanimity, not to be associated with, followed, and served? Here, some person is prone to anger[127] and easily exasperated. Even if he is criticized slightly he loses his temper and becomes irritated, hostile, and stubborn; he displays irritation, hatred, and bitterness. Just as a festering sore, if struck by a stick or a shard, will discharge even more matter, so too ... Just as a firebrand of the *tinduka* tree, if struck by a stick or shard, will sizzle and crackle even more, so too ... Just as a pit of feces, if struck by a stick or a shard, becomes even more foul-smelling, so too some person here is prone to anger and ... displays irritation, hatred, and bitterness. Such a person is to be looked upon with equanimity, not to be associated with, followed, and served. For what reason? [With the thought:] 'He might insult me, revile me, and do me harm.' Therefore such a person is to be looked upon with equanimity, not to be associated with, followed, and served.

(3) "And what kind of person is to be associated with, followed, and served? Here, some person is virtuous and of good character. Such a person is to be associated with, followed, and served. For what reason? Even though one does not follow the example of such a person, a good report still circulates about oneself: 'He has good friends, good companions, good comrades.' Therefore such a person is to be associated with, followed, and served.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world."

[A verse is attached identical with that in 3:26.]

## 28 (8) Speech Like Dung

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world. [128] What three? The one whose speech is like dung, the one whose speech is like flowers, and the one whose speech is like honey.

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is the person whose speech is like dung? Here, if he is summoned to a council, to an assembly, to his relatives' presence, to his guild, or to the court, and questioned as a witness thus: 'So, good man, tell what you know,' then, not knowing, this person says, 'I know,' or knowing, he says, 'I do not know'; not seeing, he says, 'I see,' or seeing, he says, 'I do not see.' Thus he consciously speaks falsehood for his own ends, or for another's ends, or for some trifling worldly end.<sup>26</sup> This is called the person whose speech is like dung.

(2) "And what is the person whose speech is like flowers? Here, if he is summoned to a council, to an assembly, to his relatives' presence, to his guild, or to the court, and questioned as a witness thus: 'So, good man, tell what you know,' then, not knowing, this person says, 'I do not know,' or knowing, he says, 'I know'; not seeing, he says, 'I do not

<sup>26</sup> This is the standard definition of false speech among the ten courses of unwholesome kamma, as at 10:176 §4 of the unwholesome section. The explanation of "speech like flowers," just below, is the standard definition of truthful speech in the corresponding wholesome section.

see,' or seeing, he says, 'I see'; he does not consciously speak falsehood for his own ends, or for another's ends, or for some trifling worldly end. This is called the person whose speech is like flowers.

(3) "And what is the person whose speech is like honey? Here, some person, having abandoned harsh speech, abstains from harsh speech. He speaks such words as are gentle, pleasing to the ear, and lovable, as go to the heart, are courteous, desired by many, and agreeable to many. This is the person whose speech is like honey.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world."

## 29 (9) Blind

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world. What three? The blind person, the one-eyed person, and the two-eyed person.

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is the blind person? Here, some person lacks the kind of eye [129] with which one can acquire wealth not yet acquired and increase wealth already acquired, and he also lacks the kind of eye with which one can know wholesome and unwholesome qualities, blameworthy and blameless qualities, inferior and superior qualities, dark and bright qualities with their counterparts. This is called the blind person.

(2) "And what is the one-eyed person? Here, some person has the kind of eye with which one can acquire wealth not yet acquired and increase wealth already acquired, but he lacks the kind of eye with which one can know wholesome and unwholesome qualities, blameworthy and blameless qualities, inferior and superior qualities, dark and bright qualities with their counterparts. This is called the one-eyed person.

(3) "And what is the two-eyed person? Here, some person has the kind of eye with which one can acquire wealth not yet acquired and increase wealth already acquired, and he also has the kind of eye with which one can know wholesome and unwholesome qualities, blameworthy and blameless qualities, inferior and superior qualities, dark and bright qualities with their counterparts. This is called the two-eyed person.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world."

He does not possess such wealth,  
nor does he do deeds of merit;  
the blind man destitute of eyes  
casts an unlucky throw in both respects.

The person described as one-eyed  
is a hypocrite who seeks wealth,  
[sometimes] righteously  
[and sometimes] unrighteously.



Both by thievish cheatful acts  
and by means of false speech  
the man indulging in sensual pleasures  
is skilled in amassing wealth.  
Having gone from here to hell,  
the one-eyed person is tormented.

One with two eyes is said to be  
the best kind of person.  
His wealth<sup>27</sup> is acquired by his own exertion,  
with goods righteously gained. [130]

With best intentions he then gives,  
this person with an undivided mind.  
He goes to [rebirth in] an excellent state  
where, having gone, one does not sorrow.

One should avoid from afar  
the blind one and the one-eyed person,  
but should befriend the one with two eyes,  
the best kind of person.

### 30 (10) Inverted

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world.  
What three? The person with inverted wisdom, the person with lap-like wisdom, and the  
person with wide wisdom.

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is the person with inverted wisdom? Here, some person  
often goes to the monastery to listen to the Dhamma from the bhikkhus. The bhikkhus  
teach him the Dhamma that is good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the  
end, with the right meaning and phrasing; they reveal the perfectly complete and pure  
spiritual life. While he is sitting in his seat, he does not attend to that talk at the beginning,  
in the middle, or at the end. After he has risen from his seat, he still does not attend to  
that talk at the beginning, in the middle, or at the end. Just as, when a pot is turned upside  
down, the water that had been poured into it runs off and does not remain there, so too,  
some person often goes to the monastery to listen to the Dhamma from the bhikkhus....  
After he has risen from his seat, he still does not attend to that talk at the beginning, in the  
middle, or at the end. This is called the person with inverted wisdom.

---

<sup>27</sup> Reading here *dhanam* with Ce and B. Ee *dhammam* is clearly wrong.

(2) "And what is the person with lap-like wisdom? Here, some person often goes to the monastery to listen to the Dhamma from the bhikkhus. The bhikkhus teach him the Dhamma that is good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, with the right meaning and phrasing; they reveal the perfectly complete and pure spiritual life. While he is sitting in his seat, he attends to that talk at the beginning, in the middle, and at the end. But after he has risen from his seat, he does not attend to that talk at the beginning, in the middle, or at the end. Just as, when a person has various food stuffs strewn over his lap—sesamum seeds, rice grains, cakes, and jujubes—if he loses his mindfulness when rising from that seat, [131] he would scatter them all over, so too, some person often goes to the monastery to listen to the Dhamma from the bhikkhus.... But after he has risen from his seat, he does not attend to that talk at the beginning, in the middle, or at the end. This is called the person with lap-like wisdom.

(3) "And what is the person with wide wisdom? Here, some person often goes to the monastery to listen to the Dhamma from the bhikkhus. The bhikkhus teach him the Dhamma that is good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, with the right meaning and phrasing; they reveal the perfectly complete and pure spiritual life. While he is sitting in his seat, he attends to that talk at the beginning, in the middle, and at the end. After he has risen from his seat, again he attends to that talk at the beginning, in the middle, and at the end. Just as, when a pot is kept upright, the water that had been poured into it stays there and does not run off, so too, some person often goes to the monastery to listen to the Dhamma from the bhikkhus.... After he has risen from his seat, again he attends to that talk at the beginning, in the middle, and at the end. This is called the person with wide wisdom.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world."

The person with inverted wisdom,  
stupid and undiscerning,  
often goes to visit bhikkhus  
[to hear them teach the Dhamma].

Yet this person cannot grasp  
anything from the talk,  
at its beginning, middle, and end,  
for he utterly lacks wisdom.

The person with lap-like wisdom  
is said to be better than the former.  
He too often goes to visit bhikkhus  
[to hear them teach the Dhamma].

While sitting in his seat,  
he grasps the phrasing of the talk,  
at its beginning, middle, and end.  
But after rising, he no longer understands,  
but forgets what he had learned.

The person with wide wisdom  
is said to be the best of these.  
He too often goes to visit bhikkhus  
[to hear them teach the Dhamma].

While sitting in his seat,  
he comprehends the phrasing,  
at the beginning, middle, and end  
of the talk [given by the bhikkhu].

This person of the best intentions,  
his mind undivided, retains [what he hears].  
Practicing in accordance with the Dhamma,  
he can make an end of suffering. [132]

#### IV. Divine Messengers

##### 31 (1) Brahmā

(1) "Bhikkhus, those families dwell with Brahmā where at home the mother and father are revered by their children. (2) Those families dwell with the first teachers where at home the mother and father are revered by their children. (3) Those families dwell with the gift-worthy where at home the mother and father are revered by their children.

"'Brahmā,' bhikkhus, is a designation for mother and father. 'First teachers' is a designation for mother and father. 'Gift-worthy' is a designation for mother and father. For what reason? Mother and father are helpful to their children: they raise them, nurture them, and show them the world."

Mother and father are called "Brahmā,"  
and also "first teachers."  
They are worthy of gifts from their children,  
for they have compassion for their offspring.

Therefore a wise person should revere them,

and show them due honor,  
serve them with food and drink,  
with clothes and bedding,  
by massaging and bathing them,  
and by washing their feet.

Because of this service  
to mother and father,  
the wise praise one in this world  
and after death one rejoices in heaven.

### 32 (2) Ānanda

Then the Venerable Ānanda approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said to him:

"Bhante, could a bhikkhu obtain such a state of concentration that (1) he would have no I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit in regard to this conscious body; (2) he would have no I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit in regard to all external objects; and (3) he would enter and dwell in that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, through which there is no more I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit for one who enters and dwells in it?"<sup>28</sup>

"He could, Ānanda."

"But how, bhante, could he obtain such a state of concentration?" [133]

"Here, Ānanda, a bhikkhu thinks thus: 'This is peaceful, this is sublime, that is, the stilling of all activities, the relinquishing of all acquisitions, the destruction of craving, dispassion, cessation, nibbāna.' In this way, Ānanda, a bhikkhu could obtain such a state of concentration that he would have no I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit in regard to this conscious body; he would have no I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit in regard to all external objects; and he would enter and dwell in that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, through which there is no more I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit for one who enters and dwells in it. And it was with reference to this that I said in the Pārāyana, in 'The Questions of Puṇṇaka'.<sup>29</sup>

---

<sup>28</sup> Mp explains the compound *ahaṅkāramamaṅkāramānānusayā* as "I-making by views, mine-making by craving, and the underlying tendency to conceit. These are the defilements in relation to oneself and others." Mp explains "external objects" (*bahiddhā ca sabbanimittesu*) as the five sense objects, the eternalist (and other) views, the person, and Dhamma.

<sup>29</sup> Sn 1048. The Pārāyana, the fifth and final chapter of the Suttanipāta, consists of a framing story and sixteen sections in each of which the Buddha answers the questions of the students of the elder brahmin Bāvēri. Verses from the Pārāyana are cited and explained elsewhere in AN and other Nikāyas, which testifies to its antiquity. It must have existed as an independent work before being incorporated into Sn. The

"Having comprehended the highs and lows in the world,  
he is not perturbed by anything in the world.  
Peaceful, fumeless, untroubled, wishless,  
he has, I say, crossed over birth and old age."

### 33 (3) Sāriputta<sup>30</sup>

Then the Venerable Sāriputta approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, and sat down to one side. The Blessed One then said to him:

"Sāriputta, I can teach the Dhamma briefly; I can teach the Dhamma in detail; I can teach the Dhamma both briefly and in detail. It is those who can understand that are rare."

"It is the time for this, Blessed One. It is the time for this, Fortunate One. The Blessed One should teach the Dhamma briefly; he should teach the Dhamma in detail; he should teach the Dhamma both briefly and in detail. There will be those who can understand the Dhamma."

"Therefore, Sāriputta, you should train yourselves thus: (1) 'There will be no I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit in regard to this conscious body; (2) there will be no I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit in regard to all external objects; and (3) we will enter and dwell in that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, through which there is no more I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit for one who enters and dwells in it.' It is in this way, Sāriputta, that you should train yourselves.

"When, Sāriputta, a bhikkhu [134] has no I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit in regard to this conscious body; when he has no I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit in regard to all external objects; and when he enters and dwells in that liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom, through which there is no more I-making, mine-making, and underlying tendency to conceit for one who enters and dwells in it, he is called a bhikkhu who has cut off craving, stripped off the fetter, and by completely breaking through conceit, has made an end of suffering. And it was with reference to this that I said in the Pārāyana, in 'The Questions of Udaya':<sup>31</sup>

"The abandoning of both  
sensual perceptions and dejection;  
the dispelling of dullness,

---

Pārāyana is the subject of an ancient canonical commentary, the Cūḷaniddesa, included in the Khuddaka Nikāya.

<sup>30</sup> Ee takes this sutta to belong to the preceding one and thus assigns only one number to them. In Ce and Be, which I follow, it is separate. Thus from this point on my numbering exceeds Ee by one.

<sup>31</sup> Sn 1106–7.

the warding off of remorse;<sup>32</sup>

with equanimity and mindfulness purified,  
preceded by reflection on the Dhamma:  
this, I say, is emancipation by final knowledge,  
the breaking up of ignorance."<sup>33</sup>

#### 34 (4) Causes

"Bhikkhus, there are these three causes for the origination of kamma. What three? Greed is a cause for the origination of kamma; hatred is a cause for the origination of kamma; delusion is a cause for the origination of kamma.

(1) "Any kamma, bhikkhus, fashioned through greed, born of greed, caused by greed, originated by greed, ripens wherever the individual is reborn. Wherever that kamma ripens, it is there that one experiences its result, either in this very life, or in the [next] rebirth, or on some subsequent occasion."<sup>34</sup>

(2) "Any kamma fashioned through hatred, born of hatred, caused by hatred, originated by hatred, ripens wherever the individual is reborn. Wherever that kamma ripens, it is there that one experiences its result, either in this very life, or in the [next] rebirth, or on some subsequent occasion.

(3) "Any kammafashioned through delusion, born of delusion, caused by delusion, originated by delusion, ripens wherever the individual is reborn. Wherever that kamma ripens, [135] it is there that one experiences its result, either in this very life, or in the [next] rebirth, or on some subsequent occasion.

"Suppose, bhikkhus, seeds that are intact, unspoiled, not damaged by wind and the sun's heat, fecund, well preserved, were deposited in well-prepared ground in a good field and receive proper rainfall: in this way, those seeds would grow, increase, and

---

<sup>32</sup> This is an allusion to the abandoning of the five hindrances, of which four are mentioned here.

<sup>33</sup> Mp takes this to be the fruit of arahantship based on the fourth jhāna, which is suggested by the line *upekkhāsatisamuddham*, echoing the stock formula for the fourth jhāna.

<sup>34</sup> There are some differences in the readings: *Ce diṭṭhe vā dhamme, upapajje vā, apare vā pariyāye; Be diṭṭhe vā dhamme upapajja vā apare vā pariyāye; Ee diṭṭh' eva dhamme upapajje vā apare vā pariyāye*. Mp says: "This is stated to show that the kamma is [of the type] either to be experienced in this present life, or to be experienced following rebirth, or to be experienced in some subsequent existence." For an explanation of this triad according to the Abhidhamma, see [CMA 205](#). Some scholars have argued from the variant readings that only two alternatives are involved: either in this life or upon rebirth. However, I translate in accordance with the commentarial understanding. While the commentaries may be imposing a later interpretation on more archaic texts that asserted only two ways in which kamma can ripen, as a translator I feel responsible to the text that has been transmitted rather than to theories about a more archaic original. The recognition of a threefold ripening of kamma is not exclusive to the Theravāda school but is also found in the treatises of the Sarvāstivāda Abhidharma system. Definitions of the three types—for example, in the Abhidharma Mahāvibhāṣā Śāstra at T XXVII 592a22–593b8, and in the Abhidharmakośa at T XXIX 81c10–16—are exactly the same as in the Pāli tradition and thus likely precede the division of the schools.

mature. So too, any kamma that is fashioned through greed ... hatred ... delusion, born of delusion, caused by delusion, originated by delusion, ripens wherever the individual is reborn. Wherever that kamma ripens, it is there that one experiences its result, either in this very life, or in the [next] rebirth, or on some subsequent occasion.

"These are the three causes for the origination of kamma."

"Bhikkhus, there are these three [other] causes for the origination of kamma.

What three? Non-greed is a cause for the origination of kamma; non-hatred is a cause for the origination of kamma; non-delusion is a cause for the origination of kamma.

(1) "Any kamma, bhikkhus, fashioned through non-greed, born of non-greed, caused by non-greed, originated by non-greed, is abandoned when greed has vanished; it is cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, obliterated so that it is no more subject to future arising."<sup>35</sup>

(2) "Any kamma fashioned through non-hatred, born of non-hatred, caused by non-hatred, originated by non-hatred, is abandoned when hatred has vanished; it is cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, obliterated so that it is no more subject to future arising.

(3) "Any kamma fashioned through non-delusion, born of non-delusion, caused by non-delusion, originated by non-delusion, is abandoned when delusion has vanished; it is cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, obliterated so that it is no more subject to future arising.

"Suppose, bhikkhus, there are seeds that are intact, unspoiled, [136] not damaged by wind and the sun's heat, fecund, well preserved. Then a man would burn them in a fire, reduce them to ashes, and winnow the ashes in a strong wind or let them be carried away by the swift current of a river. In this way, those seeds would be cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, obliterated so that they are no more subject to future arising. So too, any kamma that is fashioned through non-greed ... non-hatred ... non-delusion, born of non-delusion, caused by non-delusion, originated by non-delusion, is abandoned when delusion has vanished; it is cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, obliterated so that it is no more subject to future arising."

"These, bhikkhus, are the three causes for the origination of kamma."

Whatever kamma a wise person [had done]

---

<sup>35</sup> This statement has to be carefully interpreted. For an arahant—who has abandoned greed, hatred, and delusion—kamma created earlier, whether good or bad, is still capable of ripening during the final life. But because there is no more rebirth, with his passing all accumulated kamma from the past becomes defunct. Thus the intention of this statement is not that an arahant's past kamma cannot ripen while the arahant lives, but that it becomes defunct with the arahant's passing; for there will be no further continuum of existence within which its fruits might arise.

Brahmāli writes: "There must be a distinction here between 'non-greed' (*alobha*) and the situation when 'greed has vanished' (*lobhe vigata*). The former must refer to the motivation behind a particular action, the latter to the full uprooting of greed, attained only by the non-returner or even the arahant. Only in the light of this distinction does this statement make sense."

born of greed, hatred, and delusion,  
whether what was fashioned by him be little or much,  
it is to be experienced right here:  
there exists no other site [for it].<sup>36</sup>

Therefore a wise person should abandon  
[any deed] born of greed, hatred, and delusion.  
A bhikkhu, giving rise to knowledge,  
should abandon all bad destinations.<sup>37</sup>

### 35 (5) Hatthaka

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Ālavī on a heap of leaves spread out on a cow track in a siṃsapā grove. Then Hatthaka of Ālavī,<sup>38</sup> while walking and wandering for exercise, saw the Blessed One sitting there. He then approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said to the Blessed One:

"Bhante, did the Blessed One sleep well?"

"Yes, prince, I slept well. I am one of those in the world who sleep well."

"But, bhante, the winter nights are cold. It is the eight-day interval, the time when snow falls.<sup>39</sup> The ground trampled by the hooves of cattle is rough, the spread of leaves is thin, [137] the leaves on the tree are sparse, the ochre robes leave one cold, and the gale wind blows cold. Yet the Blessed One says thus: 'Yes, prince, I slept well. I am one of those in the world who sleep well.'"

<sup>36</sup> Mp resolves *mohajaṇ cāpaviddasu* (so Be, Ce; Ee *mohajaṇ cāpi 'viddasu*) into *mohajaṇcāpi aviddasu* and paraphrases: "Whatever kamma the ignorant (*avidū*) blind worldling creates that is born of greed, hatred, and delusion—whether the kamma so fashioned be little or much—it is *to be experienced right here* (*idh'eva taṃ vedaniyaṃ*), that is, that kamma is to be experienced by the fool here in his very own individual being (*idha sake attabhāveveva*); this means that it ripens in his own individual being. *There exists no other site [for it]* (*vatthum aññaṃ na vijjati*): there is no other site for the ripening of that kamma; for the kamma done by one person does not ripen in another's individual being." I have translated, however, against Mp, following Vanarata's suggestion that *viddasu* in pāda b should be taken just as it stands, as "one who knows," without assuming an elided negative *a-*. This enables us to take *idh'eva* in its usual sense, as "in this very life," rather than in terms of the implausible gloss proposed by Mp. On *idh'eva* in this sense, we find the expression *idh'eva sabbavedayitāni anabhinanditāni sītībhavissanti* at MN III 245,4–5, SN II 83,5, SN IV 213,14–15, AN II 198,33–34, and elsewhere. The point is that the arahant experiences the fruits of his residual negative kamma *in this very life*, but not afterwards because, with the ceasing of individual being, there is no "site" for it to ripen.

<sup>37</sup> *Tasmā lobhaṃ ca dosaṃ ca, mohajaṇ cāpi viddasu*. Ee reads the last pāda *mohaṇ cāpi 'viddasu*, which is missing a syllable. The text does lack a verb and direct object qualified by *mohajaṇ*. Mp supplies these in its paraphrase: "Therefore a wise person *does not do that kamma* born of greed and so forth" (*yo vidū ... taṃ lobhajādibhedaṃ kammaṃ na karoti*). It will be noted that Mp considers *lobhaṃ* and *dosaṃ* to be truncated forms of *lobhajaṇ* and *dosajaṇ*, and I translate accordingly. For the verb, I see *jahe* of pāda d to implicitly extend up into pādas a and b, thus doing a dual service.

<sup>38</sup> See **1:251**.

<sup>39</sup> *Antaraṭṭhako himapātanasaṃayo*. Mp: "A period of eight days when snow falls. It is the last four days of the month of Māgha and the first four days of Phagguṇa (roughly in mid-February)."



"Well then, prince, I will question you about this matter. You should answer as you see fit. What do you think, prince? A householder or a householder's son might have a house with a peaked roof, plastered inside and out, draft-free, with bolts fastened and shutters closed. There he might have a couch spread with rugs, blankets, and covers, with an excellent covering of antelope hide, with a canopy above and red bolsters at both ends. An oil lamp would be burning and his four wives would serve him in extremely agreeable ways. What do you think, would he sleep well or not, or what do you think about this?"

"He would sleep well, bhante. He would be one of those in the world who sleep well."

(1) "What do you think, prince? Might there arise in that householder or householder's son bodily and mental fevers born of lust, which would torment him so that he would sleep badly?"

"Yes, bhante."

"There might arise in that householder or householder's son bodily and mental fevers born of lust, which would torment him so that he would sleep badly; but the Tathāgata has abandoned such lust, cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, obliterated it so that it is no more subject to future arising. Therefore I have slept well."

(2) "What do you think, prince? Might there arise in that householder or householder's son bodily and mental fevers born of hatred ... (3) ... bodily and mental fevers born of delusion, which would torment him so that he would sleep badly?"

"Yes, bhante."

"There might arise in that householder or householder's son bodily and mental fevers born of delusion, which would torment him so that he would sleep badly; but the Tathāgata has abandoned such delusion, cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, [138] obliterated it so that it is no more subject to future arising. Therefore I have slept well."

He always sleeps well,  
the brahmin who has attained nibbāna,  
cooled off, without acquisitions,  
not tainted by sensual pleasures.

Having cut off all attachments,  
having removed anguish in the heart,  
the peaceful one sleeps well,  
having attained peace of mind.<sup>40</sup>

36 (6) Messengers<sup>41</sup>

<sup>40</sup> Similar verses are spoken to Anāthapiṇḍika at SN 10:8, I 212.

<sup>41</sup> A version of this sutta is at MN 130, but with *four* divine messengers, beginning with birth.

"Bhikkhus, there are these three divine messengers.<sup>42</sup> What three?

"Here, bhikkhus, someone engages in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. In consequence, with the breakup of the body, after death, he is reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell. There the wardens of hell grab him by both arms and show him to King Yama,<sup>43</sup> [saying]: 'This person, your majesty, did not behave properly towards his mother and father; he did not behave properly towards ascetics and brahmins; and he did not honor the elders of the family. May your majesty inflict due punishment on him!'

(1) "Then King Yama questions, interrogates, and cross-examines him about the first divine messenger: 'Good man, didn't you see the first divine messenger that appeared among human beings?' And he replies: 'No, lord, I didn't see him.'

"Then King Yama says to him: 'But, good man, didn't you ever see among human beings a man or a woman, eighty, ninety or a hundred years of age, frail, bent like a roof bracket, crooked, wobbling as they go along leaning on a stick, ailing, youth gone, with broken teeth, with grey and scanty hair or bald, with wrinkled skin and blotched limbs?' And the man replies: 'Yes, lord, I have seen this.'

"Then King Yama says to him: 'Good man, didn't it occur to you, an intelligent and mature person: "I too am subject to old age, I am not exempt from old age. Let me now do good by body, speech, and mind"?' [139] – 'No, lord, I could not. I was heedless.'

"Then King Yama says: 'Through heedlessness, good man, you failed to do good by body, speech, or mind. Surely, they will treat you in a way that fits your heedlessness. That bad kamma of yours was not done by your mother or father, nor by your brother or sister, nor by your friends and companions, nor by your relatives and family members, nor by the deities, nor by ascetics and brahmins. Rather, you were the one who did that bad kamma, and you yourself will have to experience its result.'

(2) "When King Yama has questioned, interrogated, and cross-examined him about the first divine messenger, he again questions, interrogates, and cross-examines him about the second divine messenger: 'Good man, didn't you see the second divine messenger that appeared among human beings?' And he replies: 'No, lord, I didn't see him.'

"Then King Yama says to him: 'But, good man, didn't you ever see among human beings a man or a woman, sick, afflicted, gravely ill, lying in his own urine and excrement, having to be lifted up by some and put down by others?' And he replies: 'Yes, lord, I have seen this.'

---

<sup>42</sup> Mp: "The old person, the sick one, and the corpse are called 'divine messengers' (*devadūta*) because they inspire a sense of urgency, as if warning one: 'Now you must go into the presence of death.'"

<sup>43</sup> The legendary god of death and the judge of one's future destiny.

"Then King Yama says to him: 'Good man, didn't it occur to you, an intelligent and mature person: "I too am subject to illness, I am not exempt from illness. Let me now do good by body, speech, and mind"?' – 'No, lord, I could not. I was heedless.'

"Then King Yama says: [140] 'Through heedlessness, good man, you failed to do good by body, speech, or mind. Surely, they will treat you in a way that fits your heedlessness. That bad kamma of yours was not done by your mother or father, nor by your brother or sister, nor by your friends and companions, nor by your relatives and family members, nor by the deities, nor by ascetics and brahmins. Rather, you were the one who did that bad kamma, and you yourself will have to experience its result.'

(3) "When King Yama has questioned, interrogated, and cross-examined him about the second divine messenger, he again questions, interrogates, and cross-examines him about the third divine messenger: 'Good man, didn't you see the third divine messenger that appeared among human beings?' And he replies: 'No, lord, I didn't see him.'

"Then King Yama says to him: 'But, good man, didn't you ever see among human beings a man or a woman, one, two, or three days dead, the corpse bloated, livid, and festering?' And he replies: 'Yes, lord, I have seen this.'

"Then King Yama says to him: 'Good man, didn't it occur to you, an intelligent and mature person: "I too am subject to death, I am not exempt from death. Let me now do good by body, speech, and mind"?' – 'No, lord, I could not. I was heedless.'

"Then King Yama says: 'Through heedlessness, good man, you failed to do good by body, speech, or mind. Surely, they will treat you in a way that fits your heedlessness. That bad kamma of yours was not done by your mother or father, nor by your brother or sister, nor by your friends and companions, nor by your relatives and family members, nor by the deities, nor by ascetics and brahmins. Rather, you were the one who did that bad kamma, and you yourself will have to experience its result.'

"When, bhikkhus, King Yama has questioned, interrogated, and cross-examined him about the third divine messenger, he falls silent. [141] Then the wardens of hell torture him with the fivefold transfixing. They drive a red-hot iron stake through one hand, and another red-hot iron stake through the other hand; they drive a red-hot iron stake through one foot, and another red-hot iron stake through the other foot; they drive a red-hot iron stake through the middle of his chest. There he feels painful, racking, piercing feelings,<sup>44</sup> yet he does not die so long as that bad kamma is not exhausted.

"Next the wardens of hell throw him down and pare him with axes. There he feels painful, racking, piercing feelings, yet he does not die so long as that bad kamma is not exhausted. Next the wardens of hell turn him upside down and pare him with adzes ... Next the wardens of hell harness him to a chariot and drive him back and forth across ground that is burning, blazing, and glowing ... Next the wardens of hell make him climb up and down a great mound of coals that are burning, blazing, and glowing ... Next the wardens of hell turn him upside down and plunge him into a red-hot copper cauldron that

---

<sup>44</sup> Reading with *Ce dukkhā tibbā khaṇṇā vedanā*. Be and Ee add a fourth adjective, *kharā*.

is burning, blazing, and glowing. He is cooked there in a swirl of foam. And as he is being cooked there in a swirl of foam, he is swept now up, now down, and now across. There he feels painful, racking, piercing feelings, yet he does not die so long as that bad kamma is not exhausted.

"Next the wardens of hell throw him into the great hell. Now, bhikkhus, as to that great hell:

"It has four corners and four doors  
and is divided into separate compartments;  
it is surrounded by iron ramparts  
and shut in with an iron roof. [142]

"Its floor as well is made of iron  
and heated till it glows with fire.  
The range is a full hundred *yojanas*  
which it ever covers pervasively.

"Once, bhikkhus, in the past King Yama thought: 'Those in the world who do evil deeds are punished with such diverse tortures. Oh, that I might attain the human state! That a Tathāgata, Arahant, Perfectly Enlightened One might arise in the world! That I might attend upon that Blessed One! That the Blessed One might teach me the Dhamma, and that I might come to understand his Dhamma!'

"Bhikkhus, I am not repeating something that I heard from another ascetic or brahmin, but rather I am speaking about a matter that I have actually known, seen, and understood myself."

Though warned by the divine messengers,  
those people who remain heedless  
sorrow for a long time,  
having fared on to a lower realm.

But those good people here who,  
when warned by the divine messengers,  
never become heedless  
in regard to the noble Dhamma;  
who, having seen the peril in clinging  
as the origin of birth and death,  
are liberated by non-clinging  
in the extinction of birth and death:

those happy ones have attained security;<sup>45</sup>  
they have reached nibbāna in this very life.  
Having overcome all enmity and peril,  
they have transcended all suffering.

### 37 (7) Kings (1)

"Bhikkhus, (1) on the eighth of the fortnight, the ministers and assembly members of the four great kings wander over this world,<sup>46</sup> [thinking]: 'We hope there are many people who behave properly towards their mother and father, behave properly towards ascetics and brahmins, honor the elders of the family, observe the *uposatha*, keep the extra observance days, and do meritorious deeds.'<sup>47</sup> (2) On the fourteenth of the fortnight, the sons of the four great kings wander over this world, [thinking]: 'We hope there are many people who behave properly towards their mother and father ... [143] ... and do meritorious deeds.' (3) On the fifteenth, the *uposatha* day, the four great kings themselves wander over this world, [thinking]: 'We hope there are many people who behave properly towards their mother and father ... and do meritorious deeds.'

"If, bhikkhus, there are few people who behave properly towards their mother and father ... and do meritorious deeds, the four great kings report this to the Tāvātimsa devas when they meet and are sitting together in the Sudhamma council hall: 'Revered sirs, there are few people who behave properly towards their mother and father ... and do meritorious deeds.' Then, because of this, the Tāvātimsa devas become displeased, [saying]: 'Alas, the celestial company will decline and the company of asuras will flourish!'

---

<sup>45</sup> I read Ee here *te khemappattā sukhītā*. Ce *te khoppattā sukhītā* and Be *te appamattā sukhino* are both faulty.

<sup>46</sup> The eighth of the fortnight is the day of the quarter moon, both waxing and waning. The "four great kings" (*catumahārājāno*) are the rulers of the lowest of the six sense-sphere heavenly worlds, the realm closest to the human. We find here a graded sequence: on the eighths, their ministers and assembly members (*amaccā pārissajjā*) inspect the world; on the fourteenth (the day before the full moon and new moon), their sons (*puttā*) inspect the world; and on the fifteenth, the actual full-moon and new-moon days, the four great kings themselves inspect the world. On the four great kings themselves, see [Introduction, pp. ??](#).

<sup>47</sup> Mp: "When they *observe the uposatha*, they undertake the *uposatha* factors eight times per month. Keeping the extra observance days (*paṭijāgarantī*), in a single fortnight they do so by anticipating and following up (*paccuggamanānugamana*) the four *uposatha* days. Anticipating the *uposatha* of the fifth, they undertake the *uposatha* on the fourth; and following up, on the sixth. Anticipating the *uposatha* of the eighth, they observe it on the seventh; and following up, on the ninth. Anticipating the *uposatha* of the fourteenth, they observe it on the thirteenth, and following up the *uposatha* of the fifteenth, they observe the *uposatha* at the beginning [of the next fortnight]. They *do meritorious deeds* (*puññāni karonti*) in various ways: by going for refuge, constantly observing the precepts, offering flowers, listening to the Dhamma, offering lights, making dwellings, etc. Having wandered around, [the ministers and assembly members] write down the names of the merit-makers on a golden sheet and present it to the four great kings." For canonical accounts of the *uposatha* observance, see **3:70** below and **8:41, 8:42**.

"But if there are many people who behave properly towards their mother and father ... and do meritorious deeds, the four great kings report this to the Tāvatiṃsa devas when they meet and are sitting together in the Sudhamma council hall: 'Revered sirs, there are many people who behave properly towards their mother and father, behave properly towards ascetics and brahmins, honor the elders of the family, observe the *uposatha*, keep the extra observance days, and do meritorious deeds.' Then, because of this, the Tāvatiṃsa devas become elated, [saying]: 'Indeed, the celestial company will flourish and the company of asuras will decline!'"

"Bhikkhus, once in the past, when Sakka, ruler of the devas, was guiding the Tāvatiṃsa devas, he recited this verse:<sup>48</sup> [144]

'The person who would be like me  
should observe the *uposatha*  
complete in the eight factors,  
on the fourteenth, fifteenth,  
and eighth of the fortnight,  
and during special fortnights.'<sup>49</sup>

"This verse, bhikkhus, was badly recited by Sakka, ruler of the devas, not well recited. It was badly stated, not well stated. For what reason? Because Sakka, ruler of the devas, is not devoid of lust, hatred, and delusion. But in the case of a bhikkhu who is an arahant—one whose taints are destroyed, who has lived the spiritual life, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, reached his own goal, utterly destroyed the fetters of existence, one completely liberated through final knowledge—it is fitting for him to say:

'The person who would be like me...  
and during special fortnights.'

For what reason? Because that bhikkhu is devoid of lust, hatred, and delusion."

<sup>48</sup> I follow Be as against Ce and Ee in the division between this sutta and the next. Ce and Ee take this sentence as the beginning of 3:38 and the second narrative that begins *bhūtapubbam bhikkhave* ("Bhikkhus, once in the past")—several paragraphs below—as a continuation of the sutta. Be, however, takes the first narrative about Sakka to be a continuation of 3:37, and the second narrative to mark the beginning of 3:38. A Chinese parallel, SĀ 1117 (T II 295c10–296a23), agrees with Be on this but merges into one the two statements about Sakka and the liberated bhikkhu.

<sup>49</sup> *Pāṭihāriyapakkha*. Mp says that they undertake a continuous *uposatha* observance for the full three months of the rains (*antovasse temāsaṃ*); if they cannot manage this, they should observe it for a full month after the rains, between the two invitation days, or at least for a two-week period following the first invitation day. The "invitation" (*pavāraṇa*) is the occasion, at the end of the rains, when each bhikkhu and bhikkhunī "invites" (*pavāreti*) their fellows to point out any faults in their behavior during the rains. Spk I 307,9-16, commenting on *pāṭihāriyapakkha* at SN 10:5, I 208,27, explains the term in a broader sense (see CDB p. 480, n. 573). On the *uposatha*, see 3:70 and 8:41–42.

### 38 (8) Kings (2)

"Bhikkhus, once in the past, when Sakka, ruler of the devas, was guiding the Tāvātimsa devas, on that occasion he recited this verse:<sup>50</sup>

'The person who would be like me...  
and during special fortnights.'

"This verse, bhikkhus, was badly recited by Sakka, ruler of the devas, not well recited. It was badly stated, not well stated. For what reason? Because Sakka, ruler of the devas, is not free from birth, old age and death, from sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and despair; he is not free from suffering, I say. But in the case of a bhikkhu who is an arahant—one whose taints are destroyed ... one completely liberated through final knowledge—it is fitting for him to say:

'The person who would be like me...  
and during special fortnights.'[145]

For what reason? Because that bhikkhu is free from birth, old age and death, from sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and despair; he is free from suffering, I say."

### 39 (9) Delicate

"Bhikkhus, I was delicately nurtured, most delicately nurtured, extremely delicately nurtured. At my father's residence lotus ponds were made just for my enjoyment: in one of them blue lotuses bloomed, in another red lotuses, and in a third white lotuses.<sup>51</sup> I used only sandal unguent from Kāsī and my head dress, jacket, lower garment, and upper garment were made of Kāsī cloth.<sup>52</sup> By day and by night a white canopy was held over me so that cold and heat, dust, grass, and dew would not settle on me.

"I had three mansions: one for the winter, one for the summer, and one for the rainy season.<sup>53</sup> I spent the four months of the rains in the rainy-season mansion,

---

<sup>50</sup> Be treats this sentence as the beginning of **3:38**. Strangely, Be titles this "The Second on the Four Great Kings" even though the sutta makes no mention of them.

<sup>51</sup> Mp defines *paduma* as a white lotus (*paṇḍarapadumaṃ*) and *puṇḍarīka* as a red lotus (*rattapadumaṃ*). SED, however, defines *puṇḍarīka* as "a lotus flower (esp. a white lotus)," adding that the word is used to mean "white" in general. Numerous websites I consulted also define *puṇḍarīka* as a white lotus.

<sup>52</sup> Kāsī was an alternative name for Bārāṇasī.

<sup>53</sup> These are the three seasons of northern India: the winter lasts roughly from November to March, the hot season from March to July, and the rainy season from July to November. Mp says that the winter mansion had nine stories, which were low in order to retain heat; the summer mansion had five stories,

being entertained by musicians, none of whom were male,<sup>54</sup> and I did not leave the mansion. While in other people's homes slaves, workers, and servants are given broken rice together with sour gruel for their meals, in my father's residence they were given choice hill rice, meat, and boiled rice.

(1) "Amidst such splendor and a delicate life, it occurred to me: 'An uninstructed worldling, though himself subject to old age, not exempt from old age, feels repelled, humiliated, and disgusted when he sees another who is old, overlooking his own situation.'<sup>55</sup> Now I too am subject to old age and am not exempt from old age. Such being the case, if I were to feel repelled, humiliated, [146] and disgusted when seeing another who is old, that would not be proper for me.' When I reflected thus, my intoxication with youth was completely abandoned.

(2) "[Again, it occurred to me:] 'An uninstructed worldling, though himself subject to illness, not exempt from illness, feels repelled, humiliated, and disgusted when he sees another who is ill, overlooking his own situation. Now I too am subject to illness and am not exempt from illness. Such being the case, if I were to feel repelled, humiliated, and disgusted when seeing another who is ill, that would not be proper for me.' When I reflected thus, my intoxication with health was completely abandoned.

(3) "[Again, it occurred to me:] 'An uninstructed worldling, though himself subject to death, not exempt from death, feels repelled, humiliated, and disgusted when he sees another who has died, overlooking his own situation. Now I too am subject to death and am not exempt from death. Such being the case, if I were to feel repelled, humiliated, and disgusted when seeing another who has died, that would not be proper for me.' When I reflected thus, my intoxication with life was completely abandoned.

"There are, bhikkhus, these three kinds of intoxication.<sup>56</sup> What three? Intoxication with youth, intoxication with health, and intoxication with life. (1) An uninstructed worldling, intoxicated with youth, engages in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. With the breakup of the body, after death, he is reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell. (2) An uninstructed worldling, intoxicated with health, engages in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. With the breakup of the body, after death, he is reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell. (3) An uninstructed worldling, intoxicated with life, engages in misconduct by body, [147] speech, and mind. With the breakup of the body, after death, he is reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell.

---

which were high in order to allow the air to cool; and the rains mansion had seven stories, which were neither high nor low in order to establish a medium temperature.

<sup>54</sup> *Nippurisehi*. Mp says that not only the musicians, but all the posts in the palaces were occupied by women (*itthiyo*). Thus for four months another man did not get to see him.

<sup>55</sup> *Attānaṃyeva atisitivā*. *Atisitivā* is absolutive of *atisarati*. See **DOP** sv *atisarati*.

<sup>56</sup> Ee takes this sentence to mark the beginning of a new sutta, **3:39** in its numbering. But Ce and Be, which I follow, treat this passage as a continuation of the sutta that began with the Buddha's recollection of his delicate upbringing. In Ce and Be, this entire sutta is **3:39**, so that at this point the numbering in all three eds. coincides.



"Intoxicated with youth, a bhikkhu rejects the training and reverts to the lower life; or intoxicated with health, he rejects the training and reverts to the lower life; or intoxicated with life, he rejects the training and reverts to the lower life.

"Worldlings subject to illness,  
old age, and death, are disgusted  
[by other people] who exist  
in accordance with their nature.<sup>57</sup>

"If I were to become disgusted  
with beings who have such a nature,  
that would not be proper for me  
since I too have the same nature.

"While I was dwelling thus,  
having known the state without acquisitions,  
I overcame all intoxications—  
intoxication with health,  
with youth, and with life—  
having seen security in renunciation.<sup>58</sup>

"Zeal then arose in me  
as I clearly saw nibbāna.  
Now I am incapable  
of indulging in sensual pleasures.  
Relying on the spiritual life,  
never will I turn back."<sup>59</sup>

#### 40 (10) Authorities

"Bhikkhus, there are these three authorities. What three? Oneself as one's authority; the world as one's authority; and the Dhamma as one's authority.<sup>60</sup>

---

<sup>57</sup> The third pāda is obscure: *yathā dhammā tathā santā*. I translate it literally. In explaining the fourth pāda, Mp adds *parapuggalaṃ* as an object of the verb *jigucchanti*.

<sup>58</sup> Ce, Be read *nekkhamme daṭṭhu khemataṃ*. Ee has *nekkhammaṃ daṭṭhu khemato* as its primary reading but mentions the Ce, Be variants in its notes. Mp (both Ce and Be) uses the Ce, Be reading as the lemma, which it glosses *nibbāne khemabhāvaṃ disvā*, but it then cites the Ee reading as a variant, glossed *nibbānaṃ khemato disvā*. Thus here Ee has chosen the variant as the primary reading.

<sup>59</sup> Mp says that these verses refer to his own energy as it arose while he was sitting beneath the bodhi tree.

<sup>60</sup> In Pāli: *attādhīpateyyaṃ lokādhīpateyyaṃ dhammādhīpateyyaṃ*.

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is oneself as one's authority? Here, having gone to the forest, to the foot of a tree, or to an empty hut, a bhikkhu reflects thus: 'I did not go forth from the household life into homelessness for the sake of a robe, almsfood, or lodging, or for the sake of becoming this or that,'<sup>61</sup> but rather [with the thought]: 'I am immersed in birth, old age, and death; in sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and anguish. I am immersed in suffering, afflicted by suffering. Perhaps an ending of this entire mass of suffering can be discerned.' [148] As one who has gone forth from the household life into homelessness, it would not be proper for me to seek out sensual pleasures similar to or worse than those that I have discarded.' He then reflects thus: 'Energy will be aroused in me without slackening; mindfulness will be established without confusion; my body will be tranquil without disturbance; my mind will be concentrated and one-pointed.' Having taken himself as his authority, he abandons the unwholesome and develops the wholesome; he abandons what is blameworthy and develops what is blameless; he maintains himself in purity. This is called oneself as one's authority.

(2) "And what, bhikkhus, is the world as one's authority? Here, having gone to the forest, to the foot of a tree, or to an empty hut, a bhikkhu reflects thus: 'I did not go forth from the household life into homelessness for the sake of a robe ... but rather [with the thought]: 'I am immersed in birth, old age, and death ... Perhaps an ending of this entire mass of suffering can be discerned.' As one who has gone forth from the household life into homelessness, I might think sensual thoughts, thoughts of ill will, or thoughts of harming. But the abode of the world is vast. In the vast abode of the world there are ascetics and brahmins with psychic potency and the divine eye who know the minds of others. They see things from a distance but they are not themselves seen even when they're close; they know the minds [of others] with their own mind. They would know me thus: "Look at this clansman: though he has gone forth from the household life into homelessness out of faith, he is tarnished by bad unwholesome states." There are deities, too, with psychic potency and the divine eye who know the minds of others. They see even from a distance but are not seen themselves even when close; they too know the minds [of others] with their own mind. They too would know me thus: "Look at this clansman: though he has gone forth from the household life into homelessness out of faith, he is tarnished by bad unwholesome states.'" He then reflects thus: 'Energy will be aroused in me [149] without slackening; mindfulness will be established without confusion; my body will be tranquil without disturbance; my mind will be concentrated and one-pointed.' Having taken the world as his authority, he abandons the unwholesome and develops the wholesome; he abandons what is blameworthy and develops what is blameless; he maintains himself in purity. This is called the world as one's authority.

---

<sup>61</sup> *Na itibhavābhavahetu.* Mp takes the long vowel connecting the two occurrences of *bhava* as signifying repetition, not negation: "Not for the sake of this or that prosperous future state of existence, [wishing]: '[Let me obtain] such an existence [or] such an existence'" (*iti bhavo, iti bhavo ti evaṃ āyatim na tassa tassa sampattibhavassa hetu*).

(3) "And what, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma as one's authority? Here, having gone to the forest, to the foot of a tree, or to an empty hut, a bhikkhu reflects thus: 'I did not go forth from the household life into homelessness for the sake of a robe ... but rather [with the thought]: "I am immersed in birth, old age, and death ... Perhaps an ending of this entire mass of suffering can be discerned." The Dhamma is well expounded by the Blessed One, directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise. There are fellow monks of mine who know and see. As one who has gone forth from the household life into homelessness in this well-expounded Dhamma and discipline, it would be improper for me to be lazy and heedless.' He then reflects thus: 'Energy will be aroused in me without slackening; mindfulness will be established without confusion; my body will be tranquil without disturbance; my mind will be concentrated and one-pointed.' Having taken the Dhamma as his authority, he abandons the unwholesome and develops the wholesome; he abandons what is blameworthy and develops what is blameless; he maintains himself in purity. This is called the Dhamma as one's authority.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three authorities."

For one performing an evil deed  
there is no place in the world called "hidden."  
The self within you knows, O person,  
whether it is true or false.<sup>62</sup>

Indeed, sir, you the witness  
despise your good self;  
you conceal the evil self  
existing within yourself. [150]

The devas and Tathāgatas see the fool  
acting unrighteously in the world.  
Therefore one should fare mindfully,  
taking oneself as authority;<sup>63</sup>  
alert and meditative, taking the world as authority;  
and fare in accordance with the Dhamma,  
taking the Dhamma as authority.  
Truly exerting himself, a sage does not decline.

<sup>62</sup> *Attā te purisa jānāti saccaṃ vā yadi vā musā.* Mp: "You yourself know, of whatever you do, whether it is of this or that nature. For this reason, it should be understood that, for one who does an evil deed, there is no place in the world that can be called 'hidden.'"

<sup>63</sup> Reading with Ce and Ee *tasmā hi attādhīpako sato care* as against Be *tasmā hi attādhīpateyyako ca.*

Having vanquished Māra  
and overcome the end-maker,  
the striver has finished with birth.  
Such a sage, wise, a world-knower,  
identifies with nothing at all.

## V. The Minor Chapter

### 41 (1) Present

"Bhikkhus, when three things are present, a clansman endowed with faith generates much merit. What three? (1) When faith is present, a clansman endowed with faith generates much merit. (2) When an object to be given is present, a clansman endowed with faith generates much merit. (3) When those worthy of offerings are present, a clansman endowed with faith generates much merit. When these three things are present, a clansman endowed with faith generates much merit."

### 42 (2) Cases

"Bhikkhus, in three cases one may be understood to have faith and confidence. What three? When one desires to see those of virtuous behavior; when one desires to hear the good Dhamma; and when one dwells at home with a mind devoid of the stain of miserliness, freely generous, open-handed, delighting in relinquishment, devoted to charity, delighting in giving and sharing. In these three cases, one may be understood to have faith and confidence."

One who desires to see the virtuous ones,  
who wishes to hear the good Dhamma,  
who has removed the stain of miserliness,  
is called a person endowed with faith. [151]

### 43 (3) Advantages

"Bhikkhus, when one sees three advantages, it is enough to teach others the Dhamma. What three? (1) The one who teaches the Dhamma experiences the meaning and the Dhamma.<sup>64</sup> (2) The one who hears the Dhamma experiences the meaning and the

---

<sup>64</sup> Mp explains "experiences the meaning" (*atthapaṭisaṃvedī*) as "experiences with knowledge the explanation of the meaning (or commentary)" (*aṭṭhakatham ṇāṇena paṭisaṃvedī*); and "experiences the Dhamma" (*dhammapaṭisaṃvedī*) as "experiences the Dhamma of the canonical text" (*pālīdhammam paṭisaṃvedī*). This obviously imposes a later distinction on older terms. However, while the two terms are often paired, the precise distinction between *attha* and *dhamma* is not clearly drawn in the Nikāyas. In fact,

Dhamma. (3) Both the one who teaches the Dhamma and the one who hears the Dhamma experience the meaning and the Dhamma. Seeing these three advantages, it is enough to teach others the Dhamma."

#### 44 (4) Smooth Flow

"Bhikkhus, in three cases talk flows smoothly.<sup>65</sup> What three? (1) When the one who teaches the Dhamma experiences the meaning and the Dhamma. (2) When the one who hears the Dhamma experiences the meaning and the Dhamma. (3) When both the one who teaches the Dhamma and the one who hears the Dhamma experience the meaning and the Dhamma. In these three cases talk flows smoothly."

#### 45 (5) The Wise

"Bhikkhus, there are these three things prescribed by the wise, prescribed by good people. What three? (1) Giving is prescribed by the wise, prescribed by good people. (2) The going forth is prescribed by the wise, prescribed by good people. (3) Attending upon one's mother and father is prescribed by the wise, prescribed by good people. These three things are prescribed by the wise, prescribed by good people."

Good people prescribe giving,  
harmlessness, self-control, and self-taming,  
service to one's mother and father  
and to the peaceful followers of the spiritual life.<sup>66</sup>

These are the deeds of the good  
which the wise person should pursue.  
The noble one possessed of vision  
goes to an auspicious world.

---

each term is ambivalent and thus their different nuances further complicate their relationship. *Attha* can signify meaning, benefit, good, and goal; *dhamma* can signify the teaching, the system of practice, the nature of things, and the truth pointed to by the teaching. Thus the contrast between *dhamma* and *attha* can be seen as that between the formulated teaching and its meaning; between the practice and its goal; and between the teaching and the benefit it brings.

<sup>65</sup> *Pavattinī*. Mp: "It leads out without being obstructed" (*appaṭihatā niyyānikā*).

<sup>66</sup> Mp explains *santānaṃ brahmacāriṇaṃ* as referring to those who support their parents (*idha pana mātāpitu-upaṭṭhāṇaṃ adhippetā*), but I see the expression as referring to monastics, either as the recipients of service (*upaṭṭhāṇaṃ*) or of the giving (*dānaṃ*) mentioned in pāda a. Mp further construes *santānaṃ* as genitive plural of *sant*, "good, virtuous" (Mp: *uttamaṭṭhena santānaṃ*), but it is more likely to be "peaceful," from Skt *śānta*. *Santānaṃ brahmacāriṇaṃ* is also at SN 1:10, I 5.4, where Spk I 28.2, glosses it with *santakilesānaṃ paṇḍitānaṃ vā*, "those with pacified defilements or wise ones." The Chinese parallel SĀ 995 (at T II 260c29) has 寂靜修梵行, which means that in this transmission *santānaṃ* came down as Skt *śāntānaṃ*.

#### 46 (6) Virtuous

"Bhikkhus, when virtuous renunciants dwell in dependence on a village or a town, the people there generate much merit in three ways. What three? [152] By body, speech, and mind. When virtuous renunciants dwell in dependence on a village or a town, the people there generate much merit in these three ways."

#### 47 (7) Conditioned

"Bhikkhus, there are these three characteristics that define the conditioned.<sup>67</sup> What three? An arising is seen, a vanishing is seen, and its alteration while it persists is seen. These are the three characteristics that define the conditioned.

"Bhikkhus, there are these three characteristics that define the unconditioned.<sup>68</sup> What three? No arising is seen, no vanishing is seen, and no alteration while it persists is seen. These are the three characteristics that define the unconditioned."

#### 48 (8) Mountains

"Bhikkhus, based on the Himalayas, the king of mountains, great sal trees grow in three ways. What three? (1) They grow in branches, leaves, and foliage; (2) they grow in bark and shoots; and (3) they grow in softwood and heartwood. Based on the Himalayas, the king of mountains, great sal trees grow in these three ways.

"So too, when the head of a family is endowed with faith, the people in the family who depend on him grow in three ways. What three? (1) They grow in faith; (2) they grow in virtuous behavior; and (3) they grow in wisdom. When the head of a family has faith, the people in the family who depend on him grow in these three ways."

Just as the trees that grow  
in dependence on a rocky mountain  
in a vast forest wilderness

---

<sup>67</sup> *Saṅkhatassa saṅkhatalakkaṇāni*. Lit. "three conditioned characteristics of the conditioned." And below *asaṅkhatassa asaṅkhatalakkaṇāni*, lit. "three unconditioned characteristics of the unconditioned." I render these expressions in the way I have to avoid giving the wrong impression that the characteristics themselves are conditioned or unconditioned. The point, rather, is that they determine as such the conditioned and the unconditioned.

<sup>68</sup> I follow Ee in making the statements on the characteristics of the conditioned and the unconditioned two parts of a single sutta. Ce and Be take them to be separate suttas and thus count eleven suttas in this *vagga*. The *uddāna* verse includes "*saṅkhatam*" but not "*asaṅkhatam*," which seems to support Ee. At this point, my numbering agrees with Ee but falls behind Be by one (Ce does not number the suttas continuously but begins each *vagga* with '1'). Interestingly, the Chinese parallel EĀ 22.5 (at T II 607c13–c23) mentions *only* the characteristics of the conditioned; there is no corresponding section on the characteristics of the unconditioned.

might become great 'woodland lords,'  
so, when the head of a family here  
possesses faith and virtue,  
his wife, children, and relatives  
all grow in dependence upon him;  
so too his friends, his family circle,  
and those dependent on him. [153]

Those possessed of discernment,  
seeing that virtuous man's good conduct,  
his generosity and good deeds,  
emulate his example.

Having lived here in accord with Dhamma,  
the path leading to a good destination,  
those who desire sensual pleasures rejoice,  
delighting in the deva world.

#### 49 (9) Ardor

"Bhikkhus, in three cases ardor should be exercised. What three? (1) Ardor should be exercised for the non-arising of unarisen bad unwholesome qualities. (2) Ardor should be exercised for the arising of unarisen wholesome qualities. (3) Ardor should be exercised for enduring arisen bodily feelings that are painful, racking, sharp, piercing, harrowing, disagreeable, sapping one's vitality. In these three cases ardor should be exercised.

"When a bhikkhu exercises ardor for the non-arising of unarisen bad unwholesome qualities, for the arising of unarisen wholesome qualities, and for enduring arisen bodily feelings that are painful, racking, sharp, piercing, harrowing, disagreeable, sapping one's vitality, he is called a bhikkhu who is ardent, alert, and mindful in order to make a complete end of suffering."

#### 50 (10) A Master Thief

"Bhikkhus, possessing three factors, a master thief breaks into houses, plunders wealth, commits banditry, and ambushes highways. What three? Here, a master thief depends on the uneven, on thickets, and on powerful people.

(1) "And how does a master thief depend on the uneven? Here, a master thief depends on rivers that are hard to cross and rugged mountains. It is in this way that a master thief depends on the uneven.

(2) "And how does a master thief depend on thickets? Here, a master thief depends on a a thicket of cane, [154] a thicket of trees, a coppice,<sup>69</sup> or a large dense jungle. It is in this way that a master thief depends on thickets.

(3) "And how does a master thief depend on powerful people? Here, a master thief depends on kings or royal ministers. He thinks: 'If anyone accuses me of anything, these kings or royal ministers will dismiss the case.' If anyone accuses him of anything, those kings or royal ministers dismiss the case. It is in this way that a master thief depends on powerful people.

"It is by possessing these three factors that a master thief breaks into houses, plunders wealth, commits banditry, and ambushes highways.

"So too, bhikkhus, possessing threequalities, an evil bhikkhu maintains himself in a maimed and injured condition, is blameworthy and subject to reproach by the wise, and generates much demerit. What three? Here, an evil bhikkhu depends on the uneven, on thickets, and on powerful people.

(1) "And how does an evil bhikkhu depend on the uneven? Here, an evil bhikkhu engages in unrighteous bodily, verbal, and mental action. It is in this way that an evil bhikkhu depends on the uneven.

(2) "And how does an evil bhikkhu depend on thickets? Here, an evil bhikkhu holds wrong view, adopts an extremist view. It is in this way that an evil bhikkhu depends on thickets.

(3) "And how does an evil bhikkhu depend on powerful people? Here, an evil bhikkhu depends on kings or royal ministers. He thinks: 'If anyone accuses me of anything, these kings or royal ministers will dismiss the case.' If anyone accuses him of anything, those kings or royal ministers dismiss the case. It is in this way that an evil bhikkhu depends on the powerful. [155]

"It is by possessing these threequalities that an evil bhikkhu maintains himself in a maimed and injured condition, is blameworthy and subject to reproach by the wise, and generates much demerit."

## The Second Fifty

### I. Brahmins

#### 51 (1) Two Brahmins (1)

Then two brahmins who were old, aged, burdened with years, advanced in life, come to the last stage, a hundred and twenty years of age, approached the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him. When they had concluded their greetings and cordial talk, they sat down to one side and said to the Blessed One:

---

<sup>69</sup> Reading with Ce *gedham* (PED sv *gedha*<sup>2</sup>), as against Be, Ee *rodham* (bank).



"We are brahmins, Master Gotama, old, aged ... a hundred and twenty years of age. But we have not done anything good and wholesome, nor have we made a shelter for ourselves. Let Master Gotama exhort us and instruct us in a way that will lead to our welfare and happiness for a long time!"

"Truly, brahmins, you are old, aged, burdened with years, advanced in life, come to the last stage, a hundred and twenty years of age, but you have not done anything good and wholesome, nor have you made a shelter for yourselves. Indeed, this world is swept away by old age, illness, and death. But though the world is swept away by old age, illness, and death, when one has departed, bodily, verbal, and mental self-control will provide a shelter, a harbor, an island, a refuge, and a support."

Life is swept along, short is the life span,  
no shelters exist for one who has grown old.  
Seeing clearly this peril in death,  
one should do deeds of merit that bring happiness.<sup>70</sup>

When one departs [this life],  
self-control over body, speech, and mind,  
and the deeds of merit one did while living,  
lead to one's happiness.[156]

## 52 (2) Two Brahmins (2)

Then two brahmins who were old, aged, burdened with years, advanced in life, come to the last stage, a hundred and twenty years of age, approached the Blessed One ... and said to him:

"We are brahmins, Master Gotama, old, aged ... a hundred and twenty years of age. But we have not done anything good and wholesome, nor have we made a shelter for ourselves. Let Master Gotama exhort us and instruct us in a way that will lead to our welfare and happiness for a long time!"

"Truly, brahmins, you are old, aged, burdened with years, advanced in life, come to the last stage, a hundred and twenty years of age, but you have not done anything good and wholesome, nor have you made a shelter for yourselves. Indeed, this world is burning with old age, illness, and death. But though the world is burning with old age, illness, and death, when one has departed, bodily, verbal, and mental self-control will provide a shelter, a harbor, an island, a refuge, and a support."

---

<sup>70</sup> At SN 1:3, I 2, this verse is spoken by a deity, who is then "corrected" by the Buddha with a verse that bids the "seeker of peace" to "drop the world's bait" (*lokāmisam pajahe santipekkho*).

When one's house is ablaze  
the vessel taken out  
is the one that will be useful to you,  
not the one that is burnt inside.

So since the world is ablaze  
with old age and death,  
one should take out by giving:  
what is given is well taken out.<sup>71</sup>

When one departs [this life],  
self-control overbody, speech, and mind,  
and the deeds of merit one did while alive,  
lead to one's happiness.

### 53 (3) A Certain Brahmin

Then a certain brahmin approached the Blessed One ... and said to him:  
"Master Gotama, it is said: 'A directly visible Dhamma, a directly visible Dhamma.'<sup>72</sup> In what way is the Dhamma directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise?"

(1) "Brahmin, one excited by lust, overcome by lust, with mind obsessed by it, [157] intends for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, and for the affliction of both, and he experiences mental suffering and dejection. But when lust is abandoned, he does not intend for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he does not experience mental suffering and dejection. It is in this way that the Dhamma is directly visible....

(2) "One full of hate, overcome by hatred, with mind obsessed by it, intends for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, and for the affliction of both, and he experiences mental suffering and dejection. But when hatred is abandoned, he does not intend for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he does not experience mental suffering and dejection. It is in this way, too, that the Dhamma is directly visible....

(3) "One who is deluded, overcome by delusion, with mind obsessed by it, intends for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, and for the affliction of both, and he experiences mental suffering and dejection. But when delusion is abandoned, he does not intend for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he does not experience mental suffering and dejection. It is in this way, too, that the

---

<sup>71</sup> This and the preceding verse are at SN 1:41, I 31.

<sup>72</sup> *Sandīṭṭhiko dhammo*.

Dhamma is directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise."

"Excellent, Master Gotama! Excellent, Master Gotama! Master Gotama has made the Dhamma clear in many ways, as though he were turning upright what had been overthrown, revealing what was hidden, showing the way to one who was lost, or holding up a lamp in the darkness so those with good eyesight can see forms. I now go for refuge to Master Gotama, to the Dhamma, and to the Saṅgha of bhikkhus. Let Master Gotama consider me a lay follower who from today has gone for refuge for life."

#### 54 (4) A Wanderer

Then a certain brahmin wanderer approached the Blessed One ...and said to him:

"Master Gotama, it is said: 'A directly visible Dhamma, a directly visible Dhamma.' In what way is the Dhamma directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise?"

(1) "Brahmin, one excited by lust, overcome by lust, with mind obsessed by it, intends for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he experiences mental suffering and dejection. But when lust is abandoned, he does not intend for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he does not experience mental suffering and dejection. [158] One excited by lust, overcome by lust, with mind obsessed by it, engages in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. But when lust is abandoned, he does not engage in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. One excited by lust, overcome by lust, with mind obsessed by it, does not understand as it really is his own good, the good of others, or the good of both. But when lust is abandoned, he understands as it really is his own good, the good of others, and the good of both. It is in this way, brahmin, that the Dhamma is directly visible ... to be personally experienced by the wise

(2) "One full of hate, overcome by hatred ...

(3) "One who is deluded, overcome by delusion, with mind obsessed by it, intends for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he experiences mental suffering and dejection. But when delusion is abandoned, he does not intend for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he does not experience mental suffering and dejection. One who is deluded, overcome by delusion, with mind obsessed by it, engages in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. But when delusion is abandoned, he does not engage in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. One who is deluded, overcome by delusion, with mind obsessed by it, does not understand as it really is his own good, the good of others, or the good of both. But when delusion is abandoned, he understands as it really is his own good, the good of others, and the good of both. It is in this way, too, that the Dhamma is directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise."

"Excellent, Master Gotama! ... Let Master Gotama consider me a lay follower who from today has gone for refuge for life."

## 55 (5) Nibbāna

Then the brahmin Jāṇussoṇī approached the Blessed One ...and said to him:

"Master Gotama, it is said: 'Directly visible nibbāna, directly visible nibbāna.' In what way is nibbāna directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise?" [159]

(1) "Brahmin, one excited by lust, overcome by lust, with mind obsessed by it, intends for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he experiences mental suffering and dejection. But when lust is abandoned, he does not intend for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he does not experience mental suffering and dejection. It is in this way that nibbāna is directly visible.

(2) "One full of hate, overcome by hatred ...

(3) "One who is deluded, overcome by delusion, with mind obsessed by it, intends for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he experiences mental suffering and dejection. But when delusion is abandoned, he does not intend for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he does not experience mental suffering and dejection. It is in this way, too, that nibbāna is directly visible.

"When, brahmin, one experiences the remainderless destruction of lust, the remainderless destruction of hatred, and the remainderless destruction of delusion, it is in this way, too, that nibbāna is directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise."

"Excellent, Master Gotama! ... Let Master Gotama consider me a lay follower who from today has gone for refuge for life."

## 56 (6) Depopulation

Then a certain affluent brahmin approached the Blessed One ... and said to him:

"Master Gotama, I have heard older brahmins who are aged, burdened with years, teachers of teachers, saying: 'In the past this world was so thickly populated one would think there was no space between people. The villages, towns, and capital cities were so close that cocks could fly between them.'<sup>73</sup> Why is it, Master Gotama, that at present the

---

<sup>73</sup> *Kukkuṭasampātikā*. Mp: "'Cocks' flying between them' (*kukkuṭasampāto*) is cocks' flying from the rooftops in one village to the rooftops in another. When they are so situated, it is said they are 'so close that cocks could fly between them.' There is also the reading *kukkuṭasampādikā* ('so close that cocks could walk between them'). 'Cocks' walking between them' (*kukkuṭasampādo*) is cocks' going on foot from one village to another. When they are so situated, it is said they are 'so close that cocks could walk between them.'"

number of people has declined, depopulation is seen,<sup>74</sup> and villages, [160] towns, cities, and districts have been forsaken?"<sup>75</sup>

(1) "At present, brahmin, people are excited by illicit lust, overcome by unrighteous greed, afflicted by wrong Dhamma.<sup>76</sup> As a result, they take up weapons and slay one another. Hence many people die. This is a reason why at present the number of people has declined, depopulation is seen, and villages, towns, cities, and districts have been forsaken.

(2) "Again, at present people are excited by illicit lust, overcome by unrighteous greed, afflicted by wrong Dhamma. When this happens, sufficient rain does not fall. As a result, there is a famine, a scarcity of grain; the crops become blighted and turn to straw. Hence many people die. This is another reason why at present the number of people has declined, depopulation is seen, and villages, towns, cities, and districts have been forsaken.

(3) "Again, at present people are excited by illicit lust, overcome by unrighteous greed, afflicted by wrong Dhamma. When this happens, the yakkhas release wild spirits.<sup>77</sup> Hence many people die. This is yet another reason why at present the number of people has declined, depopulation is seen, and villages, towns, cities, and districts have been forsaken."

"Excellent, Master Gotama! ... Let Master Gotama consider me a lay follower who from today has gone for refuge for life."

## 57 (7) Vaccha

Then the wanderer Vacchagotta approached the Blessed One... and said to him:

<sup>74</sup> *Tanuttaṃ paññāyati*. Lit., "the diminution [of human beings] is seen."

<sup>75</sup> *Gāṃhāpi agāṃhā honti, nigamāpi anigamā honti, nagarāpi anagarā honti, janapadāpi ajanapadā honti*. Lit., "villages have become non-villages, towns have become non-towns, cities have become non-cities, and provinces have become non-provinces."

<sup>76</sup> Mp: "*Illicit lust (adhammarāga)*: Lust is exclusively contrary to the Dhamma (*adhamma*), but it is not 'illicit lust' when it arises in relation to one's own possessions. It is only 'illicit lust' when it arises in regard to the possessions of others. *Unrighteous greed (visamālobha)*: Though greed is never actually righteous, greed arisen for an object that belongs to oneself is called righteous greed. The greed arisen for an object belonging to another is called unrighteous greed. *Wrong Dhamma (micchādhamma)*: indulgence in what is not a base." Mp-ṭ: "Indulgence in some base of lust (*rāgassa vatthuṭṭhānaṃ*) other than that considered good by the world's standards."

<sup>77</sup> I read with Be, Ee, and Mp (Ce, Be): *yakkhā vāḷe amanusse ossajjanti*. Ce of AN has *manusse* for *amanusse*. Yakkhas are demonic spirits, sometimes depicted as killing human beings and devouring their flesh, but also capable of goodness and even realization of the Dhamma. Mp: "'Yakkhas' are the ruling yakkhas. They release fierce yakkhas on the paths of humans, and when these [yakkhas] get the chance, they deprive the people of their lives" (*yakkhā ti yakkhādhīpatino. Vāḷe amanusse ossajjanti ti caṇḍayakkhe manussapathe vissajjenti, te laddhokāsā mahājanāṃ jīvitaṭṭhānaṃ pāpentī*). Though I follow Mp, I wonder if a more original reading of the text would construe the verb as passive and put all the substantives in nominative plural: *yakkhā vāḷā amanussā ossajjanti*. "Yakkhas—wild, non-human—are released."

"Master Gotama, I have heard: 'The ascetic Gotama says: "Alms should be given only to me, [161] not to others; alms should be given only to my disciples, not to the disciples of others. Only what is given to me is very fruitful, not what is given to others; only what is given to my disciples is very fruitful, not what is given to the disciples of others.'" Do those who speak thus state what has been said by Master Gotama and not misrepresent him with what is contrary to fact? Do they explain in accordance with the Dhamma so that they would not incur any reasonable criticism or ground for censure?<sup>78</sup> For we do not want to misrepresent Master Gotama."

"Those, Vaccha, who say: 'The ascetic Gotama says: "Alms should be given only to me ... only what is given to my disciples is very fruitful, not what is given to the disciples of others,'" do not state what has been said by me but misrepresent me with what is untrue and contrary to fact. One who prevents another from giving alms creates an obstruction and stumbling block for three people. What three? He creates an obstruction to the donor's acquiring merit, to the recipients' gaining a gift, and already he has maimed and injured himself. One who prevents another from giving alms creates an obstruction and stumbling block for these three people."

"But, Vaccha, I say that one acquires merit even if one throws away dishwashing water in a refuse dump or cesspit with the thought: 'May the living beings here sustain themselves with this!' How much more, then, [does one acquire merit] when one gives to human beings! However, I say that what is given to one of virtuous behavior is more fruitful than [what is given] to an immoral person. And [the most worthy recipient] is one who has abandoned five factors and possesses five factors."

"What five factors has he abandoned? Sensual desire, ill will, dullness [162] and drowsiness, restlessness and remorse, and doubt. These are the five factors that he has abandoned."

"And what five factors does he possess? The virtuous behavior, concentration, wisdom, liberation, and knowledge and vision of liberation of one beyond training. These are the five factors that he possesses."

<sup>78</sup> *Kacci te bhoto gotamassa vuttavādino ca bhavantaṃ gotamaṃ abhūtena abbhācikkhanti, dhammassa cānudhammaṃ byākaronti, na ca koci sahadhammiko vādānupāto gārayhaṃ thānaṃ āgacchati.* So all three eds., but some variants have *vādānupāto* in place of *vādānupāto*. I have discussed the formula in detail in CDB, p. 747, n. 72, but I now believe that the Pāli commentaries err in taking *vādānupāto* (or *vādānupāda*) to mean "consequence of their assertion." I now take this term to be simply a synonym of *gārayhaṃ thānaṃ*. In support of this change, see 5:5, where *sahadhammikā vādānupādā gārayhā thānā āgacchanti* and its opposite, *sahadhammikā pāsamsā thānā āgacchanti*, occur without reference to any prior assertion.

Chinese parallels to the present sutta support this interpretation. SĀ 95 (at T II 26a11–14), reads: 云何？瞿曇！作是語者，為實說耶？非為謗毀瞿曇乎？為如說說、如法說耶、法次法說，不為餘人以同法來訶責耶？（“How is it? Gotama, does one who says this speak truthfully? Does he avoid misrepresenting Gotama? Does he speak in accordance with what was said, in accordance with the Dhamma, in line with the Dhamma, so that other people cannot rightfully criticize him?”). Another parallel at T II 493b19–21 is similar, with nothing that corresponds to “consequence of an assertion.”

"It is in such a way, I say, that what is given to one who has abandoned five factors and possesses five factors is very fruitful."

Among cattle of any sort,  
whether black, white, red, or golden,  
mottled, uniform, or pigeon-colored,  
the tamed bull is born,  
the one that can bear the load,  
possessing strength, advancing with good speed.  
They yoke the burden just to him;  
they are not concerned about his color.

So too, among human beings  
it is in any kind of birth—  
among khattiyas, brahmins, vessas,  
suddas, *caṇḍālas*, or scavengers—  
among people of any sort  
that the tamed person of good manners is born:  
one firm in Dhamma, virtuous in conduct,  
truthful in speech, endowed with moral shame;  
one who has abandoned birth and death,  
consummate in the spiritual life,  
with the burden dropped, detached,  
who has done his task, free of taints;  
who has gone beyond all things [of the world]  
and by non-clinging has reached nibbāna:  
an offering is truly vast  
when planted in that spotless field.

Fools devoid of understanding,  
dull-witted, unlearned,  
do not attend on the holy ones<sup>79</sup>  
but give their gifts to those outside.  
Those, however, who attend on the holy ones,  
on the wise ones esteemed assagely,<sup>80</sup>  
and those whose faith in the Fortunate One

---

<sup>79</sup> Mp says that the "holy ones" (*sante*) are the supreme persons (*uttamapurise*): Buddhas, paccekabuddhas, and arahants.

<sup>80</sup> *Sappaññe dhīrasammate*. Mp glosses this as if it meant "esteemed, honored, by the learned" (*pañḍitehi sammate sambhāvite*), but I take *dhīrasammate* to mean "esteemed, honored, as sagely (or wise)."

is deeply rooted and well established,  
go to the world of the devas  
or are born here in a good family.  
Advancing in successive steps,  
those wise ones attain nibbāna. [163]

#### 58 (8) Tikaṇṇa

Then the brahmin Tikaṇṇa approached the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him ... Then, sitting to one side, the brahmin Tikaṇṇa, in the presence of the Blessed One, spoke praise of the brahmins who had mastered the threefold knowledge: "Such are the brahmins who are masters of the threefold knowledge; thus are the brahmins who are masters of the threefold knowledge."

[The Blessed One said:] "But how, brahmin, do the brahmins describe a brahmin who is a master of the threefold knowledge?"

"Here, Master Gotama, a brahmin is well born on both his maternal and paternal sides, of pure descent, unassailable and impeccable with respect to birth as far back as the seventh paternal generation. He is a reciter and preserver of the hymns, a master of the three Vedas with their vocabularies, ritual, phonology, and etymology, and the histories as a fifth; skilled in philology and grammar, he is fully versed in natural philosophy and in the marks of a great man. It is in this way that the brahmins describe a brahmin who is a master of the threefold knowledge."

"Brahmin, a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline is quite different from a brahmin who is a master of the threefold knowledge as the brahmins describe him."

"But in what way, Master Gotama, is one a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline? It would be good if Master Gotama would teach me the Dhamma in such a way as to make clear how one is a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline."

"Well then, brahmin, listen and attend closely. I will speak."

"Yes, sir," the brahmin Tikaṇṇa replied. The Blessed One said this:

"Here, brahmin, secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome states, a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the first jhāna, which consists of rapture and pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by thought and examination. With the subsiding of thought and examination, he enters and dwells in the second jhāna, which has internal placidity and unification of mind and consists of rapture and pleasure born of concentration, without thought and examination. With the fading away as well of rapture, he dwells equanimous and, mindful and clearly comprehending, he experiences pleasure with the body; he enters and dwells in the third jhāna of which the noble ones declare: 'He is equanimous, mindful, one who dwells happily.' With the abandoning of pleasure



and pain, and with the previous passing away of joy and dejection, [164] he enters and dwells in the fourth jhāna, neither painful nor pleasant, which has purification of mindfulness by equanimity.

(1) "When his mind is thus concentrated, purified, cleansed, unblemished, rid of defilement, malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs it to the knowledge of the recollection of past abodes. He recollects his manifold past abodes, that is, one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births, ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births, a hundred births, a thousand births, a hundred thousand births, many eons of world-dissolution, many eons of world-evolution, many eons of world-dissolution and world-evolution thus: 'There I was so named, of such a clan, with such an appearance, such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life span; passing away from there, I was reborn elsewhere, and there too I was so named, of such a clan, with such an appearance, such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life span; passing away from there, I was reborn here.' Thus he recollects his manifold past abodes with their aspects and details.

"This is the first true knowledge attained by him. Ignorance is dispelled, true knowledge has arisen; darkness is dispelled, light has arisen, as happens when one dwells heedful, ardent, and resolute.

(2) "When his mind is thus concentrated, purified, cleansed, unblemished, rid of defilement, malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs it to the knowledge of the passing away and rebirth of beings. With the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, he sees beings passing away and being reborn, inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, and he understands how beings fare on in accordance with their kamma thus: 'These beings who engaged in misconduct by body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong view, and undertook kamma based on wrong view, with the breakup of the body, after death, have been reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell; but these beings who engaged in good conduct by body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right [165] view, and undertook kamma based on right view, with the breakup of the body, after death, have been reborn in a good destination, in a heavenly world.' Thus with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, he sees beings passing away and being reborn, inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, and he understands how beings fare on in accordance with their kamma.

"This is the second true knowledge attained by him. Ignorance is dispelled, true knowledge has arisen; darkness is dispelled, light has arisen, as happens when one dwells heedful, ardent, and resolute.

(3) "When his mind is thus concentrated, purified, cleansed, unblemished, rid of defilement, malleable, wieldy, steady, and attained to imperturbability, he directs it to the knowledge of the destruction of the taints. He understands as it really is: 'This is

suffering'; he understands as it really is: 'This is the origin of suffering'; he understands as it really is: 'This is the cessation of suffering'; he understands as it really is: 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' He understands as it really is: 'These are the taints'; he understands as it really is: 'This is the origin of the taints'; he understands as it really is: 'This is the cessation of the taints'; he understands as it really is: 'This is the way leading to the cessation of the taints.'

"When he knows and sees thus, his mind is liberated from the taint of sensuality, from the taint of existence, and from the taint of ignorance. When it is liberated there comes the knowledge: '[It's] liberated.' He understands: 'Destroyed is birth, the spiritual life has been lived, what had to be done has been done, there is no more coming back to any state of being.'

"This is the third true knowledge attained by him. Ignorance is dispelled, true knowledge has arisen; darkness is dispelled, light has arisen, as happens when one dwells heedful, ardent, and resolute."

He whose virtue has no vacillation,  
who is alert and meditative,  
whose mind has been mastered,  
one-pointed, well concentrated;

the wise one, dispeller of darkness,  
the triple-knowledge bearer, victor over death;  
the one they call an abandoner of all,  
benefactor of devas and humans;

the one possessing the three knowledges,  
who dwells without delusion;  
they worship him, the Buddha  
Gotama, bearing his final body.

The one who knows his past abodes  
and sees heaven and the plane of misery,  
the sage consummate in direct knowledge  
who has reached the destruction of birth:<sup>81</sup>

he is a triple-knowledge brahmin  
through these three kinds of knowledge.

I call him a triple-knowledge master,

---

<sup>81</sup> The verse, which also occurs as DhP 423 a–d, alludes to the three knowledges.

not the other one who utters incantations.[166]

"It is in this way, brahmin, that one is a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline."

"Master Gotama, a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline is quite different from a master of the threefold knowledge according to the brahmins. And a master of the threefold knowledge according to the brahmins is not worth a sixteenth part of a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline."

"Excellent, Master Gotama!... Let Master Gotama consider me a lay follower who from today has gone for refuge for life."

59 (9) Jāṇussoṇī

Then the brahmin Jāṇussoṇī approached the Blessed One ... and said to him:

"Master Gotama, whoever has a sacrifice, a memorial meal, an offering dish, or something to be given should give the gift to brahmins who are masters of the threefold knowledge."<sup>82</sup>

[The Blessed One said:] "But how, brahmin, do the brahmins describe a brahmin who is a master of the threefold knowledge?"

"Here, Master Gotama, a brahmin is well born on both sides ... [as in 3:58] ... and [skilled] in the marks of a great man. It is in this way that the brahmins describe a master of the threefold knowledge."

"Brahmin, a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline is quite different from the one that the brahmins describe."

"But in what way, Master Gotama, is one a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline? It would be good if Master Gotama would teach me the Dhamma in such a way as to make clear how one is a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline."

"Well then, brahmin, listen and attend closely. I will speak."

"Yes, sir," the brahmin Jāṇussoṇī replied. The Blessed One said this:

"Here, brahmin, secluded from sensual pleasures... [all as in 3:58, down to] [167] ... This is the third true knowledge attained by him. Ignorance is dispelled, true knowledge has arisen; darkness is dispelled, light has arisen, as happens when one dwells heedful, ardent, and resolute."

---

<sup>82</sup> Mp: *Yañña* is "a thing to be given" (*deyyadhamma*; though this is already covered by the fourth item); *saddha* (Skt *śrāddha*), "a meal in memory of the dead" (*matakabhataṃ*); *thālipāka*, "a meal to be given to excellent persons" (*varapurisānaṃ dātabbayuttaṃ bhataṃ*, but according to SED sv *sthālī*, *sthālipāka* is more specifically a dish of barley or rice boiled in milk offered as an oblation); and *deyyadhamma*, "anything else that can be given."

Possessing virtue and observances,  
resolute, concentrated,  
his mind mastered,  
one-pointed, well concentrated;

one who knows his past abodes  
and sees heaven and the plane of misery;  
the sage consummate in direct knowledge,  
who has reached the end of birth:[168]

by possessing these three knowledges  
one is a triple-knowledge brahmin.  
I call him a triple-knowledge master,  
not the other who utters incantations.

"It is in this way, brahmin, that one is a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline."

"A master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline, Master Gotama, is quite different from a master of the threefold knowledge according to the brahmins. And a master of the threefold knowledge according to the brahmins is not worth a sixteenth part of a master of the threefold knowledge in the Noble One's discipline."

"Excellent, Master Gotama!... Let Master Gotama consider me a lay follower who from today has gone for refuge for life."

60 (10) Saṅgārava

Then the brahmin Saṅgārava approached the Blessed One and exchanged greetings with him ... Then, sitting to one side, the brahmin Saṅgārava said this to the Blessed One:

"Master Gotama, we brahmins sacrifice and enjoin others to offer sacrifices. Now both one who himself sacrifices and one who enjoins others to offer sacrifices engage in a meritorious practice that extends to many people, that is, one based on sacrifice. But one who leaves his family and goes forth from the household life into homelessness tames only himself, calms only himself, and leads to nibbāna only himself. In such a case, he engages in a meritorious practice that extends to only one person, that is, one based on going forth."

"Well then, brahmin, I will question you about this matter. You should answer as you see fit. What do you think, brahmin? Here, a Tathāgata arises in the world, an arahant, perfectly enlightened, accomplished in true knowledge and conduct, fortunate, knower of

the world, unsurpassed trainer of persons to be tamed, teacher of devas and humans, an Enlightened One, a Blessed One. He says thus: 'Come, this is the path, this is the way. Practicing in accordance with it, I have realized for myself with direct knowledge the unsurpassed culmination of the spiritual life<sup>83</sup> and make it known to others. Come, you too practice thus. Practicing in accordance with it, you too will realize for yourselves with direct knowledge the unsurpassed culmination of the spiritual life and dwell in it.' Thus the teacher teaches this Dhamma and others [169] practice accordingly. There are many hundreds, many thousands, many hundreds of thousands who do so. What do you think? When this is the case, is that act of going forth a meritorious practice that extends to one person or to many people?"

"When that is the case, Master Gotama, this is a meritorious practice that extends to many people, that is, one based on going forth."

When this was said, the Venerable Ānanda said to the brahmin Saṅgārava: "Of these two practices, brahmin, which appeals to you more as being simpler and less harmful, and as being more fruitful and beneficial?"

Thereupon the brahmin Saṅgārava said to the Venerable Ānanda: "I consider Master Gotama and Master Ānanda worthy of veneration and praise."<sup>84</sup>

A second time the Venerable Ānanda said to the brahmin: "Brahmin, I am not asking you whom you consider worthy of veneration and praise. I am asking you which of those two practices appeals to you as being simpler and less harmful, and as being more fruitful and beneficial?"

But a second time the brahmin Saṅgārava replied: "I consider Master Gotama and Master Ānanda worthy of veneration and praise."

A third time the Venerable Ānanda said to the brahmin: "Brahmin, I am not asking you whom you consider worthy of veneration and praise. I am asking you which of those two practices appeals to you as being simpler and less harmful, and as being more fruitful and beneficial?"

But a third time the brahmin Saṅgārava replied: "I consider Master Gotama and Master Ānanda worthy of veneration and praise." [170]

---

<sup>83</sup> *Anuttaram brahmacariyogadham*. Mp: "Nibbāna is 'the unsurpassed culmination of the spiritual life,' the supreme support for the spiritual life, which is the path to arahantship" (*arahattamagga-saṅkhātassa brahmacariyassa anuttaram ogadham uttamapatiṭṭhābhūtaṃ nibbānaṃ*). In MN 44.29, I 304.21–22, *nibbānogadham* is used in conjunction with *nibbānaparāyanam* and *nibbānapariyosānam*, which suggests that the three terms are synonymous. It-a I 112.11–12, glosses *nibbānogadhagāmī* (the same phrase as in AN) with *nibbānasāṅkhātam ogadham patiṭṭham pāram gacchati* ("it goes to the far shore, the support, the culmination consisting in nibbāna"). This explanation, which is inconsistent with other commentaries, supports my rendering of *nibbānogadha* here as "culmination in nibbāna" rather than "the plunge into nibbāna," a rendering used by other translators. My rendering of *amatogadha* in CDB (as at SN 45:139, 46:184, 48:42, 48:44, etc.) as "with the deathless as its ground" is not satisfactory. I am grateful to Vanarata for his comments on this term.

<sup>84</sup> Mp: "He did not want to answer Ānanda's question, so he tried to turn the discussion aside with words of praise."

Then the Blessed One thought: "Even for a third time the brahmin Saṅgārava, on being asked a legitimate question by Ānanda, falters and does not answer. Let me release him." Then the Blessed One said to the brahmin Saṅgārava: "What conversation, brahmin, arose today among the king's retinue when they assembled and were sitting in the royal palace?"

"The conversation was this, Master Gotama: 'Formerly there were fewer bhikkhus, but more who displayed superhuman wonders of psychic potency. But now there are more bhikkhus, but fewer who display superhuman wonders of psychic potency.' This was the conversation that arose today among the king's retinue."

"There are, brahmin, these three kinds of wonders. What three? The wonder of psychic potency, the wonder of mind-reading, and the wonder of instruction.<sup>85</sup>

(1) "And what, brahmin, is the wonder of psychic potency? Here, a bhikkhu wields the various kinds of psychic potency: having been one, he becomes many; having been many, he becomes one; he appears and vanishes; he goes unhindered through a wall, through a rampart, through a mountain as though through space; he dives in and out of the earth as though it were water; he walks on water without sinking as though it were earth; seated cross-legged, he travels in space like a bird; with his hand he touches and strokes the moon and sun so powerful and mighty; he exercises mastery with the body as far as the brahmā world. This is called the wonder of psychic potency.

(2) "And what, brahmin, is the wonder of mind-reading? There is one who, by means of some clue,<sup>86</sup> declares: 'Your thought is thus, such is what you are thinking, your mind is in such and such a state.' And even if he makes many declarations, they are exactly so and not otherwise.

"Again, someone does not declare [the state of mind] on the basis of a clue, [171] but he hears the sound of people, spirits, or deities [speaking] and then declares: 'Your thought is thus, such is what you are thinking, your mind is in such and such a state.' And even if he makes many declarations, they are exactly so and not otherwise.

"Again, someone does not declare [the state of mind] on the basis of a mark, or by hearing the sound of people, spirits, or deities [speaking], but he hears the sound of the diffusion of thought<sup>87</sup> as one is thinking and examining [some matter] and then declares: 'Your thought is thus, such is what you are thinking, your mind is in such and such a state.' And even if he makes many declarations, they are exactly so and not otherwise.

---

<sup>85</sup> *Iddhipāṭihāriyaṃ ādesanāpāṭihāriyaṃ anusāsanāpāṭihāriyaṃ*. Also at DN 11.3–8, I 212–14.

<sup>86</sup> *Nimittena ādisati*. Mp explains it as if it means an unrelated clue in the environment, but it may be a gesture or facial expression—what we now call “body language”—that reveals to a skilled observer the other person’s state of mind.

<sup>87</sup> *Vitakkavipphārasaddaṃ sutvā*. Mp: “Having heard the sound of those muttering while asleep or oblivious, which [sound] arises by the diffusion of thought.” I suspect that Mp misses the point. Since the examples in the sutta proceed from the coarser to the subtler, this one should be subtler than its predecessor. I think that what is intended is a subtle sound supposedly emanated by thought but not expressed verbally.

"Again, someone does not declare [the state of mind] on the basis of a mark, or by hearing the sound of people, spirits, or deities [speaking], or by hearing the sound of the diffusion of thought as one is thinking and examining [some matter], but with his own mind he encompasses the mind of one who has attained concentration without thought and examination and he understands: 'This person's mental activities are so disposed that immediately afterwards he will think this thought.'<sup>88</sup> And even if he makes many declarations, they are exactly so and not otherwise. This is called the wonder of mind-reading.

(3) "And what, brahmin, is the wonder of instruction? Here, someone instructs [others] thus: 'Think in this way and not in that way! Attend to this and not to that! Abandon this and enter and dwell in that!' This is called the wonder of instruction."<sup>89</sup>

"These, brahmin, are the three kinds of wonders. Of these three wonders, which appeals to you as the most excellent and sublime?"

"Among these, Master Gotama, when someone performs this wonder by which he wields the various kinds of psychic potency ... exercises mastery with the body as far as the brahmā world, only the one who performs this wonder experiences it and it occurs only to him. This wonder seems to me like a magical trick.

"Again, Master Gotama, when someone performs this wonder by which he declares another's state of mind on the basis of a clue ... by hearing the sound of people, spirits, or deities ... by hearing the sound of the diffusion of thought while he is thinking and examining [some matter] ... by encompassing with his own mind the mind of one who has attained concentration that is without thought and examination such that he understands: [172] 'This person's mental activities are so disposed that immediately afterwards he will think this thought,' and, even if he makes many declarations, they are exactly so and not otherwise—again, only the one who performs this wonder experiences it and it occurs only to him. This wonder, too, seems to me like a magical trick.

"But, Master Gotama, when someone performs this wonder by which he instructs [others] thus: 'Think in this way and not in that way! Attend to this and not to that! Abandon this and enter and dwell in that!'—this wonder appeals to me as the most excellent and sublime of those three wonders.

"It is astounding and amazing, Master Gotama, how well this has been stated by Master Gotama! We consider Master Gotama to be one who can perform these three wonders. For Master Gotama wields the various kinds of psychic potency ... exercises mastery with the body as far as the brahmā world. Master Gotama encompasses with his own mind the mind of one who has attained concentration that is without thought and examination such that he understands: 'This person's mental activities are so disposed that immediately afterwards he will think this thought.' And Master Gotama instructs [others]

---

<sup>88</sup> This must be referring to one in the second or higher jhāna.

<sup>89</sup> Mp gives examples: "Think thoughts of desirelessness, not thoughts of sensuality, etc. Attend to the idea of impermanence, etc., not to permanence, etc. Abandon lust for sensual pleasure and enter a world-transcending path and fruit."

thus: 'Think in this way and not in that way! Attend to this and not to that! Abandon this and enter and dwell in that!'"

"Surely, brahmin, your words are prying and intrusive.<sup>90</sup> Nevertheless, I will answer you. I do wield the various kinds of psychic potency ... exercise mastery with the body as far as the brahmā world. I do encompass with my own mind the mind of one who has attained a state of concentration that is without thought and examination such that I understand: 'This person's mental activities are so disposed that immediately following this state of mind he will think this thought.' And I do instruct [others] thus: 'Think in this way and not in that way! Attend to this and not to that! Abandon this and enter and dwell in that!'"

"But, Master Gotama, is there even one other bhikkhu apart from Master Gotama who can perform these three wonders?"

"There is not just one hundred, two hundred, three hundred, four hundred, or five hundred bhikkhus, but even more who can perform these three wonders."

"But where are those bhikkhus presently dwelling?" [173]

"Right here, brahmin, in this Saṅgha of bhikkhus."

"Excellent, Master Gotama!... Let Master Gotama consider me a lay follower who from today has gone for refuge for life."

## II. The Great Chapter

### 61 (1) Sectarian

"Bhikkhus, there are these three sectarian tenets<sup>91</sup> which, when questioned, interrogated, and cross-examined by the wise, and taken to their conclusion, will eventuate in non-doing.<sup>92</sup> What are the three?"

<sup>90</sup> *Āsajja upanīyaivācā bhāsitā*. *Āsajja* usually means "having attacked," but this meaning seems too strong here. Mp merely paraphrases without giving much help: "The words you spoke hit upon my virtues and intrude on the domain of my virtues" (*mama guṇe ghaṭṭetvā mam'eva guṇānaṃ santikaṃ upanītā vācā bhāsitā*). I therefore assume that the words, without being insulting, are considered inappropriate because they are making a personal inquiry.

<sup>91</sup> "Sectarian tenets" renders *titthāyatanāni*, lit. "bases of sects." The word *tittha* (Skt *tīrtha*), which originally meant a ford in a river, was used to designate religious teachings, probably in the sense that these teachings provide a "ford" for crossing the stream of defilements and reaching the far shore of liberation (see MN 34, where this metaphor governs a short discourse). Mp explains that the sects (*tittha*) are the sixty-two views (see DN 1.1.29–3.29, I 12–39); the founders of the sects (*titthakara*) are those who formulate those views; and the followers of the sects (*titthiya*) are those who approve of the views. The great teachers in Jainism are called in Skt *tīrthāṅkara*.

<sup>92</sup> *Parampi gantvā akiriyaṃ saṅṭhahanti*. Mp glosses *param* with *paramparā*, "lineage": "Even if they have gone to one of the three kinds of lineage, the lineage of teachers, the lineage of beliefs, and the lineage of [one's] individual existences" (*ācariyaparamparā laddhiparamparā attabhāva-paramparā ti etesu yaṃkiñci paramparam gantvā pi*). It is hard to see how this has any relevance to the context. Since *param* can also mean "later, further, afterwards," it seems the point being conveyed is that these positions, if extended further, eventuate in non-doing. On the basis of this understanding, I render *parampi gantvā* as "taken to their conclusion." *Saṅṭhahanti* is, more literally, "stop at."



(1) "There are, bhikkhus, some ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view as this: 'Whatever this person experiences—whether pleasure, pain, or neither-pain-nor-pleasure—all that is caused by what was done in the past.' (2) There are other ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view as this: 'Whatever this person experiences—whether pleasure, pain, or neither-pain-nor-pleasure—all that is caused by God's creative activity.' (3) And there are still other ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view as this: 'Whatever this person experiences—whether pleasure, pain, or neither-pain-nor-pleasure—all that occurs without a cause or condition.'<sup>93</sup>

(1) "Bhikkhus, I approached those ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view as this: 'Whatever this person experiences—whether pleasure, pain, or neither-pain-nor-pleasure—all that is caused by past deeds,'<sup>94</sup> and I said to them: 'Is it true that you venerable ones hold such a doctrine and view?' When I ask them this, they affirm it. [174] Then I say to them: 'In such a case, it is due to past deeds that you might destroy life, take what is not given, indulge in sexual activity, speak falsehood, utter divisive speech, speak harshly, indulge in idle chatter; that you might be full of longing, have a mind of ill will, and hold wrong view.'<sup>95</sup>

"Those who fall back on past deeds as the essential truth have no desire [to do] what should be done and [to avoid doing] what should not be done, nor do they make an effort in this respect. Since they do not apprehend as true and valid anything that should be done or should not be done, they are muddle-minded, they do not guard themselves, and even the personal designation 'ascetic' could not be legitimately applied to them. This was my first legitimate refutation of those ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view.

(2) "Then, bhikkhus, I approached those ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view as this: 'Whatever this person experiences—whether pleasure, pain, or neither-pain-nor-pleasure—all that is caused by God's creative activity,' and I said to them: 'Is it true that you venerable ones hold such a doctrine and view?' When I ask them this, they affirm it. Then I say to them: 'In such a case, it is due to God's creative activity that you might destroy life ... and hold wrong view.'

"Those who fall back on God's creative activity as the essential truth have no desire [to do] what should be done and [to avoid doing] what should not be done, nor do

---

<sup>93</sup> These are respectively the doctrines of the Jains, the theists, and non-causality, a doctrine elsewhere ascribed to Makkhali Gosāla (see 1:319, 3:137).

<sup>94</sup> Mp: "They hold that one experiences feelings exclusively because of kamma created in the past." In this connection, see SN 36:21, IV 230–31, where the Buddha explains eight causes for illness or affliction, only one of which is the ripening of past kamma. Brahmāli writes: "The point here seems to be that each of these unwholesome ways of acting is related to particular feelings, and that those feelings (or experiences) can only be experienced through those acts. It follows that if your kamma is such that you have to experience the feelings connected with those bad acts, then you will have to perform them." The same point, with suitable changes, applies to the following two tenets, that of God's creative activity and non-causality. In each case, agents escape responsibility for their actions.

<sup>95</sup> At MN 14.15–19, I 92–93, and MN 101, II 214–28, the Buddha challenges the Nigaṇṭhas with other arguments against their thesis that all feeling is due to past kamma.

they make an effort in this respect. Since they do not apprehend as true and valid anything that should be done or should not be done, they are muddle-minded, they do not guard themselves, and even the personal designation 'ascetic' could not be legitimately applied to them. This was my second legitimate refutation of those ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view. [175]

(3) "Then, bhikkhus, I approached those ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view as this: 'Whatever this person experiences—whether pleasure, pain, or neither-pain-nor-pleasure—all that occurs without a cause or condition,' and I said to them: 'Is it true that you venerable ones hold such a doctrine and view?' When I ask them this, they affirm it. Then I say to them: 'In such a case, it is without a cause or condition that you might destroy life ... and hold wrong view.'

"Those who fall back on absence of cause and condition as the essential truth have no desire [to do] what should be done and [to avoid doing] what should not be done, nor do they make an effort in this respect. Since they do not apprehend as true and valid anything that should be done or should not be done, they are muddle-minded, they do not guard themselves, and even the personal designation 'ascetic' could not be legitimately applied to them. This was my third legitimate refutation of those ascetics and brahmins who hold such a doctrine and view.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three sectarian tenets which, when questioned, interrogated, and cross-examined by the wise, and taken to their conclusion, will eventuate in non-doing.

"But, bhikkhus, this Dhamma taught by me is unrefuted, undefiled, irreproachable and uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins.<sup>96</sup> And what is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted, undefiled, irreproachable and uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins?

"These are the six elements': this, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted ... uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins. 'These are the six bases for contact' ... 'These are the eighteen mental examinations' ... 'These are the four noble truths': this, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted, undefiled, irreproachable and uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins.

"When it was said: "'These are the six elements': this, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted ... uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins,' for what reason was this said? There are [176] these six elements: the earth element, the water element, the fire element, the air element, the space element, and the consciousness element.<sup>97</sup> When it was said: "'These are the six elements': this, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted ... uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins,' it is because of this that this was said.

---

<sup>96</sup> Mp: "He has so far shown that these sectarian tenets, when taken to their conclusion, eventuate in non-doing, and are therefore empty and unemancipating, without substance. He now shows that the Dhamma he teaches is substantial and emancipating (*sārabhāvaṇḍeva niyyānikabhāvaṇḍa*)."

<sup>97</sup> For a detailed analysis of the six elements, see MN 140.14–19, III 240–43.

"When it was said: "'These are the six bases for contact": this, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted ... uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins,' for what reason was this said? There are these six bases for contact: the eye as a base for contact, the ear as a base for contact, the nose as a base for contact, the tongue as a base for contact, the body as a base for contact, and the mind as a base for contact. When it was said: "'These are the six bases for contact": this, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted ... uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins,' it is because of this that this was said.

"When it was said: "'These are the eighteen mental examinations": this, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted ... uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins,' for what reason was this said?<sup>98</sup> Having seen a form with the eye, one examines a form that is a basis for joy; one examines a form that is a basis for dejection; one examines a form that is a basis for equanimity. Having heard a sound with the ear ... Having smelled an odor with the nose ... Having tasted a taste with the tongue ... Having felt a tactile object with the body ... Having cognized a mental phenomenon with the mind, one examines a mental phenomenon that is a basis for joy; one examines a mental phenomenon that is a basis for dejection; one examines a mental phenomenon that is a basis for equanimity. When it was said: "'These are the eighteen mental examinations": this, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted ... uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins,' it is because of this that this was said.

"When it was said: "'These are the four noble truths": this, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted ... uncensored by wise ascetics and brahmins,' for what reason was this said? In dependence on the six elements the descent of a [future] embryo occurs.<sup>99</sup> When the descent takes place, there is name-and-form; with name-and-form as condition, there are the six sense bases; with the six sense bases as condition, there is contact; with contact as condition, there is feeling. Now it is for one who feels that I proclaim: 'This is suffering,' and 'This is the origin of suffering,' and 'This is the cessation of suffering,' and 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.'

"And what, bhikkhus, is the noble truth of suffering? Birth is suffering, old age is suffering, illness is suffering, death [177] is suffering; sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and anguish are suffering; not to get what one wants is suffering; in brief, the five aggregates subject to clinging are suffering. This is called the noble truth of suffering.

<sup>98</sup> Mp explains *manopavicāra* thus: "The mind's examination of the eighteen cases, using the feet of thought and examination (*vitakkavicārapādehi*). The word "feet" (*pāda*) is used here because *vicāra* originally meant "traveling around."

<sup>99</sup> Mp: "Why does he begin in this way? For ease of understanding. For the Tathāgata wants to explain the revolving of the twelve conditions, so he shows the round by the term 'descent of a [future] embryo' (*gabbhassāvakkanti*). For when the round has been shown by the descent of a [future] embryo, what follows will be easy to understand. Whose six elements serve as the condition, the mother's or the father's? It is neither, but descent of a [future] embryo occurs conditioned by the six elements of the being taking rebirth." Mp cites MN 38.26, I 265,35–66,6 (see too MN 93.18, II 156,30–57,3).

"And what, bhikkhus, is the noble truth of the origin of suffering? With ignorance as condition, volitional activities [come to be]; with volitional activities as condition, consciousness; with consciousness as condition, name-and-form; with name-and-form as condition, the six sense bases; with the six sense bases as condition, contact; with contact as condition, feeling; with feeling as condition, craving; with craving as condition, clinging; with clinging as condition, existence; with existence as condition, birth; with birth as condition, old age-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and anguish come to be. Such is the origin of this whole mass of suffering. This is called the noble truth of the origin of suffering.<sup>100</sup>

"And what, bhikkhus, is the noble truth of the cessation of suffering? With the remainderless fading away and cessation of ignorance comes cessation of volitional activities; with the cessation of volitional activities, cessation of consciousness; with the cessation of consciousness, cessation of name-and-form; with the cessation of name-and-form, cessation of the six sense bases; with the cessation of the six sense bases, cessation of contact; with the cessation of contact, cessation of feeling; with the cessation of feeling, cessation of craving; with the cessation of craving, cessation of clinging; with the cessation of clinging, cessation of existence; with the cessation of existence, cessation of birth; with the cessation of birth, old age-and-death, sorrow, lamentation, pain, dejection, and anguish cease. Such is the cessation of this whole mass of suffering. This is called the noble truth of the cessation of suffering.

"And what, bhikkhus, is the noble truth of the way leading to the cessation of suffering? It is just this noble eightfold path; that is, right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right concentration. This is called the noble truth of the way leading to the cessation of suffering.

"When it was said: "These are the four noble truths": this, bhikkhus, is the Dhamma taught by me that is unrefuted, undefiled, irreproachable and uncensured by wise ascetics and brahmins,' it is because of this that this was said." [178]

## 62 (2) Perils

"Bhikkhus, the uninstructed worldling speaks of these three perils that separate mother and son.<sup>101</sup> What three?

(1) "There comes a timewhen a great conflagration arises. When the great conflagration has arisen, it burns up villages, towns, and cities. When villages, towns, and

<sup>100</sup> This may be a unique instance where the noble truths of the origin and cessation of suffering are explicated by way of the full twelve factors of dependent origination. At SN 12:43, II 72–73, the origination (*samudaya*) of suffering is explained by way of the links from consciousness through craving; and its passing away (*atthaṅgama*), by way of the cessation of the links from craving through old age and death.

<sup>101</sup> *Tīṇ' imāni bhikkhave amātāputtikāni bhayānī ti assutavā puthujjano bhāsatī*. Lit. "There are these three [things] that the uninstructed worldling speaks of as 'without-mother-and-son perils.'"

cities are burning up, the mother does not find her son and the son does not find his mother. This is the first peril that separates mother and son of which the uninstructed worldling speaks.

(2) "Again, there comes a time when a great rain cloud arises. When the great rain cloud has arisen, a great deluge takes place. When the great deluge takes place, villages, towns, and cities are swept away. When villages, towns, and cities are being swept away, the mother does not find her son and the son does not find his mother. This is the second peril that separates mother and son of which the uninstructed worldling speaks.

(3) "Again, there comes a time of perilous turbulence in the wilderness, when the people of the countryside, mounted on their vehicles, flee on all sides. When there is perilous turbulence in the wilderness, and the people of the countryside, mounted on their vehicles, are fleeing on all sides, the mother does not find her son and the son does not find his mother. This is the third peril that separates mother and son of which the uninstructed worldling speaks.

"These are the three perils that separate mother and son of which the uninstructed worldling speaks.

"There are, bhikkhus, these three perils when mother and son reconnect that the uninstructed worldling speaks of as perils that separate mother and son.<sup>102</sup> What three?

(1) "There comes a time when a great conflagration arises. When the great conflagration has arisen, it burns up villages, towns, and cities. When villages, towns, and cities are burning up, there is sometimes an occasion when the mother [179] finds her son and the son finds his mother. This is the first peril when mother and son reconnect that the uninstructed worldling speaks of as a peril that separates mother and son.

(2) "Again, there comes a time when a great rain cloud arises. When the great rain cloud has arisen, a great deluge takes place. When the great deluge takes place, villages, towns, and cities are swept away. When villages, towns, and cities are being swept away, there is sometimes an occasion when the mother finds her son and the son finds his mother. This is the second peril when mother and son reconnect that the uninstructed worldling speaks of as a peril that separates mother and son.

(3) "Again, there comes a time of perilous turbulence in the wilderness, when the people of the countryside, mounted on their vehicles, flee on all sides. When there is perilous turbulence in the wilderness, and the people of the countryside, mounted on their vehicles, are fleeing on all sides, there is sometimes an occasion when the mother finds her son and the son finds his mother. This is the third peril when mother and son reconnect that the uninstructed worldling speaks of as a peril that separates mother and son.

---

<sup>102</sup> *Tīṇi samātāputtikāṇīyeva bhayāni amātāputtikāṇi bhayānī ti assutavā puthujjano bhāsati.* More literally: "There are three with-mother-and-son perils that the uninstructed worldling speaks of as 'without-mother-and-son perils.'" The perils are obviously the great fire, the flood, and the turbulence. Since these initially separate mother and son, one can call them "perils that separate mother and son." But since, in the end, mother and son find one another, one can also call them perils when mother and son reconnect.

"These are the three perils when mother and son reconnect that the uninstructed worldling speak of as perils that separate mother and son.

"There are, bhikkhus, these three perils that separate mother and son.<sup>103</sup> What three? The peril of old age, the peril of illness, and the peril of death.

(1) "When the son is growing old, the mother cannot fulfill her wish: 'Let me grow old, but may my son not grow old!' And when the mother is growing old, the son cannot fulfill his wish: 'Let me grow old, but may my mother not grow old!'

(2) "When the son has fallen ill, the mother cannot fulfill her wish: 'Let me fall ill, but may my son not fall ill!' And when the mother has fallen ill, the son cannot fulfill his wish: 'Let me fall ill, but may my mother not fall ill!'

(3) "When the son is dying, the mother cannot fulfill her wish: 'Let me die, but may my son not die!' And when the mother is dying, the son cannot fulfill his wish: 'Let me die, but may my mother not die!'

"These are the three perils that separate mother and son. [180]

"There is a path, bhikkhus, there is a way that leads to the abandoning and overcoming of these three perils when mother and son reconnect and of these three perils that separate mother and son. And what is the path and way? It is just this noble eightfold path; that is, right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, and right concentration. This is the path and way that leads to the abandoning and overcoming of these three perils when mother and son reconnect and of these three perils that separate mother and son."

### 63 (3) Venāga

On one occasion the Blessed One was wandering on tour among the Kosalans together with a large Saṅgha of bhikkhus when he reached the Kosalan brahmin village named Venāgapura. The brahmin householders of Venāgapura heard: "It is said that the ascetic Gotama, the son of the Sakyans who went forth from a Sakyan family, has arrived at Venāgapura. Now a good report about that Master Gotama has circulated thus: 'That Blessed One is an arahant, perfectly enlightened, accomplished in true knowledge and conduct, fortunate, knower of the world, unsurpassed leader of persons to be tamed, teacher of devas and humans, the Enlightened One, the Blessed One. Having realized by his own direct knowledge this world with its devas, Māra, and Brahmā, this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its devas and humans, he makes it known to others. He teaches a Dhamma that is good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end, with the right meaning and phrasing; he reveals a spiritual life that is perfectly complete and pure.' Now it is good to see such arahants."

---

<sup>103</sup> Mp: "Having shown in a provisional way (*pariyāyato*) the perils that separate mother and son, he now shows in a non-provisional way (*nippariyāyena*) the perils that separate mother and son."

Then the brahmin householders of Venāgapura approached the Blessed One. Some paid homage to the Blessed One and sat down to one side; some exchanged greetings with him, [181] and when they had concluded their greetings and cordial talk, sat down to one side; some reverentially saluted him and sat down to one side; some pronounced their name and clan and sat down to one side; some kept silent and sat down to one side. The brahmin Vacchagotta of Venāgapura then said to the Blessed One:

"It is astounding and amazing, Master Gotama, how Master Gotama's faculties are tranquil and the color of his skin is pure and bright. Just as a yellow jujube fruit in the autumn is pure and bright, so Master Gotama's faculties are tranquil and the color of his skin is pure and bright. Just as a palm fruit that has just been removed from its stalk is pure and bright, so Master Gotama's faculties are tranquil and the color of his skin is pure and bright. Just as an ornament of finest gold, well prepared by a skilled goldsmith and very skillfully wrought in the furnace, placed on red brocade, shines and beams and radiates, so Master Gotama's faculties are tranquil and the color of his skin is pure and bright.

"Whatever high and luxurious kinds of bedding there are—that is, a sofa, a divan, a long-haired coverlet, a coverlet of diverse colors, a white coverlet, a woolen coverlet with floral designs, a quilt of cotton wool, a woolen coverlet ornamented with animal figures, a woolen coverlet with double borders, a woolen coverlet with a single border, a silken sheet studded with gems, a sheet made with silk threads and studded with gems, a dancer's rug, an elephant rug, a horse rug, a chariot rug, a rug of antelope hide, a spread made of the hide of the *kadali*-deer, [a bed] with a canopy above and red bolsters at both ends—Master Gotama surely gains them at will, without trouble or difficulty."<sup>104</sup>

"Brahmin, those high and luxurious kinds of bedding are rarely obtained by those who have gone forth, and if they are obtained, they are not allowed.

"But, brahmin, there are three kinds of high and luxurious bed that at present I gain at will, without trouble or difficulty. What three? [182] The celestial high and luxurious bed, the divine high and luxurious bed, and the noble high and luxurious bed."<sup>105</sup> These are the three kinds of high and luxurious beds that at present I gain at will, without trouble or difficulty."

(1) "But, Master Gotama, what is the celestial high and luxurious bed that at present you gain at will, without trouble or difficulty?"

"Here, brahmin, when I am dwelling in dependence on a village or town, in the morning I dress, take my bowl and robe, and enter that village or town for alms. After the meal, when I have returned from the alms round, I enter a grove. I collect some grass or leaves that I find there into a pile and then sit down. Having folded my legs crosswise and

<sup>104</sup> In translating the names of these different types of beds and their appurtenances I have relied on Horner's translation of *Vin I 192,14–19* (1951, 4:256–57). She based her renderings on *Sp V 1086,1–1087,12*, which corresponds to *Mp II 292–93*.

<sup>105</sup> *Dibbaṃ uccāsayanamahāsayanam, brahmaṃ uccāsayanamahāsayanam, ariyaṃ uccāsayanamahāsayanam*.

straightened my body, I establish mindfulness in front of me. Then, secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome states, I enter and dwell in the first jhāna, which consists of rapture and pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by thought and examination. With the subsiding of thought and examination, I enter and dwell in the second jhāna, which has internal placidity and unification of mind and consists of rapture and pleasure born of concentration, without thought and examination. With the fading away as well of rapture, I dwell equanimous and, mindful and clearly comprehending, I experience pleasure with the body; I enter and dwell in the third jhāna of which the noble ones declare: 'He is equanimous, mindful, one who dwells happily.' With the abandoning of pleasure and pain, and with the previous passing away of joy and dejection, I enter and dwell in the fourth jhāna, neither painful nor pleasant, which has purification of mindfulness by equanimity.

"Then, brahmin, when I am in such a state, if I walk back and forth, on that occasion my walking back and forth is celestial.<sup>106</sup> If I am standing, on that occasion my standing is celestial. If I am sitting, on that occasion my sitting is celestial. If I lie down, on that occasion this is my celestial high and luxurious bed. This is that [183] celestial high and luxurious bed that at present I can gain at will, without trouble or difficulty.

"It is astounding and amazing, Master Gotama! Who else, apart from Master Gotama, can gain at will, without trouble or difficulty, such a celestial high and luxurious bed?

(2) "But, Master Gotama, what is the divine high and luxurious bed that at present you gain at will, without trouble or difficulty?"

"Here, brahmin, when I am dwelling in dependence on a village or town, in the morning I dress, take my bowl and robe, and enter that village or town for alms. After the meal, when I have returned from the alms round, I enter a grove. I collect some grass or leaves that I find there into a pile and then sit down. Having folded my legs crosswise and straightened my body, I establish mindfulness in front of me. Then I dwell pervading one quarter with a mind imbued with loving-kindness, likewise the second quarter, the third quarter, and the fourth quarter. Thus above, below, across, and everywhere, and to all as to myself, I dwell pervading the entire world with a mind imbued with loving-kindness, vast, exalted, measureless, without enmity, without ill will. I dwell pervading one quarter with a mind imbued with compassion ... with a mind imbued with altruistic joy ... with a mind imbued with equanimity, likewise the second quarter, the third quarter, and the

<sup>106</sup> *So ce ahaṃ, brāhmaṇa, evaṃbhūto caṅkamāmi, dibbo me eso tasmim samaye caṅkamo hoti.* Mp says that his walking back and forth is celestial when, having entered the four jhānas, he walks back and forth; and his walking back and forth is celestial when, after emerging from the four jhānas, he walks back and forth. This *seems* to imply that walking can occur even with the mind in jhāna. This, however, is contradicted by the dominant understanding that jhāna is a state of uninterrupted absorption in an object, in which case intentional movements like walking would not be possible. Mp-ṭ explains the first case of Mp (walking after entering the jhānas) to mean that he walks back and forth *immediately after* emerging from the jhāna, while the second case (walking after emerging) to mean that he walks back and forth after having emerged *some time earlier*. The same explanation holds for the divine and the noble beds.



fourth quarter. Thus above, below, across, and everywhere, and to all as to myself, I dwell pervading the entire world with a mind imbued with equanimity, vast, exalted, measureless, without enmity, without ill will.

"Then, brahmin, when I am in such a state, if I walk back and forth, on that occasion my walking back and forth is divine. If I am standing, on that occasion my standing is divine. If I am sitting, on that occasion my sitting is divine. If I lie down, on that occasion this is my divine high and luxurious bed. This is that divine high and luxurious bed that at present I can gain at will, without trouble or difficulty. [184]

"It is astounding and amazing, Master Gotama! Who else, apart from Master Gotama, can gain at will, without trouble or difficulty, such a high and luxurious bed?

(3) "But, Master Gotama, what is the noble high and luxurious bed that at present you gain at will, without trouble or difficulty?"

"Here, brahmin, when I am dwelling in dependence on a village or town, in the morning I dress, take my bowl and robe, and enter that village or town for alms. After the meal, when I have returned from the alms round, I enter a grove. I collect some grass or leaves that I find there into a pile and then sit down. Having folded my legs crosswise and straightened my body, I establish mindfulness in front of me. Then I understand thus: 'I have abandoned greed, cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, obliterated it so that it is no more subject to future arising. I have abandoned hatred, cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, obliterated it so that it is no more subject to future arising. I have abandoned delusion, cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, obliterated it so that it is no more subject to future arising.'<sup>107</sup>

"Then, brahmin, when I am in such a state, if I walk back and forth, on that occasion my walking back and forth is noble. If I am standing, on that occasion my standing is noble. If I am sitting, on that occasion my sitting is noble. If I lie down, on that occasion this is my noble high and luxurious bed. This is that noble high and luxurious bed that at present I can gain at will, without trouble or difficulty.

"It is astounding and amazing, Master Gotama! Who else, apart from Master Gotama, can gain at will, without trouble or difficulty, such a noble high and luxurious bed?

"Excellent, Master Gotama! Excellent, Master Gotama! Master Gotama has made the Dhamma clear in many ways, as though he were turning upright what had been overthrown, revealing what was hidden, showing the way to one who was lost, or holding up a lamp in the darkness so those with good eyesight can see forms. We now go for refuge to Master Gotama, [185] to the Dhamma, and to the Saṅgha of bhikkhus. Let Master Gotama consider us lay followers who from today have gone for refuge for life."

64 (4) Sarabha

---

<sup>107</sup> Mp: "This shows the lust abandoned by the path of arahantship at the site of the great enlightenment. By means of reviewing he refers to the attainment of fruition."

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Rājagaha on Mount Vulture Peak. Now on that occasion a wanderer named Sarabha had recently left this Dhamma and discipline.<sup>108</sup> He had been telling an assembly in Rājagaha: "I have learned the Dhamma of the ascetics who follow the Sakyan son. After I had learned their Dhamma, I left that Dhamma and discipline."

Then, one morning, a number of bhikkhus dressed, took their bowls and robes, and entered Rājagaha for alms. They then heard the wanderer Sarabha making such a statement to an assembly in Rājagaha. When those bhikkhus had walked for alms in Rājagaha, after their meal, when they returned from their alms round, they approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said to him:

"Bhante, the wanderer Sarabha, who recently left this Dhamma and discipline, has been telling an assembly in Rājagaha: 'I have learned the Dhamma of the ascetics who follow the Sakyan son. After I had learned their Dhamma, I left that Dhamma and discipline.' It would be good, bhante, if the Blessed One would go to the wanderers' park on the bank of the Sappinikā [river] and, out of compassion, approach the wanderer Sarabha." The Blessed One consented by silence.

Then, in the evening, the Blessed One emerged from seclusion and went to the wanderers' park on the bank of the Sappinikā [river]. He approached the wanderer Sarabha, sat down on the seat that was prepared [186] for him, and said to him: "Is it true, Sarabha, that you have been saying: 'I have learned the Dhamma of the ascetics who follow the Sakyan son. After I learned their Dhamma, I left that Dhamma and discipline'?" When this was said, the wanderer Sarabha was silent.

A second time the Blessed One said to the wanderer Sarabha: "Tell me, Sarabha, how have you learned the Dhamma of the ascetics who follow the Sakyan son? If you have not learned it completely, I will complete it. But if you have learned it completely, I will rejoice." But a second time the wanderer Sarabha was silent.

A third time the Blessed One said to the wanderer Sarabha:<sup>109</sup> "Tell me, Sarabha, how have you learned the Dhamma of the ascetics who follow the Sakyan son? If you have not learned it completely, I will complete it. But if you have learned it completely, I will rejoice." But a third time the wanderer Sarabha was silent.<sup>110</sup>

---

<sup>108</sup> Mp explains that he had been commissioned by the wanderers in his own community to take ordination with the bhikkhus, learn the secret of their success (which they believed to be a kind of magic they used to attract followers), and then return and share it with them. After his ordination he concluded that the Pātimokkha was the key to their success. Having learned the Pātimokkha, he returned to the wanderers and reported that he had learned the Dhamma of the Buddha's followers. The background story is similar to that of the *Susīma Sutta* (SN 12:70, II 119–28) but with a different outcome.

<sup>109</sup> Ee has an additional line here: *mayā kho Sarabha paññāyati samañānaṃ Sakyaputtiyaṇaṃ dhammo*: "Sarabha, the Dhamma of the ascetics who follow the Sakyan son has been seen by me." Be has a variant on this line in parentheses but Ce does not have anything corresponding to it.

<sup>110</sup> At MN 35.13–14, I 231, 27–28, 32–35, it is said: "If anyone, when asked a reasonable question up to the third time by the Tathāgata, still does not answer, his head splits into seven pieces then and there."

Then those wanderers said to the wanderer Sarabha: "The ascetic Gotama has offered to give you whatever you might ask him for, friend Sarabha. Speak, friend Sarabha! How have you learned the Dhamma of the ascetics who follow the Sakyan son? If you have not learned it completely, the ascetic Gotama will complete it for you. But if you have learned it completely, he will rejoice." When this was said, the wanderer Sarabha sat silenced, disconcerted, hunched over, downcast, glum, and speechless.

Then the Blessed One, having understood that the wanderer Sarabha [sat] silenced, disconcerted, hunched over, downcast, glum, and speechless, said to those wanderers:

(1) "Wanderers, if anyone should say about me: 'Though you claim to be perfectly enlightened, you are not fully enlightened about these things,'[187] I might question him closely about this matter, interrogate him, and cross-examine him.<sup>111</sup> When he is being closely questioned by me, interrogated, and cross-examined, it is impossible and inconceivable that he would not incur one or another of three consequences: he would either answer evasively and divert the discussion to an irrelevant subject;[or] display anger, hatred, and bitterness; or would sit silenced, disconcerted, hunched over, downcast, glum, and speechless, just like the wanderer Sarabha.<sup>112</sup>

(2) "If, wanderers, anyone should say about me: 'Though you claim to be one whose taints are destroyed, you have not fully destroyed these taints,' I might question him closely about this matter, interrogate him, and cross-examine him. When he is being closely questioned by me, interrogated, and cross-examined, it is impossible and inconceivable that he would not incur one or another of three consequences: he would either answer evasively and divert the discussion to an irrelevant subject;[or] display anger, hatred, and bitterness; or would sit silenced, disconcerted, hunched over, downcast, glum, and speechless, just like the wanderer Sarabha.

(3) "If, wanderers, anyone should say about me: 'The Dhamma does not lead one who practices it to the complete destruction of suffering, the goal for the sake of which

---

Here, however, Sarabha fails to answer the Buddha's question after it has been posed three times, yet his head remains intact and no threat is raised against him.

<sup>111</sup> This is the first of the Buddha's four kinds of self-confidence (*vesārajja*), on which see 4:8. The second claim, just below, refers to the second kind of self-confidence, and the third claim to the fourth kind of self-confidence. The third kind of self-confidence is not included here.

<sup>112</sup> From the Pāli, it is unclear what the three alternatives are in this statement. In Ce the disjunctive *vā* occurs only twice in this sentence, suggesting only two alternatives. Ee has three occurrences of *vā*, but *tuñhībhūto vā mañkubhūto vā* divides two terms that normally belong to a single alternative. Be has only one *vā*, which leaves the question of the alternatives even more obscure. I have chosen to separate "he would answer evasively ..." and "display anger, hatred, and bitterness," even though we often find the sequence without a disjunction: *aññenaññam paṭicarati, bahiddhā katham apanāmeti, kopañca dosañca appaccayañca pātukaroti*. In this respect, I have followed the divisions of the Chinese parallel, SĀ 970, which at T II 250b21–23 does offer three distinct alternatives: 彼則遼落說諸外事。或忿恚慢覆。對闕不忍。無由能現。或默然抱。愧低頭。密自思省: "He would *either* divert the discussion to another subject, *or* (或) would be overcome by anger and conceit and show impatience and incapacity, *or* would silently harbor shame, with head lowered, privately reflecting."

you teach it,<sup>113</sup> I might question him closely about this matter, interrogate him, and cross-examine him. When he is being closely questioned by me, interrogated, and cross-examined, it is impossible and inconceivable that he would not incur one or another of three consequences: he would either answer evasively and divert the discussion to an irrelevant subject, [or] display anger, hatred, and bitterness, or would sit silenced, disconcerted, hunched over, downcast, glum, and speechless, just like the wanderer Sarabha."

Then the Blessed One, having roared his lion's roar three times in the wanderers' park on the bank of the Sappinikā [river], rose up into the air and departed.<sup>114</sup>

Then, soon after the Blessed One had left, those wanderers gave the wanderer Sarabha a thorough verbal lashing,<sup>115</sup> [saying:] "Just as an old jackal in a huge forest might think: 'I will roar a lion's roar,' and yet would only howl and yelp like a jackal, so, friend Sarabha, claiming in the absence of the ascetic Gotama: 'I will roar a lion's roar,' [188] you only howled and yelped like a jackal. Just as, friend Sarabha, a chick might think: 'I will sing like a cock,' and yet would only sing like a chick, so, friend Sarabha, claiming in the absence of the ascetic Gotama: 'I will sing like a cock,' you only sang like a chick.<sup>116</sup> Just as, friend Sarabha, a bull might think to bellow deeply in an empty cow shed, so, friend Sarabha, in the absence of the ascetic Gotama you thought you could bellow deeply." [In this way] those wanderers gave the wanderer Sarabha a thorough verbal lashing.

<sup>113</sup> *Yassa kho pana te atthāya dhammo desito so na niyyāti takkarassa sammā dukkhakkhayāyā ti*. Mp takes *yassa atthāya* to mean "the purpose for which" the Dhamma is taught, identified as the destruction of lust, etc., and "the Dhamma" to be meditation on unattractiveness, etc. The verb *niyyāti* means "goes out" (to the complete destruction of suffering). *Takkarassa* is likely to be a *sandhi* formation: *takkaroassa*.

I have been able to track down two Chinese versions of the phrase (there are likely to be more): (1) EĀ 27.6 (T II 645c10–11) reads 諸賢聖出要之法。盡於苦際。欲使不出要者。終無此處 ("It is impossible that the noble ones do not go out, by this outward-going Dharma, to the complete end of suffering"). (2) EĀ 46.4 (T II 776c28–777a2) has 我所說法。賢聖得出要者。如實盡於苦際。設有沙門·婆羅門·天·若魔天來欲言未盡苦際者。無此處 ("When I have said that the noble ones go out in reality to the complete end of suffering, it is impossible that any ascetic (etc.) could come and say: '[They] have not reached the complete end of suffering'").

<sup>114</sup> Here the Chinese of SĀ 970, at T II 250b28, has simply "he got up from his seat and left" (從坐起而去) without a supernormal departure.

<sup>115</sup> *Vācāya sattitodakena sañjambharim akaṃsu*. Be, Ee have *sannitodakena* for Ce *sattitokdakena*. The Chinese counterpart at T II 250c8 says simply: "they reproached him and censured him to his face" (面前呵責毀咎).

<sup>116</sup> *Seyyathāpi, āvuso sarabha, ambakamaddari 'phussakaravitam ravissāmī' ti ambakamaddariravitamyeva ravati*. Be has *ambukasañcārī* for Ce, Ee *ambakamaddari* and *purisaka* for *phussaka*. I have taken some liberty in rendering the obscure names of these birds in order to bring out the sense. Mp (Ce) glosses *ambakamaddari* as a small chicken (*khuddakakukkuṭikā*) and *phussaka* as a large chicken (*mahākukkuṭa*). The Chinese parallel, at T II 250c3, has: "Just as a woman might try to make the sound of a man but only makes the sound of a woman" (譬如女人欲作丈夫聲，發聲即作女聲). Pāli *purisakaravitam* might be understood as the crying out of a man, and *ambaka* as a woman, but in the absence of a clear and simple contrast between *ambaka* and *purisa* in the same edition, I follow Mp's gloss.

On one occasion the Blessed One was wandering on tour among the Kosalans together with a large Saṅgha of monks when he reached the town of the Kālāmas named Kesaputta. The Kālāmas of Kesaputta heard: "It is said that the ascetic Gotama, the son of the Sakyans who went forth from a Sakyan family, has arrived at Kesaputta. Now a good report about that Master Gotama has circulated thus: 'That Blessed One is an arahant, perfectly enlightened ... [as at 3:63] ... [and] reveals a spiritual life that is perfectly complete and pure.' Now it is good to see such arahants."

Then the Kālāmas of Kesaputta approached the Blessed One. Some paid homage to the Blessed One and sat down to one side ... [as at 3:63] ... some kept silent and sat down to one side. Sitting to one side, the Kālāmas said to the Blessed One:

"Bhante, there are some ascetics and brahmins who come to Kesaputta. They explain and elucidate their own doctrines, but disparage, denigrate, deride, and denounce the doctrines of others. But then some other ascetics and brahmins come to Kesaputta, [189] and they too explain and elucidate their own doctrines, but disparage, denigrate, deride, and denounce the doctrines of others. We are perplexed and in doubt, bhante, as to which of these good ascetics speak truth and which speak falsehood."

"It is fitting for you to be perplexed, Kālāmas, it is fitting for you to be in doubt. Doubt has arisen in you about a perplexing matter.<sup>118</sup> Come, Kālāmas, do not go by oral tradition, by lineage of teaching, by hearsay, by a collection of scriptures, by logical reasoning, by inferential reasoning, by reasoned cogitation, by the acceptance of a view after pondering it, by the seeming competence [of a speaker], or because you think: 'The ascetic is our guru.'<sup>119</sup> But when, Kālāmas, you know for yourselves: 'These things are

<sup>117</sup> Be *Kesamutti*. This discourse is best known under the name "The Kālāma Sutta." A Chinese parallel is MĀ 16 (at T I 438b13–439c22). I will note below some of the important ways it differs from the Pāli version.

<sup>118</sup> From the last sentence of the preceding paragraph through this sentence, MĀ 16 reads instead: "Gotama, having heard this, we gave rise to doubt and uncertainty: 'Of these ascetics or brahmins, which [speak] truthfully and which [speak] falsely?'" The Blessed One said: "Kālāmas, do not give rise to doubt and uncertainty. For what reason? Because when there is doubt and uncertainty, there will arise perplexity. Kālāmas, you yourselves do not have pure wisdom with which to know whether there is an afterlife or not. You yourselves do not have pure wisdom about what deeds are transgressions and what deeds are not transgressions."

<sup>119</sup> These ten inadequate sources of knowledge may be divided into three categories: (1) The *first*, comprising the first four criteria, are propositions based on tradition. These include "oral tradition" (*anussava*), generally understood to refer to the Vedic tradition; "lineage" (*paramparā*), an unbroken succession of teachings or teachers; "hearsay" (or "report"; *itikirā*), popular opinion or general consensus; and "a collection of scriptures" (*piṭakasampadā*), a collection of texts regarded as infallible. In the Buddha's day these would have been orally transmitted rather than written. (2) The *second* set comprises the next four terms referring to four types of reasoning; their differences need not detain us here, but since the Buddha himself often uses reasoning, they must all involve reasoning from hypothetical premises rather than from empirical observation. (3) The *third* set, consisting of the last two items, contains two types of personal authority: the first, "seeming competence" (*bhabbarūpatā*), is the personal charisma of the speaker (perhaps including his external qualifications); the second is the authority of the speaker as one's guru (Pāli *guru* being identical with Skt *guru*).

unwholesome; these things are blameworthy; these things are censured by the wise; these things, if accepted and undertaken, lead to harm and suffering,' then you should abandon them.

(1) "What do you think, Kālāmas? When greed arises in a person, is it for his welfare or for his harm?"<sup>120</sup>

"For his harm, bhante."

"Kālāmas, a greedy person, overcome by greed, with mind obsessed by it, destroys life, takes what is not given, transgresses with another's wife, and speaks falsehood; and he encourages others to do likewise. Will that lead to his harm and suffering for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

(2) "What do you think, Kālāmas? When hatred arises in a person, is it for his welfare or for his harm?"

"For his harm, bhante."

"Kālāmas, a person who is full of hate, overcome by hatred, with mind obsessed by it, destroys life ...and he encourages others to do likewise. Will that lead to his harm and suffering for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

(3) "What do you think, Kālāmas? When delusion arises in a person, is it for his welfare or for his harm?"

"For his harm, bhante." [190]

"Kālāmas, a person who is deluded, overcome by delusion, with mind obsessed by it, destroys life ...and he encourages others to do likewise. Will that lead to his harm and suffering for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

"What do you think, Kālāmas? Are these things wholesome or unwholesome?" – "Unwholesome, bhante." – "Blameworthy or blameless?" – "Blameworthy, bhante." – "Censured or praised by the wise?" – "Censured by the wise, bhante." – "Accepted and undertaken, do they lead to harm and suffering or not, or how do you take it?" – "Accepted and undertaken, these things lead to harm and suffering. So we take it."

---

MĀ 16 does not have this passage on the ten inadequate sources of knowledge. Instead, the Buddha immediately explains to the Kālāmas the three unwholesome roots of action and how they lead to moral transgressions. And then he explains the ten courses of wholesome kamma, the explanations being very similar to those found, e.g., at **10:176** (on the threefold purity) and **10:211** (on rebirth in heaven). In MĀ 16, the Buddha does not ask the Kālāmas to judge for themselves but categorically tells them what he himself has known by direct experience. It is possible that MĀ 16 is a normalization of an original Indic text corresponding to the Pāli version, made at a time when the Buddha was widely regarded as an unquestionable authority.

<sup>120</sup> According to the Buddha, greed, hatred, and delusion are the three unwholesome roots (*akusalamūlāni*), which underlie all immoral conduct and all defiled states of mind; see **3:69**. Since the goal of his own teaching, nibbāna, is the destruction of greed, hatred, and delusion (**SN 38:1, IV 251**, 16–20), the Buddha subtly leads the Kālāmas to affirm his teaching simply by reflecting on their own experience, without any need for him to impose his authority on them.

"Thus, Kālāmas, when we said: 'Come, Kālāmas, do not go by oral tradition ... But when you know for yourselves: 'These things are unwholesome; these things are blameworthy; these things are censured by the wise; these things, if undertaken and practiced, lead to harm and suffering,' then you should abandon them,' it is because of this that this was said.

"Come, Kālāmas, do not go by oral tradition, by lineage of teaching, by hearsay, by a collection of scriptures, by logical reasoning, by inferential reasoning, by reasoned cogitation, by the acceptance of a view after pondering it, by the seeming competence [of a speaker], or because you think: 'The ascetic is our guru.' But when you know for yourselves: 'These things are wholesome; these things are blameless; these things are praised by the wise; these things, if accepted and undertaken, lead to welfare and happiness,' then you should live in accordance with them.

(1) "What do you think, Kālāmas? When non-greed arises in a person, is it for his welfare or for his harm?"

"For his welfare, bhante."

"Kālāmas, a person without greed, not overcome by greed, his mind not obsessed by it, does not destroy life, take what is not given, transgress with another's wife, or speak falsehood; nor does he encourage others to do likewise. [191] Will that lead to his welfare and happiness for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

(2) "What do you think, Kālāmas? When non-hatred arises in a person, is it for his welfare or for his harm?"

"For his welfare, bhante."

"Kālāmas, a person who is without hate, not overcome by hatred, his mind not obsessed by it, does not destroy life ... nor does he encourage others to do likewise. Will that lead to his welfare and happiness for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

(3) "What do you think, Kālāmas? When non-delusion arises in a person, is it for his welfare or for his harm?"

"For his welfare, bhante."

"Kālāmas, a person who is undeluded, not overcome by delusion, his mind not obsessed by it, does not destroy life ... nor does he encourage others to do likewise. Will that lead to his welfare and happiness for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

"What do you think, Kālāmas? Are these things wholesome or unwholesome?" –  
"Wholesome, bhante." – "Blameworthy or blameless?" – "Blameless, bhante." –  
"Censured or praised by the wise?" – "Praised by the wise, bhante." – "Accepted and undertaken, do they lead to welfare and happiness or not, or how do you take it?" –  
"Accepted and undertaken, these things lead to welfare and happiness. So we take it."

"Thus, Kālāmas, when we said: 'Come, Kālāmas, do not go by oral tradition ... But when you know for yourselves: "These things are wholesome; these things are blameless; these things are praised by the wise; these things, if accepted and undertaken, lead to welfare and happiness," then you should [192] live in accordance with them,' it is because of this that this was said.

"Then, Kālāmas, that noble disciple, who is thus devoid of longing, devoid of ill will, unconfused, clearly comprehending, ever mindful, dwells pervading one quarter with a mind imbued with loving-kindness ... with a mind imbued with compassion ... with a mind imbued with altruistic joy ... with a mind imbued with equanimity, likewise the second quarter, the third quarter, and the fourth quarter. Thus above, below, across, and everywhere, and to all as to himself, he dwells pervading the entire world with a mind imbued with equanimity, vast, exalted, measureless, without enmity, without ill will.

"This noble disciple, Kālāmas, whose mind is in this way without enmity, without ill will, undefiled, and pure, has won four assurances in this very life.

"The first assurance he has won is this: 'If there is another world, and if there is the fruit and result of good and bad deeds, it is possible that with the breakup of the body, after death, I will be reborn in a good destination, in a heavenly world.'

"The second assurance he has won is this: 'If there is no other world, and there is no fruit and result of good and bad deeds, still right here, in this very life, I maintain myself in happiness, without enmity and ill will, free of trouble.

"The third assurance he has won is this: 'Suppose evil comes to one who does evil. Then, when I have no evil intentions towards anyone, how can suffering afflict me, since I do no evil deed?'<sup>121</sup>

"The fourth assurance he has won is this: 'Suppose evil does not come to one who does evil. Then right here I see myself purified in both respects.'<sup>122</sup>

"This noble disciple, Kālāmas, whose mind is in this way without enmity, without ill will, undefiled, and pure, has won these four assurances in this very life."<sup>123</sup>

---

<sup>121</sup> This is certainly counter-intuitive, at least on the basis of what is immediately visible, for cases of "bad things happening to good people" are innumerable.

<sup>122</sup> *Idhāhaṃ ubhayen'eva visuddhaṃ attānaṃ samanupassāmi*. The exact meaning of "in both respects" is not entirely clear to me. Mp glosses: "Since I do no evil, and it is not done [to me as it is] to one who does [evil]" (*yañca pāpaṃ na karomi, yañca karotopi na karīyati*)." However, it seems to me more likely that the two kinds of purification are (1) not doing any evil deeds, and (2) developing a pure mind by practice of the four immeasurable states (loving-kindness, etc.). This seems to be the purport of the Chinese parallel (see next note).

<sup>123</sup> The four assurances of MĀ 16 (at **T I 439b8-26**) are as follows: (1) "If there is this world and the other world, if there are results of good and bad deeds, I acquire the kamma connected with this right view; I uphold it and possess it. With the breakup of the body, after death, I will certainly go to a good state, even to rebirth in the heavenly realm. (2) If this world and the other world do not exist, and there are no results of good and bad deeds, still, even in this present life, I cannot be blamed by others on account of [my conduct], but I will be praised by the wise. However, those of right effort and right view say that there is [this world, the other world, and results of karma]. (3) If anything is done, certainly I do no evil, I think nothing evil. Since I do no evil, how can suffering arise for me? (4) If anything is done, certainly I do no evil. I do not transgress against what is fearful and not fearful in the world. I always have love and



"So it is, Blessed One! So it is, Fortunate One! This noble disciple whose mind is in this way without enmity, without ill will, undefiled, and pure, [193] has won four assurances in this very life.

"The first assurance he has won ... [as above, down to:] ... The fourth assurance he has won is this: 'Suppose evil does not befall the evil-doer. Then right here I see myself purified in both respects.'

"This noble disciple, bhante, whose mind is in this way without enmity, without ill will, undefiled, and pure, has won these four assurances in this very life.

"Excellent, bhante! ... We go for refuge to the Blessed One, to the Dhamma, and to the Saṅgha of bhikkhus. Let the Blessed One consider us lay followers who from today have gone for refuge for life."

## 66 (6) Sālha

Thus have I heard. On one occasion the Venerable Nandaka was dwelling at Sāvattthī in Migāramāta's Mansion in the Eastern Park. Then Sālha, Migāra's grandson, and Rohaṇa, Pekkuniya's grandson, approached the Venerable Nandaka, paid homage to him, and sat down to one side. The Venerable Nandaka then said to Sālha:

"Come, Sālha, do not go by oral tradition, by lineage of teaching, by hearsay, by a collection of scriptures, by logical reasoning, by inferential reasoning, by reasoned cogitation, by the acceptance of a view after pondering it, by the seeming competence [of a speaker], or because you think: 'The ascetic is our guru.' But when you [194] know for yourselves: 'These things are unwholesome; these things are blameworthy; these things are censured by the wise; these things, if accepted and undertaken, lead to harm and suffering,' then you should abandon them.

(1) "What do you think, Sālha, is there greed?"

"Yes, bhante."

"I say this means longing. A greedy person, full of longing, destroys life, takes what is not given, transgresses with another's wife, and speaks falsehood; and he encourages others to do likewise. Will that lead to his harm and suffering for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

(2) "What do you think, Sālha, is there hatred?"

"Yes, bhante."

"I say this means ill will. A person full of hate, with a mind of ill will, destroys life ... and he encourages others to do likewise. Will that lead to his harm and suffering for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

---

compassion for the whole world. My mind has no belligerence towards sentient beings; it is without stains, joyful and happy."

(3) "What do you think, Sālha, is there delusion?"

"Yes, bhante."

"I say this means ignorance. A deluded person, immersed in ignorance, destroys life ...and he encourages others to do likewise. Will that lead to his harm and suffering for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

"What do you think, Sālha? Are these things wholesome or unwholesome?" – "Unwholesome, bhante." – "Blameworthy or blameless?" – "Blameworthy, bhante." – "Censured or praised by the wise?" – "Censured by the wise, bhante." – "Accepted and undertaken, do they lead to harm and suffering or not, or how do you take it?"[195] – "Accepted and undertaken, these things lead to harm and suffering. So we take it."

"Thus, Sālha, when we said: 'Come, Sālha, do not go by oral tradition ... But when you know for yourselves: 'These things are unwholesome; these things are blameworthy; these things are censured by the wise; these things, if undertaken and practiced, lead to harm and suffering,' then you should abandon them,' it is because of this that this was said.

"Come, Sālha, do not go by oral tradition, by lineage of teaching, by hearsay, by a collection of scriptures, by logical reasoning, by inferential reasoning, by reasoned cogitation, by the acceptance of a view after pondering it, by the seeming competence [of a speaker], or because you think: 'The ascetic is our guru.' But when you know for yourselves: 'These things are wholesome; these things are blameless; these things are praised by the wise; these things, if accepted and undertaken, lead to welfare and happiness,' then you should live in accordance with them.

(1) "What do you think, Sālha, is there non-greed?"

"Yes, bhante."

"I say this means absence of longing. A person without greed, without longing, does not destroy life, take what is not given, transgress with another's wife, or speak falsehood; nor does he encourage others to do likewise. Will that lead to his welfare and happiness for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

(2) "What do you think, Sālha, is there non-hatred?"

"Yes, bhante."

"I say this means non-ill will. A person without hate, with a mind free of ill will, does not destroy life ...nor does he encourage others to do likewise. Will that lead to his welfare and happiness for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

(3) "What do you think, Sālha, is there non-delusion?"

"Yes, bhante."

"I say this means true knowledge. Anundeluded person, [196] who has arrived at true knowledge, does not destroy life ... nor does he encourage others to do likewise. Will that lead to his welfare and happiness for a long time?"

"Yes, bhante."

"What do you think, Sālha? Are these things wholesome or unwholesome?" – "Wholesome, bhante." – "Blameworthy or blameless?" – "Blameless, bhante." – "Censured or praised by the wise?" – "Praised by the wise, bhante." – "Accepted and undertaken, do they lead to welfare and happiness or not, or how do you take it?" – "Accepted and undertaken, these things lead to welfare and happiness. So we take it."

"Thus, Sālha, when we said: 'Come, Sālha, do not go by oral tradition ... But when you know for yourselves: "These things are wholesome; these things are blameless; these things are praised by the wise; these things, if accepted and undertaken, lead to welfare and happiness," then you should live in accordance with them,' it is because of this that this was said.

"Then, Sālha, that noble disciple, who is thus devoid of longing, devoid of ill will, unconfused, clearly comprehending, ever mindful, dwells pervading one quarter with a mind imbued with loving-kindness ... with a mind imbued with compassion ... with a mind imbued with altruistic joy ... with a mind imbued with equanimity, likewise the second quarter, the third quarter, and the fourth quarter. Thus above, below, across, and everywhere, and to all as to himself, he dwells pervading the entire world with a mind imbued with equanimity, vast, exalted, measureless, without enmity, without ill will.

"He then understands thus: 'There is this; there is the inferior; there is the superior; there is a further escape from whatever is involved with perception.'<sup>124</sup> When he knows and sees thus, his mind is liberated from the taint of sensuality, from the taint of existence, and from the taint of ignorance. [197] When it is liberated there comes the knowledge: '[It's] liberated.' He understands: 'Destroyed is birth, the spiritual life has been lived, what had to be done has been done, there is no more coming back to any state of being.'

"He understands thus: 'Formerly, there was greed; that was unwholesome. Now there is none; thus this is wholesome. Formerly, there was hatred; that was unwholesome. Now there is none; thus this is wholesome. Formerly, there was delusion; that was unwholesome. Now there is none; thus this is wholesome.'

"Thus in this very life he dwells hungerless, quenched and cooled, experiencing bliss, having himself become divine."<sup>125</sup>

---

<sup>124</sup> *Atthi idaṃ, atthi hīnaṃ, atthi paṇītaṃ, atthi imassa saññāgatassa uttari nissaraṇaṃ.* This is also at MN 7.17, I 38,31–32, where it also follows the four divine abodes. Mp says "there is this" refers to the five aggregates, the truth of suffering; "the inferior" to the truth of the origin; "the superior" to the truth of the path; and "a further escape from whatever is involved with perception" to nibbāna, the truth of cessation.

<sup>125</sup> *Brahmabhūtena attanā viharati.* The whole phrase is also at 4:198, II 206,2–4, and MN 51.5, I 341,11–13. It seems to be a deliberate attempt by the Buddha to co-opt Upanishad terminology for the purposes of his own teaching.

## 67 (7) Bases of Talk

"Bhikkhus, there are these three bases of talk. What three? (1) Referring to the past, one would say: 'So it was in the past.' (2) Referring to the future, one would say: 'So it will be in the future.' (3) Referring to the present, one would say: 'So it is now, at present.'

"It is in relation to talk, bhikkhus, that a person may be understood as either fit to talk or unfit to talk. If this person is asked a question that should be answered categorically and he does not answer it categorically; [if he is asked] a question that should be answered after making a distinction and he answers it without making a distinction; [if he is asked] a question that should be answered with a counter-question and he answers it without asking a counter-question; [if he is asked] a question that should be set aside and he does not set it aside, in such a case this person is unfit to talk.<sup>126</sup>

"But if this person is asked a question that should be answered categorically and he answers it categorically; [if he is asked] a question that should be answered after making a distinction and he answers it after making a distinction; [if he is asked] a question that should be answered with a counter-question and he answers it with a counter-question; [if he is asked] a question that should be set aside and he sets it aside, in such a case this person is fit to talk.

"It is in relation to talk, bhikkhus, that a person should be understood as either fit to talk or unfit to talk. If this person is asked a question and he does not stand firm in regard to his position and the opposing position; if he does not stand firm in his stratagem; if he does not [198] stand firm in an assertion about what is known; if he does not stand firm in the procedure, in such a case this person is unfit to talk.<sup>127</sup>

<sup>126</sup> These are the four methods of formulating questions; see 4:42. Mp: "(1) A question that should be answered categorically (*ekamsavyākaraṇīya pañha*) is, for example, 'Is the eye impermanent?' which should be answered categorically with 'Yes, it is impermanent.' (2) A question that should be answered after making a distinction (*vibhajjavyākaraṇīya pañha*) is, for example, 'Is the impermanent the eye?' which should be answered by making a distinction: 'Not only the eye, but the ear, nose, etc., are also impermanent.' (3) A question that should be answered with a counter-question (*paṭipucchāvyākaraṇīya pañha*) is, for example, 'Does the eye have the same nature as the ear?' One should answer this by asking, 'With respect to what?' If they reply, 'With respect to seeing,' one should answer no. If they reply, 'With respect to impermanence,' one should answer yes. (4) A question that should be set aside (*thapanīya pañha*) is, for example, 'Is the soul the same as the body?' This should be set aside without answering it, saying, 'This has not been declared by the Tathāgata.'" In my opinion, better examples of "a question that should be answered after making a distinction" are the Buddha's response to Subha at MN 99.4, II 197,9-18; his response to the brahmin Ujjaya at 4:39, II 42,14-28; and the householder Vajjiyamāhita's response to the wanderers at 10:94, V 190,14-20.

<sup>127</sup> The meaning of these expressions is far from self-evident. I have therefore relied on Mp, which I translate in full, omitting only a few minor explanations meaningful only in Pāli:

"One does not stand firm in regard to his position and the opposing position (*thānāthāne na saṇṭhātī*): One does not stand firm in regard to what is a reason and what is not a reason. This is the method here: An eternalist is able to refute an annihilationist with a fitting reason. Being refuted by him, the annihilationist thinks, 'Why should I now continue to assert annihilation?' He then proclaims eternalism; he is unable to remain fixed in his own doctrine. So too, when an annihilationist is able [to refute] the eternalist [and the latter does not stand firm]; and similarly, when an advocate of personalism is able [to

"But if this person is asked a question and he stands firm in regard to his position and the opposing position; if he stands firm in his stratagem; if he stands firm in an assertion about what is known; if he stands firm in the procedure, in such a case this person is fit to talk.

"It is in relation to talk, bhikkhus, that a person should be understood as either fit to talk or unfit to talk. If this person is asked a question and he answers evasively, diverts the discussion to an irrelevant subject, and displays anger, hatred, and bitterness, in such a case this person is unfit to talk.

"But if this person is asked a question and he does not answer evasively, divert the discussion to an irrelevant subject, or display anger, hatred, and bitterness, in such a case this person is fit to talk.

"It is in relation to talk, bhikkhus, that a person should be understood as either fit to talk or unfit to talk. If this person is asked a question and he overwhelms [the questioner], crushes him, ridicules him, and seizes upon a slight error,<sup>128</sup> in such a case this person is unfit to talk.

"But if this person is asked a question and he does not overwhelm [the questioner], or crush him, or ridicule him, or seize upon a slight error, in such a case this person is fit to talk.

---

refute the emptiness doctrine], and when an advocate of emptiness is able [to refute personalism]. Such is what is meant by saying that he does not stand firm in regard to his position and the opposing position." (Could this mean, rather, that he does not stand firm in regard to what is actually the case and what is not the case, or in regard to what is possible and what is not possible? These are also meanings, respectively, of *ṭhāna* and *aṭṭhāna*.)

"*He does not stand firm in his stratagem (parikappe na saṅṭhāti)*: This is found both in asking the question and in answering it. How? For someone clears his throat, thinking: 'I will ask a question.' The other tells him: 'You will ask this.' Having realized he has been found out, he says: 'I won't ask that, but something else.' The one who is asked a question, too, strokes his chin, thinking: 'I will answer the question.' The other tells him: 'You will answer this.' Having realized he has been found out, he says: 'I won't answer in that way, but in this way.' Such is what is meant by saying that he does not stand firm in his stratagem.

"*He does not stand firm in an assertion about what is known (aññātavāde na saṅṭhāti)*: Someone asks a question. The other says: 'The question you asked is agreeable. Where did you learn this?' The other, though he has asked a question in a fitting way, gives rise to doubt because of [his opponent's] statement, thinking: 'Did I ask [about a matter] that isn't problematic?' The one who has been asked the question answers. The other says to him: 'You have answered the question well. Where did you learn this? [You answered] the question as it should be answered.' The other [the respondent], though he has answered in a fitting way, gives rise to doubt because of [his opponent's] statement, thinking: 'Did I answer [about a matter] that isn't problematic?'

"*He does not stand firm in the procedure (paṭipadāya na saṅṭhāti)*: Not having understood the rule (*vattaṃ ajānitvā*), he asks under circumstances when a question should not be asked. If a question is asked in the courtyard of a memorial shrine (*cetiyaṅgana*), one should not answer it. So too, [one should not answer] on the way to the alms round; when walking for alms in the village; when sitting in the meeting hall; when sitting and taking porridge or a meal; when sitting after the meal; and when going to the place where one passes the day. However, when one is sitting in one's day quarters, if someone asks permission and then poses a question, it should be answered; but one should not answer if they do not ask permission. Such is what is meant by: 'Asking a question without having understood the rule, he does not stand firm in the procedure.'"

<sup>128</sup> That is, he seizes upon a slight mistake on the other's part as a pretext for criticizing him.

"It is in relation to talk, bhikkhus, that a person should be understood as either having a supporting condition or not having a supporting condition. One who does not lend an ear does not have a supporting condition; one who lends an ear has a supporting condition. One who has a supporting condition directly knows one thing, fully understands one thing, abandons one thing, and realizes one thing. Directly knowing one thing, fully understanding one thing, abandoning one thing, and realizing one thing, he reaches right liberation.<sup>129</sup>

"This, bhikkhus, is the goal of talk, the goal of discussion, the goal of a supporting condition, the goal of lending an ear, that is, the emancipation of the mind through non-clinging." [199]

Those who speak with quarrelsome intent,  
settled in their opinions, swollen with pride,  
ignoble, having assailed virtues,<sup>130</sup>  
look for openings [to attack] one another.

They mutually delight when their opponent  
speaks badly and makes a mistake,  
[they rejoice] in his bewilderment and defeat;  
but noble ones don't engage in such talk.

If a wise person wants to talk,  
having known the time is right,  
without quarrelsomeness or pride,  
the sagely person should utter  
the speech that the noble ones practice,  
which is connected with the Dhamma and meaning.<sup>131</sup>

<sup>129</sup> Mp: "He directly knows one thing, a wholesome Dhamma, the noble path. He fully understands one thing, the truth of suffering. He abandons one thing, all unwholesome qualities. He realizes one thing, the fruit of arahantship or [the truth of] cessation. By means of knowledge he reaches right liberation, emancipation by the fruit of arahantship."

<sup>130</sup> *Anariyaguṇam āsajja*. The line is problematic. As printed, it would be translated: "Having attacked ignoble qualities." But *guṇa* usually means virtuous qualities. Mp gives an unconvincing explanation: "They give a talk using ignoble qualities to attack qualities." I translate on the supposition that the correct reading of the line should be *anariyā guṇam āsajja*, "the ignoble ones assail [good] qualities." A Chinese parallel, MĀ 119 at T I 609a8–b29, closely matches the Pāli in regard to the verses, and the corresponding line (609b15) accords with my interpretation: 非聖毀善德 ("the ignoble censure virtues").

<sup>131</sup> *Dhammaṭṭhapaṭisaṃyuttā yā ariyācaritā kathā*. Mp explains *dhammaṭṭhapaṭisaṃyuttā* thus: "The talk is made by one established in the Dhamma, thus it is established in the Dhamma; and [the talk] is connected with the Dhamma, so it is established in and connected with the Dhamma." Mp thus takes *dhammaṭṭha* to be a compound of *dhamme* *ṭhita*. I translate, however, on the assumption that *dhammaṭṭhapaṭisaṃyuttā* contains a *dvanda* compound that should be resolved *dhammena ca aṭṭhena ca paṭisaṃyuttā*. In explanations of right speech, it is often said that the virtuous person is *atthavādī* *dhammavādī*, "one who speaks what is beneficial (or 'meaningful'), one who speaks on the Dhamma"; see 3:69, I 204,4; 10:176§7.

Not being insolent or aggressive,  
with a mind not elated,<sup>132</sup>  
he speaks free from envy  
on the basis of right knowledge.  
He should approve of what is well expressed  
but should not attack what is badly stated.

He should not train in faultfinding  
nor seize on the other's mistakes;  
he should not overwhelm and crush his opponent,  
nor speak mendacious words.  
Truly, a discussion among the good  
is for the sake of knowledge and confidence.

Such is the way the noble discuss things;  
this is the discussion of the noble ones.  
Having understood this, the wise person  
should not swell up but should discuss things.

## 68 (8) Other Sects

"Bhikkhus, wanderers of other sects may ask you: 'Friends, there are these three things. What three? Greed, hatred, and delusion. These are the three. What, friends, is the distinction, the disparity, the difference between them?' If you are asked this, how would you answer?"

"Bhante, our teachings are rooted in the Blessed One, guided by the Blessed One, take recourse in the Blessed One. It would be good if the Blessed One would clear up the meaning of this statement. Having heard it from him, the bhikkhus will retain it in mind."

"Then listen, bhikkhus, and attend closely. I will speak."

"Yes, bhante," those bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

"Bhikkhus, if wanderers of other sects should ask you such a question, [200] you should answer them as follows: 'Lust, friends, is slightly blameworthy but slow to fade

---

V 267,22. It is unusual—but not exceptional—to find *aṭṭha* in place of *attha* with the sense of "meaning" or "benefit"; it would be more unusual to find the termination *ṭha* embedded inside a compound and followed by a past participle. The Chinese parallel, which I discovered only after I had made my translation, supports my understanding here. At T I 609b19 we read: 有法亦有義諸聖論如是, "talk that has Dhamma and that has meaning: it is such that noble ones speak." The character 義, like Pāli *attha*, means both "good" and "meaning," and 有義 can mean either "beneficial" or "meaningful."

<sup>132</sup> I read here with Be *anunnatena manasā*, as against Ce, Ee *anupādinna manasā*. Mp (both Ce and Be) glosses with *anuddhatena cetasā*, which supports *anunnatena manasā*.

away; hatred is very blameworthy but quick to fade away; delusion is very blameworthy and slow to fade away.<sup>133</sup>

(1) "[Suppose they ask:] 'But, friends, what is the reason unarisen lust arises and arisen lust increases and expands?' You should answer: 'An attractive object. For one who attends carelessly to an attractive object, unarisen lust arises and arisen lust increases and expands. This, friends, is the reason unarisen lust arises and arisen lust increases and expands.'

(2) "[Suppose they ask:] 'But what, friends, is the reason unarisen hatred arises and arisen hatred increases and expands?' You should answer: 'A repulsive object. For one who attends carelessly to a repulsive object, unarisen hatred arises and arisen hatred increases and expands. This, friends, is the reason unarisen hatred arises and arisen hatred increases and expands.'

(3) "[Suppose they ask:] 'But what, friends, is the reason unarisen delusion arises and arisen delusion increases and expands?' You should answer: 'Careless attention. For one who attends carelessly, unarisen delusion arises and arisen delusion increases and expands. This, friends, is the reason unarisen delusion arises and arisen delusion increases and expands.'

(1) "[Suppose they ask:] 'But what, friends, is the reason unarisen lust does not arise and arisen lust is abandoned?' You should answer: 'An unattractive object. For one who attends carefully to an unattractive object, unarisen lust does not arise [201] and arisen lust is abandoned. This, friends, is the reason unarisen lust does not arise and arisen lust is abandoned.'

(2) "[Suppose they ask:] 'But what, friends, is the reason unarisen hatred does not arise and arisen hatred is abandoned?' You should answer: 'The liberation of the mind by loving-kindness. For one who attends carefully to the liberation of the mind by loving-kindness, unarisen hatred does not arise and arisen hatred is abandoned. This, friends, is the reason unarisen hatred does not arise and arisen hatred is abandoned.'

(3) "[Suppose they ask:] 'But what, friends, is the reason unarisen delusion does not arise and arisen delusion is abandoned?' You should answer: 'Careful attention. For one who attends carefully, unarisen delusion does not arise and arisen delusion is abandoned. This, friends, is the reason unarisen delusion does not arise and arisen delusion is abandoned.'"

## 69 (9) Roots

---

<sup>133</sup> Mp illustrates how lust is "less blameworthy" with the example of marriage, which, though rooted in sexual desire, is socially accepted and thus less blameworthy in regard to its kammic consequences. But since lust is connected with pleasure, it is hard to remove. Hatred and delusion are both regarded as blamable in society and have serious kammic consequences. Hatred, however, is connected with displeasure, and since beings naturally desire happiness they want to be rid of it. Delusive ideas, if deeply rooted in craving, wrong views, or conceit, will be as hard to remove as lust.



"Bhikkhus, there are these three unwholesome roots. What three? The unwholesome root, greed; the unwholesome root, hatred; and the unwholesome root, delusion.

(1) "Whatever greed occurs, bhikkhus, is unwholesome. Whatever [deed] a greedy person performs by body, speech, and mind is also unwholesome. When a greedy person, overcome by greed, with mind obsessed by it, inflicts suffering upon another under a false pretext<sup>134</sup>—by killing, imprisonment, confiscation, censure, or banishment—[thinking]: 'I am powerful, I want power,' that too is unwholesome. Thus numerous bad unwholesome qualities originate in him born of greed, caused by greed, arisen from greed, conditioned by greed.

(2) "Whatever hatred occurs is unwholesome. Whatever [deed] a person full of hate performs by body, speech, and mind is also unwholesome. When a person full of hate, overcome by hatred, with mind obsessed by it, inflicts suffering upon another under a false pretext ... [thinking]: 'I am powerful, [202] I want power,' that too is unwholesome. Thus numerous bad unwholesome qualities originate in him born of hatred, caused by hatred, arisen from hatred, conditioned by hatred.

(3) "Whatever delusion occurs is unwholesome. Whatever [deed] a deluded person performs by body, speech, and mind is also unwholesome. When a deluded person, overcome by delusion, with mind obsessed by it, inflicts suffering upon another under a false pretext ... [thinking]: 'I am powerful and I want power,' that too is unwholesome. Thus numerous bad unwholesome qualities originate in him born of delusion, caused by delusion, arisen from delusion, conditioned by delusion.

"Such a person, bhikkhus, is called one who speaks at an improper time, who speaks falsely, who speaks what is unbeneficial, who speaks non-Dhamma, who speaks non-discipline. And why is such a person called one who speaks at an improper time ... who speaks non-discipline? This person inflicts suffering upon another under false pretexts—by killing, imprisonment, confiscation, censure, or banishment—thinking: 'I am powerful, I want power.' Thus when spoken to in accordance with fact, he despises [the one who reproaches him]; he does not admit [his faults]. When spoken to contrary to fact, he does not make an effort to unravel what is said to him: 'For such and such a reason this is untrue; for such and such a reason this is contrary to fact.' Therefore such a person is called one who speaks at an improper time, who speaks falsely, who speaks what is unbeneficial, who speaks non-Dhamma, who speaks non-discipline.

"Such a person, overcome by bad unwholesome qualities born of greed ... born of hatred ... born of delusion, with his mind obsessed by them, dwells in suffering in this very life, with distress, anguish, and fever, and with the breakup of the body, after death, a bad destination can be expected for him.

---

<sup>134</sup> *Asatā dukkham upadahati*. Mp (Ce): "He creates suffering by falsehood, by what is non-existent, having spoken about an unreal fault" (*abhūtena avijjamānena yaṃ kiñci tassa abhūtaṃ dosaṃ vatvā dukkham uppādeti*). Note that Mp takes *asatā* to be synonymous with *abhūtena*. In both text and Mp, Be reads *uppādayati* whereas Ce and Ee have *upadahati*.

"Suppose a tree<sup>135</sup> was choked and enveloped by three *māluvā* creepers. It would meet with calamity, with disaster, with calamity and disaster. So too, such a person overcome by bad unwholesome qualities born of greed [203] ... born of hatred ... born of delusion, with his mind obsessed by them, dwells in suffering in this very life, with distress, anguish, and fever, and with the breakup of the body, after death, a bad destination can be expected for him. These are the three unwholesome roots.

"There are, bhikkhus, these three wholesome roots. What three? The wholesome root, non-greed; the wholesome root, non-hatred; and the wholesome root, non-delusion.

(1) "Whatever non-greed occurs, bhikkhus, is wholesome. Whatever [deed] one without greed performs by body, speech, and mind is also wholesome. When one without greed, not overcome by greed, with mind not obsessed by it, does not inflict suffering upon another under false pretexts—by killing, imprisonment, confiscation, censure, or banishment—thinking: 'I am powerful, I want power,' that too is wholesome. Thus numerous wholesome qualities originate in him born of non-greed, caused by non-greed, arisen from non-greed, conditioned by non-greed.

(2) "Whatever non-hatred occurs is wholesome. Whatever [deed] one without hate performs by body, speech, and mind is also wholesome. When one without hate, not overcome by hatred, with mind not obsessed by it, does not inflict suffering upon another under false pretexts ... that too is wholesome. Thus numerous wholesome qualities originate in him born of non-hatred, caused by non-hatred, arisen from non-hatred, conditioned by non-hatred.

(3) "Whatever non-delusion occurs is wholesome. Whatever [deed] one who is undeluded performs by body, speech, and mind is also wholesome. When one who is undeluded, not overcome by delusion, with mind not obsessed by it, does not inflict suffering upon another under false pretexts ... that too is wholesome. Thus [204] numerous wholesome qualities originate in him born of non-delusion, caused by non-delusion, arisen from non-delusion, conditioned by non-delusion.

"Such a person, bhikkhus, is called one who speaks at the proper time, who speaks in accordance with fact, who speaks what is beneficial, who speaks Dhamma, who speaks discipline. And why is such a person called one who speaks at the proper time ... who speaks discipline? This person does not inflict suffering upon another under false pretexts—by killing, imprisonment, confiscation, censure, or banishment—thinking: 'I am powerful, I want power.' Thus when spoken to in accordance with fact, he admits [his faults]; he does not despise [the one who reproaches him]. When spoken to contrary to fact, he makes an effort to unravel what is said to him: 'For such and such a reason this is untrue; for such and such a reason this is contrary to fact.' Therefore such a person is called one who speaks at the proper time, who speaks in accordance with fact, who speaks what is beneficial, who speaks Dhamma, who speaks discipline.

---

135

Here and below the text mentions three kinds of trees: the *sāla*, the *dhava*, and the *phandana*.

"Such a person has abandoned the bad unwholesome qualities born of greed ... born of hatred ... born of delusion, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, obliterated them so that they are no more subject to future arising. He dwells happily in this very life, without distress, anguish, or fever, and in this very life he attains nibbāna.

"Suppose a tree was choked and enveloped by three *māluvā* creepers. Then a man would come along bringing a shovel and a basket. He would cut down the creepers at their roots, dig them up, and pull out the roots, even the fine rootlets and root-fiber. He would cut the creepers into pieces, split the pieces, and reduce them to slivers. Then he would dry the slivers in the wind and sun, burn them in a fire, [205] reduce them to ashes, and winnow the ashes in a strong wind or let them be carried away by the swift current of a river. In this way, those *māluvā* creepers would be cut off at the root, made like a palm stump, obliterated so that they are no more subject to future arising.

"So too, bhikkhus, such a person has abandoned the bad unwholesome qualities born of greed ... born of hatred ... born of delusion, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, obliterated them so that they are no more subject to future arising. He dwells happily in this very life, without distress, anguish, or fever, and in this very life he attains final nibbāna. These are the three wholesome roots."

#### 70 (10) *Upasatha*

Thus have I heard. On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Sāvattihī in Migāramātā's Mansion in the Eastern Park. Then Visākhā Migāramātā, on the day of the *uposatha*, approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, and sat down to one side. The Blessed One then said to her:

"Why, Visākhā, have you come in the middle of the day?"

"Today, bhante, I am observing the *uposatha*."

"There are, Visākhā, three kinds of *uposathas*. What three? The cowherds' *uposatha*, the Nigaṇṭhas' *uposatha*,<sup>136</sup> and the noble ones' *uposatha*.

(1) "And how, Visākhā, is the cowherds' *uposatha* observed? Suppose, Visākhā, in the evening a cowherd returns the cows to their owners. He reflects thus: 'Today the cows grazed in such and such a place and drank water in such and such a place. Tomorrow the cows will graze in such and such a place and drink water in such and such a place.' So too, someone here observing the *uposatha* reflects thus: 'Today I ate this and that food; today I ate a meal of this and that kind. [206] Tomorrow I will eat this and that food; tomorrow I will eat a meal of this and that kind.' He thereby passes the day with greed and longing in his mind. It is in such a way that the cowherds' *uposatha* is observed. The

---

<sup>136</sup> The Nigaṇṭhas are the Jain ascetics, followers of Mahāvīra, the best known teacher of Jainism, known in the Nikāyas as the Nigaṇṭha Nātaputta (Nāthaputta, Nātaputta). He was a contemporary of the Buddha and is included among the six rival teachers (see DN 2.16–33, I 52–59). It will be noted how, whenever the Nikāyas discuss the Jains, their tone becomes satirical if not scornful.

cowherds'*uposatha*, thus observed, is not of great fruit and benefit, nor is it extraordinarily brilliant and pervasive.

(2) "And how, Visākhā, is the Nigaṇṭhas'*uposatha* observed? There are, Visākhā, ascetics called Nigaṇṭhas. They enjoin their disciples thus: 'Come, good man, lay down the rod towards living beings dwelling more than a hundred *yojanas*' distance in the eastern quarter.<sup>137</sup> Lay down the rod towards living beings dwelling more than a hundred *yojanas*' distance in the western quarter. Lay down the rod towards living beings dwelling more than a hundred *yojanas*' distance in the northern quarter. Lay down the rod towards living beings dwelling more than a hundred *yojanas*' distance in the southern quarter.' Thus they enjoin them to be sympathetic and compassionate towards some living beings, but not to others. On the *uposatha* day, they enjoin their disciples thus: 'Come, good man, having laid aside all clothes, recite: 'I am not anywhere the belonging of anyone, nor is there anywhere anything in any place that is mine.'<sup>138</sup> However, his parents know: 'This is our son.' And he knows: 'These are my parents.' His wife and children know: 'He is our supporter.' And he knows: 'These are my wife and children.' His slaves, workers, and servants know: 'He is our master.' And he knows: 'These are my slaves, workers, and servants.' Thus on an occasion when they should be enjoined in truthfulness, [the Nigaṇṭhas] enjoin them in false speech. This, I say, is false speech. When that night has passed, he makes use of possessions that have not been given. This, I say, is taking what has not been given. It is in such a way that the Nigaṇṭhas'*uposatha* is observed. When one has observed the *uposatha* in the way of the Nigaṇṭhas, the *uposatha* is not of great fruit and benefit, nor is it extraordinarily brilliant and pervasive.

(3) "And how, Visākhā, is the noble ones'*uposatha* observed? [207] The defiled mind is cleansed by exertion.<sup>139</sup> And how is the defiled mind cleansed by exertion? Here,

<sup>137</sup> *Ye puratthimāya disāya pāṇā param yojanasataṃ tesu daṇḍaṃ nikkhipāhi*. Mp explains this as if it meant "having gone farther than a hundred *yojanas*" (*yojanasataṃ atikkamitvā tato param*). A *yojana* is appx. six miles. Thus the Jains seem to be saying here, "Don't inflict violence on beings living far away from you." This seems a misrepresentation of the Jain teaching, which strictly emphasizes non-harming (*ahiṃsā*) towards all living beings and analyzes the practice of non-harming in minute detail. See in this connection: <http://www.jainworld.com/philosophy/ahimsa.asp>.

<sup>138</sup> *Nāhaṃ kvaṇa, kassaci kiñcanatasmim, na ca mama kvaṇa, katthaci kiñcanatātthi*. Ce, Be, and Ee differ slightly among themselves in their reading of this formula. I follow Ce here and later at **4:185**. The purpose of the formula, according to this text, is to instill an attitude of non-possessiveness, one of the basic Jain virtues. The Buddha also taught this formula—which may have been in circulation among various contemplative communities—using it as a means to eliminate "I-making" and "mine-making." I discuss the terms in more detail in **Fours <n. 279>**.

<sup>139</sup> *Upakkiliṭṭhassa visākhē cittassa upakkamena pariyodapanā hoti*. Mp: "Why does he say this? Because the *uposatha* is not very fruitful if one observes it with a defiled mind, but becomes very fruitful if it is observed with a purified mind. He thus makes this statement to introduce the meditation subjects to be used for purifying the mind." What follows here are five of the standard six recollections (*cha anussatiyo*; see **6:10, etc.**). For some reason, the sixth recollection, of generosity (*cāgānussati*), is omitted. The omission would seem, at first blush, to result from a fault in transmission. However, the Chinese parallel, MĀ 202 (at T I 770a16–773a1), also lacks this recollection, which suggests that the omission—whether accidental or deliberate—preceded the split between the Vibhajjavādins (the ancestors of the Theravāda) and the Sarvāstivādins. Interestingly, in MĀ 202 the eight precepts *precede* the five recollections, while the

Visākhā, a noble disciple recollects the Tathāgata thus: 'The Blessed One is an arahant, perfectly enlightened, accomplished in true knowledge and conduct, fortunate, knower of the world, unsurpassed trainer of persons to be tamed, teacher of devas and humans, the Enlightened One, the Blessed One.' When a noble disciple recollects the Tathāgata, his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned in the same way that one's head, when dirty, is cleansed by exertion.

"And how, Visākhā, does one cleanse a dirty head by exertion? By means of cleansing paste, clay, water, and the appropriate effort by the person. It is in such a way that one's head, when dirty, is cleansed by exertion. So too, the defiled mind is cleansed by exertion. And how is the defiled mind cleansed by exertion? Here, Visākhā, a noble disciple recollects the Tathāgata thus: 'The Blessed One is ... teacher of devas and humans, the Enlightened One, the Blessed One.' When a noble disciple recollects the Tathāgata, his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned. This is called a noble disciple who observes the *uposatha* of Brahmā, who dwells together with Brahmā, and it is by considering Brahmā that his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned.<sup>140</sup> It is in this way that ś.

"The defiled mind, Visākhā, is cleansed by exertion. And how is the defiled mind cleansed by exertion? Here, Visākhā, a noble disciple recollects the Dhamma thus: 'The Dhamma is well expounded by the Blessed One, directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise.' When a noble disciple recollects the Dhamma, his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind [208] are abandoned in the same way that one's body, when dirty, is cleansed by exertion.

"And how, Visākhā, does one cleanse a dirty body by exertion? By means of a bathing brush, lime powder, water, and the appropriate effort by the person. It is in such a way that one's body, when dirty, is cleansed by exertion. So too, the defiled mind is cleansed by exertion. And how is the defiled mind cleansed by exertion? Here, Visākhā, a noble disciple recollects the Dhamma thus: 'The Dhamma is well expounded by the Blessed One... to be personally experienced by the wise.' When a noble disciple recollects the Dhamma, his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned. This is called a noble disciple who observes the *uposatha* of the Dhamma, who dwells together with the Dhamma, and it is by considering the Dhamma that his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned. It is in this way that the defiled mind is cleansed by exertion.

"The defiled mind, Visākhā, is cleansed by exertion. And how is the defiled mind cleansed by exertion? Here, Visākhā, a noble disciple recollects the Saṅgha thus: 'The

---

Pāli has the sets in reverse. The sequence of the Chinese version is more consistent with other Buddhist teachings, which treat virtuous conduct as the basis for meditation.

<sup>140</sup> Mp: "It is the perfectly enlightened Buddha who is called Brahmā" (*brahmā vuccati sammā sambuddho*).

Saṅgha of the Blessed One's disciples is practicing the good way, practicing the straight way, practicing the true way, practicing the proper way; that is, the four pairs of persons, the eight types of individuals—this Saṅgha of the Blessed One's disciples is worthy of gifts, worthy of hospitality, worthy of offerings, worthy of reverential salutation, the unsurpassed field of merit for the world.' When a noble disciple recollects the Saṅgha, his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned in the same way that a dirty cloth is cleansed by exertion.

"And how, Visākhā, does one cleanse a dirty cloth by exertion? [209] By means of heat, lye, cow dung, water, and the appropriate effort by the person. It is in such a way that a dirty cloth is cleansed by exertion. So too, the defiled mind is cleansed by exertion. And how is the defiled mind cleansed by exertion? Here, Visākhā, a noble disciple recollects the Saṅgha thus: 'The Saṅgha of the Blessed One's disciples is practicing the good way... the unsurpassed field of merit for the world.' When a noble disciple recollects the Saṅgha, his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned. This is called a noble disciple who observes the *uposatha* of the Saṅgha, who dwells together with the Saṅgha, and it is by considering the Saṅgha that his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned. It is in this way that the defiled mind is cleansed by exertion.

"The defiled mind, Visākhā, is cleansed by exertion. And how is the defiled mind cleansed by exertion? Here, Visākhā, a noble disciple recollects his own virtuous behavior as unbroken, flawless, unblemished, unblotched, freeing, praised by the wise, ungrasped, leading to concentration. When a noble disciple recollects his virtuous behavior, his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned in the same way that a dirty mirror is cleansed by exertion.

"And how, Visākhā, is a dirty mirror cleansed by exertion? By means of oil, ashes, a roll of cloth, and the appropriate effort by the person. It is in such a way that a dirty mirror is cleansed by exertion. So too, the defiled mind is cleansed by exertion. And how is the defiled mind cleansed by exertion? [210] Here, Visākhā, a noble disciple recollects his own virtuous behavior as unbroken ... leading to concentration. When a noble disciple recollects his virtuous behavior, his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned. This is called a noble disciple who observes the *uposatha* of virtuous behavior, who dwells together with virtuous behavior, and it is by considering virtuous behavior that his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned. It is in this way that the defiled mind is cleansed by exertion.

"The defiled mind, Visākhā, is cleansed by exertion. And how is the defiled mind cleansed by exertion? Here, Visākhā, a noble disciple recollects the deities thus: 'There are devas [ruled by] the four great kings, Tāvatiṃsa devas, Yāma devas, Tusita devas, devas who delight in creation, devas who control what is created by others, devas of

Brahmā's company, and devas still higher than these.<sup>141</sup> I too have such faith as those deities possessed because of which, when they passed away here, they were reborn there; I too have such virtuous behavior... such learning ... such generosity ... such wisdom as those deities possessed because of which, when they passed away here, they were reborn there.' When a noble disciple recollects the faith, virtuous behavior, learning, generosity, and wisdom in himself and in those deities, his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned in the same way that impure gold is cleansed by exertion.

"And how, Visākhā, is impure gold cleansed by exertion? By means of a furnace, salt, red chalk, a blow-pipe and tongs, and the appropriate effort by the person. It is in such a way that impure gold is cleansed by exertion. So too, the defiled mind is cleansed by exertion. [211] And how is the defiled mind cleansed by exertion? Here, Visākhā, a noble disciple recollects the deities thus: 'There are devas [ruled by] the four great kings ... and devas still higher than these. I too have such faith ... such wisdom as those deities possessed because of which, when they passed away here, they were reborn there.' When a noble disciple recollects the faith, virtuous behavior, learning, generosity, and wisdom in himself and in those deities, his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned. This is called a noble disciple who observes the *uposatha* of the deities, who dwells together with the deities, and it is by considering the deities that his mind becomes placid, joy arises, and the defilements of the mind are abandoned. It is in this way that the defiled mind is cleansed by exertion.

(i) "This noble disciple, Visākhā, reflects thus:<sup>142</sup> 'As long as they live the arahants abandon and abstain from the destruction of life; with the rod and weapon laid aside, conscientious and kindly, they dwell compassionate towards all living beings. Today, for this night and day, I too shall abandon and abstain from the destruction of life; with the rod and weapon laid aside, conscientious and kindly, I too shall dwell compassionate towards all living beings. I shall imitate the arahants in this respect and the *uposatha* will be observed by me.'

(ii) "'As long as they live the arahants abandon and abstain from taking what is not given; they take only what is given, expect only what is given, and are honest at heart, devoid of theft. Today, for this night and day, I too shall abandon and abstain from taking what is not given; I shall accept only what is given, expect only what is given, and be honest at heart, devoid of theft. I shall imitate the arahants in this respect and the *uposatha* will be observed by me.'

---

<sup>141</sup> These are the six sense-sphere heavenly realms. The devas higher than these belong to the form and formless realms.

<sup>142</sup> At this point, the Buddha explains the eight precepts undertaken by lay followers on the *uposatha* days. These appear again in AN at 8:41–45. They correspond closely to the ten precepts of the novice monk, with the seventh and eighth joined and the tenth (abstaining from acceptance of gold and silver, that is, money) omitted.

(iii) "As long as they live the arahants abandon sexual activity and observe celibacy, living apart, abstaining from sexual intercourse, the common person's practice. Today, for this night and day, I too shall abandon sexual activity and observe celibacy, living apart, abstaining from sexual intercourse, the common person's practice. I shall imitate the arahants in this respect and the *uposatha* will be observed by me.'[212]

(iv) "As long as they live the arahants abandon and abstain from false speech; they speak truth, adhere to truth; they are trustworthy and reliable, no deceivers of the world. Today, for this night and day, I too shall abandon and abstain from false speech; I shall be a speaker of truth, an adherent of truth, trustworthy and reliable, no deceiver of the world. I shall imitate the arahants in this respect and the *uposatha* will be observed by me.'

(v) "As long as they live the arahants abandon and abstain from liquor, wine, and intoxicants, the basis for heedlessness. Today, for this night and day, I too shall abandon and abstain from liquor, wine, and intoxicants, the basis for heedlessness. I shall imitate the arahants in this respect and the *uposatha* will be observed by me.'

(vi) "As long as they live the arahants eat once a day,<sup>143</sup> abstaining from eating at night and from food outside the proper time. Today, for this night and day, I too shall eat once a day, abstaining from eating at night and from food outside the proper time. I shall imitate the arahants in this respect and the *uposatha* will be observed by me.'

(vii) "As long as they live the arahants abstain from dancing, singing, instrumental music, and unsuitable shows, and from adorning and beautifying themselves by wearing garlands and applying scents and unguents. Today, for this night and day, I too shall abstain from dancing, singing, instrumental music, and unsuitable shows, and from adorning and beautifying myself by wearing garlands and applying scents and unguents. I shall imitate the arahants in this respect and the *uposatha* will be observed by me.'

(viii) "As long as they live the arahants abandon and abstain from the use of high and luxurious beds; they lie down on a low resting place, either a small bed or a straw mat. Today, for this night and day, I too shall abandon and abstain from the use of high and luxurious beds; I shall lie down on a low resting place, either a small bed or a straw mat. I shall imitate the arahants in this respect and the *uposatha* will be observed by me.'

"It is in this way, Visākhā, that the noble ones' *uposatha* is observed. When one has observed the *uposatha* in the way of the noble ones it is of great fruit and benefit, extraordinarily brilliant and pervasive.

"To what extent is it of great fruit and benefit? To what extent is it extraordinarily brilliant and pervasive? Suppose, Visākhā, one were to exercise sovereignty and kingship

---

<sup>143</sup> *Ekabhattika*. This might also have been rendered "eat in one part of the day." Mp: "There are two meal [periods], the morning meal [period] and the evening meal [period]. The morning meal [period] ends at midday; the evening meal [period] extends from midday until the following daybreak. Therefore even those who eat ten times before noon are said to eat once a day (*ekabhattika*)."



over these sixteen great countries abounding in the seven precious substances,<sup>144</sup>[213] that is, [the countries of] the Aṅgans, the Magadhans, the Kāsis, the Kosalans, the Vajjis, the Mallas, the Cetis, the Vaṅgas, the Kurus, the Pañcālas, the Macchas, the Sūrasenas, the Assakas, the Avantis, the Gandhārans, and the Kambojans:<sup>145</sup> this would not be worth a sixteenth part of the *uposatha* observance complete in those eight factors. For what reason? Because human kingship is poor compared to celestial happiness.

"For the devas [ruled by] the four great kings,<sup>146</sup> a single night and day is equivalent to fifty human years; thirty such days make up a month, and twelve such months make up a year. The life span of the devas [ruled by] the four great kings is five hundred such celestial years. It is possible, Visākhā, that if some woman or man here observes the *uposatha* complete in these eight factors, with the breakup of the body, after death, they will be reborn in companionship with the devas [ruled by] the four great kings. It was with reference to this that I said human kingship is poor compared to celestial happiness.

"For the Tāvatiṃsa devas a single night and day is equivalent to a hundred human years; thirty such days make up a month, and twelve such months make up a year. The life span of the Tāvatiṃsa devas is a thousand such celestial years. It is possible, Visākhā, that if some woman or man here observes the *uposatha* complete in these eight factors, with the breakup of the body, after death, they will be reborn in companionship with the Tāvatiṃsa devas. It was with reference to this that I said human kingship is poor compared to celestial happiness.

"For the Yāma devas a single night and day is equivalent to two hundred human years; thirty such days make up a month, and twelve such months make up a year. The life span of the Yāma devas is two thousand such celestial years. It is possible, Visākhā, that if some woman or man here observes the *uposatha* complete in these eight factors, with the breakup of the body, after death, they will be reborn in companionship with the Yāma devas. It was with reference to this [214] that I said human kingship is poor compared to celestial happiness.

"For the Tusita devas, a single night and day is equivalent to four hundred human years; thirty such days make up a month, and twelve such months make up a year. The life span of the Tusita devas is four thousand such celestial years. It is possible, Visākhā, that if some woman or man here observes the *uposatha* complete in these eight

<sup>144</sup> Ce *pahūtasattaratanānaṃ*; Be *pahūtarattaratanānaṃ*; Ee *pahūtamahāsattaratanānaṃ*. Mp (Ce and Be) reads *pahūtarattaratanānaṃ*, but Mp (Ee) has *–satta–* here. Mp explains: "Possessed of abundant precious substances consisting in *ratta*; the meaning is that it is filled with the seven precious substances so that, if the surface of Jambudīpa (the Indian subcontinent) were the size of the surface of a *bheri* drum, the amount of seven substances would be the size of one's waist." There is thus an ambiguity about whether the original reading had *–satta–* or *–ratta–*. Mp-ṭ states that the word *ratta* is a synonym for precious substance (*ratta-saddo ratanapariyāyo*), but also says that the reading *pahūtasattaratanānaṃ* is found in the text. I translate on the basis of the latter reading.

<sup>145</sup> Most of these states are located in the Indian subcontinent, but Gandhāra and Kamboja were in the northwest, corresponding to parts of modern Pakistan and Afghanistan.

<sup>146</sup> Here begins a cosmological overview of the six sense-sphere heavens.

factors, with the breakup of the body, after death, they will be reborn in companionship with the Tusita devas. It was with reference to this that I said human kingship is poor compared to celestial happiness.

"For the devas who delight in creation, a single night and day is equivalent to eight hundred human years; thirty such days make up a month, and twelve such months make up a year. The life span of the devas who delight in creation is eight thousand such celestial years. It is possible, Visākhā, that if some woman or man here observes the *uposatha* complete in these eight factors, with the breakup of the body, after death, they will be reborn in companionship with the devas who delight in creation. It was with reference to this that I said human kingship is poor compared to celestial happiness.

"For the devas who control what is created by others, a single night and day is equivalent to sixteen hundred human years; thirty such days make up a month, and twelve such months make up a year. The life span of the devas who control what is created by others is sixteen thousand such celestial years. It is possible, Visākhā, that if some woman or man here observes the *uposatha* complete in these eight factors, with the breakup of the body, after death, they will be reborn in companionship with the devas who control what is created by others. It was with reference to this that I said human kingship is poor compared to celestial happiness."

One should not kill living beings or take what is not given;  
one should not speak falsehood or drink intoxicants; [215]  
one should refrain from sexual activity, from unchastity;  
one should not eat at night or outside the prescribed time.

One should not wear garlands or apply scents;  
one should sleep on a [low] bed or a mat on the ground;  
this, they say, is the eight-factored *uposatha*  
proclaimed by the Buddha,  
who reached the end of suffering.

As far as the sun and moon revolve,  
shedding light, so beautiful to gaze upon,  
dispellers of darkness, moving through the firmament,  
they shine in the sky,<sup>147</sup> brightening up the quarters.

Whatever wealth exists within this sphere—  
pearls, gems, and beryl, an excellent stone,<sup>148</sup>

---

<sup>147</sup> Reading with Be, Ee *nabhe pabhāsanti* as against Ce *nabhe pabhāśenti*, "lighting up the skies."

<sup>148</sup> Following Mp, I understand *bhaddakam* here to be merely a qualification of *veḷuriyaṃ*, not a separate type of precious stone.

*siṅgī* gold or [natural mountain] gold,  
and the gold called *haṭaka*—<sup>149</sup>  
those are not worth a sixteenth part  
of an *uposatha* complete in the eight factors,  
just as all the hosts of stars  
[do not match] the moon's radiance.<sup>150</sup>

Therefore a virtuous woman or man,  
having observed the *uposatha* complete in eight factors,  
and having made merit productive of happiness,  
blameless goes to a heavenly state.

### III. Ānanda

#### 71 (1) Channa

Then the wanderer Channa approached the Venerable Ānanda and exchanged greetings with him. When they had concluded their greetings and cordial talk, he sat down to one side and said to the Venerable Ānanda:

"Friend Ānanda, do you prescribe the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion?"<sup>151</sup>

"We do, friend." [216]

"But what is the danger that you have seen on account of which you prescribe the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion?"

(1) "One excited by lust, friend, overcome by lust, with mind obsessed by it, **intends for his own affliction**, for the affliction of others, and for the affliction of both, and he experiences mental suffering and dejection. But when lust is abandoned, he **does not intend for his own affliction**, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he does not experience mental suffering and dejection.

"One excited by lust, overcome by lust, with mind obsessed by it, engages in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. But when lust is abandoned, one does not engage in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. One excited by lust, overcome by lust, with mind obsessed by it, does not understand as it really is his own good, the good of others, and the good of both. But when lust is abandoned, one understands as it really is one's own good, the good of others, and the good of both. Lust leads to blindness, loss of vision,

---

<sup>149</sup> Mp: "Siṅgī gold (*siṅgīsuvanna*) is gold similar [in color] to a cow's horn (*gosīṅgasadisa*). Mountain gold (*kañcana*) is gold found on a mountain. Natural gold (*jātarūpa*) is gold the color of the Buddha. *Haṭaka* is gold removed by ants."

<sup>150</sup> *Candappabhā*. Mp: "A nominative used in a genitive sense, meaning 'to the moon's radiance' (*candappabhāya*)."

<sup>151</sup> I take this sentence to be interrogative in sense though it contains no interrogative particle.

and lack of knowledge; it is obstructive to wisdom, aligned with distress, and does not lead to nibbāna.

(2) "One full of hate, overcome by hatred ...

(3) "One deluded, overcome by delusion, with mind obsessed by it, intends for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, and for the affliction of both, and he experiences mental suffering and dejection. But when delusion is abandoned, he does not intend for his own affliction, for the affliction of others, or for the affliction of both, and he does not experience mental suffering and dejection.

"One deluded, overcome by delusion, with mind obsessed by it, engages in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. But when delusion is abandoned, he does not engage in misconduct by body, speech, and mind. One deluded, overcome by delusion, with mind obsessed by it, does not understand as it really is his own good, the good of others, and the good of both. But when delusion [217] is abandoned, one understands as it really is one's own good, the good of others, and the good of both. Delusion leads to blindness, loss of vision, and lack of knowledge; it is obstructive to wisdom, aligned with distress, and does not lead to nibbāna.

"Having seen these dangers in lust, hatred, and delusion, we prescribe their abandoning."

"But is there a path, friend, is there a way to the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion?"

"There is a path, friend, there is a way to the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion."

"But what is the path, what is the way to the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion?"

"It is just this noble eightfold path, that is, right view ... right concentration. This is the path, the way to the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion."

"Excellent, friend, is the path, excellent the way to the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion. It is enough, friend Ānanda, to be heedful."

## 72 (2) Ājīvaka

On one occasion the Venerable Ānanda was dwelling at Kosambīn Ghosita's Park. Then a certain householder, a disciple of the Ājīvakas,<sup>152</sup> approached the Venerable Ānanda, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said to him:

(1) "Bhante Ānanda, whose Dhamma is well expounded? (2) Who in the world are practicing the good way? (3) Who in the world are the fortunate ones?"<sup>153</sup>

---

<sup>152</sup> The school of Makkhali Gosāla, which taught strict determinism and emphasized extreme austerities.

<sup>153</sup> Here and below the plural *sugatā* is used. Thus in this context the word has a wider range than merely the Buddha, its usual application.

"Well then, householder, I will question you about this matter. You should answer as you see fit.

(1) "What do you think, householder? Is the Dhamma of those who teach the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion well expounded or not, or how do you take it?" [218]

"The Dhamma of those who teach the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion is well expounded. So I take it."

(2) "What do you think, householder? Are those practicing for the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion practicing the good way in the world or not, or how do you take it?"

"Those practicing for the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion are practicing the good way in the world. So I take it."

(3) "What do you think, householder? Are those who have abandoned lust, hatred, and delusion, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, obliterated them so that they are no more subject to future arising fortunate ones in the world or not, or how do you take it?"

"Those who have abandoned lust, hatred, and delusion, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, obliterated them so that they are no more subject to future arising are fortunate ones in the world. So I take it."

"Thus, householder, you have declared: 'The Dhamma of those who teach the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion is well expounded.' You have declared: 'Those practicing for the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion are practicing the good way in the world.' And you have declared: 'Those who have abandoned lust, hatred, and delusion, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, obliterated them so that they are no more subject to future arising are fortunate ones in the world.'"

"It is astounding and amazing, bhante, that there is no extolling of one's own Dhamma nor any denigration of the Dhamma of others, but just the teaching of the Dhamma in its own sphere. The meaning is stated, but one does not bring oneself into the picture.<sup>154</sup>

"Bhante Ānanda, you teach the Dhamma for the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion; [219] so your Dhamma is well expounded. You are practicing for the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion; so you are practicing the good way in the world. You have abandoned lust, hatred, and delusion, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, obliterated them so that they are no more subject to future arising; so you are the fortunate ones in the world.

"Excellent, bhante! Excellent, bhante! The noble Ānanda has made the Dhamma clear in many ways, as though he were turning upright what had been overthrown, revealing what was hidden, showing the way to one who was lost, or holding up a lamp in the darkness so those with good eyesight can see forms. Bhante Ānanda, I now go for

---

<sup>154</sup> *Attho ca vutto, attā ca anupanīto*. There is a word play here between *attho*, "meaning," and *attā*, "self."

refuge to the Blessed One, to the Dhamma, and to the Saṅgha of bhikkhus. Let the Noble Ānanda consider me a lay follower who from today has gone for refuge for life."

### 73 (3) The Sakyan

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling among the Sakyans at Kapilavatthu in the BanyanTreePark. Now on that occasion the Blessed One had just recently recovered from illness. Then the Sakyan Mahānāma approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said to him:

"For a long time, bhante, I have understood the Dhamma taught by the Blessed One thus: 'Knowledge occurs for one who is concentrated, not for one who lacks concentration.' Does concentration precede knowledge, bhante, or does knowledge precede concentration?"

Then it occurred to the Venerable Ānanda: "The Blessed One has just recently recovered from his illness, yet this Mahānāma the Sakyan asks him a very deep question. Let me lead Mahānāma the Sakyan off to one side and teach him the Dhamma."

Then the Venerable Ānanda took Mahānāma the Sakyan by the arm, led him off to one side, and said to him: "The Blessed One has spoken about the virtuous behavior of a trainee and the virtuous behavior of one beyond training, the concentration of a trainee [220] and the concentration of one beyond training, the wisdom of a trainee and the wisdom of one beyond training.

(1) "And what, Mahānāma, is the virtuous behavior of a trainee? Here, a bhikkhu is virtuous; he dwells restrained by the Pātimokkha, possessed of good conduct and resort, seeing danger in minute faults. Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. This is called the virtuous behavior of a trainee.

(2) "And what is the concentration of a trainee?<sup>155</sup> Here, secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome states, a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the first jhāna ... [as at 3:58] ... the fourth jhāna.... This is called the concentration of a trainee.

(3) "And what is the wisdom of a trainee? Here, a bhikkhu understands as it really is: 'This is suffering' ... [as in 3:12] ... 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' This is called the wisdom of a trainee.

"Whenthis noble disciple is thus accomplished in virtuous behavior, concentration, and wisdom, with the destruction of the taints, he realizes for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it.<sup>156</sup>

---

<sup>155</sup> Ee is missing the question here.

<sup>156</sup> Mp: "Having explained the virtuous behavior, concentration, and wisdom of the trainee (*sekha*), he explains the virtuous behavior, concentration, and wisdom of one beyond training (*asekha*) by way of the fruit of arahantship: 'The fruition knowledge of one beyond training arises later than the concentration and insight knowledge of a trainee. The concentration of the fruit in one beyond training arises later than the trainee's insight knowledge.'"

"It is in this way, Mahānāma, that the Blessed One has spoken about the virtuous behavior of a trainee and the virtuous behavior of one beyond training; about the concentration of a trainee and the concentration of one beyond training; about the wisdom of a trainee and the wisdom of one beyond training."

#### 74 (4) The Nigaṇṭha

On one occasion the Venerable Ānanda was dwelling at Vesālī in the hall with the peaked roof in the Great Wood. Then the Licchavi Abhaya and the Licchavi Paṇḍitakumāra approached the Venerable Ānanda, paid homage to him, and sat down to one side.<sup>157</sup> The Licchavi Abhaya then said to the Venerable Ānanda:

"Bhante, the NigaṇṭhaNātaputtaclaims to be all-knowing and all-seeing and to have all-embracing knowledge and vision, [saying]: 'When I am walking, standing, sleeping, and awake, knowledge and vision are constantly and continuously present to me.'<sup>158</sup> He prescribes the termination of old kammās by means of austerity and the demolition of the bridge by not creating any new kamma.<sup>159</sup>[221] Thus, through the destruction of kamma, suffering is destroyed. Through the destruction of suffering, feeling is destroyed. Through the destruction of feeling, all suffering will be worn away. In this way, the overcoming [of suffering] takes place through this directly visible purification by wearing away.<sup>160</sup> What does the Blessed One say about this?"

"Abhaya, these three kinds of wearing-away purification have been properly expounded by the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One who knows and sees, for the purification of beings, for the overcoming of sorrow and lamentation, for the passing away of pain and dejection, for the achievement of the method, for the realization of nibbāna. What three?

(1) "Here, Abhaya, a bhikkhu is virtuous ... [as in 3:73] ... Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. He does not create any new kamma and he terminates the old kamma having contacted it again and again.<sup>161</sup> The wearing away is directly visible,

<sup>157</sup> The Licchavis were the dominant clan in the Vajji republic, which had its capital at Vesālī.

<sup>158</sup> See n. 136. For a satire of Nātaputta's claim to omniscience, see MN 76.21–22, II 519, 13–33.

<sup>159</sup> *So purāṇānaṃ kammānaṃ tapasā byantībhāvaṃ paññāpeti navānaṃ kammānaṃ akaraṇā setughātāṃ*. Mp: "He declares the destruction by austere practice of accumulated kammās (*āyūhita-kammānaṃ*) and the present non-accumulation of any kammās that might have been accumulated. The demolition of the bridge (*setughātāṃ*) is the demolition of the factor and the demolition of the condition (*padaghātāṃ paccayaghātāṃ*). Presumably what is meant is the destruction of kammic accumulations and the destruction of their condition.

<sup>160</sup> *Evam etissā sandiṭṭhikāya nijjarāya visuddhiyā samatikkamo hoti*. The "wearing away" of old kamma through austerities is a fundamental Jain concept.

<sup>161</sup> *So navañckammaṃ na karoti, purāṇañckammaṃ phussa phussa vyantīkaroti*. Mp: "He does not accumulate new kamma. 'Old kamma' is the kamma accumulated in the past. Having contacted it again and again, he makes it vanish. This means that having contacted the resultant-contact again and again, he destroys that kamma."

immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise.

(2) "When, Abhaya, this bhikkhu is thus accomplished in virtuous behavior, secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome states, he enters and dwells in the first jhāna ... [as in 3:58] ... the fourth jhāna.... He does not create any new kamma and he terminates the old kamma having contacted it again and again. The wearing away is directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise.

(3) "When, Abhaya, this bhikkhu is thus accomplished in virtuous behavior and concentration, then, with the destruction of the taints, he realizes for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it. He does not create any new kamma and he terminates the old kamma having contacted it again and again. The wearing away is directly visible, immediate, inviting one to come and see, applicable, to be personally experienced by the wise.<sup>162</sup>

"These, Abhaya, are the three kinds of wearing-away purification that have been properly expounded by the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One who knows and sees, for the purification of beings, for the overcoming of sorrow and lamentation, for the passing away of pain and dejection, for the achievement of the method, for the realization of nibbāna."

When this was said, the Licchavi Paṇḍitakumāra said to the Licchavi Abhaya: "Why, friend Abhaya, don't you thank<sup>163</sup> the Venerable Ānanda for his well-stated words?"

"How, friend, could I not thank the Venerable Ānanda for his well-stated words? [222] If one were not to thank the Venerable Ānanda for his well-stated words, one's head would split apart!"

#### 75(5) Should be Encouraged

Then the Venerable Ānanda approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, and sat down to one side. The Blessed One then said to him:

---

<sup>162</sup> Mp identifies the three stages of wearing away with the four noble attainments. The description of the bhikkhu in the first "wearing away" as virtuous, according to Mp, indicates the lower two paths and fruits—those of stream-entry and the once-returner—for disciples at these stages are said to have fulfilled virtuous behavior. The description of the bhikkhu in the second "wearing away," as one who attains the four jhānas, indicates the attainment of the third path and fruit, that of the non-returner, described as one who has fulfilled concentration. And the description of the bhikkhu in the third "wearing away" as one who has reached the destruction of the taints indicates the fruit of arahantship, since the arahant has fulfilled wisdom. Mp mentions another interpretation, which holds that all three kinds of "wearing away" are descriptions of arahantship, made from the standpoint of the arahant's virtue, concentration, and wisdom. For the correlation between the three trainings and the four noble attainments, see below 3:86.

<sup>163</sup> *Abbhanumodasi*. Lit. "to rejoice along with."



"Ānanda, those for whom you have compassion and who think you should be heeded, whether friends or companions, relatives or family members, should be encouraged, settled, and established by you in three things. What three?

(1) "They should be encouraged, settled, and established in unwavering confidence<sup>164</sup> in the Buddha thus: 'The Blessed One is ... [as in 3:70] ... teacher of devas and humans, the Enlightened One, the Blessed One.'

(2) "They should be encouraged, settled, and established in unwavering confidence in the Dhamma thus: 'The Dhamma is well expounded by the Blessed One, directly visible ... [as in 3:70] ... to be personally experienced by the wise.'

(3) "They should be encouraged, settled, and established in unwavering confidence in the Saṅgha thus: 'The Saṅgha of the Blessed One's disciples is practicing the good way ... [as in 3:70] ... the unsurpassed field of merit for the world.'

"There might be, Ānanda, alteration in the four great elements—the earth element, the water element, the fire element, and the air element—but there cannot be alteration in a noble disciple who possesses unwavering confidence in the Buddha. In this context, this is alteration: that this noble disciple who possesses unwavering confidence in the Buddha could be reborn in hell, in the animal realm, or in the sphere of afflicted spirits. Such a thing is impossible. [223]

"There might be, Ānanda, alteration in the four great elements—the earth element, the water element, the fire element, and the air element—but there cannot be alteration in a noble disciple who possesses unwavering confidence in the Dhamma ... in the Saṅgha. In this context, this is alteration: that this noble disciple who possesses unwavering confidence in the Saṅgha could be reborn in hell, in the animal realm, or in the sphere of afflicted spirits. Such a thing is impossible.

"Ānanda, those for whom you have compassion and who think you should be heeded, whether friends or companions, relatives or family members, should be encouraged, settled, and established by you in these three things."

## 76 (6) Existence

Then the Venerable Ānanda approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said to him:

"Bhante, it is said: 'existence, existence.' In what way, bhante, is there existence?"<sup>165</sup>

(1) "If, Ānanda, there were no kamma ripening in the sensory realm, would sense-sphere existence be discerned?"

<sup>164</sup> *Aveccappasāda*. Mp: "Unshakable confidence that arises by having experienced, by having known, their virtues." The expression signifies the confidence possessed by a noble person, one who has reached the minimal level of stream-entry.

<sup>165</sup> *Bhava*. What is meant is a concrete state of individual existence in one of the three realms. Nibbāna is called *bhavanirodha*, the cessation of individual existence.

"No, bhante."

"Thus, Ānanda, for beings hindered by ignorance and fettered by craving, kamma is the field, consciousness the seed, and craving the moisture for their consciousness to be established in an inferior realm. In this way there is the production of renewed existence in the future.<sup>166</sup>

(2) "If, Ānanda, there were no kamma ripening in the form realm, would form-sphere existence be discerned?"

"No, bhante."

"Thus, Ānanda, for beings hindered by ignorance and fettered by craving, kamma is the field, consciousness the seed, and craving the moisture for their consciousness to be established in a middling realm. In this way there is the production of renewed existence in the future.

(3) "If, Ānanda, there were no kamma ripening in the formless realm, would formless-sphere existence be discerned?" [224]

"No, bhante."

"Thus, Ānanda, for beings hindered by ignorance and fettered by craving, kamma is the field, consciousness the seed, and craving the moisture for their consciousness to be established in a superior realm. In this way there is the production of renewed existence in the future.

"It is in this way, Ānanda, that there is existence."

## 77 (7) Volition and Aspiration

Then the Venerable Ānanda approached the Blessed One ... and said to him:

"Bhante, it is said: 'existence, existence.' In what way, bhante, is there existence?"

(1) "If, Ānanda, there were no kamma ripening in the sensory realm, would sense-sphere existence be discerned?"

"No, bhante."

"Thus, Ānanda, for beings hindered by ignorance and fettered by craving, kamma is the field, consciousness the seed, and craving the moisture for their volition and aspiration<sup>167</sup> to be established in an inferior realm. In this way there is the production of renewed existence in the future.

(2) "If, Ānanda, there were no kamma ripening in the form realm, would form-sphere existence be discerned?"

<sup>166</sup> *Āyatim punabbhavābhiniḍḍatiḥoti*. Mp says that the consciousness that serves as the seed (*bīja*) is the kammically active consciousness (*abhisankhāravīññāṇam*) coarsened with the kamma. In calling craving moisture (*sneha*) a word play is involved. *Sneha*, in Pāli, can mean both moisture and affection; in the latter sense, *sneha* is sometimes used as a synonym for craving. The rebirth process is described in similar terms at SN 5:9, SN 12:64, SN 22:53, SN 22:54. The "inferior realm" (*hīnā dhātu*) is the sensory realm. Similarly, just below, the "middling realm" (*majjhimā dhātu*) is the form realm, and the "superior realm" (*paṇītā dhātu*) is the formless realm. The Buddha's path aims at overcoming rebirth in all realms.

<sup>167</sup> *Cetanā patiṭṭhitā patthanā patiṭṭhitā*. Mp: "The kammic volition and kammic aspiration."

"No, bhante."

"Thus, Ānanda, for beings hindered by ignorance and fettered by craving, kamma is the field, consciousness the seed, and craving the moisture for their volition and aspiration to be established in a middling realm. In this way there is the production of renewed existence in the future.

(3) "If, Ānanda, there were no kamma ripening in the formless realm, would formless-sphere existence be discerned?"

"No, bhante."

"Thus, Ānanda, for beings hindered by ignorance and fettered by craving, kamma is the field, consciousness the seed, and craving the moisture for their volition and aspiration to be established in a superior realm. In this way there is the production of renewed existence in the future.

"It is in this way, Ānanda, that there is existence." [225]

## 78 (8) Setting Up

Then the Venerable Ānanda approached the Blessed One ... The Blessed One then said to him:

"Ānanda, are all rules and observances, [austere] lifestyles, and spiritual life fruitful when set up as the essence?"<sup>168</sup>

"Not exclusively so, bhante."

"Well then, Ānanda, distinguish [them]."

"Bhante, suppose one cultivates behavior and observances, an [austere] lifestyle, and a spiritual life, setting them up as if they were the essence. If unwholesome qualities then increase and wholesome qualities decline, such behavior and observances, [austere] lifestyle, and spiritual life, set up as the essence, are fruitless. But if unwholesome qualities decline and wholesome qualities increase, then such behavior and observances, [austere] lifestyle, and spiritual life, set up as the essence, are fruitful."

This is what the Venerable Ānanda said. The Teacher agreed. Then the Venerable Ānanda, thinking, "The Teacher has agreed," paid homage to the Blessed One, circumambulated him keeping the right side towards him, and left.

<sup>168</sup> *Sīlabbatam jīvitam brahmacariyam upaṭṭhānasāraṃ*. From the sequence, it is unclear whether *upaṭṭhānasāra* is one term parallel to the others or a distributive applying to each of the predecessors. Mp glosses as if the latter is the case, that is, as if it meant *the setting up* of the former three practices, taking them to be the core or essence of spiritual life: *Upaṭṭhānena sāraṃ 'idaṃ varam idaṃ niṭṭhā' ti evaṃ upaṭṭhitan* ("Setting them up as the essence, having set them up [with the conviction] that they are excellent, the goal"). The same sequence of terms is at **Ud 6:8, 71,29–32. Ud-a 351, 9–17**, allows both interpretations: either as a distributive or as one additional type of ascetic practice, perhaps the "carrying out" of certain ascetic practices. Collectively, the three (or four) terms represent the extreme of self-mortification; specific practices are described below at **3:156 §2** where they are called "the blistering way of practice." The opposite extreme is the view that there is no harm in sensual pleasures, which corresponds to the sensualist practice described at **3:156 §1**. The Buddha's "middle way," at **3:156 §3**, avoids the two extremes.

Then, not long after the Venerable Ānanda had left, the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus: "Bhikkhus, Ānanda is a trainee, but it is not easy to find one equal to him in wisdom."

## 79 (9) Fragrance

Then the Venerable Ānanda approached the Blessed One ... and said to him:

"Bhante, there are these three fragrances that spread with the wind but not against the wind. What three? The fragrance of roots, the fragrance of heartwood, and the fragrance of flowers. These three fragrances spread with the wind but not against the wind. Is there any fragrance that spreads with the wind, against the wind, and both with and against the wind?"

"There is, Ānanda, a fragrance that spreads with the wind, [226] against the wind, and both with and against the wind."

"But, bhante, what is that fragrance?"

"Here, Ānanda, in whatever village or town a man or a woman has gone for refuge to the Buddha, the Dhamma, and the Saṅgha; he or she is virtuous and of good character, abstaining from the destruction of life, taking what is not given, sexual misconduct, false speech, and liquor, wine, and intoxicants, the basis for heedlessness; and he or she dwells at home with a heart devoid of the stain of miserliness, freely generous, open-handed, delighting in relinquishment, devoted to charity, delighting in giving and sharing—in such a case, ascetics and brahmins in [all] quarters speak their praise, saying: 'In such and such a village or town a man or a woman has gone for refuge to the Buddha, the Dhamma, and the Saṅgha ... delighting in giving and sharing.'

"The deities and the spirits,<sup>169</sup> too, speak their praise, saying: 'In such and such a village or town a man or a woman has gone for refuge to the Buddha, the Dhamma, and the Saṅgha ... is virtuous and of good character... delighting in giving and sharing.'

"This, Ānanda, is the fragrance that spreads with the wind, against the wind, and both with and against the wind."

The fragrance of flowers does not spread against the wind,  
nor the fragrance of sandal, *tagara*,<sup>170</sup> or jasmine.  
But the fragrance of good people spreads against the wind:  
the good person's fragrance pervades all quarters.<sup>171</sup>

## 80 (10) Abhibhū

---

<sup>169</sup> Ce and Ee read *devatāpi'ssa amanussā*. Be does not have *amanussā*, "the spirits."

<sup>170</sup> A shrub from which a fragrant powder or perfume is produced.

<sup>171</sup> The verse is also at Dh 54.

Then the Venerable Ānanda approached the Blessed One ... [227] ... and said to him:

"Bhante, in the presence of the Blessed One I heard this; in his presence I learned this: 'Abhibhū, a disciple of the Blessed One Sikhī, while staying in the brahmā world, conveyed his voice throughout a thousandfold world system.'<sup>172</sup> How far, bhante, can the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One convey his voice?"

"He was a disciple, Ānanda. The Tathāgatas are immeasurable."<sup>173</sup>

A second time the Venerable Ānanda said to the Blessed One: "Bhante, in the presence of the Blessed One I heard this ... How far, bhante, can the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One convey his voice."

"He was a disciple, Ānanda. The Tathāgatas are immeasurable."

A third time the Venerable Ānanda said to the Blessed One: "Bhante, in the presence of the Blessed One I heard this ... How far, bhante, can the Blessed One, the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One convey his voice?"

"Have you heard, Ānanda, about a thousandfold minor world system?"

"It is the time for this, Blessed One. It is the time for this, Fortunate One. The Blessed One should speak. Having heard this from the Blessed One, the bhikkhus will retain it in mind."

"Well then, Ānanda, listen and attend closely. I will speak."

"Yes, bhante," the Venerable Ānanda replied. The Blessed One said this:

(1) "A thousand times the world in which the sun and moon revolve and light up the quarters with their brightness is called a thousandfold minor world system.<sup>174</sup> In that thousandfold world system there are a thousand moons, a thousand suns, a thousand Sinerusking of mountains, a thousand Jambudīpas, a thousand Aparagoyānas, a thousand Uttarakurus, a thousand Pubbavidehas,<sup>175</sup> and a thousand four great oceans; a thousand four great kings, a thousand [heavens] of devas [ruled by] the four great kings, a thousand Tāvātimsa [heavens], a thousand [228] Yāma [heavens], a thousand Tusita [heavens], a thousand [heavens] of devas who delight in creation, a thousand [heavens] of devas who control what is created by others, a thousand brahmā worlds.

(2) "A world that is a thousand times a thousandfold minor world system is called a thousand-to-the-second-power middling world system.<sup>176</sup> (3) A world that is a thousand

<sup>172</sup> See SN 6:14, I 155–57. "Conveyed his voice" renders *sarena viññāpesi*, more literally "communicated with his voice."

<sup>173</sup> *Sāvako so Ānanda appameyyā tathāgatā*. Mp: "The Buddha said this to indicate: 'Ānanda, why do you say this? He was a disciple established in partial knowledge. But the Tathāgatas, having fulfilled the ten perfections and attained omniscience, are immeasurable. The domain, range, and power of a disciple is one thing, the range of the Buddhas is quite different. It is like comparing a bit of soil in your fingernail with the soil of the great earth.'"

<sup>174</sup> *Cūḷanikā lokadhātu*. Mp: "This is the domain of a disciple" (*ayaṃ sāvakassa visayo*).

<sup>175</sup> These are the four continents, located respectively to the south, west, north, and east.

<sup>176</sup> *Dvisahassī majjhimā lokadhātu*. It is necessary to use some such expression rather than "a two-thousandfold middling world system." For the middling world system is not twice the size of a thousandfold minor world system, but *a thousand times* its size, that is, a thousandfold world system

times a thousand-to-the-second-power middling world system is called a thousand-to-the-third-power great world system. Ānanda, the Tathāgata can convey his voice as far as he wants in a thousand-to-the-third-power great world system."

"But in what way, bhante, can the Tathāgata convey his voice as far as he wants in a thousand-to-the-third-power great world system?"

"Here, Ānanda, the Tathāgata suffuses with his radiance a thousand-to-the-third-power great world system. When those beings perceive that light, then the Tathāgata projects his voice and makes them hear its sound. It is in such a way, Ānanda, that the Tathāgata can convey his voice as far as he wants in a thousand-to-the-third-power great world system."<sup>177</sup>

When this was said, the Venerable Ānanda said to the Blessed One: "It is my good fortune! I am very fortunate that my Teacher is so powerful and mighty."

When this was said, the Venerable Udāyī said to the Venerable Ānanda: "What is it to you, friend Ānanda, that your Teacher is so powerful and mighty?"<sup>178</sup>

When this was said, the Blessed One said to the Venerable Udāyī: "Do not say so, Udāyī! Do not say so, Udāyī!"<sup>179</sup> Udāyī, if Ānanda were to die without being free of lust, then because of his confidence he would exercise celestial kingship among the devas seven times and great kingship in this Jambudīpa seven times. However, in this very life Ānanda will attain final nibbāna." [229]

#### IV. Ascetics

##### 81 (1) Ascetics

"Bhikkhus, there are these three ascetic tasks to be practiced by an ascetic. What three? (1) The undertaking of the training in the higher virtuous behavior, (2) the undertaking of the training in the higher mind, and (3) the undertaking of the training in the higher wisdom. These are the three ascetic tasks to be practiced by an ascetic.

"Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train yourselves thus: 'We will have a keen desire to undertake the training in the higher virtuous behavior; we will have a keen

---

squared. Similarly, just below, a *tisahassī mahāsaḥassī lokadhātu* is not three times the size of a minor world system, but *a thousand times* the size of a thousand-to-the-second-power middling world system, in other words, a thousandfold world system cubed.

<sup>177</sup> Could this passage mark a major step towards the apotheosis of the Buddha? In flavor it seems more in keeping with the opening of such Mahāyāna sūtras as the Saddharmapuṇḍarīka and the Pañcavīsati-prajñāpāramitā than with the Pāli Nikāyas.

<sup>178</sup> Mp: "This was the elder Lāḍudāyī (a troublemaker in the Saṅgha). It is said that in the past he resented the elder [Ānanda for being appointed] the Buddha's attendant. Therefore, now that he had a chance, at the end of the Buddha's lion's roar, he tries to puncture the elder Ānanda's confidence, as if extinguishing a burning candle, hitting the snout of a stray bull, or turning upside down a vessel full of food."

<sup>179</sup> Mp: "The Buddha says this, as if a benevolent man were to say repeatedly to another man tottering at the edge of a precipice, 'Come this way.'"

desire to undertake the training in the higher mind; we will have a keen desire to undertake the training in the higher wisdom.' It is in this way that you should train yourselves."

## 82 (2) The Donkey<sup>180</sup>

"Bhikkhus, suppose a donkey was following rightbehind a herd of cattle, [thinking]: 'I'm a cow too, I'm a cow too.'<sup>181</sup>(1) But his appearance would not be like that of the cows, (2) his braying would not be like that of the cows, and (3) his footprint would not be like that of the cows. Yet he follows right behind a herd of cattle, [thinking]: 'I'm a cow too, I'm a cow too.'

"So too, a bhikkhu might be following right behind the Saṅgha of bhikkhus, [thinking]: 'I'm a bhikkhu too, I'ma bhikkhu too.'(1) But his desire to undertake the training in the higher virtuous behavior is not like that of the other bhikkhus;(2) his desire to undertake the training in the higher mind is not like that of the other bhikkhus;(3) his desire to undertake the training in the higher wisdom is not like that of the other bhikkhus. Yet he follows right behind the Saṅgha of bhikkhus, [thinking]: 'I'm a bhikkhu too, I'ma bhikkhu too.'

"Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train yourselves thus: 'We will have a keen desire to undertake the training in the higher virtuous behavior; we will have a keen desire to undertake the training in the higher mind; we will have a keen desire to undertake the training in the higher wisdom.' It is in this way that you should train yourselves."

## 83 (3) The Field

"Bhikkhus, there are these three preliminary tasks of a farmer. What three? (1) Here, the farmer first of all thoroughly plows and harrows the field. (2) Next, he sows seeds at the proper time. (3) And then he occasionally irrigates [230] and drains the field. These are the three preliminary tasks of a farmer.

"So too, bhikkhus, there are these three preliminary tasks of a bhikkhu. What three? (1) The undertaking of the training in the higher virtuous behavior; (2) the undertaking of the training in the higher mind; and (3) the undertaking of the training in the higher wisdom. These are the three preliminary tasks of a bhikkhu.

---

<sup>180</sup> Ee treats this sutta as part of the preceding one, but Ce and Be treat it as distinct. Thus from the next sutta on, my numbering will be one short of Be and one ahead of Ee.

<sup>181</sup> Ce *ahampamhā*, *ahampamhā*; Ee, virtually the same, merely resolves the *sandhi*: *aham pi amhā*, *aham pi amhā*. Be's *aham pi dammo aham pi dammo* seems to be an attempt to make sense of an obscure original. The Sinhala translation repeats the Pāli and adds in parentheses *mama de gavayem*, *mama de gavayem*, ("I too am a cow, I too am a cow"). DOP relates *amhā*<sup>2</sup> to Skt *hambhā*, "the lowing of a cow, a cow." See SED, sv *hambhā*, "lowing or bellowing of cattle."

"Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train yourselves thus: 'We will have a keen desire to undertake the training in the higher virtuous behavior ... the training in the higher mind ... the training in the higher wisdom.' It is in this way that you should train yourselves."

#### 84 (4) The Young Vajjian

Thus have I heard. On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Vesālī in the hall with the peaked roof in the Great Wood. Then a certain Vajjian bhikkhu approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, and said to him:

"Bhante, every half-month more than a hundred and fifty training rules come up for recitation. I cannot train in them."

"Can you train in the three trainings, bhikkhu: the training in the higher virtuous behavior, the training in the higher mind, and the training in the higher wisdom?"

"I can, bhante."

"Therefore, bhikkhu, train in the three trainings: the training in the higher virtuous behavior, the training in the higher mind, and the training in the higher wisdom. As you train in them, you will abandon lust, hatred, and delusion. With the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion, you will do nothing unwholesome or resort to anything bad."

Then, sometime later, that bhikkhu trained in the higher virtuous behavior, the higher mind, and the higher wisdom. As he [231] trained in them, he abandoned lust, hatred, and delusion. With the abandoning of lust, hatred, and delusion, he did nothing unwholesome and did not resort to anything bad.

#### 85 (5) A Trainee

Then a certain bhikkhu approached the Blessed One ... and said to him: "Bhante, it is said: 'A trainee, a trainee.' In what way is one a trainee?"

"He trains, bhikkhu, therefore he is called a trainee. And in what does he train? He trains in the higher virtuous behavior; he trains in the higher mind; he trains in the higher wisdom. He trains, bhikkhu, therefore he is called a trainee."

As the trainee trains  
along the straight path,  
the knowledge of destruction arises first  
immediately followed by final knowledge.<sup>182</sup>

---

<sup>182</sup> Mp: "The knowledge of destruction arises first (*khayasmiṃ paṭhamam ñāṇam*): first the knowledge of the path arises, called the knowledge of destruction because it is the knowledge associated with the path, which is called destruction because it destroys the defilements. *Immediately followed by final knowledge* (*tato aññā anantarā*): right after the knowledge of the fourth path arises, the fruit of arahantship arises."



Thereafter, when the fetters of existence are destroyed,  
for one liberated by final knowledge,  
the knowledge arises:  
"My liberation is unshakable."<sup>183</sup>

## 86 (6) The Process of Training (1)

"Bhikkhus, every half-month more than a hundred and fifty training rules come up for recitation; clansmen who desire their own good train in these. These are all comprised within these three trainings. What three? The training in the higher virtuous behavior, the training in the higher mind, and the training in the higher wisdom. These are the three trainings in which all this is comprised.

"Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu fulfills virtuous behavior, but cultivates concentration and wisdom only to a moderate extent. He falls into offenses in regard to the lesser and minor training rules and rehabilitates himself.<sup>184</sup> For what reason? Because I have not said that he is incapable of this.<sup>185</sup> But in regard to those training rules that are fundamental to the spiritual life, in conformity with the spiritual life,<sup>186</sup> his behavior is constant and steadfast. Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. With the utter destruction of three fetters, [232] he is a stream-enterer, no longer subject to [rebirth in] the lower world, fixed in destiny, with enlightenment as his destination.

"Another bhikkhu fulfills virtuous behavior, but cultivates concentration and wisdom only to a moderate extent. He falls into offenses in regard to the lesser and minor training rules and rehabilitates himself. For what reason? Because I have not said that he is incapable of this. But in regard to those training rules that are fundamental to the spiritual life, in conformity with the spiritual life, his behavior is constant and steadfast. Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. With the utter destruction of three

<sup>183</sup> Mp: "The knowledge arises (*ñāṇam ve hoti*): this is reviewing knowledge" (*paccavekkhaṇañāṇa*); see **Vism 676, Ppn 22.19–21.**

<sup>184</sup> *Khuddānukhuddakāni sikkhāpadāni*. At **DN 16.6.3, II 154, 16–17**, shortly before his passing, the Buddha permitted the bhikkhus, if they so desired, to abolish these rules. However, in the Vinaya account of the first Buddhist council, the monks were uncertain about which rules were minor and therefore decided to retain them all (**Vin II 287, 29–288, 35**). Mp, commenting on the present sutta, says: "The teachers who specialize in the Great Aṅguttara Nikāya say, 'Apart from the four *pārājikas* (offenses entailing expulsion), all the rest are lesser and minor'" (*ime pana aṅguttaramahānikāyavaḷaṇṇanaka-ācariyā 'cattāri pārājikāni tḥapetvā sesāni sabbānipi khuddānukhuddakāni* ).

<sup>185</sup> *Na hi m'ettha, bhikkhave, abhabbatā vuttā*. Mp paraphrases: "Bhikkhus, I have not stated that it is impossible for a noble person to fall into such an offense and to be rehabilitated" (*bhikkhave na hi mayā ettha evarūpaṃ āpattiṃ āpajjane ca vuṭṭhāne ca ariyapuggalassa abhabbatā kathitā*).

<sup>186</sup> *Tāni ādibrahmacariyikāni brahmacariyasārūppāni*. Mp: "Those training rules that are fundamental to the spiritual life: these are the four major training rules fundamental to the spiritual life of the path. In conformity with the spiritual life: these same [rules] are in conformity with, fitting for, the spiritual life of the four paths" (*ādibrahmacariyikāni ti maggabrahmacariyassa ādibhūtāni cattāri mahāsīlasikkhāpadāni; brahmacariyasārūppāni ti tāni yeva catummaggaḥ brahmacariyassa sārūppāni anucchavikāni*).

fetters and with the diminishing of greed, hatred, and delusion, he is a once-returner who, after coming back to this world only one more time, will make an end of suffering.

"Another bhikkhu fulfills virtuous behavior and concentration, but cultivates wisdom only to a moderate extent. He falls into offenses in regard to the lesser and minor training rules and rehabilitates himself. For what reason? Because I have not said that he is incapable of this. But in regard to those training rules that are fundamental to the spiritual life, in conformity with the spiritual life, his behavior is constant and steadfast. Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. With the utter destruction of the five lower fetters, he is one of spontaneous birth, due to attain final nibbāna there without returning from that world.

"Another bhikkhu fulfills virtuous behavior, concentration, and wisdom. He falls into offenses in regard to the lesser and minor training rules and rehabilitates himself. For what reason? Because I have not said that he is incapable of this. But in regard to those training rules that are fundamental to the spiritual life, in conformity with the spiritual life, his behavior is constant and steadfast. Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. With the destruction of the taints, he realizes for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it.

"Thus, bhikkhus, one who cultivates in part succeeds in part; one who cultivates fully reaches fulfillment. These training rules, I say, are not barren."

## 87 (7) The Process of Training (2)

"Bhikkhus, every half-month more than a hundred and fifty training rules come up for recitation; clansmen who desire their own good [233] train in these. These are all comprised within these three trainings. What three? The training in the higher virtuous behavior, the training in the higher mind, and the training in the higher wisdom. These are the three trainings in which all this is comprised.

"Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu fulfills virtuous behavior, but cultivates concentration and wisdom only to a moderate extent. He falls into offenses in regard to the lesser and minor training rules and rehabilitates himself. For what reason? Because I have not said that he is incapable of this. But in regard to those training rules that are fundamental to the spiritual life, in conformity with the spiritual life, his behavior is constant and steadfast. Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. With the utter destruction of three fetters, he is a seven-times-at-most attainer who, after roaming and wandering on among devas and humans seven times at most, makes an end of suffering.<sup>187</sup> With the utter destruction of three fetters, he is a family-to-family attainer who, after roaming and wandering on among good families two or three times, makes an

---

<sup>187</sup> This is the first, and most sluggish, of the three grades of stream-enterer. The other two follow just below. The Pāli names for the three are, respectively: *sattakkhattuparama*, *kolamkola*, and *ekabījī*.

end of suffering. With the utter destruction of three fetters, he is a one-seed attainer who, after being reborn once more in human existence, makes an end of suffering. With the utter destruction of three fetters and with the diminishing of greed, hatred, and delusion, he is a once-returner who, after coming back to this world only one more time, makes an end of suffering.

"Another bhikkhu fulfills virtuous behavior and concentration, but cultivates wisdom only to a moderate extent. He falls into offenses in regard to the lesser and minor training rules and rehabilitates himself. For what reason? Because I have not said that he is incapable of this. But in regard to those training rules that are fundamental to the spiritual life, in conformity with the spiritual life, his behavior is constant and steadfast. Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. With the utter destruction of the five lower fetters, he is one bound upstream, heading towards the Akaniṭṭha realm ... an attainer of nibbāna through exertion ... an attainer of nibbāna without exertion ... an attainer of nibbāna upon landing ... an attainer of nibbāna in the interval.<sup>188</sup>

"Another bhikkhu fulfills virtuous behavior, concentration, and wisdom. He [234] falls into offenses in regard to the lesser and minor training rules and rehabilitates himself. For what reason? Because I have not said that he is incapable of this. But in regard to those training rules that are fundamental to the spiritual life, in conformity with the spiritual life, his behavior is constant and steadfast. Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. With the destruction of the taints, he realizes for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it.

"Thus, bhikkhus, one who cultivates in part succeeds in part; one who cultivates fully reaches fulfillment. These training rules, I say, are not barren."

### 88 (8) The Process of Training (3)

"Bhikkhus, every half-month more than a hundred and fifty training rules come up for recitation; clansmen who desire their own good train in these. These are all comprised within these three trainings. What three? The training in the higher virtuous behavior, the training in the higher mind, and the training in the higher wisdom. These are the three trainings in which all this is comprised.

"Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu fulfills virtuous behavior, concentration, and wisdom. He falls into offenses in regard to the lesser and minor training rules and rehabilitates himself. For what reason? Because I have not said that he is incapable of this. But in regard to those training rules that are fundamental to the spiritual life, in conformity with the spiritual life, his behavior is constant and steadfast. Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. With the destruction of the taints, he realizes for himself with

---

<sup>188</sup> These are five grades of non-returner, presented here from the most sluggish to the most acute. For a fuller discussion, see 7:55.

direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it.

"If he does not attain and penetrate this,<sup>189</sup> with the utter destruction of the five lower fetters, he is an attainer of nibbāna in the interval. If he does not attain and penetrate this, with the utter destruction of the five lower fetters, he is an attainer of nibbāna upon landing ... an attainer of nibbāna without exertion ... an attainer of nibbāna through exertion ... one bound upstream, heading towards the Akaniṭṭha realm.

"If he does not attain and penetrate this, with the utter destruction of three fetters and with the diminishing of greed, hatred, and delusion, he is a once-returner who, after coming back to this [235] world only one more time, makes an end of suffering. If he does not attain and penetrate this, with the utter destruction of three fetters, he is a one-seed attainer who, after being reborn once more in human existence, makes an end of suffering. If he does not attain and penetrate this, with the utter destruction of three fetters, he is a family-to-family attainer who, after roaming and wandering on among good families two or three times, makes an end of suffering. If he does not attain and penetrate this, with the utter destruction of three fetters, he is a seven-times-at-most attainer who, after roaming and wandering on among devas and humans seven times at most, makes an end of suffering.

"Thus, bhikkhus, one who cultivates fully reaches fulfillment; one who cultivates in part succeeds in part. These training rules, I say, are not barren."

#### 89 (9) The Trainings (1)

"Bhikkhus, there are these three trainings. What three? The training in the higher virtuous behavior, the training in the higher mind, and the training in the higher wisdom.

"And what, bhikkhus, is the training in the higher virtuous behavior? Here, a bhikkhu is virtuous ... Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. This is called the training in the higher virtuous behavior.

"And what, bhikkhus, is the training in the higher mind? Here, secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome states, a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the first jhāna ... the fourth jhāna.... This is called the training in the higher mind.

"And what, bhikkhus, is the training in the higher wisdom? Here, a bhikkhu understands as it really is: 'This is suffering' ... 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' This is called the training in the higher wisdom.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three trainings."

#### 90 (10) The Trainings (2)

---

<sup>189</sup> *Taṃ vā pana anabhisambhavaṃ appaṭivijjhaṃ.* Mp: "If he does not reach and penetrate that arahantship" (*taṃ arahattaṃ apāpuṇanto appaṭivijjhanto*).

"Bhikkhus, there are these three trainings. What three? The training in the higher virtuous behavior, the training in the higher mind, and the training in the higher wisdom.

"And what, bhikkhus, is the training in the higher virtuous behavior? Here, a bhikkhu is virtuous ... Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. This is called the training in the higher virtuous behavior.

"And what, bhikkhus, is the training in the higher mind? Here, secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome states, a bhikkhu enters and dwells in the first jhāna ... [236] the fourth jhāna.... This is called the training in the higher mind.

"And what, bhikkhus, is the training in the higher wisdom? Here, with the destruction of the taints, a bhikkhu realizes for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three trainings."

Energetic, strong, and resolute,  
meditative, mindful, the faculties guarded,  
one should practice the higher virtue,  
the higher mind, and the higher wisdom.

As before, so after;  
as after, so before;  
as below, so above;  
as above, so below;

as by day, so at night;  
as at night, so by day,  
having overcome all quarters,  
with measureless concentration.<sup>190</sup>

They call him a trainee on the path,  
whose conduct has been well purified.  
They call him enlightened in the world,  
a wise one<sup>191</sup> who has reached the goal of the practice.

---

<sup>190</sup> Mp, commenting on this verse and the previous one, says: "*As before, so after*: as earlier one trains in the three trainings, so one trains in them afterwards; and so for the second line. *As below, so above*: as one sees the lower part of the body as unattractive, one extends this to the upper part; and inversely for the second line. *As by day, so at night*: As one trains in the three trainings by day, so one trains in them at night; and inversely for the second line. *Having overcome all quarters* by way of the object, *with measureless concentration*, with the concentration of the path of arahantship."

<sup>191</sup> I read with Be, Ee *dhīraṃ paṭipadantaṃ*. Ce has *vīraṃ*. Mp glosses: "A wise one endowed with wisdom; one who is wise in terms of the aggregates, wise in terms of the sense bases, gone to the end of the practice" (*khandhadhīra-āyatanadhīravasena dhīraṃ dhitisampannaṃ paṭipattiyā antaṃ gataṃ*).

For one liberated  
by the destruction of craving,  
with the cessation of consciousness  
the emancipation of the mind  
is like the extinguishing of a lamp.<sup>192</sup>

#### 91 (11) Paṅkadhā

On one occasion the Blessed One was wandering on tour among the Kosalans together with a large Saṅgha of bhikkhus when he reached the Kosalan town of Paṅkadhā. He then dwelled near Paṅkadhā.

Now on that occasion the bhikkhu Kassapagottā was resident at Paṅkadhā. There the Blessed One instructed, encouraged, inspired, and gladdened the bhikkhus with a Dhamma talk connected with the training rules. Then, while the Blessed One was instructing ... and gladdening the bhikkhus with a talk on the Dhamma connected with the training rules, the bhikkhu Kassapagotta became impatient and bitter, [thinking]: "This ascetic is too stringent."<sup>193</sup>

Then, having dwelled at Paṅkadhā as long as he wanted, the Blessed One set out on tour towards Rājagaha. Wandering on tour, the Blessed One eventually arrived at Rājagaha. [237] There, at Rājagaha, the Blessed One dwelled on Mount Vulture Peak. Then, not long after the Blessed One had left, the bhikkhu Kassapagotta was filled with remorse and regret, [thinking]: "It is my misfortune and loss that when the Blessed One was instructing, encouraging, inspiring, and gladdening the bhikkhus with a Dhamma talk connected with the training rules, I became impatient and bitter, [thinking]: 'This ascetic is too stringent.' Let me now go to the Blessed One and confess my transgression to him."

Then the bhikkhu Kassapagotta cleaned up his lodging, took his bowl and robe, and set out for Rājagaha. Eventually he arrived at Rājagaha and went to Mount Vulture Peak. He approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said:

"Bhante, on one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at the Kosalan town of Paṅkadhā. There the Blessed One instructed, encouraged, inspired, and gladdened the bhikkhus with a Dhamma talk connected with the training rules. While he was instructing ... and gladdening them, I became impatient and bitter, thinking: 'This ascetic is too stringent.' Then, having dwelled at Paṅkadhā as long as he wanted, the Blessed One

---

<sup>192</sup> Mp: "This is the arahant's emancipation of mind, occurring with the ceasing of the final consciousness. It is like the full extinguishing of a lamp. No place where it has gone is discerned; there is only arrival at the indiscernible state (*apaṇṇattikabhāvūpagamano yeva hoti*)."

<sup>193</sup> *Adhisallikhatev'āyaṃ samaṇo*. Mp is not particularly helpful with *adhisallikhati*, glossing it *atīviya sallikkhitam katvā saṇhaṃ saṇham katheti*. DOP has "is overly scrupulous." The expression also occurs in a similar context at **MN I 449, 12–13**.

set out on tour for Rājagaha. Not long after he left, I was filled with remorse and regret, thinking: 'It is my misfortune and loss that when the Blessed One was instructing ... and gladdening the bhikkhus with a Dhamma talk connected with the training rules, I became impatient and bitter, thinking: "This ascetic is too stringent." Let me now go to the Blessed One and confess my transgression to him.'

"Bhante, I have committed a transgression [238] in that, when the Blessed One was instructing, encouraging, inspiring, and gladdening the bhikkhus with a Dhamma talk connected with the training rules, I so foolishly, stupidly, and unskillfully became impatient and bitter, thinking: 'This ascetic is too stringent.' Bhante, may the Blessed One accept my transgression seen as a transgression for the sake of future restraint."

"Surely, Kassapa, you have committed a transgression in that, when I was instructing, encouraging, inspiring, and gladdening the bhikkhus with a talk on the Dhamma connected with the training rules, you so foolishly, stupidly, and unskillfully became impatient and bitter, thinking: 'This ascetic is too stringent.' But since you see your transgression as a transgression and make amends for it in accordance with the Dhamma, we accept it. For it is growth in the Noble One's discipline that one sees one's transgression as a transgression, makes amends for it in accordance with the Dhamma, and undertakes future restraint.

(1) "If, Kassapa, an elder bhikkhu<sup>194</sup> does not desire to train and does not speak praise of undertaking the training; if he does not encourage in the training other bhikkhus who do not desire to train; and if he does not speak genuine, real, and timely praise of those bhikkhus who desire to train, I do not speak praise of such an elder bhikkhu. For what reason? Because other bhikkhus, [hearing]: 'The Teacher speaks praise of him,' might associate with him, and those who associate with him might follow his example. If they follow his example, this would lead to their harm and suffering for a long time. Therefore I do not speak praise of such an elder bhikkhu.

(2) "If, Kassapa, a bhikkhu of middle standing ... (3) If a junior bhikkhu does not desire to train and does not speak praise of undertaking the training; if he does not encourage in the training other bhikkhus who do not desire to train; and if he does not speak genuine, real, and timely praise of those bhikkhus who desire to train, I do not speak praise of such a junior bhikkhu. For what reason? Because other bhikkhus, [hearing]: 'The Teacher speaks praise of him,' might associate with him, and those who associate with him [239] might follow his example. If they follow his example, this would lead to their harm and suffering for a long time. Therefore I do not speak praise of such a junior bhikkhu.

(1) "If, Kassapa, an elder bhikkhu desires to train and speaks praise of undertaking the training; if he encourages in the training other bhikkhus who do not

---

<sup>194</sup> The sutta itself does not specify a triad, but I assume it is the distinction between elder, middling, and junior bhikkhus that warrants including this sutta in the Threes.

desire to train; and if he speaks genuine, real, and timely praise of those bhikkhus who desire to train, I speak praise of such an elder bhikkhu. For what reason? Because other bhikkhus, [hearing]: 'The Teacher speaks praise of him,' might associate with him, and those who associate with him might follow his example. If they follow his example, this would lead to their welfare and happiness for a long time. Therefore I speak praise of such an elder bhikkhu.

(2) "If, Kassapa, a bhikkhu of middle standing ... (3) If a junior bhikkhu desires to train and speaks praise of undertaking the training; if he encourages in the training other bhikkhus who do not desire to train; and if he speaks genuine, real, and timely praise of those bhikkhus who desire to train, I speak praise of such a junior bhikkhu. For what reason? Because other bhikkhus, [hearing]: 'The Teacher speaks praise of him,' might associate with him, and those who associate with him might follow his example. If they follow his example, this would lead to their welfare and happiness for a long time. Therefore I speak praise of such a junior bhikkhu."

#### V. A Lump of Salt<sup>195</sup>

##### 92 (1) Urgent

"Bhikkhus, there are these three urgent tasks of a farmer.<sup>196</sup> What three? (1) First, the farmer swiftly yet thoroughly plows the field and swiftly yet thoroughly harrows it. (2) Next, he swiftly sows seeds. (3) And then he swiftly [240] irrigates and drains the field. These are the three urgent tasks of a farmer.

"This farmer has no psychic potency or spiritual might [by which he could command]: 'Let my crops start growing today! Let them mature tomorrow! Let them bear grain the day after tomorrow!' But, with the change of seasons, there comes a time when the crops grow, mature, and bear grain.

"So too, bhikkhus, there are these three urgent tasks of a bhikkhu. What three? (1) The undertaking of the training in the higher virtuous behavior; (2) the undertaking of the training in the higher mind; and (3) the undertaking of the training in the higher wisdom. These are the three urgent tasks of a bhikkhu.

"This bhikkhu has no psychic potency or spiritual might [by which he could command]: 'Let my mind be liberated from the taints by non-clinging today, or tomorrow, or the day after tomorrow!' Rather, as this bhikkhu trains in the higher virtuous behavior, the higher mind, and the higher wisdom, there comes an occasion when his mind is liberated from the taints by non-clinging.

---

<sup>195</sup> The printed version of Ce does not have an *uddāna* verse for this chapter, so I have used the verse in the electronic version of Ce for sutta titles.

<sup>196</sup> *Accāyikāni*. I translate in accordance with the gloss in Mp-ṭ: *sīghaṃ pavattabbāni*, "to be taken care of quickly."



"Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train yourselves thus: 'We will have a keen desire to undertake the training in the higher virtuous behavior, the training in the higher mind, and the training in the higher wisdom.' It is in this way that you should train yourselves."

### 93 (2) Solitude

"Bhikkhus, wanderers of other sects prescribe these three kinds of solitude. What three? Solitude with respect to robes, solitude with respect to almsfood, and solitude with respect to lodgings.<sup>197</sup>

"This, bhikkhus, is what wanderers of other sects prescribe as solitude with respect to robes: they wear hemp robes, robes of hemp-mixed cloth, shroud robes, rag-robes; robes made from tree bark, antelope hides, strips of antelope hide; robes of *kusagrass*, bark fabric, or wood-shavings fabric; a blanket made of headhair or of animal wool, [241] a covering made of owls' wings. That is what wanderers of other sects prescribe as solitude with respect to robes.

"This is what wanderers of other sects prescribe as solitude with respect to almsfood: they eat greens, millet, forest rice, hide-parings, moss, rice bran, the scum of rice, sesame flour, grass, or cowdung. They subsist on forest roots and fruits; they feed on fallen fruits. That is what wanderers of other sects prescribe as solitude with respect to almsfood.

"This is what wanderers of other sects prescribe as solitude with respect to lodgings: a forest, the foot of a tree, a charnel ground, remote lodgings in forests and jungle groves, the open air, a heap of straw, a chaff-house. That is what wanderers of other sects prescribe as solitude with respect to lodgings.

"These are the three kinds of solitude that wanderers of other sects prescribe.

"In this Dhamma and discipline, bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of solitude for a bhikkhu. What three?

"Here, (1) a bhikkhu is virtuous; he has abandoned immorality and remains secluded from it. (2) He holds right view; he has abandoned wrong view and remains secluded from it.<sup>198</sup> (3) He is one whose taints are destroyed; he has abandoned the taints and remains secluded from them.

"When a bhikkhu is virtuous, one who has abandoned immorality and remains secluded from it; when he is one of right view, who has abandoned wrong view and remains secluded from it; when he is one whose taints are destroyed, who has abandoned the taints and remains secluded from them, he is then called a bhikkhu who has attained the foremost, attained the core, one who is pure and established in the core.

---

<sup>197</sup> Mp: "Solitude with respect to robes (*cīvarapaviveka*): Separation from defilements arising on account of a robe. The same method with the other two [almsfood and lodgings]."

<sup>198</sup> Mp: "This is said with reference to its abandoning by the path of stream-entry."

"Suppose, bhikkhus, there is a farmer whose field of hill rice has ripened. The farmer would swiftly have the plants cut. Then he would swiftly have the plants collected. Then he would swiftly [242] have them transported [to the threshing place]. Then he would swiftly pile them up, have them threshed, get the straw removed, get the chaff removed, and winnow it. Then he would swiftly have it brought over, get it pounded, and get the husks removed. In this way, the farmer's grains of rice would be foremost, of premium quality, pure, and established in the core.

"So too, bhikkhus, when a bhikkhu is virtuous ... one of right view ... one who has abandoned the taints and remains secluded from them, he is then called a bhikkhu who is foremost, of premium quality, pure, and established in the core."

#### 94 (3) Autumn<sup>199</sup>

"Bhikkhus, just as, in the autumn, when the sky is clear and cloudless, the sun, ascending in the sky, dispels all darkness from space as it shines and beams and radiates, so too, when the dust-free, stainless Dhamma-eye arises in the noble disciple, then, together with the arising of vision, the noble disciple abandons three fetters: identity view, doubt, and wrong grasp of behavior and observances.<sup>200</sup>

"Afterwards, when he departs from two states, longing and ill will, then, secluded from sensual pleasures, secluded from unwholesome states, he enters and dwells in the first jhāna, which consists of rapture and pleasure born of seclusion, accompanied by thought and examination. If, bhikkhus, the noble disciple should pass away on that occasion, there is no fetter bound by which he might return to this world."<sup>201</sup>

#### 95 (4) Assemblies

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of assemblies.<sup>202</sup> What three? The assembly of the foremost, the divided assembly, and the harmonious assembly. [243]

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is the assembly of the foremost? Here, in this kind of assembly the elder bhikkhus do not become luxurious and lax, but discard backsliding and take the lead in solitude; they arouse energy for the attainment of the as-yet-

<sup>199</sup> Ee mistakenly prints this sutta as belonging to the preceding one. Ce, Be, which I follow, treat it as independent.

<sup>200</sup> Mp explains the *dhammacakkhu* with reference to the commentarial conception of momentary path experiences as the "eye of the path of stream-entry that comprehends the Dhamma of the four noble truths."

<sup>201</sup> This phrase normally denotes the attainment of non-returning. Mp, however, identifies this disciple as a "jhāna non-returner" (*jhānānāgāmī*), that is, a stream-enterer or once-returner who also attains jhāna. Though such a practitioner has not yet eliminated the two fetters of sensual desire and ill will, by virtue of attaining jhāna he or she is bound to be reborn in the form realm and attain nibbāna there, without taking another rebirth in the sense-sphere realm.

<sup>202</sup> A partial synthesis of 2:43 and 2:44.

unattained, for the achievement of the as-yet-unachieved, for the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. [Those in] the next generation follow their example. They too do not become luxurious and lax, but discard backsliding and take the lead in solitude; they too arouse energy for the attainment of the as-yet-unattained, for the achievement of the as-yet-unachieved, for the realization of the as-yet-unrealized. This is called the assembly of the foremost.

(2) "And what is the divided assembly? Here, the assembly in which the bhikkhus take to arguing and quarreling and fall into disputes, stabbing each other with piercing words, is called the divided assembly.

(3) "And what is the harmonious assembly? Here, the assembly in which the bhikkhus dwell in concord, harmoniously, without disputes, blending like milk and water, viewing each other with eyes of affection, is called the harmonious assembly.

"When the bhikkhus dwell in concord, harmoniously, without disputes, blending like milk and water, viewing each other with eyes of affection, on that occasion they generate much merit. On that occasion the bhikkhus dwell in a divine abode, that is, in the liberation of mind through altruistic joy. When one is joyful, rapture arises. For one with a rapturous mind, the body becomes tranquil. One tranquil in body feels pleasure. For one feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated.

"Just as, when it is raining and the rain pours down in thick droplets on a mountain top, the water flows down along the slope and fills the cleft, gullies, and creeks; these, becoming full, fill up the pools; these, becoming full, fill up the lakes; these, becoming full, fill up the streams; these, becoming full, fill up the rivers; and these, becoming full, fill up the ocean; so too, when the bhikkhus dwell in concord, harmoniously, without disputes, blending like milk and water, viewing each other [244] with eyes of affection, on that occasion they generate much merit. On that occasion the bhikkhus dwell in a divine abode, that is, in the liberation of mind through altruistic joy. When one is joyful, rapture arises. For one with a rapturous mind, the body becomes tranquil. One tranquil in body feels pleasure. For one feeling pleasure, the mind becomes concentrated.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of assemblies."

#### 96 (5) Thoroughbred (1)

"Bhikkhus, possessing three factors a king's excellent thoroughbred horse is worthy of a king, an accessory of a king, and reckoned as a factor of kingship. What three? Here, a king's excellent thoroughbred horse possesses beauty, strength, and speed. Possessing these three factors, a king's excellent thoroughbred horse is ... reckoned as a factor of kingship.

"So too, possessing three qualities, a bhikkhu is worthy of gifts, worthy of hospitality, worthy of offerings, worthy of reverential salutation, an unsurpassed field of merit for the world. What three? Here, a bhikkhu possesses beauty, strength, and speed.

(1) "And how does a bhikkhu possess beauty? Here, a bhikkhu is virtuous; he dwells restrained by the Pātimokkha, possessed of good conduct and resort, seeing danger in minute faults. Having undertaken the training rules, he trains in them. It is in this way that a bhikkhu possesses beauty.

(2) "And how does a bhikkhu possess strength? Here, a bhikkhu arouses energy for abandoning unwholesome qualities and acquiring wholesome qualities; he is strong, firm in exertion, not casting off the duty of cultivating wholesome qualities. It is in this way that a bhikkhu possesses strength.

(3) "And how does a bhikkhu possess speed? Here, a bhikkhu understands as it really is: 'This is suffering,' and 'This is the origin of suffering,[245] and 'This is the cessation of suffering,' and 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' It is in this way that a bhikkhu possesses speed.

"Possessing these three qualities, a bhikkhu is worthy of gifts, worthy of hospitality, worthy of offerings, worthy of reverential salutation, an unsurpassed field of merit for the world."

#### 97 (6) Thoroughbred (2)

[All as in 3:96, with only the following difference in factor (3):]

"And how does a bhikkhu possess speed? Here, with the utter destruction of the five lower fetters, a bhikkhu is one of spontaneous birth, due to attain final nibbāna there without ever returning from that world. It is in this way that a bhikkhu possesses speed.

"Possessing these three qualities, a bhikkhu is ... an unsurpassed field of merit for the world."

#### 98 (7) Thoroughbred (3)

[All as in 3:96, with only the following difference in factor (3):] [246]

"And how does a bhikkhu possess speed? Here, with the destruction of the taints, a bhikkhu has realized for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it. It is in this way that a bhikkhu possesses speed.

"Possessing these three qualities, a bhikkhu is ... an unsurpassed field of merit for the world."

#### 99 (8) Bark Fabric

"Bhikkhus, when it is new, cloth made of bark fabric<sup>203</sup> is ugly, uncomfortable, and of little value. When it has been worn,<sup>204</sup> cloth made of bark fabric is ugly, uncomfortable, and of little value. When it is old, cloth made of bark fabric is still ugly, uncomfortable, and of little value. They use old cloth made of bark fabric for cleaning pots or they discard it on a rubbish heap.

(1) (i)<sup>205</sup> "So too, bhikkhus, if a junior bhikkhu is immoral, of bad character, this, I say, counts as his ugliness. [247] Just as cloth made of bark fabric is ugly, so, I say, this person is similar.

(ii) "For those who associate with him, resort to him, attend on him, and follow his example, this leads to their harm and suffering for a long time. This, I say, counts as his uncomfortableness. Just as cloth made of bark fabric is uncomfortable, so, I say, this person is similar.

(iii) "When he accepts a robe, almsfood, lodging, and medicines and provisions for the sick, this [acceptance] is not of great fruit and benefit for those [who offer such things]. This, I say, counts as his being of little value. Just as cloth made of bark fabric is of little value, so, I say, this person is similar.

(2) "If a bhikkhu of middle standing ...

(3) If an elder bhikkhu is immoral, of bad character, this, I say, counts as his ugliness ... [all as above] ... Just as cloth made of bark fabric is of little value, so, I say, this person is similar.

"If such an elder bhikkhu speaks in the midst of the Saṅgha, the bhikkhus say to him: 'What gives you, an incompetent fool, the right to speak? Do you think you too are entitled to speak?' He then becomes angry and displeased and utters speech on account of which the Saṅgha expels him, as if [discarding] the clothing made of bark fabric on the rubbish heap.<sup>206</sup>

"When it is new, bhikkhus, cloth from Kāsī is beautiful, comfortable, and of great value. When it has been worn, [248] cloth from Kāsī is beautiful, comfortable, and of great value. When it is old, cloth from Kāsī is beautiful, pleasant to the touch, and of great value. They use old cloth from Kāsī as a wrapping for gems or they deposit it in a fragrant casket.

(1) (i) "So too, if a junior bhikkhu is virtuous, of good character, this, I say, counts as his beauty. Just as cloth from Kāsī is beautiful, so, I say, this person is similar.

---

<sup>203</sup> I translate *potthako* based on Mp's gloss *vākamayavattham*.

<sup>204</sup> Text uses *majjhimo*, lit. "of middle age."

<sup>205</sup> There are two triads in this sutta. Both the immoral and the virtuous monk are distinguished into the junior, the one of middle standing, and the elder, and this distinction forms a triad. Yet under each type, three statements are made—about the monk himself, his effect on those who associate with him, and the merit gained by gifts to him—which also constitute a triad. I indicate the major triad with Arabic numerals and the minor one with small Roman numerals.

<sup>206</sup> In Ee, this sentence marks the end of this sutta and the next paragraph the beginning of a new one. I follow Ce and Be, which treat the passage on the cloth from Kāsī as a continuation of the same sutta. My numbering will now exceed that of Ee by one.

(ii) "For those who associate with him, resort to him, attend on him, and follow his example, this leads to their welfare and happiness for a long time. This, I say, counts as his comfortableness. Just as cloth from Kāsi is comfortable, so, I say, this person is similar.

(iii) "When he accepts a robe, almsfood, lodging, and medicines and provisions for the sick, this [acceptance] is of great fruit and benefit for those [who offer such things]. This, I say, counts as his being of great value. Just as cloth from Kāsi is of great value, so, I say, this person is similar.

(2) "Ifa bhikkhu of middle standing ...

(3) Ifan elder bhikkhu is virtuous, of good character, this, I say, counts as his beauty ... [all as above] ... Just as cloth from Kāsi is of great value, so, I say, this person is similar.

"If such an elder bhikkhu speaks in the midst of the Saṅgha, [249] the bhikkhus say: 'Please let the venerable ones be quiet. An elder bhikkhu is speaking on the Dhamma and the discipline.' Those words of his should be preserved, just as they deposit a cloth from Kāsi in a fragrant casket.<sup>207</sup>

"Therefore, bhikkhus, you should train yourselves thus: 'We will be like cloth from Kāsi, not like cloth made of bark fabric.' It is in such a way that you should train yourselves."

#### 100 (9) A Lump of Salt

"Bhikkhus, if one were to say thus: 'A person experiences kamma in precisely the same way that he created it,' in such a case there could be no living of the spiritual life and no opportunity would be seen for completely making an end of suffering.<sup>208</sup> But if one

<sup>207</sup>

*Tassa taṃ vacanaṃ ādheyyaṃ gacchati gandha-karaṇḍake va naṃ kāsikavatthaṃ nikkhipanti.* This last sentence is included in Ee, in brackets, but not in Ce or Be. However, **Pp 34,37–35,1**, on *tayo kāsikavatthūpamā puggalā*, includes this sentence (but without *nikkhipanti*). I include it because the simile is a fitting counterpart to the one just above about expelling an immoral elder.

<sup>208</sup>

The first position, rejected by the Buddha, reads in Pāli: *Yo, bhikkhave, evaṃ vadeyya, 'yathā yathā 'yaṃ puriso kammaṃ karoti tathā tathā taṃ paṭisaṃvediyatī' ti, evaṃ santaṃ, bhikkhave, brahmacariyavāso na hoti, okāso na paññāyati sammā dukkhassa antakiriyāya.* And the second, affirmed by him, reads: *Yo ca kho, bhikkhave, evaṃ vadeyya, 'yathā yathā vedanīyaṃ ayaṃ puriso kammaṃ karoti tathā tathā 'ssa vipākaṃ paṭisaṃvediyatī' ti, evaṃ santaṃ, bhikkhave, brahmacariyavāso hoti, okāso paññāyati sammā dukkhassa antakiriyāya.*

The exact difference between the two positions is not self-evident. Mp states by way of explanation: "*In precisely the same way*: If one says, 'One experiences the result of kamma in precisely the same way that one created it,' then, since it isn't possible to prevent the result of kamma once done, one would surely experience the result of whatever kamma one has created. *In such a case, there could be no living of the spiritual life*: kamma to be experienced upon rebirth, done prior to the development of the path, would necessarily have to be experienced, whether or not one has lived the spiritual life. *No opportunity would be seen for completely making an end of suffering*: since, in such a case, there is the accumulating of kamma by oneself and the experiencing of its result, therefore an opportunity would not be seen for making an end of the suffering of the round."

were to say thus: 'When a person creates kamma that is to be experienced in a particular way, he experiences its result precisely in that way,' in such a case the living of the spiritual life is possible and an opportunity is seen for completely making an end of suffering.<sup>209</sup>

"Here, bhikkhus, some person has created trifling bad kamma yet it leads him to hell, while some other person here has created exactly the same trifling kamma yet it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

"What kind of person creates trifling bad kamma that leads him to hell? Here, some person is undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom; he is limited and has a mean character,<sup>210</sup> and dwells in suffering.<sup>211</sup> When such a person creates trifling bad kamma, it leads him to hell.

---

The point Mp is trying to make, it seems, is that if one has to experience the result of every kamma one has created of the type to be experienced upon rebirth, and of every kamma one has created of the type to be experienced in some life subsequent to the next, one would have to continue into the next rebirth, and into indefinite future rebirths, in order to experience those results. In such a case, because those karmas are bound to ripen, one would have to remain in saṃsāra forever in order to experience their fruits. It is not at all evident from the sutta itself, however, that this is the intended meaning. It seems, rather, that what the sutta is saying is that one need not experience the result of kamma in *exactly the same way* that one created it (so that, for example, if one killed a person one would not have to be killed in turn). The point is then that when one's wholesome and unwholesome karmas ripen, they will have to be experienced, respectively, as pleasant and as painful, even though the *quantum* of pleasure and pain need not correspond to the moral force of the original action.

<sup>209</sup> Mp explains this in terms of the Abhidhamma theory that kamma is created by the seven *javanacittas*, the karmically active mental events in a cognitive process. The first *javana* is of the type to be experienced in this present life (*ditṭhadhammavedanīya*); if it misses the chance to ripen in this life, it becomes defunct (*ahosi*). The seventh *javana* is to be experienced after rebirth in the next life (*upapajjavedanīya*), and if it misses the chance to ripen in that life, it becomes defunct. The middle five *javanas* are to be experienced on some subsequent occasion (*aparapariyāyavedanīya*), which means that they can ripen any time after the next life for as long as one continues in saṃsāra. Since this theory arose long after the compilation of the Nikāyas, it is improbable that it conveys the purport of the present passage. As I explained in the preceding note, the text seems to be saying simply that when one creates unwholesome kamma, one will experience its result as painful, whether to a strong degree or to a slight degree; but the *degree of the result* cannot be rigidly correlated with the severity of the original action. The converse holds with wholesome kamma, which is to be experienced as pleasant. It is this variability that allows a person, through the development of the path, to overcome the consequences of grave unwholesome kamma and thereby attain the end of suffering in saṃsāra. This interpretation seems to be borne out by the examples given in the sutta.

The Chinese parallel, MĀ 11 (at T I 433a12–434a11), does not make a clear distinction between two contrary positions. I read it thus: "The Buddha told the bhikkhus: '[If one says:] "One receives the result of kamma according to the way it has been done by a person"—in this case, one does not practice the spiritual life and is unable to end suffering. If one says: "One receives the result of kamma according to the way it has been done by a person"—in this case, one practices the spiritual life and is able to end suffering"' (世尊告諸比丘。隨人所作業則受其報。如是。不行梵行不得盡苦。若作是說。隨人所作業則受其報。如是。修行梵行便得盡苦)。Either there has been a mistake here in the textual transmission of the text, or the point in this version is that, of two people who hold the same view about karma, one does not practice and thus does not make an end to suffering, while the other practices and makes an end to suffering.

<sup>210</sup> *Paritto appātumo*. Mp explains: "He is limited because of the limitation of his virtues (*parittagūṇo*). His self (*ātumā*) is his body (*attabhāvo*); even though his body may be large, he has a 'mean

"What kind of person creates exactly the same trifling bad kamma and yet it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue]? Here, some person is developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom. He is unlimited and has a lofty character, and he dwells without measure.<sup>212</sup> When such a person creates exactly the same trifling bad kamma, it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].<sup>213</sup> [250]

(1) "Suppose a man would drop a lump of salt into a small bowl of water. What do you think, bhikkhus? Would that lump of salt make the small quantity of water in the bowl<sup>214</sup> salty and undrinkable?"

"Yes, bhante. For what reason? Because the water in the bowl is limited; thus that lump of salt would make it salty and undrinkable."

"But suppose a man would drop a lump of salt into the river Ganges. What do you think, bhikkhus? Would that lump of salt make the river Ganges become salty and undrinkable?"

"No, bhante. For what reason? Because the river Ganges contains a large volume of water; thus that lump of salt would not make it salty and undrinkable."

"So too, bhikkhus, some person here has created trifling bad kamma yet it leads him to hell, while some other person here has created exactly the same trifling kamma yet it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

"What kind of person creates trifling bad kamma that leads him to hell? Here, some person is undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom. When such a person creates a trifling bad kamma, it leads him to hell.

"What kind of person creates exactly the same trifling bad kamma and yet it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less an abundant [residue]? Here, some person is developed in developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom. When such a person has created exactly the same trifling bad

---

character' because of the limitation of his virtues." *Ātuma(n)* is an alternative form of *atta(n)* (Skt *ātman*). Mp identifies it with *attabhāva*. The Chinese parallel reads the corresponding phrase (occurring at T I 433a28) as "his life span is very short" (壽命甚短).

<sup>211</sup> Text reads *appadukkhavihārī*, which does not fit the context well. Mp offers an unconvincing resolution of the compound: "He dwells in suffering because of his small evil deed" (*appakenapi pāpena dukkhavihārī*). The Chinese parallel has nothing corresponding to this against which to check it. I amend the text to read simply *dukkhavihārī*. It is possible that *appa* entered via a recitation error based on *appamāṇavihārī* just below.

<sup>212</sup> *Aparitto mahattā* (Be: *mahatto*). Mp (Ce): "He is unlimited because his virtues are not limited; even when his body is small, he has 'a great character' because of the greatness of his virtues" (*guṇa-mahantatāya mahattā*). Mp takes all these terms to imply that the person being described is an arahant, which is puzzling since, according to the Abhidhamma philosophy that underlies the commentaries, an arahant does not create any kamma at all. Again, the Chinese parallel (at T I 433b11) interprets this by way of the life span: "he has an extremely long life span" (壽命極長).

<sup>213</sup> That is, a residue to be experienced in future lives.

<sup>214</sup> Be is missing *udakamallake* here.



kamma, it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

(2) "Here, bhikkhus, someone is imprisoned for [stealing] half a *kahāpaṇa*, a *kahāpaṇa*, [251] or a hundred *kahāpaṇas*,<sup>215</sup> while someone else is not imprisoned for [stealing] the same amount of money.

"What kind of person is imprisoned for [stealing] half a *kahāpaṇa*, a *kahāpaṇa*, or a hundred *kahāpaṇas*? Here, someone is poor, with little property and wealth. Such a person is imprisoned for [stealing] half a *kahāpaṇa*, a *kahāpaṇa*, or a hundred *kahāpaṇas*.

"What kind of person is not imprisoned for [stealing] half a *kahāpaṇa*, a *kahāpaṇa*, or a hundred *kahāpaṇas*? Here, someone is rich, with much money and wealth. Such a person is not imprisoned for [stealing] half a *kahāpaṇa*, a *kahāpaṇa*, or a hundred *kahāpaṇas*.

"So too, bhikkhus, some person has created trifling bad kamma yet it leads him to hell, while some other person here has created exactly the same trifling kamma yet it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

"What kind of person creates trifling bad kamma that leads him to hell? Here, some person is undeveloped in body ... and wisdom. When such a person has created trifling bad kamma, it leads him to hell.

"What kind of person creates exactly the same trifling bad kamma and yet it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue]? Here, some person is developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom. When such a person has created exactly the same trifling bad kamma, it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

(3) "Bhikkhus, take the case of a sheep merchant or butcher, [252] who can execute, imprison, fine, or otherwise penalize someone who has stolen one of his sheep, but can't do so to someone else who has stolen his sheep.

"What kind of person<sup>216</sup> can the sheep merchant or butcher execute, imprison, fine, or otherwise penalize for stealing a sheep? One who is poor, with little property and wealth. The sheep merchant or butcher can execute, imprison, fine, or otherwise penalize such a person for stealing a sheep.

"What kind of person can't the sheep merchant or butcher execute, imprison, fine, or otherwise penalize for stealing a sheep? One who is rich, with a lot of money and wealth, a king or royal minister. The sheep merchant or butcher can't execute, imprison,

---

<sup>215</sup> *Kahāpaṇa*: The major unit of currency used in northern India during the Buddha's time.

<sup>216</sup> Where Ce here reads *kathaṃrūpo* and below *evarūpo*, it is better to read with Be and Ee the accusatives *kathaṃrūpaṃ* and *evarūpaṃ*. These words are to be correlated with the accusative present participle *ādiyamānaṃ* occurring in the middle of each sentence; they qualify, not the sheep merchant or butcher, but the person who has stolen the sheep. Curiously, in the counterpart on the rich man, Ce has the right readings *kathaṃrūpaṃ* and *evarūpaṃ*, in agreement with Be and Ee.

fine, or otherwise penalize such a person for stealing a sheep; he can only plead with him: 'Sir, return my sheep or pay me for it.'

"So too, bhikkhus, some person has created trifling bad kamma yet it leads him to hell, while some other person here has created exactly the same trifling kamma yet it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

"What kind of person creates trifling bad kamma that leads him to hell? Here, some person is undeveloped in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom; he is limited and has a mean character, and dwells in suffering. When such kind of [253] person has created a trifling bad kamma, it leads him to hell.

"What kind of person creates exactly the same trifling bad kamma and yet it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less an abundant [residue]? Here, some person is developed in body, virtuous behavior, mind, and wisdom. He is unlimited and has a lofty character, and he dwells without measure. When such a person has created exactly the same trifling bad kamma, it is to be experienced in this very life, without even a slight [residue] being seen, much less abundant [residue].

"If, bhikkhus, one were to say thus: 'A person experiences kamma in precisely the same way that he created it,' in such a case there could be no living of the spiritual life and no opportunity would be seen for completely making an end of suffering. But if one were to say thus: 'When a person creates kamma that is to be experienced in a particular way, he experiences its result precisely in that way,' in such a case the living of the spiritual life is possible and an opportunity is seen for completely making an end of suffering."

#### 101 (10) The Soil Remover

"Bhikkhus, there are gross defilements of gold: soil, grit, and gravel. Now the soil remover or his apprentice first pours the gold into a trough and washes, rinses, and cleans it. When that has been removed and eliminated, there still remain middle-size defilements in the gold: fine grit and coarse sand. The soil remover or his apprentice washes, rinses, and cleans it again. When that has been removed and eliminated, there still remain subtle defilements in the gold: fine sand and black dust. So the soil remover or his apprentice washes, rinses, and cleans it again. When that has been removed and eliminated, only grains of gold remain.

"The goldsmith or his apprentice now pours the gold into a melting pot, and fans it, melts it, [254] and smelts it. But even when this has been done, the gold is not yet

settled and the dross has not yet been entirely removed.<sup>217</sup> The gold is not yet malleable, wieldy, and luminous, but still brittle and not properly fit for work.

"But as the goldsmith or his apprentice continues to fan, melt, and smelt the gold, a time comes when the gold is settled and the dross has been entirely removed, so that the gold becomes malleable, wieldy, and luminous, pliant and properly fit for work. Then whatever kind of ornament the goldsmith wishes to make from it—whether a bracelet, earrings, a necklace, or a golden garland—he can achieve his purpose.

"So too, bhikkhus, when a bhikkhu is devoted to the higher mind, (1) there are in him gross defilements: bodily, verbal, and mental misconduct. An earnest, capable bhikkhu abandons, dispels, terminates, and obliterates them. When this has been done, (2) there remain in him middling defilements: sensual thoughts, thoughts of ill will, and thoughts of harming. An earnest, capable bhikkhu abandons, dispels, terminates, and obliterates them. When this has been done, (3) there remain in him subtle defilements: thoughts about his relations,<sup>218</sup> thoughts about his country, and thoughts about his reputation.<sup>219</sup> An earnest, capable bhikkhu abandons, dispels, terminates, and obliterates them. When this has been done, then there remain thoughts connected with the Dhamma.<sup>220</sup> That concentration is not peaceful and sublime, not gained by

---

<sup>217</sup> I follow Ce here: *dhamati sandhamati niddhamati*. *Taṃ hoti jātārūpaṃ dhantaṃ sandhantaṃ niddhantaṃ, anihitaṃ anikkhittakasāvaṃ*. Be has the same up to *niddhantaṃ*, but it then omits *anihitaṃ* and reads *aniddhantakasāvaṃ* where Ce has *anikkhittakasāvaṃ*. Ee allows a bracketed alternative: *dhamati sandhamati [na] niddhamati. Taṃ hoti jātārūpaṃ dhantaṃ sandhantaṃ aniddhantaṃ, anihitaṃ aninnītakasāvaṃ*. An older Sri Lankan ed. mentioned in a note to Ce also has *aninnītakasāvaṃ*.

<sup>218</sup> I read with Ce, Be *ñātivitakko*, as against Ee *jātivitakko*, "thoughts about [social] class."

<sup>219</sup> *Anavaññattipaṭisaṃyutto vitakko*. Lit. "thought connected with not being looked down upon." The Chinese parallel, SĀ 1246 (at T II 341c12–13), has "thought about rebirth in heaven" (生天覺).

<sup>220</sup> *Dhammavitakkā*. Mp glosses this as thoughts connected with the ten corruptions of insight (*dasa vipassan'upakkilesavitakkā*), but it seems this could just as well mean reflections on the teaching or on the meditation subject.

fulltranquilization,<sup>221</sup> not attained to unification, but isreined in and checkedby forcefully suppressing [the defilements].<sup>222</sup>

"But, bhikkhus,there comes a timewhen his mind becomes internally steady, composed, unified, and concentrated. That concentration is peaceful and sublime, gained by fulltranquilization, and attained to unification; it is not reined in and checked by forcefully suppressing [the defilements].<sup>223</sup> Then, there being a suitable basis, he is capable of realizing any state realizable by direct knowledge towards whichhemight inclinehis mind.<sup>224</sup> [255]

"If he wishes:<sup>225</sup> May I wield the various kinds of psychic potency: having been one, may I become many; having been many, may I become one; may I appear and vanish; may I go unhindered through a wall, through a rampart, through a mountain as though through space; may I dive in and out of the earth as though it were water; may I walk on water without sinking as though it were earth; seated cross-legged, may I travel

<sup>221</sup> Readings differ between *nappaṭipassaddhaladdho* and *nappaṭipassaddhiladdho*. Discrepancies are found even within the same text. Ee is consistent, reading *nappaṭipassaddhaladdho* in the negative sentence and *paṭipassaddhaladdho* in the positive counterpart. Be, however, has *nappaṭipassaddhaladdho* and *paṭipassaddhiladdho* in the respective sentences. To make matters more confusing, Mp (Be) inverts the forms, reading *nappaṭipassaddhiladdho* in the lemma commenting on the negative term, but *paṭipassaddhaladdho* in the lemma commenting on the positive term. Mp (Be), commenting on this sutta, explains *nappaṭipassaddhiladdho* as “not gained by the full tranquilizing of defilements” (*na kilesapaṭipassaddhiyā laddho*) and *paṭipassaddhaladdho* as “gained by the full tranquilizing of defilements” (*kilesapaṭipassaddhiyā laddho*).

Ce reads *na paṭipassaddhiladdho* and *paṭipassaddhiladdho* in the sutta, but Mp (Ce) has *na paṭipassaddhaladdho* and *paṭipassaddhaladdho* in the respective lemmas. Moreover, in 5:27 (where only the positive term occurs), Ce and Be have *paṭipassaddhaladdho* as against Ee *paṭipassaddhiladdho*. Mp (Ce) here reads *paṭipassaddhiladdho* in the lemma, as against Mp (Be) *paṭipassaddhaladdho*. Mp says that *paṭipassaddham* and *paṭipassaddhi* are one in meaning (*idaṃ atthato ekaṃ*), proposing two resolutions: “It is gained by the full tranquilizing of defilements, or it has gained the full tranquilization of defilements (*kilesapaṭipassaddhiyā laddhattākilesapaṭipassaddhibhāvaṃ vā laddhattā*), thus it is *paṭipassaddhiladdho*.”

<sup>222</sup> Ce, Ee *sasaṅkhāraniggayhavāritavato*; in place of *–vato* Be reads the termination as *–gato*. I interpret *sasaṅkhāra* as “forceful” (lit. “with exertion”); *niggayha* as “having suppressed”; *vārita* as “reined in”; and (following Ce) *–vato* as “checked.” A rendering based on the Be variant might be: “but is reached when [the defilements] are reined in by forcefully suppressing [them].”

<sup>223</sup> Ce, Ee *na sasaṅkhāraniggayhavāritavato*; Be *–gato*. SĀ 1246 (atT II 341c21–22) has: “The bhikkhu attains concentration that is not maintained by exertion; he attains the peaceful and sublime, the quiescent happy state, the unified mind, in which all the taints are destroyed” (比丘得諸三昧。不為有行所持。得寂靜勝妙。得息樂道。一心一意。盡諸有漏)。

<sup>224</sup> *Yassa yassa ca abhiññā sacchikaraṇīyassa dhammassa cittaṃ abhininnāmeti abhiññā sacchikiriyaṃ tatra tatveva sakkebhābhataṃ pāpuṇāti sati sati āyatane*. Mp explains the “suitable basis” as “past causes and the presently obtainable jhāna, and other things, which are the basis for the direct knowledges” (*pubbaheṭusaṅkhāte ceva idāni ca paṭiladdhabbe abhiññāpāḍakajjhānādibhede ca sati sati kāraṇe*). The expression occurs at Vism 371,26–33, Ppn 11.122, and is commented upon at Vism-mhṭ (VRI ed. I 429). Vism 376,28–378,2, Ppn 12.14–19, explains the basis for the direct knowledges to be the concentrated mind that has acquired eight qualities: namely, it is (1) purified, (2) cleansed, (3) unblemished, (4) rid of defilement, (5) malleable, (6) wieldy, (7) steady, and (8) attained to imperturbability. Alternatively, it says, “concentrated” may be considered the first quality and “steady and attained to imperturbability” jointly constitute the eighth.

<sup>225</sup> This begins the standard canonical passage on the six kinds of direct knowledge (*abhiññā*). The first five are commented on in detail in Vism chaps. 12 and 13.

in space like a bird; with my hand may I touch and stroke the moon and sun so powerful and mighty; may I exercise mastery with the body as far as the brahmā world,'he is capable of realizing it, there being a suitable basis.

"If he wishes: 'May I, with the divine ear element, which is purified and surpasses the human, hear both kinds of sounds, the divine and human, those that are far as well as near,'he is capable of realizing it, there being a suitable basis.

"If he wishes: 'May I understand the minds of other beings and persons, having encompassed them with my own mind. May I understand a mind with lust as a mind with lust, and a mind without lust as a mind without lust; a mind with hatred as a mind with hatred, and a mind without hatred as a mind without hatred; a mind with delusion as a mind with delusion, and a mind without delusion as a mind without delusion; a contracted mind as contracted and a distracted mind as distracted; an exalted mind as exalted and an unexalted mind as unexalted; a surpassable mind as surpassable and an unsurpassable mind as unsurpassable; a concentrated mind as concentrated and an unconcentrated mind as unconcentrated; a liberated mind as liberated and an unliberated mind as unliberated,'<sup>226</sup>he is capable of realizing it, there being a suitable basis.

"If he wishes: 'May I recollect my manifold past abodes, that is, one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births, ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births, a hundred births, a thousand births, a hundred thousand births, many eons of world-dissolution, many eons of world-evolution, many eons of world-dissolution and world-evolution thus: "There [256] I was so named, of such a clan, with such an appearance, such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life span; passing away from there, I was reborn elsewhere, and there too I was so named, of such a clan, with such an appearance, such was my food, such my experience of pleasure and pain, such my life span; passing away from there, I was reborn here"—may I thus recollect my manifold past abodes with their aspects and details,'he is capable of realizing it, there being a suitable basis.

"If he wishes: 'May I, with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, see beings passing away and being reborn, inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, and understand how beings fare on in accordance with their kamma thus: "These beings who engaged in misconduct by body, speech, and mind, who reviled the noble ones, held wrong view, and undertook kamma based on wrong view, with the breakup of the body, after death, have been reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell; but these beings who engaged in good conduct by body, speech, and mind, who did not revile the noble ones, who held right view, and undertook kamma based on right view, with the breakup of the body, after death, have been reborn in a good destination, in the heavenly world"—thus with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, may I see beings passing away

---

<sup>226</sup> I here follow Ce, Be, which put the liberated mind before the unliberated mind, as against Ee, which inverts them.

and being reborn, inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, fortunate and unfortunate, and understand how beings fare on in accordance with their kamma,'he is capable of realizing it, there being a suitable basis.

"If he wishes: 'May I, with the destruction of the taints, in this very life realize for myself with direct knowledge the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, may I dwell in it,'he is capable of realizing it, there being a suitable basis."

102 (11) A Goldsmith<sup>227</sup>

"Bhikkhus, when a bhikkhu is devoted to the higher mind, from time to time he should give attention to three marks.<sup>228</sup> (1) From time to time he should give attention to the mark of concentration; (2) from time to time to the mark of exertion; and (3) from time to time to the mark of equanimity.

"If a bhikkhu devoted to the higher mind attends exclusively to the mark of concentration, it is possible that his mind will veer towards laziness. If he attends exclusively to the mark of exertion, it is possible that his mind will veer towards restlessness. If [257] he attends exclusively to the mark of equanimity, it is possible that his mind will not be properly concentrated for the destruction of the taints. But when a bhikkhu devoted to the higher mind from time to time gives attention to the mark of concentration, from time to time to the mark of exertion, and from time to time to the mark of equanimity, his mind becomes malleable, wieldy, and luminous, pliant and properly concentrated for the destruction of the taints.

"Suppose, bhikkhus, a goldsmith or his apprentice would prepare a furnace, heat up the crucible, take some gold with tongs, and put it into the crucible. Then from time to time he would blow on it, from time to time sprinkle water over it, and from time to time just look on. If the goldsmith or his apprentice were to exclusively blow on the gold, it is possible that the gold would just burn up. If he were to exclusively sprinkle water on the gold, it is possible the gold would cool down. If he were exclusively to just look on, it is possible the gold would not reach the right consistency. But if the goldsmith or his apprentice from time to time blows on it, from time to time sprinkles water over it, and from time to time just looks on, the gold would become malleable, wieldy, and luminous, pliant and properly fit for work. Then whatever kind of ornament the goldsmith wishes to make from it—whether a bracelet, earrings, a necklace, or a golden garland—he can achieve his purpose.

"So too, when a bhikkhu is devoted to the higher mind, from time to time he should give attention to three marks. From time to time he should give attention to the

---

<sup>227</sup> Ee treats this as a continuation of the preceding sutta, while in Ce and Be, which are clearly correct, it is a different sutta. With the next sutta, my numbering will again exceed Ee's by two.

<sup>228</sup> *Tīṇi nimittāni*. Mp glosses as "three causes" (*tīṇi kāraṇāni*). The three *nimittas* are *samādhinimitta*, *paggahanimitta*, and *upekkhānimitta*.

mark of concentration; from time to time to the mark of exertion; and from time to time to the mark of equanimity.

"If a bhikkhu devoted to the higher mind attends exclusively to the mark of concentration, [258] it is possible that his mind will veer towards laziness. If he attends exclusively to the mark of exertion, it is possible that his mind will veer towards restlessness. If he attends exclusively to the mark of equanimity, it is possible that his mind will not be properly concentrated for the destruction of the taints. But when from time to time he gives attention to the mark of concentration, from time to time to the mark of exertion, and from time to time to the mark of equanimity, his mind becomes malleable, wieldy, and luminous, not brittle but properly concentrated for the destruction of the taints. Then, there being a suitable basis, he is capable of realizing any state realizable by direct knowledge towards which he might incline his mind.

"If he wishes: 'May I wield the various kinds of psychic potency' ... [all as in 3:101, down to:] ... If he wishes: 'May I, with the destruction of the taints, in this very life realize for myself with direct knowledge the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, may I dwell in it,' he is capable of realizing it, there being a suitable basis."

## The Third Fifty

### I. Enlightenment

#### 103 (1) Before

"Bhikkhus, before my enlightenment, while I was just a bodhisatta, not yet fully enlightened, it occurred to me: (1) 'What is the gratification in the world? (2) What is the danger in it? (3) What is the escape from it?'<sup>229</sup>

"Then, bhikkhus, it occurred to me: 'The pleasure and joy that arise in dependence on the world: this is the gratification in the world. That the world is impermanent, suffering, and subject to change: this is the danger in the world. The removal and abandonment of desire and lust for the world: this is the escape from the world.'

"So long, bhikkhus, as I did not directly know as they really are the gratification in the world [259] as gratification, the danger as danger, and the escape from it as escape, I did not claim to have awakened to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment in this world with its devas, Māra, and Brahmā, in this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its devas and humans. But when I directly knew as it really is the gratification in the world as gratification, the danger as danger, and the escape from it as escape, then I claimed to

---

<sup>229</sup> In SN, this "template" and the two to follow are applied separately to the four elements (14:31–33, II 169–73), the five aggregates (22:26–28, III 27–31), and the six sense bases (35:13–18, IV 6–13).

have awakened to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment in this world with ... its devas and humans.

"The knowledge and vision arose in me: 'Unshakable is my liberation of mind; this is my last birth; now there is no more renewed existence.'"

#### 104 (2) Gratification (1)<sup>230</sup>

(1) "Bhikkhus, I set out seeking the gratification in the world. Whatever gratification there is in the world—that I found. I have clearly seen with wisdom just how far the gratification in the world extends.

(2) "I set out seeking the danger in the world. Whatever danger there is in the world—that I found. I have clearly seen with wisdom just how far the danger in the world extends.

(3) "I set out seeking the escape from the world. Whatever escape there is from the world—that I found. I have clearly seen with wisdom just how far the escape from the world extends.

"So long, bhikkhus, as I did not directly know as they really are the gratification in the world as gratification, the danger as danger, and the escape from it as the escape, I did not claim to have awakened to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment in this world with its devas, Māra, and Brahmā, in this generation with its ascetics and brahmins, its devas and humans. But when I directly knew as it really is the gratification in the world as gratification, the danger as danger, and the escape from it as escape, then I claimed to have awakened to the unsurpassed perfect enlightenment in this world with ... its devas and humans.

"The knowledge and vision arose in me: 'Unshakable is my liberation of mind; this is my last birth; now there is no more renewed existence.'"[260]

#### 105 (3) Gratification (2)

"Bhikkhus, (1) if there were no gratification in the world, beings would not become enamored of it; but because there is gratification in the world, beings become enamored of it. (2) If there were no danger in the world, beings would not become disenchanted with it; but because there is danger in the world, beings become disenchanted with it. (3) If there were no escape from the world, beings would not escape from it; but because there is an escape from the world, beings escape from it.

"So long, bhikkhus, as beings have not directly known as they really are the gratification in the world as gratification, the danger as danger, and the escape from it as escape, they have not escaped from this world with its devas, Māra, and Brahmā, from

---

<sup>230</sup> Ee treats this sutta as a continuation of the preceding one, whereas Ce and Be, which I follow, consider it distinct. Thus my numbering will exceed Ee's by three.



this population with its ascetics and brahmins, its devas and humans; they have not become detached from it, released from it, nor do they dwell with a mind rid of barriers. But when beings have directly known as it really is the gratification in the world as gratification, the danger as danger, and the escape from it as escape, then they have escaped from this world with ... its devas and humans; they have become detached from it, released from it, and they dwell with a mind rid of barriers."

#### 106 (4) Ascetics<sup>231</sup>

"Bhikkhus, those ascetics or brahmins who do not understand as it really is (1) the gratification in the world as gratification, (2) the danger as danger, and (3) the escape from it as escape: these I do not consider to be ascetics among ascetics or brahmins among brahmins, and these venerable ones do not, by realizing it for themselves with direct knowledge, in this very life enter and dwell in the goal of asceticism or the goal of brahminhood.

"But those ascetics and brahmins who understand as it really is the gratification in the world as gratification, the danger as danger, and the escape from it as escape: these I consider to be ascetics among ascetics and brahmins among brahmins, and these venerable ones, by realizing it for themselves with direct knowledge, in this very life enter and dwell in the goal of asceticism and the goal of brahminhood." [261]

#### 107 (5) Wailing

"Bhikkhus, (1) in the Noble One's discipline, singing is wailing. (2) In the Noble One's discipline, dancing is madness. (3) In the Noble One's discipline, to laugh excessively, displaying one's teeth, is childishness. Therefore, bhikkhus, in regard to singing and dancing [let there be] the demolition of the bridge. When you smile rejoicing in the Dhamma, you may simply show a smile."<sup>232</sup>

#### 108 (6) No Satiation

"Bhikkhus, there are three things that give no satiation by indulging in them. What three? (1) There is no satiation by indulging in sleep. (2) There is no satiation by indulging in liquor and wine. (3) There is no satiation by indulging in sexual intercourse. These are the three things that give no satiation by indulging in them."

---

<sup>231</sup> Again, Ee treats this sutta as a continuation of the preceding one, whereas Ce and Be, which I follow, count it separately. Thus from the next sutta on my numbering exceeds Ee's by four.

<sup>232</sup> *Setughāto gīte, setughāto nacce*. Mp: "Let there be the demolition of the condition for singing. He shows: 'Abandon singing together with its cause.' The same method with regard to dancing." On *setughāto*, see too above **<n. 159>** *Alaṃ vo dhammappamoditānaṃ sataṃ sitaṃ sitamattāya*. Mp: "When there is a reason to smile [in rejoicing in the Dhamma], it is proper to smile merely by showing the tips of your teeth simply to show that you are pleased."

## 109 (7) Peaked Roof (1)

Then the householder Anāthapiṇḍika approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, and sat down to one side. The Blessed One then said to him:

"Householder, when the mind is unprotected, bodily, verbal, and mental actions are unprotected.

"For one whose bodily, verbal, and mental deeds are unprotected, bodily, verbal, and mental actions become tainted.<sup>233</sup> For one whose bodily, verbal, and mental deeds become tainted, bodily, verbal, and mental actions become rotten. One whose bodily, verbal, and mental deeds become rotten will not have a good death.<sup>234</sup>

"Suppose a house with a peaked roof is badly thatched: then the roof peak, the rafters, and the walls are unprotected; the roof peak, the rafters, and the walls become tainted; the roof peak, the rafters, and the walls become rotten.

"So too, householder, [262] when the mind is unprotected, bodily, verbal, and mental actions are unprotected ... One whose bodily, verbal, and mental deeds are rotten will not have a good death.

"When, householder, the mind is protected, bodily, verbal, and mental actions are protected.

"For one whose bodily, verbal, and mental deeds are protected, bodily, verbal, and mental actions do not become tainted. For one whose bodily, verbal, and mental deeds do not become tainted, bodily, verbal, and mental actions do not become rotten. One whose bodily, verbal, and mental deeds do not become rotten will have a good death.

"Suppose a house with a peaked roof is well thatched: then the roof peak, the rafters, and the walls are protected; the roof peak, the rafters, and the walls do not become tainted; the roof peak, the rafters, and the walls do not become rotten.

"So too, householder, when the mind is protected, bodily, verbal, and mental actions are protected ... One whose bodily, verbal, and mental deeds do not become rotten will have a good death."

## 110 (8) Peaked Roof (2)

The Blessed One then said to the householder Anāthapiṇḍika:

"Householder, when the mind has failed, bodily, verbal, and mental actions fail. One whose bodily, verbal, and mental deeds fail will not have a good death.

"Suppose a house with a peaked roof is badly thatched: then the roof peak, the rafters, and the walls fail. So too, when the mind has failed, bodily, verbal, and mental

---

<sup>233</sup> I here use "deed" for *kammanta* and "action" for *kamma*. In this context it seems there is no real difference between the two, the text itself shifting from one to the other as if they were synonymous.

"Tainted" renders *avassuta*, pp of *avassavati*, related via the verb *savati*, "to flow," to the noun *āsava*.

<sup>234</sup> I use one word where the Pāli uses two synonymous terms for death, *maraṇam* and *kālakiriyā*.

actions fail. One whose bodily, verbal, and mental deeds have failed will not have a good death.

"Householder, when the mind has not failed, bodily, verbal, and mental actions do not fail. One whose deeds of body, speech, and mind do not fail will have a good death.

"Suppose a house with a peaked roof is well thatched: then the roof peak, [263] the rafters, and the walls do not fail. So too, when the mind has not failed, bodily, verbal, and mental actions do not fail. One whose deeds of body, speech, and mind do not fail will have a good death."

#### 111 (9) Causes (1)

"Bhikkhus, there are these three causes for the origination of kamma. What three? Greed is a cause for the origination of kamma; hatred is a cause for the origination of kamma; delusion is a cause for the origination of kamma.

(1) "Any kamma fashioned by greed, born of greed, caused by greed, originating from greed, is unwholesome and blameworthy and results in suffering. That kamma leads to the origination of kamma, not to the cessation of kamma."<sup>235</sup>

(2) "Any kamma fashioned by hatred ... (3) Any kamma fashioned by delusion, born of delusion, caused by delusion, originating from delusion, is unwholesome and blameworthy and results in suffering. That kamma leads to the origination of kamma, not to the cessation of kamma.

"These are the three causes for the origination of kamma."<sup>236</sup>

"There are, bhikkhus, these three [other] causes for the origination of kamma."<sup>237</sup> What three? Non-greed is a cause for the origination of kamma; non-hatred is a cause for the origination of kamma; non-delusion is a cause for the origination of kamma.

(1) "Any kamma fashioned by non-greed, born of non-greed, caused by non-greed, originating from non-greed, is wholesome and blameless and results in happiness. That kamma leads to the cessation of kamma, not to the origination of kamma.

(2) "Any kamma fashioned by non-hatred ... (3) Any kamma fashioned by non-delusion, born of non-delusion, caused by non-delusion, originating from non-delusion, is wholesome and blameless and results in happiness. That kamma leads to the cessation of kamma, not to the origination of kamma.

"These are the three [other] causes for the origination of kamma." [264]

#### 112 (10) Causes (2)

---

<sup>235</sup> Mp: "This kamma brings the origination—that is, the accumulation—of other kamma leading towards the round [of rebirths]."

<sup>236</sup> Ee treats this sentence as the end of the sutta and the next sentence as the beginning of a new sutta. Ce and Be, in accordance with the *uddāna* verse, take this to be a single sutta divided into two parts by way of the unwholesome and wholesome roots.

<sup>237</sup> Mp: "This kamma leads to the origination of kammās going towards the end of the round [of rebirths]."

"Bhikkhus, there are these three causes for the origination of kamma. What three?  
 (1) Desire arises with reference to things in the past that are the basis for desire and lust.  
 (2) Desire arises with reference to things in the future that are the basis for desire and lust.  
 (3) Desire arises with reference to things presently existing that are the basis for desire and lust.

(1) "And how, bhikkhus, does desire arise with reference to things in the past that are the basis for desire and lust? One thinks about and mentally examines things in the past that are the basis for desire and lust. As one does so, desire arises. When desire springs up, one is fettered by those things. The mental infatuation is what I call the fetter. It is in this way that desire arises with reference to things in the past that are the basis for desire and lust.

(2) "And how does desire arise with reference to things in the future that are the basis for desire and lust? One thinks about and mentally examines things in the future that are the basis for desire and lust. As one does so, desire arises. When desire springs up, one is fettered by those things. The mental infatuation is what I call the fetter. It is in this way that desire arises with reference to things in the future that are the basis for desire and lust.

(3) "And how does desire arise with reference to things presently existing that are the basis for desire and lust? One thinks about and mentally examines things presently existing that are the basis for desire and lust. As one does so, desire arises. When desire springs up, one is fettered by those things. The mental infatuation is what I call the fetter. It is in this way that desire arises with reference to things presently existing that are the basis for desire and lust.

"These are the three causes for the origination of kamma."<sup>238</sup> [265]

"There are, bhikkhus, these three [other] causes for the origination of kamma. What three? Desire does not arise with reference to things in the past that are the basis for desire and lust. Desire does not arise with reference to things in the future that are the basis for desire and lust. Desire does not arise with reference to things presently existing that are the basis for desire and lust.

(1) "And how, bhikkhus, does desire not arise with reference to things in the past that are the basis for desire and lust? One understands the future result of things in the past that are the basis for desire and lust. Having understood the future result, one avoids it.<sup>239</sup> Having avoided it, one becomes dispassionate in mind, and having pierced through

<sup>238</sup> Ee again treats this sentence as the end of the sutta and the next sentence as the beginning of a new sutta (no. 110), while Ce and Be, which I follow, take this to be a single sutta divided into two sections. My numbering, from the next sutta on, exceeds Ee's by two.

<sup>239</sup> Here—and in the parallel passages below—I follow the Ce reading: ... *tadabhinivajjeti. Tadabhinivajjetvā cetasā abhivirājetvā*. Be has *tadabhinivatteti. Tadabhinivattetvā cetasā abhinivijjhitvā*. Ee has *tadabhinivaddheti* and *tadabhinivaddhetvā*, which cannot be correct. However, just below Ee agrees with Ce, as against Be, in reading *abhivirājetvā*.

with wisdom, one sees.<sup>240</sup> It is in this way that desire does not arise with reference to things in the past that are the basis for desire and lust.

(2) "And how, bhikkhus, does desire not arise with reference to things in the future that are the basis for desire and lust? One understands the future result of things in the future that are the basis for desire and lust. Having understood the future result, one avoids it. Having avoided it, one becomes dispassionate in mind and, having pierced through with wisdom, one sees. It is in this way that desire does not arise with reference to things in the future that are the basis for desire and lust.

(3) "And how, bhikkhus, does desire not arise with reference to things presently existing that are the basis for desire and lust? One understands the future result of things presently existing that are the basis for desire and lust. Having understood the future result, one avoids it. Having avoided it, one becomes dispassionate in mind and, having pierced through with wisdom, one sees. It is in this way that desire does not arise with reference to things presently existing that are the basis for desire and lust.

"These are the three [other] causes for the origination of kamma."

## II. Bound for the Plane of Misery

### 113 (1) Bound for the Plane of Misery

"Bhikkhus, there are three who, if they do not abandon this [fault of theirs], are bound for the plane of misery, bound for hell. Which three? [266] (1) One who, though not celibate, claims to be celibate; (2) one who slanders a pure celibate leading a pure celibate life with a groundless charge of non-celibacy; and (3) one who holds such a doctrine and view as this: 'There is no fault in sensual pleasures,' and then falls into indulgence in sensual pleasures.<sup>241</sup> These are the three who, if they do not abandon this [fault of theirs], are bound for the plane of misery, bound for hell."

### 114 (2) Rare

"Bhikkhus, the manifestation of three [persons] is rare in the world. What three?

(1) The manifestation of a Tathāgata, an Arahant, a Perfectly Enlightened One is rare in

<sup>240</sup> *Paññāya ativijjha passati*. Mp: "One sees having penetrated it with the wisdom of the path together with insight."

<sup>241</sup> *So kāmesu pātavyatam āpajjati* (Be adds *tāya* before *kāmesu*, probably representing *tāya diṭṭhiyā*). Mp: "Indulgence: [the view that] they are to be drunk, to be enjoyed; [he thinks they are] to be enjoyed with a mind without hesitation, just as water is to be drunk by one who is thirsty" (*pīvitabbatam paribhuñjitabbatam nirāsakena cittena pipāsītassa pāṇīyapivanasadisam paribhuñjitabbatam*). Ps II 371,22-24, commenting on *pātavyatam āpajjanti* at MN I 305,21, says: "He falls into [the view that] one should drink up sensual objects with the defilement of sensuality, that they are to be enjoyed according to one's pleasure" (*te vatthukāmesu kilesakāmena* has a similar comment on the same Pāli expression *pātavyatam pīvitabbatam, yathāruci paribhuñjitabbatam āpajjanti ti attho*). *Pātabba* (= *pātavya*) occurs as an optative participle of *pīvati*, to drink, at Vin II 208,11.

the world. (2) A person who teaches the Dhamma and discipline proclaimed by the Tathāgata is rare in the world. (3) A grateful and thankful person is rare in the world. The manifestation of these three [persons] is rare in the world."

#### 115 (3) Immeasurable

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world. What three? The one who is easily measured, the one who is hard to measure, and the immeasurable one.

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is the person who is easily measured? Here, some person is restless, puffed up, personally vain, talkative, rambling in his talk, muddle-minded, without clear comprehension, unconcentrated, with a wandering mind, with loose sense faculties. This is called the person who is easily measured.

(2) "And what the person who is hard to measure? Here, some person is not restless, puffed up, and personally vain; he is not talkative and rambling in his talk; he has mindfulness established and clearly comprehends, is concentrated, with a one-pointed mind, with restrained sense faculties. This is called the person who is hard to measure.

(3) "And what is the person who is immeasurable? Here, a bhikkhu is an arahant, one whose taints have been destroyed. This is called the person who is immeasurable.

"These are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world." [267]

#### 116 (4) Imperturbable

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world. What three?

(1) "Here, bhikkhus, with the complete surmounting of perceptions of forms, with the passing away of perceptions of sensory impingement, with non-attention to perceptions of diversity, [perceiving] 'space is infinite,' some person enters and dwells in the base of the infinity of space. He relishes it, desires it, and finds satisfaction in it. If he is firm in it, resolved on it, often dwells in it, and has not lost it when he dies, he is reborn in companionship with the devas of the base of the infinity of space. The lifespan of the devas of the base of the infinity of space is 20,000 eons. The worldling remains there all his life, and when he has completed the entire lifespan of those devas, he goes to hell, to the animal realm, or to the sphere of afflicted spirits.<sup>242</sup> But the Blessed One's disciple remains there all his life, and when he has completed the entire lifespan of those devas, he attains final nibbāna in that very same state of existence. This is the distinction, the

---

<sup>242</sup> According to the Theravāda Abhidhamma, on passing away from the formless realm, a worldling may be reborn on the same formless plane, on a higher formless plane, or in the sense-sphere realm with a three-rooted rebirth consciousness. This means that they will be reborn either as an intelligent human being or as a deva. Rebirth into the lower planes can occur in later rebirths, but not in the rebirth immediately following the fall from the formless realm. See CMA 226–27.

disparity, the difference between the instructed noble disciple and the uninstructed worldling, that is, when there is future destination and rebirth.<sup>243</sup>

(2) "Again, by completely surmounting the base of the infinity of space, [perceiving] 'consciousness is infinite,' someone here enters and dwells in the base of the infinity of consciousness. He relishes it, desires it, and finds satisfaction in it. If he is firm in it, resolved on it, often dwells in it, and has not lost it when he dies, he is reborn in companionship with the devas of the base of the infinity of consciousness. The life span of the devas of the base of the infinity of consciousness is 40,000 eons. The worldling remains there all his life, and when he has completed the entire life span of those devas, he goes to hell, to the animal realm, or to the sphere of afflicted spirits. But the Blessed One's disciple remains there all his life, and when he has completed the entire life span of those devas, he attains final nibbāna in that very same state of existence. This is the distinction, the disparity, the difference [268] between the instructed noble disciple and the uninstructed worldling, that is, when there is future destination and rebirth.

---

<sup>243</sup> I read with Ce, Ee: *yadidaṃ gatiyā upapattiyā sati*. Be omits *sati* here (and in the next two paragraphs), but includes it in the parallels at 4:123 and 4:125. Mp, commenting on 4:123, explains: "When there is future destination and rebirth, the noble disciple who is a trainee does not descend to a lower rebirth but attains final nibbāna in the same form-sphere existence [or] in a higher realm." The same applies, with the appropriate modification, to those reborn in formless-sphere existence.

Mp-ṭi to 4:123 sheds light on the question how noble disciples can be reborn in the formless realm: "When the Buddha speaks of the life spans of humans and devas, he does not give specific figures for the life span [of those] in the four planes of misery and earth-bound devas. Why not? Because in hell, kamma alone determines [the life span]; one suffers there until one's kamma is exhausted. The same holds for the other planes of misery. Kamma also determines the life span for earth-bound devas. For some reborn there remain there only for a week, some for two weeks, and some for an eon.

"Among humans, some laypeople become stream-enterers and attain the fruit of once-returning, the fruit of non-returning, and even arahantship. Of these, stream-enterers, etc., can remain [in the lay life] their entire lives, but arahants either attain final nibbāna or go forth [into homelessness]. Why? Because arahantship is the most virtuous state and the lay life is inferior. It isn't possible for arahants to sustain the most virtuous state in an inferior condition, so they either attain final nibbāna [i.e., pass away] or go forth. But when earth-bound devas attain arahantship they remain their entire lives; stream-enterers and once-returners among the six classes of sense-sphere devas remain their entire lives. For a non-returner it is suitable to go to a form-sphere existence, and for arahants to attain final nibbāna. Why? Because there is no chance that they might regress. In the form and formless realms, all remain for their entire life spans. Stream-enterers and once-returners reborn in the form realm do not return to this world, but attain final nibbāna there. They are called 'jhāna non-returners.'

"But what determines [rebirth] for those who gain the eight meditative attainments? The jhāna in which they are proficient does, for they are reborn in accordance with whatever they are proficient in. If they are proficient in all, what determines [their rebirth]? The attainment of the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception, for they are definitely reborn in the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception. For noble disciples reborn among the nine brahma worlds, rebirth may occur there [in the same plane] or in a higher one, but not in a lower one. But worldlings may be reborn in the same plane, in a higher one, or in a lower one. Noble disciples in the five pure abodes and the four formless planes may be reborn in the same plane or in a higher one. A non-returner reborn in the plane of the first jhāna purifies the nine brahma worlds and attains final nibbāna while dwelling at the peak. Three deva worlds are called the 'best states of existence': the plane of great fruit (*vehapphala*), Akaniṭṭha, and the base of neither-perception-nor-non-perception. Non-returners reborn in these three states do not go higher, nor lower, but attain final nibbāna right there."

(3) "Again, bhikkhus, by completely surmounting the base of the infinity of consciousness[perceiving] 'there is nothing,' some person here enters and dwells in the base of nothingness. He relishes it, desires it and finds satisfaction in it. If he is firm in it, resolved on it, often dwells in it, and has not lost it when he dies, he is reborn in companionship with the devas of the base of nothingness. The life span of the devas of the base of nothingness is 60,000 eons. The worldling remains there all his life, and when he has completed the entire life span of those devas, he goes to hell, to the animal realm, or to the sphere of afflicted spirits. But the Blessed One's disciple remains there all his life, and when he has completed the entire life span of those devas, he attains final nibbāna in that very same state of existence. This is the distinction, the disparity, the difference between the instructed noble disciple and the uninstructed worldling, that is, when there is future destination and rebirth.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world."

#### 117 (5) Failures and Accomplishments

"Bhikkhus, there are these three failures. What three? Failure in virtuous behavior, failure in mind, and failure in view.

(1) "And what is failure in virtuous behavior? Here, someone destroys life, takes what is not given, engages in sexual misconduct, speaks falsehood, speaks divisively, speaks harshly, and indulges in idle chatter. This is called failure in virtuous behavior.

(2) "And what is failure in mind? Here, someone is full of longing and has a mind of ill will. This is called failure in mind.

(3) "And what is failure in view? Here, someone holds wrong view and has an incorrect perspective thus: 'There is nothing given, nothing sacrificed, nothing offered; there is no [269] fruit or result of good and bad actions; there is no this world, no other world; there is no mother, no father; there are no beings spontaneously reborn; there are in the world no ascetics and brahmins of right conduct and right practice who, having realized this world and the other world for themselves by direct knowledge, make them known to others.' This is called failure in view.

"Because of failure in virtuous behavior, with the breakup of the body, after death, beings are reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell. Because of failure in mind ... Because of failure in view, with the breakup of the body, after death, beings are reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three failures.

"There are, bhikkhus, these three accomplishments. What three? Accomplishment in virtuous behavior, accomplishment in mind, and accomplishment in view.

(1) "And what is accomplishment in virtuous behavior? Here, someone abstains from the destruction of life, from taking what is not given, from sexual misconduct, from



false speech, from divisive speech, from harsh speech, and from idle chatter. This is called accomplishment in virtuous behavior.

(2) "And what is accomplishment in mind? Here, someone is without longing and has a mind free of ill will. This is called accomplishment in mind.

(3) "And what is accomplishment in view? Here, someone holds right view and has a correct perspective thus: 'There is what is given, sacrificed, and offered; there is fruit and result of good and bad actions; there is this world and the other world; there is mother and father; there are beings spontaneously reborn; there are in the world ascetics and brahmins of right conduct and right practice who, having realized this world and the other world for themselves by direct knowledge, make them known to others.' This is called accomplishment in view. [270]

"Because of accomplishment in virtuous behavior, with the breakup of the body, after death, beings are reborn in a good destination, in a heavenly world. Because of accomplishment in mind ... Because of accomplishment in view, with the breakup of the body, after death, beings are reborn in a good destination, in a heavenly world.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three accomplishments."

## 118 (6) Dice

"Bhikkhus, there are these three failures. What three? Failure in virtuous behavior, failure in mind, and failure in view.

"And what is failure in virtuous behavior? Here, someone destroys life ... [as in 3:117] ... This is called failure in view.

"Because of failure in virtuous behavior, with the breakup of the body, after death, beings are reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell. Because of failure in mind ... Because of failure in view, with the breakup of the body, after death, beings are reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell.

"Just as dice,<sup>244</sup> when thrown upward, will rest firmly wherever they fall, so too, because of failure in virtuous behavior ... failure in mind ... failure in view, with the breakup of the body, after death, beings are reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three failures.

"There are, bhikkhus, these three accomplishments. What three? Accomplishment in virtuous behavior, accomplishment in mind, and accomplishment in view.

---

<sup>244</sup> *Apaṇṇako maṇi*. Mp-ṭ says it is a special kind of die with six surfaces, similar to a jewel, used by those devoted to the game of dice (*evaṃ chahi talehi samannāgato pāsakakīḷāpasutānaṃ maṇisadiso pāsakaviseso*). I use the more familiar plural form rather than the singular "die."

"And what, bhikkhus, is accomplishment in virtuous behavior? Here, someone abstains from the destruction of life ... [as in 3:117] ... This is called accomplishment in view.

"Because of accomplishment in virtuous behavior, with the breakup of the body, after death, beings are reborn in a good destination, in a heavenly world. Because of accomplishment in mind ... Because of accomplishment in view, with the breakup of the body, after death, beings are reborn in a good destination, in a heavenly world.

"Just as dice, when thrown upward, will rest firmly wherever they fall, so too, because of accomplishment in virtuous behavior ... accomplishment in mind ... accomplishment in view, with the breakup of the body, after death, beings are reborn in a good destination, in a heavenly world.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three accomplishments."

#### 119 (7) Activity

"Bhikkhus, there are these three failures. What three? Failure in activity, failure in livelihood, and failure in view.

(1) "And what is failure in activity? Here, someone destroys life ... and indulges in idle chatter. This is called failure in activity.

(2) "And what is failure in livelihood? Here, someone is of wrong livelihood and earns a living by a wrong type of livelihood. This is called failure in livelihood.

(3) "And what is failure in view? [271] Here, someone holds wrong view and has an incorrect perspective thus: 'There is nothing given ... there are in the world no ascetics and brahmins of right conduct and right practice who, having realized this world and the other world for themselves by direct knowledge, make them known to others.' This is called failure in view.

"These are the three failures.

"There are, bhikkhus, these three accomplishments. What three? Accomplishment in activity, accomplishment in livelihood, and accomplishment in view.

(1) "And what is accomplishment in activity? Here, someone abstains from the destruction of life ... and from idle chatter. This is called accomplishment in activity.

(2) "And what is accomplishment in livelihood? Here, someone is of right livelihood and earns a living by a right type of livelihood. This is called accomplishment in livelihood.

(3) "And what is accomplishment in view? Here, someone holds right view and has a correct perspective thus: 'There is what is given ... there are in the world ascetics and brahmins of right conduct and right practice who, having realized this world and the other world for themselves by direct knowledge, make them known to others.' This is called accomplishment in view.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three accomplishments."

## 120 (8) Purity (1)

"Bhikkhus, there are these three purities. What three? Bodily purity, verbal purity, and mental purity.

(1) "And what is bodily purity? Here, someone abstains from the destruction of life, from taking what is not given, and from sexual misconduct. This is called bodily purity.

(2) "And what is verbal purity? Here, someone abstains from false speech, from divisive speech, from harsh speech, and from idle chatter. This is called verbal purity.

(3) "And what is mental purity? Here, someone is without longing, without ill will, [272] and holds right view. This is called mental purity.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three purities."

## 121 (9) Purity (2)

"Bhikkhus, there are these three purities. What three? Bodily purity, verbal purity, and mental purity.

(1) "And what is bodily purity? Here, a bhikkhu abstains from the destruction of life, from taking what is not given, and from sexual activity. This is called bodily purity.

(2) "And what is verbal purity? Here, a bhikkhu abstains from false speech, from divisive speech, from harsh speech, and from idle chatter. This is called verbal purity.

(3) "And what is mental purity?"<sup>245</sup> Here, when there is sensual desire in him, a bhikkhu understands: 'There is sensual desire in me'; or when there is no sensual desire in him, he understands: 'There is no sensual desire in me'; and he also understands how unarisen sensual desire arises, how arisen sensual desire is abandoned, and how abandoned sensual desire does not arise again in the future.'

"When there is ill will in him ... When there is dullness and drowsiness in him ... When there is restlessness and remorse in him ... [273] ... When there is doubt in him, he understands: 'There is doubt in me'; or when there is no doubt in him, he understands: 'There is no doubt in me'; and he also understands how unarisen doubt arises, how arisen doubt is abandoned, and how abandoned doubt does not arise again in the future. This is called mental purity.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three purities."

90. Pure in body, pure in speech,  
pure in mind, without taints:  
they call the pure one, accomplished in purity,

---

<sup>245</sup> The definition of mental purity here replicates the section of the Satipatthāna Sutta on contemplation of the five hindrances (DN 22.13, II 300,4–301,24; MN 10.36, I 60,7–36).

"one who has washed away evil."

## 122 (10) Sagacity

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of sagacity. What three? Bodily sagacity, verbal sagacity, and mental sagacity.

(1) "And what is bodily sagacity? Here, someone abstains from the destruction of life, from taking what is not given, and from sexual activity. This is called bodily sagacity.

(2) "And what is verbal sagacity? Here, someone abstains from false speech, from divisive speech, from harsh speech, and from idle chatter. This is called verbal sagacity.

(3) "And what is mental sagacity? Here, with the destruction of the taints, a bhikkhu has realized for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it. This is called mental sagacity.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of sagacity."

A sage by body, a sage in speech,  
a sage in mind, without taints:  
they call the sage, accomplished in sagacity,  
"one who has abandoned all." [274]

## III. Bharaṇḍu<sup>246</sup>

## 123 (1) Kusinārā

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Kusinārā, in the Balihaṇḍa forest thicket. There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus ...

"Here, bhikkhus, a bhikkhu dwells in dependence on a certain village or town. A householder or a householder's son approaches him and invites him for the next day's meal. If he wishes, the bhikkhu accepts. When the night has passed, in the morning the bhikkhu dresses, takes his bowl and robe, and goes to the residence of that householder or householder's son. He sits down in the seat that has been prepared and that householder or householder's son, with his own hand, serves and satisfies him with various kinds of delicious food. (1) It occurs to him: 'How good, indeed, that this householder or householder's son, with his own hand, serves and satisfies me with various kinds of delicious food!' (2) It also occurs to him: 'Oh, in the future too may this householder or householder's son, with his own hand, serve and satisfy me with a similar variety of delicious food!' (3) He uses that food while being tied to it, infatuated with it, blindly absorbed in it, not seeing the danger in it and understanding the escape from it. He thinks

<sup>246</sup>

Again, I rely on the summary verse in Ce (electronic) for titles.

sensual thoughts in relation to it; he thinks thoughts of ill will; he thinks thoughts of harming. What is given to such a bhikkhu, I say, is not of great fruit. For what reason? Because the bhikkhu is heedless.

"Here, a bhikkhu dwells in dependence on a certain village or town. A householder or a householder's son approaches him and invites him for the next day's meal. If he wishes, the bhikkhu accepts. When the night has passed, in the morning the bhikkhu dresses, takes his bowl and robe, and goes to the residence of that householder or householder's son. He sits down in the seat that has been prepared and that householder or householder's son, with his own hand, serves and satisfies him with various kinds of delicious food. (1) It does not occur to him: 'How good, indeed, that this householder [275] or householder's son, with his own hand, serves and satisfies me with various kinds of delicious food!' (2) It also does not occur to him: 'Oh, in the future too may this householder or householder's son, with his own hand, serve and satisfy me with a similar variety of delicious food!' (3) He uses that food without being tied to it, infatuated with it, and blindly absorbed in it, but seeing the danger in it and understanding the escape from it. He thinks thoughts of renunciation in relation to it; he thinks thoughts of non-ill will; he thinks thoughts of non-harming. What is given to such a bhikkhu, I say, is of great fruit. For what reason? Because the bhikkhu is heedful."

#### 124 (2) Arguments

"Bhikkhus, wherever bhikkhus take to arguing and quarreling and fall into a dispute, stabbing each other with piercing words, I am uneasy even about directing my attention there, let alone about going there. I conclude about them: 'Surely, those venerable ones have abandoned three things and cultivated three [other] things.'

"What are the three things they have abandoned? Thoughts of renunciation, thoughts of non-ill will, and thoughts of non-harming. These are the three things they have abandoned.

"What are the three things they have cultivated? Sensual thoughts, thoughts of ill will, and thoughts of harming. These are the three things they have cultivated.

"Wherever bhikkhus take to arguing and quarreling and fall into a dispute ... I conclude: 'Surely, those venerable ones have abandoned these three things and cultivated these three [other] things.'

"Bhikkhus, wherever bhikkhus are dwelling in concord, harmoniously, without disputes, blending like milk and water, viewing each other with eyes of affection, I am at ease about going there, let alone about directing my attention there. I conclude: 'Surely, those venerable ones have abandoned three things and cultivated three [other] things.'

"What are the three things they have abandoned? [276] Sensual thoughts, thoughts of ill will, and thoughts of harming. These are the three things they have abandoned.

"What are the three things they have cultivated? Thoughts of renunciation, thoughts of non-ill will, and thoughts of non-harming. These are the three things they have cultivated.

"Wherever bhikkhus are dwelling in concord ... I conclude: 'Surely, those venerable ones have abandoned these three things and cultivated these three [other] things.'"

#### 125 (3) Gotamaka

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Vesālī at the Gotamaka Shrine.<sup>247</sup> There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus ...

"Bhikkhus, (1) I teach the Dhamma through direct knowledge, not without direct knowledge. (2) I teach the Dhamma with reasons, not without reasons. (3) I teach the Dhamma accompanied by wonders, not without wonders.<sup>248</sup> Since I teach the Dhamma through direct knowledge, not without direct knowledge; since I teach the Dhamma with reasons, not without reasons; since I teach the Dhamma accompanied by wonders, not without wonders, my exhortation should be acted upon, my instructions should be acted upon. It is enough for you to rejoice, enough for you to be elated, enough for you to be joyful: 'The Blessed One is perfectly enlightened! The Dhamma is well expounded by the Blessed One! The Saṅgha is practicing the good path!'"

This is what the Blessed One said. Elated, those bhikkhus delighted in the Blessed One's statement. And while this discourse was being spoken, the thousandfold world system shook.

#### 126 (4) Bharaṇḍu

On one occasion the Blessed One was wandering on tour among the Kosalans when he reached Kapilavatthu. Mahānāma the Sakyan heard: "The Blessed One has arrived at Kapilavatthu." Then Mahānāma the Sakyan approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, and stood to one side. The Blessed One then said to him:

---

<sup>247</sup> Mp: "In the first twenty years after the enlightenment, the Tathāgata often stayed among the deva communities (*devakulesuyeva*): sometimes at the Cāpāla Shrine, sometimes at the Sārandada, sometimes at the Bahuputta, and sometimes at the Gotamaka. Since he was living at Vesālī at this time, he stayed at the abode of the Gotamaka spirit." Mp explains that this sutta was spoken as a sequel to the Mūlapariyāya Sutta (MN 1). The background story, told at **Ps I 56–59**, and translated at Bodhi 2006:82–86, relates that a group of brahmins had taken ordination under the Buddha and quickly mastered his teachings. Filled with pride on account of their learning, they no longer went to listen to the Dhamma. The Buddha spoke the Mūlapariyāya Sutta to cut down their pride. Unable to understand it, they were humbled and apologized to the Buddha. Sometime later the Buddha spoke this Gotamaka Sutta to guide them to arahantship.

<sup>248</sup> *Sappāṭihāriya*. Mp explains this to mean "removing opposition" (*paccanīkapaṭiharaneṇa sappāṭihāriyaṃ*). But **3:60** enumerates three kinds of wonders (*tīnīpāṭihāriyāni*), and it seems these (particularly the third) are relevant here, too. Perhaps the basic idea is that what "takes away" (*paṭiharati*) distorted views and defilements is a *pāṭihāriyaṃ*.

"Go, Mahānāma, and find a suitable rest house in Kapilavatthu where we might stay for the night." [277]

"Yes, bhante," Mahānāma replied. He then entered Kapilavatthu and searched the entire city but did not see a suitable rest house where the Blessed One could stay for the night. So he returned to the Blessed One and told him: "Bhante, there is no suitable rest house in Kapilavatthu where the Blessed One might stay for the night. But Bharaṇḍu the Kālāma, formerly the Blessed One's fellow monk, [is here].<sup>249</sup> Let the Blessed One spend the night at his hermitage."

"Go, Mahānāma, and prepare a mat for me."

"Yes, bhante," Mahānāma replied. Then he went to Bharaṇḍu's hermitage, prepared a mat, set out water for washing the feet, returned to the Blessed One, and said:

"I have spread a mat, bhante, and set out water for washing the feet. The Blessed One may go at his own convenience."

Then the Blessed One went to Bharaṇḍu's hermitage, sat down on the seat that was prepared for him, and washed his feet. It then occurred to Mahānāma: "This is not a proper time for staying with the Blessed One, for he is tired. I will visit him tomorrow." Then he paid homage to the Blessed One, circumambulated him keeping the right side towards him, and departed.

Then, when the night had passed, Mahānāma approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, and sat down to one side. The Blessed One then said to him:

"There are, Mahānāma, these three kinds of teachers found existing in the world. What three?"

(1) "Here, Mahānāma, some teacher prescribes the full understanding of sensual pleasures, but not of forms or feelings. (2) Another teacher prescribes the full understanding of sensual pleasures and forms, but not [278] of feelings. (3) Still another teacher prescribes the full understanding of sensual pleasures, forms, and feelings. These are the three kinds of teachers found existing in the world. Is the goal of these three kinds of teachers the same or different?"

When this was said, Bharaṇḍu the Kālāma said to Mahānāma: "Say the same, Mahānāma." But the Blessed One said to Mahānāma: "Say different, Mahānāma."

A second time ... A third time Bharaṇḍu the Kālāma said to Mahānāma: "Say the same, Mahānāma." But the Blessed One said to Mahānāma: "Say different, Mahānāma."

Then it occurred to Bharaṇḍu: "The ascetic Gotama has contradicted me three times in front of the influential Mahānāma the Sakyan. I had better leave Kapilavatthu."

Then Bharaṇḍu the Kālāma left Kapilavatthu. When he left Kapilavatthu, he left for good and never returned.

---

<sup>249</sup> *Purāṇasabrahmacārī*. Mṃ says that they had lived together at Ālāra Kālāma's hermitage. Ālāra Kālāma was one of the meditation masters under whom the future Buddha trained before his enlightenment. See MN I 163,31.

## 127 (5) Hatthaka

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Sāvattṭhī in Jeta's Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Park. Then, when the night had advanced, the young deva Hatthaka,<sup>250</sup> illuminating the entire Jeta's Grove, approached the Blessed One. Having approached, [while thinking:] "I will stand in front of the Blessed One," he sank down, descended, and could not remain in place. Just as ghee or oil, when poured on sand, sinks down, descends, and does not remain in place, so the young deva Hatthaka, [while thinking:] "I will stand in front of the Blessed One," sank down, descended, and could not remain in place. [279]

Then the Blessed One said to Hatthaka: "Create a gross body, Hatthaka."

"Yes, bhante," Hatthaka replied. Then he created a gross body, paid homage to the Blessed One, and stood to one side. The Blessed One then said to him:

"Hatthaka, do those teachings that you could recall in the past, when you were a human being, come back to you now?"<sup>251</sup>

"Bhante, those teachings that I could recall in the past, when I was a human being, come back to me now; and teachings that I could not recall in the past, when I was a human being, come back to me now."<sup>252</sup> Just as the Blessed One is now hemmed in by bhikkhus, bhikkhunīs, male and female lay followers, kings and royal ministers, sectarian teachers and their disciples, so I am hemmed in by other young devas. Young devas come to me even from a distance, [thinking]: 'We will hear the Dhamma from the young deva Hatthaka.'

"I died, bhante, insatiable and unquenchable in three things. What three? (1) I died insatiable and unquenchable in seeing the Blessed One. (2) I died insatiable and unquenchable in hearing the good Dhamma. (3) I died insatiable and unquenchable in attending upon the Saṅgha. I died insatiable and unquenchable in these three things.

"I could never get enough of  
seeing the Blessed One,  
hearing the good Dhamma,  
and attending on the Saṅgha.

"Training in the higher virtuous behavior,  
I rejoiced in hearing the good Dhamma.  
Hatthaka has gone to [rebirth in] Aviha<sup>253</sup>  
not having gotten enough of these three things."

---

<sup>250</sup> Apparently this is Hatthaka of Āḷavī (see 1:251), though Mp does not identify him as such.  
<sup>251</sup> Mp explains *dhammā ... pavattino* as "the Buddha-word that you learned in the past" (*pubbe uggahitabuddhavadānaṃ*).

<sup>252</sup> Mp: "Teachings that he has forgotten because he neglected to recite them."

<sup>253</sup> *Aviha*: One of the five pure abodes (*suddhāvāsa*) into which only non-returners are reborn.



## 128 (6) Pollution

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling in Barāṇāsī at the deer park in Isipatana. Then, in the morning, the Blessed One dressed, took his bowl and robe, and entered Barāṇāsī for alms. [280] While walking for alms near the cattle-yoking fig tree,<sup>254</sup> the Blessed One saw a dissatisfied bhikkhu, [seeking] gratification outwardly,<sup>255</sup> muddle-minded, without clear comprehension, unconcentrated, with a wandering mind and loose sense faculties. Having seen him, he said to that bhikkhu:

"Bhikkhu, bhikkhu! Do not pollute yourself.<sup>256</sup> It is inevitable, bhikkhu, that flies will pursue and attack one who has polluted himself and been tainted by a stench."<sup>257</sup>

Then, being exhorted thus by the Blessed One, that bhikkhu acquired a sense of urgency.<sup>258</sup>

When the Blessed One had walked for alms in Barāṇāsī, after his meal, when he had returned from his alms round, he addressed the bhikkhu:

"Bhikkhus, this morning I dressed, took my bowl and robe, and entered Barāṇāsī for alms. While walking for alms near the cattle-yoking fig tree, I saw a dissatisfied bhikkhu [seeking] gratification outwardly, muddle-minded, without clear comprehension, unconcentrated, with a wandering mind and loose sense faculties. Having seen him, I said to that bhikkhu: 'Bhikkhu, bhikkhu! Do not pollute yourself. It is inevitable, bhikkhu, that flies will pursue and attack one who has polluted himself and been tainted by a stench.' Then, being exhorted thus by me, that bhikkhu acquired a sense of urgency."

When this was said, a certain bhikkhu asked the Blessed One: "What, bhante, is meant by 'pollution'? What is the 'stench'? And what are the 'flies'?"

(1) "Longing, bhikkhu, is what is meant by 'pollution'. (2) Ill will is the 'stench'. (3) Bad unwholesome thoughts are the 'flies.' It is inevitable that flies will pursue and attack one who has polluted himself and been tainted by a stench." [281]

The flies—thoughts based on lust—  
will run in pursuit of one  
unrestrained in the sense faculties,

<sup>254</sup> *Goyogapilakkhasmiṃ*. Mp: "Near the fig tree that had grown up at the place for selling cattle." PED explains *pilakkha* as a wavy-leaved fig tree.

<sup>255</sup> *Rittassādaṃ bāhirassādaṃ*. Mp: "Dissatisfied: lacking the pleasure of the jhānas. [Seeking] gratification outwardly: the gratification of sensual pleasure." The Chinese parallel, SĀ 1081 (T II 283a20–283b26) says (at 283a23) that "he had given rise to an unwholesome thought connected with evil craving" (起不善覺，以依惡貪).

<sup>256</sup> *Mā kho tvaṃ attānaṃ kaṭuvīyaṃ akāsi*. Mp glosses *kaṭuvīyaṃ* simply as *ucchiṭṭhaṃ*, "left over" food, without further explanation. DOP defines the word as "(what is) left over; (what is) polluted, impure."

<sup>257</sup> *Be āmagandhena*; Ce, Ee *āmagandhe*. See *Āmagandha-sutta*, Sn 239–52. Mp: "The foul odor consisting in anger."

<sup>258</sup> *Samvegamaṇāpādi*. Mp: "He became a stream-enterer." The suttas normally use a stock formula to indicate attainment of stream-entry, but nothing of this formula is found in the text.

unguarded in the eye and ear.

A bhikkhu who is polluted,  
tainted by a stench,  
is far from nibbāna  
and reaps only distress.

Whether in the village or the forest,  
the unwise foolish person,  
not having gained peace for himself,  
goes around followed by flies.<sup>259</sup>

But those accomplished in virtuous behavior  
who delight in wisdom and peace,  
those peaceful ones live happily,  
having destroyed the flies.<sup>260</sup>

#### 129 (7) Anuruddha (1)

Then the Venerable Anuruddha approached the Blessed One, paid homage to him, sat down to one side, and said: "Now, bhante, with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, I see that women, with the breakup of the body, after death, are mostly reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell. What qualities does a woman possess on account of which, with the breakup of the body, after death, she is reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell?"

"When she possesses three qualities, Anuruddha, with the breakup of the body, after death, a woman is reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell. What three?

(1) "Here, Anuruddha, in the morning a woman dwells at home with a mind obsessed by the stain of miserliness. (2) At midday she dwells at home with a mind obsessed by envy. (3) And in the evening she dwells at home with a mind obsessed by sensual lust. When she possesses these three qualities, with the breakup of the body, after death, a woman is reborn in the plane of misery, in a bad destination, in the lower world, in hell."

#### 130 (8) Anuruddha (2)

---

<sup>259</sup> Ce reads pāda b *aladdhā samamattano*; Be *aladdhā samathamattano*; Ee *sammamattano*. I prefer the Ce reading. All three eds. read the verb in pāda c as *pareti*, which Mp glosses with *gacchati*.

<sup>260</sup> *Nāsayitvāna makkhikā*. The absolutive is from the verb *nāseti*, "to destroy."

Then the Venerable Anuruddha approached the Venerable Sāriputta and exchanged greetings with him. When they had concluded their greetings and cordial talk, [282] he sat down to one side and said to the Venerable Sāriputta:

"Here, friend Sāriputta, with the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, I survey a thousandfold world system. Energy is aroused in me without slackening; my mindfulness is established without confusion; my body is tranquil without disturbance; my mind is concentrated and one-pointed. Yet my mind is still not liberated from the taints through non-clinging."

[The Venerable Sāriputta said:] (1) "Friend Anuruddha, when you think: 'With the divine eye, which is purified and surpasses the human, I survey a thousandfold world system,' this is your conceit.

(2) "And when you think: 'Energy is aroused in me without slackening; my mindfulness is established without confusion; my body is tranquil without disturbance; my mind is concentrated and one-pointed,' this is your restlessness.

(3) "And when you think: 'Yet my mind is still not liberated from the taints through non-clinging,' this is your remorse.

"It would be good if you would abandon these three qualities and stop attending to them. Instead, direct your mind to the deathless element."

Some time later the Venerable Anuruddha abandoned those three qualities and stopped attending to them. Instead, he directed his mind to the deathless element. Then, dwelling alone, withdrawn, heedful, ardent, and resolute, in no long time the Venerable Anuruddha realized for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, that unsurpassed consummation of the spiritual life for the sake of which clansmen rightly go forth from the household life into homelessness; and having entered upon it, he dwelled in it. He directly knew: "Destroyed is birth, the spiritual life has been lived, what had to be done has been done, there is no more coming back to any state of being." And the Venerable Anuruddha became one of the arahants.

### 131 (9) Concealed

"Bhikkhus, there are these three things that flourish when concealed, not when exposed. What three? (1) Women flourish when concealed, not when exposed.<sup>261</sup> (2) The hymns of the brahmins flourish when concealed, not [283] when exposed. (3) And wrong views flourish when concealed, not when exposed. These are the three things that flourish when concealed, not when exposed.

---

<sup>261</sup> The exact import of this is not clear to me. Perhaps the sense is that women are best kept within the home rather than permitted to go out in public places on their own. The Chinese parallel, EĀ 22.4 (at T II 607b26-607c11), is exactly like the Pāli, though it includes a verse which simply reiterates the same statements as in the prose portion of the sutta.

"Bhikkhus, there are these three things that shine when exposed, not when concealed. What three? (1) The moon shines when exposed, not when concealed. (2) The sun shines when exposed, not when concealed. (3) The Dhamma and discipline proclaimed by the Tathāgata shines when exposed, not when concealed. These are the three things that shine when exposed, not when concealed."

#### 132 (10) Line Etched in Stone

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of persons found existing in the world. What three? The person who is like a line etched in stone; the person who is like a line etched in the ground; and the person who is like a line etched in water.

(1) "And what kind of person is like a line etched in stone? Here, some person often gets angry, and his anger persists for a long time. Just as a line etched in stone is not quickly erased by the wind and water but persists for a long time, so too, some person often gets angry, and his anger persists for a long time. This is called the person who is like a line etched in stone.

(2) "And what kind of person is like a line etched in the ground? Here, some person often gets angry, but his anger does not persist for a long time. Just as a line etched in the ground is quickly erased by the wind and water and does not persist for a long time, so too, some person often gets angry, but his anger does not persist for a long time. This is called the person who is like a line etched in the ground.

(3) "And what kind of person is like a line etched in water? Here, some person, even when spoken to roughly [284] and harshly, in disagreeable ways, remains on friendly terms [with his antagonist], mingles [with him], and greets [him]. Just as a line etched in water quickly disappears and does not persist for a long time, so too, some person, even when spoken to roughly and harshly, in disagreeable ways, remains on friendly terms [with his antagonist], mingles [with him], and greets [him]. This is called the person who is like a line etched in water.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons found existing in the world."

#### IV. A Warrior

##### 133 (1) A Warrior

"Bhikkhus, possessing three factors, a warrior is worthy of a king, an accessory of a king, and reckoned a factor of kingship. What three? Here, a warrior is a long-distance shooter, a sharp-shooter, and one who splits a great body. Possessing these three factors, a warrior is worthy of a king, an accessory of a king, and reckoned a factor of kingship. So too, possessing three factors, a bhikkhu is worthy of gifts, worthy of hospitality, worthy of offerings, worthy of reverential salutation, an unsurpassed field of merit for the

world. What three? Here, a bhikkhu is a long-distance shooter, a sharp-shooter, and one who splits a great body.

(1) "And how is a bhikkhu a long-distance shooter? Here, any kind of form whatsoever—whether past, future, or present, internal or external, gross or subtle, inferior or superior, far or near—a bhikkhu sees all form as it really is with correct wisdom thus: 'This is not mine, this I am not, this is not my self.' Any kind of feeling whatsoever ... [285] ... Any kind of perception whatsoever ... Any kind of volitional activities whatsoever ... Any kind of consciousness whatsoever—whether past, future, or present, internal or external, gross or subtle, inferior or superior, far or near—a bhikkhu sees all consciousness as it really is with correct wisdom thus: 'This is not mine, this I am not, this is not my self.' It is in this way that a bhikkhu is a long-distance shooter.

(2) "And how is a bhikkhu a sharp-shooter? Here, a bhikkhu understands as it really is: 'This is suffering.' He understands as it really is: 'This is the origin of suffering.' He understands as it really is: 'This is the cessation of suffering.' He understands as it really is: 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' It is in this way that a bhikkhu is a sharp-shooter.

(3) "And how is a bhikkhu one who splits a great body? Here, a bhikkhu splits the great mass of ignorance. It is in this way that a bhikkhu is one who splits a great body.

"Possessing these three qualities, a bhikkhu is worthy of gifts, worthy of hospitality, worthy of offerings, worthy of reverential salutation, an unsurpassed field of merit for the world."

#### 134 (2) Assemblies

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of assemblies. What three? The assembly trained in vain talk, the assembly trained in interrogation, and the assembly trained to the limits. These are the three kinds of assemblies."<sup>262</sup> [286]

#### 135 (3) A Friend

"Bhikkhus, one should associate with a friend who possesses three factors. What three? (1) Here, a bhikkhu gives what is hard to give. (2) He does what is hard to do. (3) He patiently endures what is hard to endure. One should associate with a friend who possesses these three factors."

---

<sup>262</sup> The first two are at 2:47. On "the assembly trained to the limits" (Ce *yāvatāvavinītā parisā*; Be *yāvatāvavinītā parisā*; Ee *yāvatajjhāvinītā parisā*), Mp says: "Trained by way of its capacity, meaning an assembly trained after one has known its capacity" (*pamāṇavasena vinītā, pamāṇaṃ ñatvā vinītaparisā ti attho*). This seems to be a unique occurrence of the expression in the Nikāyas. Mp also recognizes a reading *yāvatajjhā*, which it explains as "an assembly trained after one has known its inclination" (*yāva ajjhāsayā ti attho, ajjhāsayam ñatvā vinītaparisā ti vuttaṃ hoti*). Vanarata prefers a Burmese variant mentioned in a note in Ee, *yāvatajjanīvinītā parisā*, which he understands to be "an assembly that gives in to training only as long as (*yāva*) threats are applied."

## 136 (4) Arising

(1) "Bhikkhus, whether Tathāgatas arise or not, there persists that law, that stability of the Dhamma, that fixed course of the Dhamma:<sup>263</sup> 'All conditioned phenomena are impermanent.' A Tathāgata awakens to this and breaks through to it, and then he explains it, teaches it, proclaims it, establishes it, discloses it, analyzes it, and elucidates it thus: 'All conditioned phenomena are impermanent.'<sup>264</sup>

(2) "Bhikkhus, whether Tathāgatas arise or not, there persists that law, that stability of the Dhamma, that fixed course of the Dhamma: 'All conditioned phenomena are suffering.' A Tathāgata awakens to this and breaks through to it, and then he explains it, teaches it, proclaims it, establishes it, discloses it, analyzes it, and elucidates it thus: 'All conditioned phenomena are suffering.'

(3) "Bhikkhus, whether Tathāgatas arise or not, there persists that law, that stability of the Dhamma, that fixed course of the Dhamma: 'All phenomena are non-self.' A Tathāgata awakens to this and breaks through to it, and then he explains it, teaches it, proclaims it, establishes it, discloses it, analyzes it, and elucidates it thus: 'All phenomena are non-self.'"

## 137 (5) A Hair Blanket

"Bhikkhus, a hair blanket is declared to be the worst kind of woven garment.<sup>265</sup> A hair blanket is cold in cold weather, hot in hot weather, ugly, foul-smelling, and uncomfortable. So too, the doctrine of Makkhali is declared the worst among the doctrines of the various ascetics.<sup>266</sup> The hollow man Makkhali teaches the doctrine and view: 'There is no kamma, no deed, no energy.' [287]

(1) "Bhikkhus, the Blessed Ones, Arahants, Perfectly Enlightened Ones of the past taught a doctrine of kamma, a doctrine of deeds, a doctrine of energy. Yet the hollow man Makkhali contradicts them [with his claim]: 'There is no kamma, no deed, no energy.'

(2) "The Blessed Ones, Arahants, Perfectly Enlightened Ones of the future will also teach a doctrine of kamma, a doctrine of deeds, a doctrine of energy. Yet the hollow

---

<sup>263</sup> *Thitā sā dhātu dhammaṭṭhitatā dhammaniyāmatā*. Mp explains "impermanent" (*anicca*) as non-existent after having come to be (*huvā abhavaṭṭhena*); "suffering" (*dukkha*) as oppression (*sampīḷanaṭṭhena dukkhā*); and non-self (*anattā*) as not subject to the exercise of mastery (*avasavattan-aṭṭhena*).

<sup>264</sup> In SN 12:20, II 25–27, this same framework is applied to the twelvefold formula of dependent origination.

<sup>265</sup> *Ce kesakambalotesaṃ pāvārānaṃ paṭikiṭṭho*, as against Be, Ee *kesakambalotesaṃ paṭikiṭṭho*. PED defines *pāvāra* as "a cloak, a mantle."

<sup>266</sup> See 1:319 for another critique of Makkhali Gosāla. The simile of the trap recurs at the end of this sutta.

man Makkhali contradicts them [with his claim]: 'There is no kamma, no deed, no energy.'

(3) "At present I am the Arahant, the Perfectly Enlightened One, and I teach a doctrine of kamma, a doctrine of deeds, a doctrine of energy. Yet the hollow man Makkhali contradicts me [with his claim]: 'There is no kamma, no deed, no energy.'

"Just as a trap set at the mouth of a river would bring about harm, suffering, calamity, and disaster to many fish, so too, the hollow man Makkhali is, as it were, a 'trap for people' who has arisen in the world for the harm, suffering, calamity, and disaster of many beings."

#### 138 (6) Accomplishment

"Bhikkhus, there are these three accomplishments. What three? Accomplishment of faith, accomplishment of virtuous behavior, and accomplishment of wisdom. These are the three accomplishments."

#### 139 (7) Growth<sup>267</sup>

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of growth. What three? Growth in faith, growth in virtuous behavior, and growth in wisdom. These are the three kinds of growth."

#### 140 (8) Horses (1)

"Bhikkhus, I will teach you the three kinds of wild colts and the three kinds of persons who are like wild colts. Listen and attend closely. I will speak."

"Yes, bhante," those bhikkhus replied. The Blessed One said this:

"And what, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of wild colts? [288] (1) Here, one kind of wild colt possesses speed but not beauty or the right proportions. (2) Another kind of wild colt possesses speed and beauty but not the right proportions. (3) And still another kind of wild colt possesses speed, beauty, and the right proportions. These are the three kinds of wild colts.

"And what, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons who are like wild colts? (1) Here, one kind of person who is like a wild colt possesses speed but not beauty or the right proportions. (2) Another kind of person who is like a wild colt possesses speed and beauty but not the right proportions. (3) And still another kind of person who is like a wild colt possesses speed, beauty, and the right proportions.

(1) "And how does a person who is like a wild colt possess speed but not beauty or the right proportions? Here, a bhikkhu understands as it really is: 'This is

---

<sup>267</sup> Ee treats this sutta as a continuation of the preceding one, whereas Ce and Be, which I follow, treat it as separate. Thus my numbering will again exceed Ee's by three.

suffering,'and'This is the origin of suffering,'and'This is the cessation of suffering,'and'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' This, I say, is his speed. But when asked a question pertaining to the Dhamma or the discipline, he falters and does not answer. This, I say, is his lack of beauty. And he does not gain robes, almsfood, lodgings, and medicines and provisions for the sick. This, I say, is his lack of the right proportions. In this way a person who is like a wild colt possesses speed but not beauty or the right proportions.

(2) "And how does a person who is like a wild colt possess speed and beauty but not the right proportions? Here, a bhikkhu understands as it really is: 'This is suffering' ... 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' This, I say, is his speed. And when asked a question pertaining to the Dhamma or the discipline, he answers and does not falter. This, I say, is his beauty. But he does not gain robes ... and [other] supports for the sick. This, I say, is his lack of the right proportions. In this way [289] a person who is like a wild colt possesses speed and beauty but not the right proportions.

(3) "And how does a person who is like a wild colt possess speed, beauty, and the right proportions? Here, a bhikkhu understands as it really is: 'This is suffering,' and 'This is the origin of suffering,' and 'This is the cessation of suffering,' and 'This is the way leading to the cessation of suffering.' This, I say, is his speed. And when asked a question pertaining to the Dhamma or the discipline, he answers and does not falter. This, I say, is his beauty. And he gains robes ... and [other] supports for the sick. This, I say, is his right proportions. In this way a person who is like a wild colt possesses speed, beauty, and the right proportions.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons who are like wild colts."

#### 141 (9) Horses (2)

"Bhikkhus, I will teach you the three kinds of good horses and the three kinds of persons who are like good horses.<sup>268</sup> Listen ...

"And what, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of good horses? (1) Here, one kind of good horse possesses speed but not beauty or the right proportions. (2) Another kind of good horse possesses speed and beauty but not the right proportions. (3) Still another kind of good horse possesses speed, beauty, and the right proportions. These are the three kinds of good horses.

"And what, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons who are like good horses? (1) Here, one kind of person who is like a good horse possesses speed but not beauty or the right proportions. (2) Another kind of person who is like a good horse possesses speed and beauty but not the right proportions. (3) Still another kind of person who is like a good horse possesses speed, beauty, and the right proportions. [290]

---

<sup>268</sup> Ce, Ee *tayo ca assasadasse ... tayo ca purisasadasse*. Lit., "the three kinds of good horses among horses and the three kinds of good horses among men."



(1) "And how does a person who is like a good horse possess speed but not beauty or the right proportions? Here, with the utter destruction of the five lower fetters, a bhikkhu becomes one of spontaneous birth, due to attain final nibbāna there without ever returning from that world. This, I say, is his speed. But when asked a question pertaining to the Dhamma or the discipline, he falters and does not answer. This, I say, is his lack of beauty. And he does not gain robes, almsfood, lodgings, and medicines and provisions for the sick. This, I say, is his lack of the right proportions. In this way a person who is like a good horse possesses speed but not beauty or the right proportions.

(2) "And how does a person who is like a good horse possess speed and beauty but not the right proportions? Here, with the utter destruction of the five lower fetters, a bhikkhu becomes one of spontaneous birth, due to attain final nibbāna there without ever returning from that world. This, I say, is his speed. And when asked a question pertaining to the Dhamma or the discipline, he answers and does not falter. This, I say, is his beauty. But he does not gain robes ... and [other] supports for the sick. This, I say, is his lack of the right proportions. In this way a person who is like a good horse possesses speed and beauty but not the right proportions.

(3) "And how does a person who is like a good horse possess speed, beauty, and the right proportions? Here, with the utter destruction of the five lower fetters, a bhikkhu becomes one of spontaneous birth, due to attain final nibbāna there without ever returning from that world. This, I say, is his speed. And when asked a question pertaining to the Dhamma or the discipline, he answers and does not falter. This, I say, is his beauty. And he gains robes ... and [other] supports for the sick. This, I say, is his right proportions. In this way a person who is like a good horse possesses speed, beauty, and the right proportions.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of persons who are like good horses."

#### 142 (10) Horses (3)

"Bhikkhus, I will teach you the three kinds of excellent thoroughbred horses and the three kinds of excellent thoroughbred persons. Listen ... [291]

"And what, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of excellent thoroughbred horses? Here, one kind of excellent thoroughbred horse ... possesses speed, beauty, and the right proportions. These are the three kinds of excellent thoroughbred horses.

"And what, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of excellent thoroughbred persons? Here, one kind of person ... possesses speed, beauty, and the right proportions.

"And how does an excellent thoroughbred person ... possess speed, beauty, and the right proportions? Here, with the destruction of the taints, a bhikkhu has realized for himself with direct knowledge, in this very life, the taintless liberation of mind, liberation by wisdom; and having entered upon it, he dwells in it. This, I say, is his speed. And when asked a question pertaining to the Dhamma or the discipline, he answers and does

not falter. This, I say, is his beauty. And he gains robes ... and [other] supports for the sick. This, I say, is his right proportions. In this way an excellent thoroughbred person possesses speed, beauty, and the right proportions.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three kinds of excellent thoroughbred persons."

#### 143 (11) The Peacock Sanctuary (1)<sup>269</sup>

On one occasion the Blessed One was dwelling at Rājagaha at the wanderers' park, the peacock sanctuary. There the Blessed One addressed the bhikkhus: ...

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, a bhikkhu is best among devas and humans: one who has reached the ultimate conclusion, won ultimate security from bondage, lived the ultimate spiritual life, and gained the ultimate consummation. What three? (1) The aggregate of virtuous behavior of one beyond training, (2) the aggregate of concentration of one beyond training, and (3) the aggregate of wisdom of one beyond training.<sup>270</sup> Possessing these three qualities, a bhikkhu is best among devas and humans ... and gained the ultimate consummation."

#### 144 (12) The Peacock Sanctuary (2)

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, a bhikkhu is best among devas and humans: one who has reached the ultimate conclusion, won ultimate security from bondage, lived the ultimate spiritual life, and gained the ultimate consummation. What three? [292] (1) The wonder of psychic potency, (2) the wonder of mind-reading, and (3) the wonder of instruction. Possessing these three qualities, a bhikkhu is best among devas and humans ... and gained the ultimate consummation."

#### 145 (13) The Peacock Sanctuary (3)

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, a bhikkhu is best among devas and humans: one who has reached the ultimate conclusion, won ultimate security from bondage, lived the ultimate spiritual life, and gained the ultimate consummation. What three? (1) Right view, (2) right knowledge, and (3) right liberation. Possessing these three qualities, a bhikkhu is best among devas and humans ... and gained the ultimate consummation."

### V. Auspicious

#### 146 (1) Unwholesome

---

<sup>269</sup> Ee at I 291–92 combines this sutta and the next two into one, 3:140 in its numbering. Ce, Be count each separately. See **11:10**, which merges them into a single sutta supplemented by two additional factors for a total of eleven qualities. From **3:146** on, my numbering exceeds Ee's by five.

<sup>270</sup> The one beyond training (*asekha*) is the arahant.

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, one is deposited in hell as if brought there. What three? Unwholesome bodily action, unwholesome verbal action, and unwholesome mental action. Possessing these three qualities, one is deposited in hell as if brought there.

"Possessing three qualities, one is deposited in heaven as if brought there. What three? Wholesome bodily action, wholesome verbal action, and wholesome mental action. Possessing these three qualities, one is deposited in heaven as if brought there."

#### 147 (2) Blameworthy

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, one is deposited in hell as if brought there. What three? Blameworthy bodily action, blameworthy verbal action, and blameworthy mental action. Possessing these three qualities, one is deposited in hell as if brought there.

"Possessing three qualities, one is deposited in heaven as if brought there. What three? Blameless bodily action, blameless verbal action, and blameless mental action. Possessing these three qualities, one is deposited in heaven as if brought there." [293]

#### 148 (3) Unrighteous

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, one is deposited in hell as if brought there. What three? Unrighteous bodily action, unrighteous verbal action, and unrighteous mental action. Possessing these three qualities, one is deposited in hell as if brought there.

"Possessing three qualities, one is deposited in heaven as if brought there. What three? Righteous bodily action, righteous verbal action, and righteous mental action. Possessing these three qualities, one is deposited in heaven as if brought there."

#### 149 (4) Impure

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, one is deposited in hell as if brought there. What three? Impure bodily action, impure verbal action, and impure mental action. Possessing these three qualities, one is deposited in hell as if brought there.

"Possessing three qualities, one is deposited in heaven as if brought there. What three? Pure bodily action, pure verbal action, and pure mental action. Possessing these three qualities, one is deposited in heaven as if brought there."

#### 150 (5) Maimed (1)

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities, the foolish, incompetent, bad person maintains himself in a maimed and injured condition; he is blameworthy and subject to reproach by the wise; and he generates much demerit. What three? Unwholesome bodily

action, unwholesome verbal action, and unwholesome mental action. Possessing these three qualities ... he generates much demerit.

"Possessing three qualities, the wise, competent, good person preserves himself unmaimed and uninjured; he is blameless and beyond reproach by the wise; and he generates much merit. What three? Wholesome bodily action, wholesome verbal action, and wholesome mental action. Possessing these three qualities ... he generates much merit."

#### 151 (6) Maimed (2)

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities ... Blameworthy bodily action, blameworthy verbal action, and blameworthy mental action....

"Possessing three qualities ... Blameless bodily action, blameless verbal action, and blameless mental action...."

#### 152 (7) Maimed (3)

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities ... Unrighteous bodily action, unrighteous verbal action, and unrighteous mental action....[294]

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities ... Righteous bodily action, righteous verbal action, and righteous mental action...."

#### 153 (8) Maimed (4)

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities ... Impure bodily action, impure verbal action, and impure mental action....

"Bhikkhus, possessing three qualities ... Pure bodily action, pure verbal action, and pure mental action. Possessing these three qualities, the wise, competent, good person preserves himself unmaimed and uninjured; he is blameless and beyond reproach by the wise; and he generates much merit."

#### 154 (9) Homage

"Bhikkhus, there are these three kinds of homage. What three? By body, by speech, and by mind. These are the three kinds of homage."

#### 155 (10) A Good Morning

"Bhikkhus, those beings who engage in good conduct by body, speech, and mind in the morning have a good morning. Those beings who engage in good conduct by body,

speech, and mind in the afternoon have a good afternoon. And those beings who engage in good conduct by body, speech, and mind in the evening have a good evening."

Truly propitious and auspicious,  
a happy daybreak and a joyful rising,  
a precious moment and a blissful hour  
will come for those who offer alms  
to those leading the spiritual life.

Upright acts of body and speech,  
upright thoughts and aspirations:  
when one does what is upright  
one gains upright benefits.

Those happy ones who have gained such benefits  
come to growth in the Buddha's teaching.  
May you and all your relatives  
be healthy and happy! [295]

## VI. Ways of Practice<sup>271</sup>

### 156 (1) [Establishments of Mindfulness]<sup>272</sup>

"Bhikkhus, there are these three ways of practice. What three? The coarse way of practice, the blistering way of practice, and the middle way of practice.<sup>273</sup>

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is the coarse way of practice? Here, someone holds such a doctrine and view as this: 'There is no fault in sensual pleasures,' and then indulges in sensual pleasures. This is called the coarse way of practice.

(2) "And what is the blistering way of practice?<sup>274</sup> Here, someone goes naked, rejecting conventions, licking his hands, not coming when asked, not stopping when asked; he does not accept food brought or food specially made or an invitation to a meal; he receives nothing from a pot, from a bowl, across a threshold, across a stick, across a pestle, from two eating together, from a pregnant woman, from a woman nursing a child,

<sup>271</sup> Ee does not number this as a separate *vagga* but titles it *Acelaka-vagga*. Ce counts it as the sixth *vagga* in the third Fifty, called *Paṭipadāvagga*. Be also counts it as the sixth *vagga* (sixteenth in its total for the Threes), called *Acelakavagga*, "Chapter on the Naked Ascetic."

<sup>272</sup> I base this title on the *uddāna* verse of Be. Neither Ce nor Be assigns a title to this sutta; neither Ce nor Ee has an *uddāna* verse.

<sup>273</sup> The coarse way of practice (*āgālhā paṭipadā*) corresponds to the extreme of indulgence in sensual pleasure; the blistering way of practice (*nijjhāmā paṭipadā*), to the extreme of self-mortification. Those are the two extremes that the Buddha rejected in his first discourse (SN 56:11, V 421,4–9).

<sup>274</sup> The following list of ascetic practices is also at DN I 166–67; MN I 77–78, 307–8, 342–43.

from a woman being kept by a man, from where food is advertised to be distributed, from where a dog is waiting, from where flies are buzzing; he accepts no fish or meat, he drinks no liquor, wine, or fermented brew.

"He keeps to one house [on alms round], to one morsel of food; he keeps to two houses, to two morsels ... he keeps to seven houses, to seven morsels. He lives on one saucer a day, on two saucers a day ... on seven saucers a day. He takes food once a day, once every two days ... once every seven days; thus even up to once every fortnight, he dwells pursuing the practice of taking food at stated intervals.

"He is an eater of greens or millet or forest rice or hide-parings or moss or rice bran or rice scum or sesame flour or grass or cow dung. He subsists on forest roots and fruits; he feeds on fallen fruits.

"He wears hemp robes, robes of hemp-mixed cloth, shroud robes, rag-robes; robes made from tree bark, antelope hides, strips of antelope hide; robes of *kusa* grass, bark fabric, or wood-shavings fabric; a mantle made of head hair[296] or of animal wool, a covering made of owls' wings.

"He is one who pulls out hair and beard, pursuing the practice of pulling out hair and beard. He is one who stands continuously, rejecting seats. He is one who squats continuously, devoted to maintaining the squatting position. He is one who uses a mattress of thorns; he makes a mattress of thorns his bed. He dwells pursuing the practice of bathing in water three times daily including the evening. Thus in such a variety of ways he dwells pursuing the practice of tormenting and mortifying the body. This is called the blistering way of practice.

(3) "And what is the middle way of practice? Here, a bhikkhu dwells contemplating the body in the body, ardent, clearly comprehending, mindful, having removed longing and dejection in regard to the world. He dwells contemplating feelings in feelings ... mind in mind ... phenomena in phenomena, ardent, clearly comprehending, mindful, having removed longing and dejection in regard to the world. This is called the middle way of practice.

"These, bhikkhus, are the three ways of practice."

157 (2)–162 (7) [Right Strivings, Etc.]<sup>275</sup>

(157) "Bhikkhus, there are these three ways of practice. What three? The coarse way of practice, the blistering way of practice, and the middle way of practice.

(1) "And what, bhikkhus, is the coarse way of practice? ... [as in 3:156] ... This is called the coarse way of practice.

---

<sup>275</sup> Ee compresses all these into a single sutta numbered 152. I follow Ce and Be in counting each as a distinct sutta.

(2) "And what is the blistering way of practice? ... [as in 3:156] ... This is called the blistering way of practice.

(3) "And what is the middle way of practice? Here, a bhikkhu generates desire for the non-arising of unarisen bad unwholesome states; he makes an effort, arouses energy, applies his mind, and strives. He generates desire for the abandoning of arisen bad unwholesome states ... for the arising of unarisen wholesome states ... for the maintenance of arisen wholesome states, for their non-decline, increase, expansion, and fulfillment by development; [297] he makes an effort, arouses energy, applies his mind, and strives....

(158) "... he develops the basis for psychic potency that possesses concentration due to desire and activities of striving. He develops the basis for psychic potency that possesses concentration due to energy activities of striving ... that possesses concentration due to mind activities of striving ... that possesses concentration due to investigation and strenuous activities of striving ...."

(159) "... he develops the faculty of faith, the faculty of energy, the faculty of mindfulness, the faculty of concentration, the faculty of wisdom...."

(160) "... he develops the power of faith, the power of energy, the power of mindfulness, the power of concentration, the power of wisdom...."

(161) "... he develops the enlightenment factor of mindfulness, the enlightenment factor of discrimination of phenomena, the enlightenment factor of energy, the enlightenment factor of rapture, the enlightenment factor of tranquility, the enlightenment factor of concentration, the enlightenment factor of equanimity...."

(162) "... he develops right view, right intention, right speech, right action, right livelihood, right effort, right mindfulness, right concentration. This is called the middle way of practice."

"These, bhikkhus, are the three ways of practice."

## VII. Courses of Kamma Repetition Series

163 (1)–182 (20)<sup>276</sup>

(163) "Bhikkhus, one possessing three qualities is deposited in hell as if brought there. What three? (1) One destroys life oneself, (2) encourages others to destroy life, and (3) approves of the destruction of life. One possessing these three qualities is deposited in hell as if brought there."

(164) "Bhikkhus, one possessing three qualities is deposited in heaven as if brought there. What three? (1) One abstains from the destruction of life oneself, (2)

---

<sup>276</sup> Ee groups each pair of suttas, respectively on qualities that lead to hell and to heaven, as a single sutta, and thus counts ten suttas (153–62, in its enumeration). Ce and Be, which I follow, enumerate each pair of contrasting suttas separately and thus count twenty suttas.

encourages others to abstain from the destruction of life, and (3) approves of abstaining from the destruction of life. One possessing these three qualities is deposited in heaven as if brought there."

(165) "... (1) One takes what is not given oneself, (2) encourages others to take what is not given, and (3) approves of taking what is not given...."

(166) "... (1) One abstains from taking what is not given oneself, (2) encourages others to abstain from taking what is not given, and (3) approves of abstaining from taking what is not given...."

(167) "... (1) One engages in sexual misconduct oneself, (2) encourages others [298] to engage in sexual misconduct, and (3) approves of engaging in sexual misconduct ...."

(168) "... (1) One abstains from sexual misconduct oneself, (2) encourages others to abstain from sexual misconduct, and (3) approves of abstaining from sexual misconduct...."

(169) "... (1) One speaks falsely oneself, (2) encourages others to speak falsely, and (3) approves of false speech...."

(170) "... (1) One abstains from false speech oneself, (2) encourages others to abstain from false speech, and (3) approves of abstaining from false speech...."

(171) "... (1) One speaks divisively oneself, (2) encourages others to speak divisively, and (3) approves of divisive speech...."

(172) "... (1) One abstains from divisive speech oneself, (2) encourages others to abstain from divisive speech, and (3) approves of abstaining from divisive speech...."

(173) "... (1) One speaks harshly oneself, (2) encourages others to speak harshly, and (3) approves of harsh speech...."

(174) "... (1) One abstains from harsh speech oneself, (2) encourages others to abstain from harsh speech, and (3) approves of abstaining from harsh speech...."

(175) "... (1) One indulges in idle chatter oneself, (2) encourages others to indulge in idle chatter, and (3) approves of indulging in idle chatter...."

(176) "... (1) One abstains from idle chatter oneself, (2) encourages others to abstain from idle chatter, and (3) approves of abstaining from idle chatter...."

(177) "... (1) One is full of longing oneself, (2) encourages others in longing, and (3) approves of longing...."

(178) "... (1) One is without longing oneself, (2) encourages others to be without longing, and (3) approves of being without longing...." [299]

(179) "... (1) One has ill will oneself, (2) encourages others in ill will, and (3) approves of ill will...."

(180) "... (1) One is without ill will oneself, (2) encourages others to be without ill will, and (3) approves of being without ill will ...."

(181) "... (1) One holds wrong view oneself, (2) encourages others in wrong view, and (3) approves of wrong view...."



(182) "... (1) One holds right view oneself, (2) encourages others in right view, and (3) approves of right view. One possessing these three qualities is deposited in heaven as if brought there."

#### VIII. Lust, Etc., Repetition Series<sup>277</sup>

183 (1)

"Bhikkhus, for direct knowledge of lust, three things<sup>278</sup> are to be developed. What three? Emptiness concentration, markless concentration, and wishless concentration.<sup>279</sup> For direct knowledge of lust, these three things are to be developed."

184 (2)–352 (170)

"Bhikkhus, for full understanding of lust ... for the utter destruction ... for the abandoning ... for the destruction ... for the vanishing ... for the fading away ... for the cessation ... for the giving up ... For the relinquishment of lust, these three things are to be developed.

"Bhikkhus, for direct knowledge ... for full understanding ... for the utter destruction ... for the abandoning ... for the destruction ... for the vanishing ... for the fading away ... for the cessation ... for the giving up ... for the relinquishment of

---

<sup>277</sup> Be and Ee count only one sutta here, 184 and 163 in their respective enumerations. Ce, which I follow, counts 170 suttas.

<sup>278</sup> With Be and Ee, I read simply *tayo dhammā* rather than *ime tayo dhammā* with Ce.

<sup>279</sup> *Suññata samādhi, animitta samādhi, appaṇihita samādhi*. Mp says only that "insight is explained by means of them (*tīhipi samādhīhi vipassanā va kathitā*)."<sup>279</sup> The three are mentioned as a set at DN III 219,21–22, again without explanation, but Sv III 1003–4 comments: "The explanation is threefold, by way of arrival (*āgamanato*), by way of quality (*saguṇato*), and by way of object (*ārammaṇato*). (1) *By way of arrival*, (i) one bhikkhu interprets in terms of non-self, sees in terms of non-self, and reaches the path by [contemplation of] non-self; for him, insight is called 'emptiness.' Why? Because of the absence of the defilements responsible for [the idea of] self or non-emptiness. The concentration of the path (*magga-samādhi*), being reached by insight, is called emptiness; and the concentration of the fruit (*phalasamādhi*), being reached by the path, is also called emptiness. (ii) Another interprets in terms of impermanence, sees in terms of impermanence, and reaches the path by [contemplation of] impermanence; for him, insight is called 'markless.' Why? Because of the absence of the defilements responsible for marks. The concentration of the path, being reached by insight, is called markless; and the concentration of the fruit, being reached by this path, is also called markless. (iii) Another interprets in terms of suffering, sees in terms of suffering, and reaches the path by [contemplation of] suffering; for him, insight is called 'wishless.' Why? Because of the absence of the defilements responsible for wishes. The concentration of the path, being reached by insight, is called wishless; and the concentration of the fruit, being reached by this path, is also called wishless. (2) *By way of quality*: The concentration of the path is empty because it is empty of lust, etc.; it is markless, because the marks of lust, etc., are absent; and it is wishless because wishes caused by lust, etc., are absent. (3) *By way of object*: Nibbāna is emptiness because it is empty of lust, etc.; it is markless and wishless, because it is without the marks of lust, etc., and without wishes caused by lust, etc." *Vism* 657,13–259,10, Ppn 21.66–73, discusses the three "gateways to liberation" (*vimuttimukha*) under the same three names.

hatred ... delusion ... anger ... hostility ... denigration ... insolence ... envy ...  
miserliness ... deceitfulness ... craftiness ... obstinacy ... rivalry ... conceit ...  
arrogance ... intoxication ... heedlessness, three things are to be developed. What three?  
Emptiness concentration, markless concentration, and wishless concentration. For the  
relinquishment of heedlessness, these three things are to be developed."

This is what the Blessed One said. Elated, those bhikkhus delighted in the Blessed  
One's statement.

The Book of the Threes is finished.